A Literature Review of the Evidence Base for Culture, The Arts and Sport Policy

Culture, The Arts and Sport

www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch

The paper carries the Nordic Ecolabel for low emissions during production, and is 100% recyclable.

Astron 209395 7/04

ISBN 0-7559-3782-1

Price £5.00

www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch
Further copies of this report are available priced £5.00. Cheques should be made payable to The Stationery Office Ltd and addressed to:

The Stationery Office Bookshop
71 Lothian Road
Edinburgh
EH3 9AZ
Tel: 0870 606 5566
Fax: 0870 606 5588

The views expressed in this report are those of the researcher and do not necessarily represent those of the Department or Scottish Ministers.

© Crown Copyright 2004
Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged. For more extensive reproduction, please write to the Chief Researcher at Office of Chief Researcher, 4th Floor West Rear, St Andrew’s House, Edinburgh EH1 3DG
**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to acknowledge the help and co-operation of all those who took the time to meet with me or discuss with me by telephone or e-mail, relevant issues to this Review and have provided me with reports, documents and contacts to assist in carrying out the Review. These are (in chronological order):

**External**

Christine Hamilton and Adrienne Scullion, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, University of Glasgow
Jo Hargreaves, Morris Hargreaves & McIntyre
David Hunter, National Library of Scotland
Sheila McClure and Christine Maclean, National Museums Scotland
Jon Best, Sportscotland
Prof Fred Coalter, Institute for Sports Research, University of Stirling
Rod Stone, Aberdeenshire Council and Steve Grimmond, Dundee City Council, both representing VOCAL
Ruth Boram, Heather Ackroyd and Paul Buchanan, VisitScotland
Christine Galey, Scottish Museums Council
Beverley Francis and Jackie McLean, New Opportunities Fund
Gary Mundy, Ian Wood, Delis Aston and Melinda Anderson, Dept of Culture Media and Sport
Roberta Doyle, National Galleries of Scotland
Caroline Docherty, Scottish Arts Council
Roo Kharbanda, Convention of Scottish Local Authorities
Scott Donaldson, Alan Knowles and Isabella Edgar, Scottish Screen
Rhona Arthur, Scottish Libraries Information Council
Tom Costly, NFO WorldGroup
Evelyn Johnston, Education, Culture & Sport, Highland Council
Joe Larkin and Patricia Mullen, Cultural and Leisure Services, Glasgow City Council
Derek Janes, Culture and Leisure, City of Edinburgh Council
Denis McCoy, Dept of Culture, Arts and Leisure, Northern Ireland Office
Stephanie Knight, Queen Margaret University College, Edinburgh
Marcus Wilson, Hi-Arts
Kate Wimpress, Arts and Social Inclusion Partnership, Edinburgh

**Scottish Executive**

Policy colleagues in Cultural Policy and Sport & Co-ordination Divisions
Fiona McWhannel, Research and Economic Unit, Education Department
Raakhi Odedra, Research and Economic Unit, Education Department
Anthony Moulds, Research and Economic Unit, Education Department
Susie Gledhill, EventScotland
Mary Allison, Health Department
Jo MacDonald, Research & Economic Unit, Schools Group, Education Department
Julie McCallum, Education Department
Gerhard Mors, ETLLD Analytical Services
Joe Jobling, ECSU, Education Department
UPDATE STATEMENT

Since this Review was completed in February 2004, there have been various developments in government cultural policy and in research in the fields of culture, the arts and sport. Latest research developments and publications will be recorded in the culture and sport research database that has been created by the Scottish Executive as a result of this Review, and which will shortly be made publicly available on-line.

The Centre for Cultural Policy Research (CCPR) at Glasgow University will maintain and develop the database over the next 3 years, keeping it up to date and current for the benefit of central and local government, the non-departmental government bodies and agencies, and other organisations interested and involved in cultural or sport research. The CCPR will also encourage research establishments to send in details, for updating purposes, of robust new evidence in these areas.

Many of the non-departmental government bodies will also have launched strategies and documents since publication of this Review, and therefore it has to be borne in mind that Annex I is contemporary with February 2004, and does not refer to latest developments or publications by these bodies.

Cultural policy developments in government have also taken place since completion of this Review, and these include:

- “Cultural Policy Statement”, published by the Scottish Executive in April 2004 – this document outlines the Executive’s policy and vision for culture in Scotland, which includes – “Establish Scotland as a vibrant, cosmopolitan, competitive country and an internationally recognised creative hub”; “.. the key values of access and excellence will be guiding principles”. The document also states the remit of the Cultural Commission which is undertaking the ongoing review of cultural provision in Scotland. The Commission will provide practical recommendations on how cultural policy is to be implemented. If legislation is required, a Culture Bill will be published by 2007.

- “Culture at the Heart of Regeneration”, issued by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport in June 2004 – this consultation document by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport sets out the case for culture as “a driver of sustainable regeneration in England”. It seeks responses to questions on how to take the culture and regeneration agenda forward, with a delivery plan proposed for publication in early 2005. The Scottish Executive welcomes this consultation as an exercise that helpfully complements this Literature Review. Feedback from the consultation and the findings of the Review will helpfully inform the developing policy agenda and be of interest to the Cultural Commission.

