

CONSULTATION QUESTIONS

1. Do you support the development of an MPA network in Scotland's Seas?

Yes No

Comments|Our organisation supports the general principle of MPAs but with certain reservations and conditions.

MPAs should always be backed with accurate scientific evidence.

MPAs should only be designated once management proposals are known and have been accepted by those most affected by designation. Our organisation does not believe it is acceptable to designate an MPA without first understanding the consequences for those likely to be affected.

There is a real concern having "moving species" such as skate and cetaceans as a need for designation, as these tend to cover large areas with as yet, no clear plan on how to "manage" protecting these species.

Individual possible Nature Conservation MPAs

2. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Clyde Sea Sill* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

3. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *East Caithness Cliffs* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

4. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *East of Gannet and Montrose Fields* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

5. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Faroe-Shetland sponge belt* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

6. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Fetlar to Haroldswick* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

7. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Hatton-Rockall Basin* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

8. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Creran* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

9. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sunart* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments Our members support the principle of L. Sunart MPA with the proviso that existing fishing methods and aquaculture sites are not affected

Management Options: Yes No

Comments Our fishing members have suggested various local management options. It would be important to ensure that local communities were involved in all aspects of managing this MPA.

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments It is important that all aspects of the the socio-economic assessment are considered before designation

All of the above: Yes No

Comments Loch Sunart MPA has the backing of our organisation and in conjunction with the Mull Fisherman's Association(MFA) suggests an area at the entrance to the Loch, be considered as a "scallop nursery" protected zone.

10. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sunart to the Sound of Jura* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments There is real concern as to the size of this proposal, the lack of scientific detail regarding the skate, their breeding grounds and the need to designate this area. It is an important, safe, commercial fishing area and within sections of the proposal, used by all the main finfish farms. It is suggested that smaller designations within this area might be more appropriate once more scientific data is available, regarding skate.

Management Options: Yes No

Comments If this area is designated then management options should

include using all the commercial fishing and aquaculture interests to ensure that their activities are not adversely affected.

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments Socio-economic assessment should be taken into account before any designation. This is an important safe fishing area in winter months in particular

All of the above: Yes No

Comments Such a large area has the potential to adversely affect our industries. More detail should be given before designating such a large area of the seabed

11. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Loch Sween* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options: Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment: Yes No

Comments

All of the above: Yes No

Comments

12. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Lochs Duich, Long and Alsh* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation: Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

13. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Monach Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

14. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Mousa to Boddam* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

15. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-east Faroe Shetland Channel* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

16. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-west Orkney* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

17. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *North-west sea lochs and Summer Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

18. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Noss Head* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

19. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Papa Westray* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

20. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Rosemary Bank Seamount* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

21. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Small Isles* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

22. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *South Arran* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

23. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for *The Barra Fan and Hebrides Terrace Seamount* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

24. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Turbot Bank* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

25. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Upper Loch Fyne and Loch Goil* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

26. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *West Shetland Shelf (formerly Windsock)* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

27. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessment for the *Wyre and Rousay Sounds* possible Nature Conservation MPA?

Designation:

Yes No

Comments

Management Options:

Yes No

Comments

Socioeconomic Assessment:

Yes No

Comments

All of the above:

Yes No

Comments

Choices to represent features in the MPA Network

28. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, ocean quahog and shelf banks and mounds in the Southern North Sea, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features, bearing in mind Turbot Bank will need to be designated to represent sandeel in this region:

- Firth of Forth Banks Complex
- Turbot bank and Norwegian Boundary Sedimentary Plain
- Or Firth of Forth Banks Complex, Turbot bank and Norwegian Boundary Sedimentary Plain

Comments

29. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, ocean quahog and shelf banks and mounds in the Southern North Sea?

Yes No

Comments

30. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing the burrowed mud feature in the Fladens, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features, bearing in mind the part of Central Fladen (known as Central Fladen (Core)) containing tall seapen (*Funiculina quadrangularis*) will need to be designated to represent tall seapen in this region:

- Central Fladen pMPA only
- The tall sea-pen component of Central Fladen, plus Western Fladen
- Or the tall sea-pen component of Central Fladen, plus South-East Fladen.

Comments

31. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing the burrowed mud feature in the Fladens?

Yes No

Comments

32. Recognising the scientific advice from JNCC included alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, offshore deep sea mud, and burrowed mud in OSPAR Regions III and V, do you have a preference or comments on the following combinations to represent these features:

South-West Sula Sgeir and Hebridean slope
Or Geikie slide and Hebridean slope

Comments

33. Do you have any comments on the case for designation, management options and socioeconomic assessments for the preference you have indicated in the question above, regarding alternatives for representing offshore subtidal sands and gravels, offshore deep sea mud, and burrowed mud in OSPAR Regions III and V?

Yes No

Comments

Sustainability Appraisal

34. Do you have any comments on the Sustainability Appraisal of the MPA network as a whole?

Yes No

Comments

Final Thoughts

35. On the basis of your preferences on which pMPAs should be designated, do you view this to form a complete or ecologically coherent network, subject to the completion and recommendations of SNH's further work on the 4 remaining search locations?

Yes No

Comments Unknown at this stage

36. Do you have any other comments on the case for designation, management options, environmental or socioeconomic assessments of the pMPAs, or the network as a whole?

Yes No

Comments Our main concerns remain as they have been from the outset. The consequences of any designation for the Isle of Mull fishermen and fish farmers are unknown. There is some comfort in knowing that all activities should continue in an MPA unless it can be shown that these activities will cause damage to what is being protected. (as agreed in documentation) However at this stage this appears not to be known? It is unfair to ask any commercial organisation or business to agree and sign up to MPAs without first knowing definitively, how this will affect their activities.

