

Pakistan Scottish Apprenticeship Program

Final Report

March 2018

Contact:

[redacted]

Contents

Abbreviations 3

Introduction 4

Policy Dialogue 5

 Key Takeaways 6

Consultative Workshop 7

 Key Takeaways 8

Scoping Visit to Scotland 8

 Way Forward 10

Stakeholder Engagement Seminar 11

 Way Forward 12

Budget Spending 13

Annex 14

Abbreviations

DFID	Department for International Development
EU	European Union
ILO	International Labour Organization
JICA	Japanese International Cooperation Agency
NAVTTTC	National Vocational and Technical Training Commission
SDS	Skills Development Scotland
SME	Small Medium Enterprise
TEVTA	Technical Education and Vocational Training Association
TIKA	Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

Introduction

Pakistan has one of the largest youth populations in the world with 40% of the total population under the age of 18, 34% under the age of 15 and 21.6% between the ages of 15 and 24. Unfortunately, as per the World Bank¹ reports, 32% of the youth are illiterate while 8.2% are unemployed with no technical or vocational skills. This picture is bleaker still for young women who have comparatively lower literacy levels and fewer employment opportunities.

Given that 64 million of Pakistan's population is made up of youth, it is essential to utilize their talent and skills to ensure they become drivers of economic change. The Learning Generation² Report published by the International Commission on Financing Global Education states that by the year 2030, half of the world's jobs – around 2 billion – are expected to disappear due to automation. About 40% of employers, globally, are already finding it difficult to recruit people with the skills they need. This skills gap will have a severe impact on social and economic growth globally.

Formally, skills development in Pakistan is carried out through polytechnic and vocational institutions, apprenticeship schemes under several ministries and departments, and commercial training institutions. Informally, Pakistan uses the '*Ustad Shagird*' system of training which mostly constitutes shadowing a professional and learning by doing. Despite the number of forces involved in skills development in Pakistan, the overall proportion of skilled labor is on the lower side and there is a significant gap between the skills provided by these institutions.

To improve access to technical vocational education and training, the government has revised apprenticeship laws that ensure the relevance and quality of TVET in Pakistan. While this is a positive step in the right direction, its implementation is still lacking. A 2013 apprenticeship survey conducted by ILO reported a total of 59,348³ apprentices only. Given the unemployment rate and the skills gap, this number is insufficient.

In its second cycle, this project aimed to make the apprenticeship program more sustainable by giving local governments ownership of the program. For an apprenticeship training programme to have a lasting impact we need to adopt the right kind of approach. Each country in the world has its own methodology, where some leave it entirely to the market to provide necessary skills to employment, while others let governments regulate training matters depending on economic situation and political convictions.

This cycle of the Scottish Apprenticeship Scheme focused primarily on Punjab; as the size of Punjab's population between the ages of 15-29 is estimated at about 30 million and a further 36 million are below the age of 15. This youth bulge, which is likely to carry on well beyond 2025, is resulting in a surge of young adults entering the job market. At the current rates of labour force participation, this implies the need to create between 900,000 to 1.1 million new jobs every year till 2020 to keep unemployment at its current level⁴.

Keeping this in mind, British Council realized the role and importance of government ownership for lasting sustainability. British Council will therefore executed the next cycle of the Scottish

¹ The World Bank Statistics, 2014

² The Learning Generation, 2016 <http://report.educationcommission.org/report/>

³ Apprenticeship Systems in Pakistan (ILO), 2013

⁴ http://www.pndpunjab.gov.pk/system/files/Punjab_Skills_Sector_Plan_2018_0.pdf

Apprenticeship Scheme in collaboration with NAVTTC, Punjab TVETA and Skills Development Scotland.

To achieve this goal, the British Council engaged stakeholders in various activities throughout the year. Details of each are as follows:

Policy Dialogue



A policy dialogue themed “**Bridging the Skills Gap through Apprenticeship Programs – Scottish Apprenticeship Program and a Way Forward**” was organized in March in Islamabad (Annex A).

The aim of this policy dialogue was to provide the industry and government TEVTAs the space to identify the main shortcomings of existing apprenticeship models, as well as to highlight the urgency of skills gap and the need for more effective technical and vocational centres.