In Scotland, action will not come to an end following the publication of this Review. In addition to creating the database mentioned above, the Executive will seek to establish and engage research networks involving its cultural agencies, other government departments, and other interested parties. The aim will be to encourage collaboration between researchers, to plug gaps in evidence and thereby better inform future policy making in the areas of culture, the arts and sport.
Steps to develop activity across Ministerial portfolios are in progress following Scotland’s First Minister, Jack McConnell’s speech on St Andrew’s Day 2003. The First Minister said, “Culture cuts across all portfolios of government, and it can make a difference to our success in each. ... “This is about how Ministers use arts and culture to achieve more effectively their policy objectives. ... “I want to see imaginative and new proposals coming forward from all Ministers that help create access to cultural activity.” A positive range of initiatives is emerging in response to that call; again, the findings of this Review will help inform content and delivery.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SECTION 1: CULTURE AND THE ARTS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1 SOCIAL IMPACT OF CULTURE AND THE ARTS</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Culture and the Arts</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Social Impact</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social impact of culture and the arts</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation and under-represented groups</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audience Development</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND SOCIAL INCLUSION</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Projects</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amateur and Community Theatre</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museums/Galleries</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Libraries</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young People and Cultural Services</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND ETHNIC MINORITIES</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Activities</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museums and Galleries</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND REDUCTION OF YOUTH CRIME</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND DISABILITY</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 6 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND REGENERATION/COMMUNITY IMPACT</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 7 CULTURE, THE ARTS AND HEALTH</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Projects and Healthcare</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effect of the Environment in Healthcare</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>CULTURE, THE ARTS AND EDUCATION/EMPLOYMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The relationship between culture, the arts and Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Educational Attainment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moving Image Art and Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>ECONOMIC IMPACT OF CULTURE AND THE ARTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Definition of Economic Impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>West End Theatre in London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arts in the Highlands and Islands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural Industries in Yorkshire and the Humber</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Museums, Archives, Libraries and Galleries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>CULTURAL TOURISM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The ‘immeasurable factors’ in evaluating the economic impact of culture and the arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>SPORT AND SOCIAL INCLUSION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation in Sports in Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sport and Reduction in Youth Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Concessionary Schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Barriers to participation by specific groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>SPORT AND ETHNIC MINORITIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>SPORT AND DISABILITY</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SECTION 2: SPORT AND PHYSICAL ACTIVITY
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This review of the social and economic impacts of culture, the arts and sport provides an overview and compendium of robust research evidence, both national and international, in these fields. It creates a coherent social research evidence base to inform Scottish policy development and future investment in culture, the arts and sport, and also investment in wider policy areas which can achieve their objectives through initiatives employing culture, the arts and sport. The Review has highlighted gaps in evidence which, if addressed, should contribute significantly to a robust evidence base for all these policy areas.

The Review has concentrated on the main issues covered by the National Cultural Strategy, Sport 21, and the Partnership for a Better Scotland agreement. It has examined research that has focused on the benefits of participation; the under-representation of different groups in culture, arts and sport; and the social and economic impact of participation in such activities and the hosting of major events, on individuals and communities.

One conclusion from this examination of recent (or most prominent) literature relevant to the Review is that although there is a wealth of research evidence available in each of the respective areas that demonstrates social and/or economic impact, there is no common or systematic approach to evaluation of initiatives or programmes, rendering it impossible to compare and contrast findings. Many studies are ‘ad hoc’, and focus specifically on the ‘local’ context, making it difficult to draw conclusions regarding the ‘bigger picture’. However, in providing an overview of the kind of research and evaluation that has recently taken place and presenting its findings, the Review is able to present the bigger picture of some common and consistent themes that arise from evaluation of the impact of participation on different groups.

Key Findings from a review of the research literature are:

Social Impact

Personal and Community Development

- Participation in cultural and sporting activities has been shown to result in the gaining of new skills, improve informal and formal learning, increase self-confidence, self-esteem and a feeling of self-worth, improve or create social networks, enhance quality of life, promote social cohesion, personal and community empowerment, improve personal and local image, identity and a sense of well-being
- For young people in particular, participation can reduce truancy/bad behaviour at school, reduce the propensity to offend and lead to better educational/employment prospects
- For ethnic minority groups, all of the above personal and social aspects can occur, and in addition participation in cultural activities relating to their own culture can result in an enhanced sense of pride within, and ‘empowerment’ of, the ethnic community
- For disabled people, participation can reduce isolation, increase social networks and enhance quality of life
**Social Justice**

- Although no research has demonstrated a *causal* relationship between participation in arts, culture and sport activities and a reduction in offending behaviour, national and international research and evaluation has demonstrated a link between the two.
- Where sport and arts activities have been targeted at young people at risk, or actual offenders, there has occurred a significant reduction in crime figures in these areas or a reduced propensity to offend.
- Programmes of activities can not only create a ‘diversion’ from criminal behaviour, but can facilitate key skills in learning, develop personal and social skills and provide routes into further education and employment, all of which can lead to the propensity not to re-offend or participate in criminal behaviour.

**Health**

- Research (including clinical research) has shown that participation in cultural or sporting activities (including physical activity) has led to improved physical and mental health (e.g., reduced stress levels, reduction in anxiety and blood pressure, reduction in visits to GP etc).
- Clinical, hospital based research has provided hard, undisputed facts on the improvement of health. However, ‘softer’ more qualitative outcomes have been shown to include improved communication skills in those with special needs; ‘carers’ having developed new skills and confidence; and improved interpersonal skills and increased social networks having led to an improved sense of well-being amongst the target population.

**Education**

- Robust and longitudinal research studies have shown that there is an association between cultural possessions in the home/culture in family background and educational performance; that there is a link between cultural participation and increased literacy and that participation in music and visual arts is linked to being above average in reading, maths and behaviour.
- It is believed by educators that arts activities and creativity in education have a positive educational impact on the majority of pupils.
- Sports and arts schools perform better over time and at a given point in time than maintained schools.
- Participation in arts education can lead to not only the development of arts and knowledge skills, but to increased confidence and the development of communication skills, an understanding of diversity and transferable skills for future employment.

**Participation and Under-represented Groups**

- Various quantitative research projects have provided information on the level and extent of participation by the general population in culture, the arts and sport.
- Such studies have shown that certain groups are under-represented in participation in each of these areas – low socio-economic groups, young people with low educational attainment, disabled and mobility impaired people (particularly those living in rural...
areas); and ethnic minority groups; young males post-education (in the arts), teenage girls (in sport) and school children and teenagers (visiting heritage organisations)

**Barriers to participation**

- Research has investigated the reasons for under-representation of these groups and has found that the main, common barriers are: lack of time and money (particularly the cost issue for families); availability and location; lack of, or inaccessible, public transport (particularly for those living in rural or peripheral areas); lack of information, lack of understanding and perception that the activity is ‘not for them’; irrelevance to their everyday lives, and ‘management ethos’
- In addition to the above, for ethnic minority groups there are barriers such as lack of diversity in representation of the arts and in sport, lack of their own culture portrayed, language barriers, fear of racism and social constraints
- For disabled people and mobility impaired people (e.g. the elderly), lack of appropriate access to and at the facilities, lack of programmes geared to their needs; lack of emotional and physical support, and a sense of ‘feeling different’ constrain their participation in cultural and sport activities
- For the lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender community, the small number of plays and arts events that are reflective of their culture in spite of the fact that a considerable number of people in the arts world are from their communities; the lack of books on subjects related to their communities in libraries; and the lack of privacy in changing rooms in leisure centres

**Audience Development**

- Partnership working and engaging with the local community can increase audience attendance at the theatre, particularly when the programmes reflect arts and art forms that attract the target audience
- Evening openings of art galleries can uncover a ‘lost segment’ of people who cannot find time for such visits during the day; can stimulate perception of art galleries as a social destination; and there is potential to augment the gallery experience with special events, music, cafes etc; similarly, Sunday openings and social events in galleries would encourage more attenders and a high proportion of people would like evening openings
- People would like museums to have evening opening hours, to have more ‘innovative’ displays and to be more ‘child friendly’
- Arts provision (e.g. the number of galleries in an area) does not necessarily equate to high attendance
- Arts and cultural facilities need to devote more time and resources to making existing programmes more user-friendly and psychologically and intellectually accessible, and should provide more and easily accessible information to raise awareness
- Specifically targeting a particular group and organising an event with educational content can create future interest in and attendance at art exhibitions
- Some venues lack understanding of box office computer systems, have poor data collection systems and events are based on an inaccurate picture of audiences
Economic Impact

**Culture and the Arts**

- Various economic appraisals and evaluations of the establishment of a major arts centre, theatre in London, the cultural industries such as museums, libraries, galleries and exhibitions, and major cultural events have demonstrated direct and indirect economic impacts on local areas and beyond.
- Evaluations have shown that additional expenditure and employment both locally and nationally have often been the result of a cultural centre or major event having been staged.
- *Social* impact has also resulted from such cultural facilities or events, including the creation of a ‘cultural sector’ in a city, the creation of a centre of international excellence, enhancing the image of an area, creating a ‘sense of place’ and civic pride, and promoting the area on the international stage.
- Such events and cultural facilities also highlight the importance of cultural tourism to the national economy and evaluation of international visitor attractions (such as the Guggenheim Museum) and international events (eg Winter Olympics in the US) have demonstrated the economic and cultural impact on the local community and the host nation.

**Sport**

- Economic evaluations of sporting events have demonstrated an economic impact on the local area by way of additional expenditure, the generation of additional employment, and the potential for long term economic gains, particularly when a major sporting event has been the catalyst for regeneration of an area.
- This can also result in the promotion of a city or area on the global stage, and attract visitors to a particular area they may never have visited in the past.
- Negative as well as beneficial social costs can also impact on the local community, such as noise pollution, overcrowding in the city, unused facilities, increase in council tax and increased crime rates during the event.

**Gaps in research evidence and information**

- *Data collection*: research on participation (and therefore non-participation), and views and attitudes to culture and sport requires to be carried out on a large-scale, consistent basis, so that information can be disaggregated at least to local authority level.
- *Longitudinal studies*: very few longitudinal studies are available to inform the assessment of the social and economic impact of cultural and sport initiatives, programmes and major events over the medium to long term. There is a need to measure beyond immediate impact.
- *Under-represented groups*: more research needs to be carried out, particularly at a national level on attitudes held and behavioural reasons behind non-participation by some particular groups in cultural and physical activities and guidance for the cultural and sport agencies on how to promote inclusion can be drawn from examples of good practice.
• **Well-being and Quality of Life:** a) there needs to be more research done on the definition, analysis and measurement of the concepts of ‘well-being’ and ‘quality of life’, as often they are cited as the outcomes of participation in arts, culture and sport activities; and b) on the measurement of the relative contribution of arts, culture and sport

• **Physical activity:** there has been little large-scale research on programmes promoting children’s physical activity, or that has focused on socially excluded children; there has been little evaluation of physical activity interventions that have built on young people’s ideas

• **Arts and Prisons:** there appears to have been little evaluation of arts projects and programmes in UK prisons/rehabilitation centres over recent years, and how they may contribute to a reduction in re-offending, learning life skills such as literacy, and increased employability; longitudinal research should be carried out in this area

• **Arts and Health:** there is a need for a more formal outcome evaluation of the role of arts in health, with many projects being too small-scale for rigorous analysis; there is also a need, where appropriate, for the social and economic impact of the benefits of arts interventions in healthcare to be assessed, with financial savings to the National Health Service demonstrated by economically evaluating the beneficial impact to patients’ health

• **Creativity in Education:** With recent developments in this field, longitudinal research requires to be carried out on the role of creativity in education, at both primary and secondary school level, and how it contributes to problem-solving skills, and cognitive and social development in school and beyond