In addition to representatives from Punjab TEVTA and NAVTTC, other players in the skills development sphere in Pakistan such as ILO, GIZ, TIKA, JICA, EU, DFID, USAID and r2v were also invited to participate.

After welcome remarks by the Head of Higher Education and Skills British Council, a presentation was given detailing the current skills sector scenario and what is being done by the various partners. The idea was to apprise all stakeholders of the various programs currently in place in attempt to harmonise efforts and have a constructive discussion around problems and solutions.

With all three direct stakeholders i.e. government, industry and development sector in the same place, it was evident that there was a clear lack of clarity regarding existing apprenticeship laws and policies. This inevitably resulted in the underperformance of the skills sector in Pakistan.

During the discussions, representatives from Punjab TEVTA pointed out that as per their provincial policy, they give employers the freedom to hire and train on their own, but the industry more often than not shows limited interest as they don't want to bear the extra cost of training. He further pointed out the various government efforts in place including the "Punjab Development Fund" that are all focused towards improving the skills sector.

Participants from the industry and the development sector contributed by saying that rather than put the onus of training solely on the industry, there needs to exist a more collaborative approach where for instance the government can work with the industry to identify trends and develop a curriculum, and the industry can then implement the curriculum.

[redacted] a skills sector consultant said *"we need to identify a way to integrate the efforts of all three parties – government, development and private sector – each with a completely different agenda. Policy dialogues like these give us the space and the opportunity to do just that"*.

Key Takeaways

Some key takeaways from the discussion were as follows:

- As per existing policies that focus on large enterprises alone, apprenticeship models should be introduced in SMEs as well

- Government should assist the SMEs in building the capacity to implement apprenticeship programs

- Develop a "tri-party" association that works to identify future employment trends and current skills gap so as to ensure the relevance of apprenticeship models

- Set up classrooms in factories instead of off-site, allowing for better access to latest technology and training as per exact requirements of the employers

- Develop a strong monitoring mechanism to ensure apprentices or the industry aren't being exploited and that quality and standards are being maintained

- Develop a formal curriculum which should be revised periodically to factor in the ever changing industry needs

- Identify a way to have the three direct stakeholders – government, industry, and apprentices – work together

- Awareness session should be hosted with stakeholders so that are conscious of the new policy developed at Federal level and what it entails

- Using the Federal Policy as a guideline, provinces to develop their own policies and review old laws

Consultative Workshop



Factoring in the action points from the policy dialogue, instead of the initially proposed capacity building workshop for Punjab TVETA, the British Council organized a stakeholders' consultation themed **"Skill Led Labour through Apprenticeship Programs"** in November (Annex B).

The aim of this consultation was to engage **all** stakeholders – government, industry, **and** apprentices – in a meaningful discussion around existing apprenticeship models and policies in Pakistan, identifying shortcomings, especially with regards to quality and standards, and proposing a way forward, ensuring all stakeholders are aware of their respective roles and are able to contribute to the skills development sector in the country.

In addition to apprentices currently enrolled in various apprenticeship programs – including those enrolled in the British Council's Scottish Apprenticeship program, representatives from NAVTTC, Punjab TEVTA and the industry were also in attendance. The event was very well attended with over 70 participants present at the event.

Executive Director (ED) National Vocational and Technical Training Commission (NAVTTC), Director Apprenticeship Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA), and Managing Director (MD) Punjab Vocational Training Council (PVTTC), were some key representatives from relevant government departments. From the industry, we were joined by Country Head Premier Energy, Secretary General Pakistan Electric Fan Manufacturers Association (PEFMA), and General Manager Anwar Khawaja Industries. Other in attendance included representatives from companies such as Crescent Textile Mills, Millat Tractors, Pak Electron Ltd, Shaan Food and Mavrick amongst others.

After opening remarks by ED NAVTTC, Director Punjab TEVTA and MD PVTTC gave presentations on their existing programs, outlining key achievements and limitations. In his closing remarks MD PVTTC Mr. [redacted] rightfully pointed out that *"social empowerment cannot occur without economic empowerment, and apprenticeship programs can put us on the path for economic empowerment"*.