• **Employment:** there has been little research or evaluation of projects or programmes designed to increase participation in the arts, culture or sport, and how these impact on future employment; research has demonstrated that participation in arts activities at school can develop transferable skills for the workplace, but there is little evidence on the actual employment effect

• **Art as itself:** there is a need for research on the social impact of art itself. Research on the intrinsic nature of art and its capacity to provide meaning to different individuals and different cultures would assist art providers to better understand what art means to target audiences and perhaps encourage more participation/attendance

• **Monitoring and Evaluation:** Various evaluation toolkits are made available by certain organisations to assist those funded to evaluate individual projects; however, there is a clear gap in the availability of a consistent, common evaluation framework which can be used by all sectors to evaluate programmes and initiatives. There is therefore a need for the developing of one (or more) of the existing evaluation toolkits, using the evaluation guidelines in the government’s ‘Magenta Book’[^1] as a starting point, and

also taking account of HM Treasury’s ‘Green Book’ for economic evaluation of programmes and events and relevant initiatives

- **The Bigger Picture:** organisations and agencies involved in cultural and sport research should be encouraged to capitalise on the potential of the research to gather robust information on *wider, related* aspects of their service, rather than focusing too narrowly on *specific* aspects of that service. This would then ensure that findings related to wider policy issues and would produce data that would not only be helpful to the organisation and other bodies, but be more influential in policy development in the longer term

- **Combined Social/Economic Impact Evaluation:** It would be useful to government policy teams and to the organisations involved in the delivery and the commissioning of project or programme evaluation, if a) an economic appraisal took place prior to the start up of the programme; b) evaluation of the social outcomes and impact of the programme was carried out; and c) an economic evaluation such as a cost effectiveness or ideally cost benefits analysis was carried out to measure the *economic* benefits of the *social* outcomes

- **Major Events:** Conventional economic impact methodologies evaluating major events tend not to take into account the *social* impacts such as enhanced quality of life, sense of place, improved image of the host area and thus its ability to attract investment and employment as a result; they also often do not highlight the *negative* costs. A method that evaluates both the economic and social benefits and disbenefits should be found, examining the negative as well as the positive effects on the community

- **Dissemination of information:** sponsored NDPBs and agencies in Scotland perceive a need for a ‘central’ point of information such as a website or publication, which would provide information on the level of attendance/participation in sport, arts and cultural activities, and the frequency and intensity of use of facilities across the different cultural and sport sectors

- **Partnership Working:** the Review cites examples of successful projects where partnership working has taken place, and there are many examples of good practice for future use. There is much scope for more partnership working to take place between delivery organisations on research and evaluation of initiatives, and sharing findings. All organisations interviewed for this Review were of the view that there was scope for more co-operative working and collaboration, which would be beneficial from a policy and cost point of view

This Review has found that there does exist a wide body of evidence on the impact of culture, the arts and sport on individuals and communities, but that there are various gaps in research which, if filled, would contribute significantly to a robust evidence base for these policy areas. The Scottish Executive is currently considering the way ahead in light of the Review’s findings, and the wider research community may also be interested to note the gaps in research and the potential for future collaboration in addressing these evidence requirements.
INTRODUCTION

1 The recent Partnership Agreement for a Better Scotland (PABS, May 2003)) has made several high level commitments to promote cultural life, including sport, as “inclusive and accessible”, where participation brings real benefits to communities and individuals. PABS also commits to maximising the contribution that sport, culture and the arts can play in promoting Scotland and in attracting international events.

2 However, at present there is no strategic overview of the evidence base that indicates that sport, culture and the arts do indeed bring real economic and/or social benefits to society. This Review will therefore draw together recent research evidence that provides firm, robust evidence on the links between participation in culture and sport and the social and economic impact on communities and individuals. This is particularly important in light of further investment to be made in these areas, ensuring that good value for money is obtained in supporting the government’s key objectives. The Review is a first step in developing a longer term research framework to inform policy development, implementation and evaluation in the areas of culture and sport. By providing a coherent social research evidence base, it will highlight gaps in research and will underpin future collaborative efforts between the various cultural and sport agencies to provide robust evidence on which to base cultural and sport policy.

BACKGROUND

3 In the Partnership Agreement for Scotland 2000 (PABS), the government committed to developing a National Cultural Strategy, recognising that arts and culture play a central role in enhancing the quality of people’s lives and contributing to a civic pride in Scotland. Since publication of the Strategy, culture and sport have received substantial increases in funding, including national and non-national museums in Scotland, the promotion of excellence in traditional arts, major investment to enable one year’s free music tuition for every school pupil by Primary 6, and the attraction of major events in Scotland.

4 The overarching aim of the National Cultural Strategy2 is “to place culture at the heart” of government policy and to widen opportunities, promote education, and develop and celebrate excellence. The Strategy aims to “ensure that all can contribute to, enjoy and benefit from Scotland’s culture” and acknowledges that “participation in cultural activities can improve the quality of life of individuals and communities, promote social inclusion, raise self-esteem and confidence, and widen horizons”. Strategic objectives of the Strategy are to:

- Promote creativity, the arts and other cultural activity
- Celebrate Scotland’s cultural heritage in its full diversity
- Realise culture’s potential contribution to education, promote inclusion and enhance people’s quality of life, and
- Assure an effective national support framework for culture.

5 The government also recognises how community art and culture can bring about social inclusion and regeneration and that arts and culture are able to provide a ‘sense of

---

2 “Creating our future…minding our past”, National Cultural Strategy, 2000, Scottish Executive
place’ and pride in the community. In recognition of this, one of the National Cultural Strategy’s priorities seeks to “maximise the social benefits of culture” by promoting “community-based cultural and sporting activities in the context of Social Inclusion Partnerships, to include a wide range of activities”.

6 Similar aims apply to participation in sport – The National Strategy for Sport³ has as one of its main targets, that 49% of those aged 14 years and over in SIP areas will be taking part in sport activity at least once a week by 2007. Cultural services, including sport, have the potential to develop both personal social capital, increasing confidence and self-esteem and increasing employability, and social capital in the community, strengthening networks and creating a sense of local identity and pride amongst community members and community regeneration.

7 The link between participation in sport and health benefits has long afforded recognition, but the links between the arts, culture and health are still to be fully recognised. At the Arts as Medicine conference in 2001 it was stated that although “benefits of cultural projects in health and community are difficult to measure …they are manifestly apparent to those professionals and volunteers who work closest to the process” and that “health is not just about living longer – it’s about well being and quality of life”. Speakers at the conference provided various examples of initiatives where art had benefited the well-being of the patients, and research providing evidence on these findings is presented later in this Review. However, it was acknowledged that we may perhaps “lack a history of rigorous evaluation of things we think are beneficial (unlike USA)”.

8 This Review will therefore draw together recent key findings on the social and economic impact of culture and sport, including various major events that have taken place, both in Scotland and elsewhere. It also covers information set out in policy documents relevant to the PABS priorities, and in corporate strategies and action plans of the different agencies, plus conference proceedings on relevant topics. In the timeframe available, it will not be possible to cover every research project or evaluation that has been carried out in these fields – there is a wealth of research available. However, the Review will focus on the main or most relevant research and evaluations that have been carried out in recent years, that relate to the National Cultural and Sport Strategies to increase participation of socially excluded groups, youth, ethnic minorities and disabled people, and that improve health, personal development, educational attainment and well-being.

Structure of the Report

9 An Executive Summary is provided at the beginning of this Review, highlighting the main findings on the social and economic impact of culture, the arts and sport and highlighting gaps in research in these areas. The Introduction and Background to the policy needs for the Review follows. The main body of the Review is divided into three sections – Section 1 on Culture and the Arts, Section 2 on Sport and Physical Activity and Section 3 on Conclusions.

³ Sport 21 2003-2007, the National Strategy for Sport, Sportscotland, 2003
⁴ Realising the Potential of Cultural Services, Fred Coalter, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh 2000
Within Section 1 on Culture and the Arts, the literature is divided into sub-sections of the social and the economic impact of the arts. The social impact subsection on Culture and the Arts is further themed by Chapters 1 to 8 covering the following categories – Social Impact of Culture and the Arts; Social Inclusion; Ethnic Minorities; Reduction of Youth Crime, Disability; Regeneration/Community Impact; Arts and Health; and Arts and Education. The Economic Impact of Culture and the Arts sub-section is reviewed in Chapter 9, and Chapter 10 covers Cultural Tourism and Major Cultural Events.

The social impact subsection of Sport and Physical Activity is themed by Chapters 11-14 covering Sport and Social Inclusion; Ethnic Minorities; Disability; and Sport, Physical Activity and Health. The economic impact of Major Sporting Events is reviewed in Chapter 15.

Each ‘theme’ is summarised at the beginning of that chapter, highlighting the main findings from the literature in that particular research area. Within each chapter main findings and the nature of the research are bulleted or highlighted to make these more accessible to the reader.

Section 3 concludes the Review with Chapter 16, making general Conclusions about the findings, and highlighting Gaps in Research and Information.
SECTION 1

CULTURE AND THE ARTS
CHAPTER 1

SOCIAL IMPACT OF CULTURE AND THE ARTS

Definition of culture and the arts

1.1 Culture and arts cover a wide area of activities, events, projects etc, but fall mainly into the following categories:

- Museums, Galleries, Libraries, Theatre, Literature, Music, Dance, Festivals, Crafts, Exhibitions, Film/Video, Art Classes (ie in schools), Design (ie in hospitals) and Leisure activities (ie reading, playing a musical instrument, going to cinema etc).

1.2 The following sections present and draw on various research and evaluation projects that have covered one or more of these areas and have been able to demonstrate the type of under-represented groups in culture and the arts, the impact of participation on socially excluded groups such as those in low socio-economic groups, ethnic minorities, young people ‘at risk’, disabled people, older people, those living in deprived areas, those with ill-health, and rural dwellers. The Culture and Arts section will also cover ‘arts in education’, impact on employment and the area of audience development.

Definition of Social impact

1.3 Inevitably, the social impact of an intervention, programme or project is difficult to definitively define. Social impact can cover many different aspects of life, whether the impact is personal (eg increased confidence, self-esteem, enhanced skills), ‘structural’ (eg better housing conditions in a regenerated area, more pleasant area lived in) or a combination of both, where, due to participation in a particular cultural or arts activity, a more confident sense of self is developed, leading to increased social networking, employment or a better job, more activity in the community leading to the creation of a better place to live, improved health and well-being leading to a better quality of life, civic pride etc. Social impact is not only difficult to define, it is also difficult to measure in a ‘hard’, robust way, and although quantitative methods are necessary to measure the extent of social impact across a particular population, ‘softer’ qualitative research methods are required to explore the type and depth of social impact on individuals and communities. For the purpose of this Literature Review, social impact will be defined as any impact on individuals or communities that manifests itself in the areas of:

- **Personal development** – increasing individuals’ or communities’ confidence and sense of self-worth; providing a sense of empowerment; creating a sense of control over one’s own life and self-determination; improving self-image and creating increased understanding of diversity

- **Social Cohesion** – increased friendship, increased contact with other cultures, enlarged social network, sense of ‘belonging’ to a particular group/club/network/community
• **Community Image/Regeneration**: sense of pride in community, more involved in the community (eg volunteering, helping organise local events etc), working in partnership with other organisations for the community, people feeling more positive about where they live, feeling safer where they live, pride in own culture or ethnicity

• **Health and Well-being** – improved physical and/or mental health, stress reduction, pain reduction, reduction in morbidity, increased physical and mental activity, positive response to therapies, sense of well-being and positive outlook, improved quality of life

• **Education and Learning** – development of transferable skills to the workplace, building arts/sports skills for employment in these areas, enhanced employability (eg increased creativity), increased enjoyment of arts/sports activities, stimulated life-long interest in culture, the arts and sport, increased volunteering network.