These presentations were followed by apprentices who took the stage to talk about their varying experiences as well as voicing their concerns regarding existing programs. Many pointed to the need for stronger career guidance and collaboration with the industry so they are able to develop skills which result in employment. A young apprentice from Anwar Khawaja Industries – a British Council partner for the Scottish Apprenticeship Program – stated that *“while we do develop the technical skills, it is equally essential to focus some time on soft skills development too. In the increasingly competitive environment skills like these can only give us an advantage.”*

[redacted], Country Head Premier Energy applauded the Scottish model of apprenticeship and said there was much to be learnt from it – *“Scottish Apprenticeship is a unique pilot program implemented by British Council and the Scottish Government.”* He further acknowledge the expertise of Skills Development Scotland stating *“they are very hands on when it comes to trainings and there are many best practices that with some adjustments can be introduced in Pakistan as well”*.

Key Takeaways

During group discussions, the participants got an opportunity delve deeper into the successes and failures of the current apprenticeship models. Some key takeaways are as follows:

- Training should include field specific as well as interpersonal skills development
- Better evaluation of apprenticeship programs, or real-time assessment of programs so training can be tweaked accordingly
- Stronger monitoring of industry trends to ensure relevance of skills being taught
- More effective communication between the industry and government to ensure smooth delivery to training programs as well as ensuring greater employment post-training
- Guidance counselling services must be put in place – from an early age – to help students develop skills that they have the most aptitude for
- Sharing of financial burden should be shared by both the government and the industry. Similar to the Scottish model, government can fund all trainings while the industry can pay for apprentice salaries
- The Apprenticeship Ordinance of 1962, currently applicable to large employers (those employing more than 50 workers) only must updated to include SMEs and amended to account for modern needs and accompanying challenges

Scoping Visit to Scotland

Given the past discussion and current skills scenario, the scoping visit to Scotland was organize, the objective of which was to give senior federal and provincial TEVTA officials and core industry partners the opportunity to observe the delivery of one of the most successful apprenticeship schemes in person, and identify best practices especially with regards to quality and



standards that can be modified to work in Pakistan.

The delegation consisted of senior federal and provincial TEVTA officials as well as Scottish Apprenticeship Program partners from Cycle 1. The detailed list of participants can be found in Annex C.

In addition to meetings with Skills Development Scotland, the group also got the opportunity to visit trade/ skills colleges in Glasgow, where they were able to observe first-hand the delivery of skills training. A detailed plan of the visit is as follows:

Scoping Visit – Plan			
Day 1	SDS Glasgow	How are frameworks developed, how are skills trends identified, how do you ensure collaboration with the industry, who does what, what happens post apprenticeship? What is the employability rate? Who hires?	Scotland
Day 2	Trade/ Skills College	How programs are designed, implemented, and monitored	Scotland
Day 3	Scottish Government and/or something around quality	Quality and standard setting, what laws exist, how are they successfully translated across the board, how are all parties taken on board?	Scotland
Day 4	Welsh Government – skills and training	A look into the Welsh model, how it works, how it's different from the Scotland Apprenticeship model, how are apprentices matched, how are counsellors trained, how many, where are they placed, how do you ensure access?	Wales
Day 5	Welsh Government – skills and training		Wales



Upon their return, the delegation was requested to fill out a brief survey to help identify areas of future collaboration as well as next steps. A template of the survey form can be found in Annex D. The survey results indicate that all delegates were very pleased with the format of the visit. In particular, they found visits to the West College Scotland and East Kilbride Group Training Association (EKGTA) most useful. NAVTTC official quoted “It was a very useful visit for me as I got the opportunity to observe SDS’s work in the

skills sector. The opportunity to learn more about their quality assurance mechanisms in particular was very useful for me”.

Way Forward

The following areas of possible future collaborations were identified:

Collaboration in improving and implementing the accreditation of qualifications process in Pakistan

Trainings for government officials in Pakistan as a means of introducing them to Scottish Apprenticeship best practices

Partnership with West College Scotland for improvements in training delivery

Guidance around means of facilitating better collaboration between training providers, industry and government institutions

Ensuring sector plans are made factoring in industry requirements and skills production

Formation of sector skills council and their active participation in apprenticeship training programs

Implementation of CBT based apprenticeship training programs

Similar trainings of staff in Scotland

Some next steps identified are as follows:

Ensure that existing Apprenticeship Ordinances and policies are updated and made functional across Pakistan

Strengthen the linkages between industry and training providers to ensure relevant skills are being taught

Manage training provider facilities better so as to ensure trainers are fully capable to transferring and teaching skills

Review existing apprenticeship training programs within industries and align them with government policies

Introduce quality measures for Competency Based Training



Stakeholder Engagement Seminar

A closing seminar to engage with industry members and government institutions was organized. The objective of this seminar was to brief participants on the learnings and results of the Scottish Apprenticeship Cycles 1 and 2 and provide a space for the various stakeholders – training providers, industries, employers and government bodies – to come together and identify next steps and a plan for the successful implementation of the recently developed Apprenticeship Act, 2018.

In addition to representation from NAVTTC, this event was attended by partners in the development sector such as GIZ, USAID as well as industry members such as Pak Steels, Fazal Industries and Victory Pipes. This mix of participants allowed for candid discussions around each stakeholder's concerns with regards to current apprenticeship models and laws.

During his opening remarks Deputy Director **[redacted]** emphasised the importance of the meeting stating "Platforms like these that bring together various stakeholders provide us with an enabling environment to bring about much needed change. We can have open productive discussions about the various issues and collectively propose solutions that will work. Ultimately, apprenticeship programs don't benefit just the youth; they benefit employers too who will have access to a well-trained resource pool."

[redacted], Director General NAVTTC added that NAVTTC has been working diligently to ensure improvements in the skills sector in Pakistan. In addition to the various youth skills development programs, they have also successfully set up Sector Skills Councils and plan on establishing many more. NAVTTC has also developed a Competency Based Training (CBT) model of apprenticeship which is likely to attract more participation from the industry. Some other steps NAVTTC has taken to bridge the existing skills gap are as follows:

- Implementing the PM Youth Skills Development Program
- TEVTA certifications are endorsed by NAVTTC
- Ensuring employers' engagement: the current skills curriculum is close to industry requirements as it has been reviewed by industry players.
- Learning from British experiences examples: participation in World Skills Competitions, Sector Skills Councils (hospitality, textile, automobile), and hosting Skills Shows in Pakistan.

During his address **[redacted]** emphasised the participation of industry members in bridging the skills gap and implementing successful apprenticeship models by stating "*training should be with the industry, by the industry and for the industry.*" He further stated some industry players have launched and are running their own apprenticeship/training programs as they are opposed to taking risk with their capital, but quality of training provided are not always up to the mark.

During the discussions, **[redacted]**, Director General Education, Research, Training & Policy Reforms of Overseas Pakistanis Foundation suggested organizing award ceremonies for the industries who successfully implement apprenticeship programs as a means of recognizing their efforts and encouraging them to continue implementing similar programs. He further emphasised the importance of awareness session to industry members as a means of increasing their participation in such programs.

Way Forward

During the discussions, the following next steps were identified:

Develop handbook around the new Apprenticeship Act,2018 which translates it in a simple understandable language both English and Urdu

Involve Chambers and Sector Councils in implementing apprenticeship programs successfully

Communicate the benefits of this Act to the different stakeholders to ensure clarity around its benefits

Involve different development partners so all efforts in the skills development sector are complimentary

Design and implement a mass awareness campaigns around the importance and benefits of apprenticeship programs and more specifically the Apprenticeship Act, 2108



Budget Spending

A brief outline of the spending on the project is as follows:

Scottish Apprenticeship – 2017	
	Amount
Policy Dialogue	£ 8000
Consultative Workshop	£ 12, 000
Stakeholder Engagement Seminar	£ 10,000
Scoping Visit (10 delegates)	£ 20,000
Total	£ 50,000

Annex

Annex A – Agenda for Policy Dialogue

Tentative Agenda – Policy Dialogue on Apprenticeship	
9:30 - 10:00	Registration
10:00 - 10:15	Welcome Remarks - [redacted] Head of Higher Education and Skills, British Council
10:15 - 10:20	Introductions
10:20 - 10:30	Overview of Scottish Apprenticeship Project – [redacted] Manager Scottish Scheme, British Council
10:30 - 12:00	Discussions and Way Forward
12:00 onwards	Lunch