---

**Social Impact of Culture and the Arts**

Matarasso’s seminal report *Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of participation in Arts Programmes 1997*, identified 50 social impacts of participative arts programmes and concluded that participation in the arts can benefit individuals and communities such as–

- Increasing individual and community confidence
- Creating transferable skills
- Building confidence in minority groups
- Promoting contact, social networking and contributing to social cohesion

**Participation and Under-represented Groups in Culture and the Arts**

Quantitative research projects, using robust methods, provide an overview of the extent and nature of participation in cultural and activities in Scotland and the UK. Findings indicate that those who tend to be under-represented are:

- Those in low socio-economic groups
- Young males post-education
- Young people with low educational attainment
- Ethnic minority groups
- Disabled and mobility impaired people (particularly those living in rural areas)

School children, teenagers, ethnic minority groups and disabled people are particularly under-represented in people visiting heritage organisations

Findings also suggest that social and family background and significant others influence participation in cultural activities and the arts

**Audience Development in the Arts**

Research into audience development has been carried out on a variety of cultural and art activities, and has mainly been quantitative (combined with qualitative) in nature and provides robust findings on the type of audience that attends and the potential audience that does not attend
Dance
Audiences want to see dance at a local venue; the majority of attendees are general arts attenders; cost of the ticket is the least important barrier; and companies do not have effective and informative advertising about dance events

Some venues lack understanding of box office computer systems; have poor data collection systems and events are based on an inaccurate picture of audiences

Research Guidance Notes have been produced for venues based on the above findings

Theatre
Partnership working and engaging with the local community can increase audience attendance at the theatre

Psychological barriers are foremost in deterring young people from attending cultural venues (e.g., theatre) and innovative methods of marketing are required to increase attendance by this group

Galleries
Evening openings of art galleries in London uncovered a ‘lost segment’ of people who cannot find time for such visits during the day; can stimulate perception of art galleries as a social destination; and there is potential to augment the gallery experience with special events, music, cafés, etc; Sunday openings and social events in galleries in Scotland would encourage more attenders and a high proportion of people would like evening openings

Gallery provision (e.g., the number of galleries in a town/city) does not necessarily equate to high attendance

The majority of attenders at galleries are high income groups, and local papers are the main source of information on gallery events

Galleries need to devote more time and resources to making existing programmes more user-friendly and psychologically and intellectually accessible, and should provide more and easily accessible information to raise awareness

Specifically targeting a particular group and organising an event with educational content can create future interest in and attendance at art exhibitions

The current market for galleries in Scotland is 1,020,000, comprising 57% of the potential market

Heritage
Barriers to attendance include user perceptions (e.g., irrelevance), lack of specific facilities, lack of information and awareness, poor physical access to and at the resource, limited intellectual access, cost of entry and management ethos

Culture, Arts and Leisure
Qualitative research exploring the barriers to participation for different social groups has found that main constraints fall into the categories of time considerations (including opening hours); cost implications; geographical issues; lack of, or inaccessible public transport; lack of awareness; and perceptions of ‘eligibility’

There is a perception amongst certain groups (e.g., LGBT, disabled people, elderly people) that their ‘culture’ and needs are not catered for by cultural and leisure facilities
1.4 The following section discusses a recent review of research on the impact of culture and the arts and refers to the important 1997 seminal study by Matarasso\(^5\), which, using rigorous research methods, identified a variety of social impacts on individuals and communities through participation in arts programmes. This section will then be followed by reference to various reviews and individual projects on aspects relevant to the social impact of culture and the arts - the level of participation by particular groups in society, and research on audience development and how to increase participation.

1.5 Reeves’ 2002 report\(^6\) on measuring the economic and social impact of the arts reviewed and assessed the comprehensiveness and quality of the existing evidence base. The review identified key research needs to help improve the robustness of research methods and evidence that can demonstrate the contribution of arts and culture to the social and economic objectives of central and local government. Reeves’ review assessed the quality and appropriateness of research designs used in measuring the impact of the arts, and how methodologies can be improved and ‘streamlined’ to demonstrate more effectively the arts’ impact in various social policy areas.

1.6 Reeves’ report covered studies that had evaluated the social benefits and effects of arts interventions on different target groups, and in the areas of regeneration, education, health and criminal justice. The report cites how Matarasso’s seminal report resulted from the ‘sea-change’ in British urban regeneration policy, where interest shifted to the potential benefits of arts and culture in communities. Matarasso compiled 50 social impacts identified through his study of participative arts programmes, and these are annexed at the end of this Review. His study was the first large-scale attempt in the UK to gather evidence of the social benefits and impacts of participation in the arts. Matarasso used a multiple-method approach on case studies across the UK, describing the characteristics and outcomes of a set of cases or projects and systematically collecting and analysing information about key variables such as behaviour, attitudes beliefs etc. He evaluated some 60 projects closely, with 30 others involved more peripherally. His study included rural, small town, suburban, city and metropolitan situations, involving amateur work, education and outreach work, community arts and more. Around 600 people were interviewed and took part in discussion groups, and 513 participants’ questionnaires were completed, with a further 500 other types of questionnaire completed in the various case studies.

- Matarasso concluded that participation in the arts does bring benefits to individuals and communities, with individual benefits such as an increase in confidence, creative and transferable skills and human growth translating into wider social impact, building the confidence of minority groups, promoting contact and contributing to social cohesion.
- He also considered that many of the social impacts of participatory arts work can be identified and demonstrated, and that it “cannot be argued that the arts, and the benefits they return for the public money invested in them, are beyond evaluation other than in aesthetic terms”.

\(^5\) Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in Arts Programmes, F Matarasso, Comedia, 1997
\(^6\) Measuring the economic and social impact of the arts: a review, Michelle Reeves, 2002
1.7 Since this study, there has been a proliferation of research on the social impact of culture and the arts, particularly in the last two or three years. However, much of it appears to be either small-scale or lacking rigorous analysis and evaluation, and this Review will attempt to draw together the most robust and vigorous research that demonstrates a link between participation in culture and social impacts on the individual or communities.

1.8 Reeves’ report cites many recent ‘strands of activity’ in research, data collection, publications etc to promote good practice and demonstrate the impact of the arts on community development. It indicates that together, “all of these strands of activity represent a concerted attempt to streamline the bewildering array of performance indicators currently in use to assess the value and quality of cultural services and activities”, and to “establish coherent qualitative and quantitative benchmarks which can capture the range and depth of the impacts which arts organisations and cultural activities can bring”. There is therefore, much going on in the study of social impact by way of participation in cultural activities, but as yet, there has been no large-scale ‘streamlining’ of activity and common methodological framework used by different researchers and evaluators in the field.

### Participation and under-represented groups in culture and the arts

1.9 Participation in cultural and arts activities is usually measured by large-scale representative surveys of the general population. The following research studies have measured the extent of participation in culture and the arts, providing empirical data and have identified, where possible, those groups that are under-represented.

1.10 A 2002 quantitative research report on participation in and attitudes towards the arts in Scotland, demonstrated that the vast majority of the population – over 2000 people were interviewed in a representative sample of Scotland – were positive about the contribution that culture and the arts can make to society.

- nine out of ten people agreed that arts and cultural activities give a lot of pleasure, the success of Scottish artists, performers and writers give people a sense of pride, that artists, performers and writers are important people who contribute to society, and the arts and cultural activities help bring communities together and help enrich the quality of people’s lives.
- 85% of respondents indicated attending cultural activity of some form (a decrease from 89% in 1998) and the most frequently attended activities were cinema, museums, pantomimes/variety shows and visiting art galleries.
- overall levels of participation in some cultural activity also decreased from 85% in 1998 to 78% in 2001/02.
- however, whilst overall 45% of those interviewed stated they were interested in arts and cultural events, 46% indicated they were ‘not very’ or ‘not at all’ interested. This group (almost half of those interviewed) were most likely to reside in Lanarkshire or Ayrshire, and belonged to the socio-economic group C2 and DE. Clearly, those who were the poorest in society had least interest in art and cultural activities.

---

7 ‘Attendance at, participation in and attitudes towards the arts in Scotland 2001/02’, NFO System Three, 2002
1.11 However, although the research provided robust data on levels of attendance and participation in cultural events, it did not explore the barriers to participation of lower socio-economic groups, reasons why they did not participate or were disinterested in the arts or cultural events, and what would encourage them to participate in the future.

1.12 A very recent study (2003)\textsuperscript{8} aiming to develop a central body of data on young people on various aspects of their lives, carried out an omnibus survey of 62 schools in Scotland and 1543 pupils aged 11-16yrs completed questionnaires; a total of 2,124 interviews were achieved with this age group; furthermore a representative quota sample of 972 young people aged 17-25 years were surveyed (and interviewed) across 85 enumeration districts in Scotland.

- the research found that over half (55%) of 17-25 year olds agreed with the statement that ‘Scotland is a creative culture, with lots of fresh ideas’, and that their topics of conversation ranged from personal issues, to social and cultural issues eg television programmes, future employment, sport, cost of living, clothing and fashion, and their and their family’s health.
- the most popular activities that this age group typically take part in on a weekly basis include watching TV (81%), listening to music (77%), going to a pub/bar (65%), going to a nightclub (54%) and listening to the radio (51%).
- in comparison, 11-16 year olds most liked to listen to music (81%), go to friends’ houses (79%), watch TV or videos (77%), text friends (67%) and talk on the phone (66%). Just over half liked to ‘hang about the street’ and pupils living in deprived areas were more likely than other groups to report this.
- when 17-25 year olds were asked what they would like to do more of in their free time, 26% mentioned going to the gym, 15% to live music events, 11% to do volunteering, and 9% to go to a leisure centre.
- amongst 11-16 years olds the responses included going to the cinema (31%), volunteering (28%), go clubbing (25%), take part in sports (23%) and take music/dance/swimming lessons (17%).

1.13 MORI’s survey of UK museums and galleries in 2001\textsuperscript{9} attempted to go beyond the issue of how many people visit museums and explored issues such as who these people are and what they get out of their visit. Over 5,000 adults and 2,500 schoolchildren were questioned.

- the survey found that people in higher social classes are more likely to visit, with social classes A, B and C1 accounting for 70% of museum and gallery visitors, but only 49% of the UK population.
- it also established that Black and Asian visitors tend to visit less frequently than white visitors.
- the survey examined reasons why people do not visit museums and galleries, which included: nothing they wanted to see, museums are boring, difficult to get out/health reasons, admission charges too high, poor transport/too far to travel, and inconvenient opening hours.