Annex B – Agenda for Stakeholders’ Consultation

Tentative Agenda – Stakeholders’ Consultation	
9:30 - 10:00	Registration
10:00 - 10:15	Welcome Remarks – Head of Higher Education and Skills, British Council
10:15 - 10:45	Remarks – Executive Director NAVTTC
10:45 - 11:00	Presentation on Scottish Apprenticeship Scheme and Introduction to Theme – Manager Scottish Scheme, British Council
11:00 - 11:15	Presentation on Apprenticeship Training Models in Pakistan – Director Apprenticeship Training Program, Punjab TEVTA
11:15 - 11:30	Tea
11:30 - 12:15	Experience Sharing – Industry Partners
12:15 - 12:30	Group Formation
12:30 - 13:30	Lunch
13:30 - 15:00	Group Discussions
15:00 - 15:30	Presentations and Way Forward
15:30 - 16:00	Closing Remarks – Area Director Punjab, British Council

Annex C – Delegation List of Participants of Scoping Visit

Scoping Visit Scotland – Delegation List				
Sr No	Title	Name	Designation	Organization
1	Ms	[redacted]	Manager Scottish Scheme	British Council
2	Dr	[redacted]	Director Apprenticeship Training	Punjab TEVTA
3	Ms	[redacted]	Deputy Director Certification	NAVTTTC
4	Ms	[redacted]	Director Certification	NAVTTTC
5	Mr	[redacted]	In Charge	Metal Industry
6	Mr	[redacted]	Principal Govt Institute of Leather Technology	Sindh TEVTA
7	Ms	[redacted]	Manager	Mini Sanatzar Muridke
8	Mr	[redacted]	Assisant Vice President	Crescent Textiles
9	Mr	[redacted]	Product & Furniture Designer- Owner	Decent Furniture

10	Mr	[redacted]	CEO GOC Pak	Khawaja Industries
----	----	------------	-------------	--------------------

Annex D – Scoping Visit Post Trip Survey

Name:

Designation:

Organization Name:

Please rate the following aspects of the visit:

Location

Speakers

Sessions

How **relevant** was the scoping visit for you/ your organization?

What was the most **useful aspect** of this visit for you?

What did you **like the least** about this visit?

Based on the visit and the partners we met, what are some areas of potential collaboration you identified?

What are some actions you may potentially take or changes you may introduce in your respective organizations?

Please state any next steps you would like the British Council to take moving forward?

Please share any additional suggestion/recommendation you might have for us.

Annex E - Agenda of Closing Seminar

Tentative Agenda

Venue: Marriot

Date: 6th March, 2018

11:00 – 11:15	Opening and welcome remarks by [redacted] , Deputy Director British Council
11:15 – 11:30	Address by [redacted] , NACTTV
11:30 – 11:45	Pakistan Scottish Apprenticeship – Experience Sharing
11:45 – 12:30	Discussions around way forward/ Implementation Plan
12:30 – 13:00	Wrap up and thank you by [redacted] , Head of HE & Skills British Council
13:00 onwards	Lunch

Annex F - Participant List from Closing Seminar

Sr#	Title	Name	Designation	Organization
1	Mr	[redacted]	Project Officer	ILO
2	Ms	[redacted]	Senior Education Advisor	USAID
3	Mr	[redacted]	Director	NAVTTTC
4	Mr	[redacted]	Director Apprenticeship	NAVTTTC
5	Mr	[redacted]	Director Admin	NAVTTTC
6	Mr	[redacted]	DD Research	NAVTTTC
7	Mr	[redacted]	Executive Director	Agror Pharma
8	Mr	[redacted]	Head of Industrial Relations	Kohinoor Textile Mills Ltd
9	Mr	[redacted]	COO	Seronic Pvt Ltd
10	Mr	[redacted]	Director General	NAVTTTC
11	Mr	[redacted]	D.G Education Training	Overseas Pakistani's Foundation
12	Ms	[redacted]	Development Advisor	European Union
13	Mr	[redacted]	Advocate	Juridician Consultants
14	Mr	[redacted]	Director	Castpro Engineering
15	Mr	[redacted]	DG A & F	NAVTTTC
16	Mr	[redacted]	GM Operations	Castpro Engineering
17	Ms	[redacted]	Private Sector Development Advisor	DFID
18	Mr	[redacted]	Director	Fazal Industries
19	Mr	[redacted]	CEO	Earthiend Engineering Ltd
20	Mr	[redacted]		