\textsuperscript{8} YouthLink Scotland State of The National Survey: Schools Omnibus and Young People Survey, MORI, 2003
\textsuperscript{9} Visitors to museums and galleries in the UK, MORI, 2001
A survey in England carried out in 1993\(^9\) (although some 10 years old now, but included in this Review as a good example of empirical data on participation in the arts) was carried out to provide empirical evidence which could inform future planning and policy-making relating to young people’s engagement with the arts. The overall aim was to provide a national picture of young people’s participation in the arts, both within and outside formal education. Data for the study were collected through an interviewing programme involving young people between the ages of 14 and 24 in five regions of England. The random quota sample, involving face-to-face interviews with 700 young people, covered the five key independent variables of gender, age, urban/rural, residency, ethnicity and current status (eg at school, college, full-time employment or unemployment). Also interviewers were instructed to aim for a 55:45 ratio of respondents from middle class and working class backgrounds, and to include young people with physical disabilities in their sub-samples. Findings included:

- of the five broad leisure categories (social; sport; media-arts audience; arts participation and miscellaneous), only about a quarter of the sample participated in at least one art form, thus 77% did not mention participation in any form of artistic leisure activity.
- participation was most frequently mentioned in connection with music and the visual arts. Over half of the young people however, participated in at least one sport in their leisure time.
- findings on leisure activity in rural and urban locations found that proximity and accessibility of factors were not overriding factors in explaining arts participation. Generally, the greater availability of amenities did not attract a higher share of young people in urban areas.
- however, rural young people had sport as most popular leisure activity, whilst those from urban locations mentioned ‘media-arts: audience’ activities most.
- analysis by gender confirmed conventional understanding, with 27% of females mentioning at least one ‘arts:participation’ activity and only 19% of males doing so. ‘Media-arts:audience’ was the leading leisure category for females whilst ‘sport’ was the highest ranking leisure activity for males.
- the research found social class differences in the participation in leisure activities – participation in the arts was less than one in four (23%) for the total sample, but 1 in 3 (34%) for young people in Social Class I and II (eg, musical instrument playing varied from 15% in Social Class I and II to 1% in Social Class IV and V).
- similarly, respondents from professional backgrounds were more likely to refer to ‘media-arts:audience’ activities such as reading, cinema, listening to music and going to the theatre than their lower social class counterparts.
- analysis by ethnicity showed that white Europeans had a greater involvement in ‘arts:participation’ than ethnic minorities (24% and 13% respectively). However, ethnic minorities showed more involvement with ‘media-arts:audience’ activities, especially those from Asian communities.
- when examined by age, the rate of arts participation was particularly low for 17-20 year olds.
- analysis of leisure activity by current status showed that young people in post-16 full-time education ranked highest in arts participation (34%), followed by students in

---

\(^9\) Arts in their View: a study of youth participation in the arts, J Harland et al, National Foundation for Educational Research, 1995
schools (29%). The lowest ranking was from trainees, who recorded only 13% in arts involvement.

- analysis by educational attainment showed that painting/drawing and playing a musical instrument as leisure arts activities ranked highly with interviewees who had 4 or more GCSEs.
- overall, the findings suggest that females and young people of higher social class and high educational attainment are more likely to be arts participants.
- when asked about any influencing factors on their arts participation and appreciation, one-third of the total sample felt they could not nominate any direct positive influence.
- amongst the other two-thirds, most frequently mentioned influences were ‘significant others’ eg family (especially mothers), secondary arts teachers and friends.
- drama participation and theatre consumption ranked highest as significant ‘arts-event’ experiences in ‘turning on’ young people to the arts.

1.15 The authors concluded that the results suggested that “unless young people are fortunate enough to inherit ‘cultural capital’ and/or experience the supportive and broadening influence of further and higher education, avenues through which young people can be encouraged to engage with the arts outside of formal education in a sustained way are somewhat inadequate”. The report also concludes that for those young people who do show arts commitment, there is ample evidence to suggest that there are very positive outcomes from such involvement, and that “personal and social development opportunities are acknowledged: arts can be recognised as a powerful civilising aspect in their culture, adding quality to their daily lives”.

### Audience Development in Culture and the Arts

1.16 A closely related aspect to participation in culture and the arts, is audience development. The following section will give an account of several pieces of research that have been carried out recently on audience development, and how to increase participation by the public in general, or by different types of group. As indicated earlier, a **scoping study is currently being undertaken for the Scottish Arts Council which will inform the design of a national research project into audiences for the arts in Scotland**, and feed into an assessment of future funding priorities. The aims of the study are to establish what information on arts audiences currently exists, how it is collected and by whom, and to identify any gaps in this information.

**Dance**

1.17 Previous research in 2002 for the Scottish Arts Council into audience development includes a recent piece of research (2002)\(^\text{11}\) which established the **profile of attenders at dance events in Scotland** and made various recommendations on how to increase such audiences. The research involved the data analysis of information about ticket buyers at 511 professional dance performances across 9 venues in Scotland, representing around 70% of all dance performances in Scotland between autumn 1998 and winter 2001, and covering details of almost 44,000 ticket buyers. Qualitative research was then conducted, with 6 focus groups.

\(^{11}\) ‘Profile of Dance Attenders in Scotland’, Heather Maitland and Tim Baker, 2002
in 3 cities selected to provide a cross section of Scottish audience types as a whole, consisting of 3 groups of 12 people who were categorised as attenders of dance events, and 3 groups who were non-attenders of dance but attenders of other arts performances at the same venue. The study also included an overview of research into UK audiences for dance events in the past 10 years.

• the research found that there were fewer dance events being programmed across Scotland between 1999 and 2001, and that only 0.7% of all ticket buyers bought dance tickets in more than one city, indicating that people wanted to see dance at a local venue.
• most ticket buyers lived locally (two-thirds), and the focus groups revealed that attenders tended to fall into two types of group – ‘enthusiasts’ who are confident in their knowledge of dance and seek new type of dance events, and ‘incidentals’ who might attend a dance event if it looks sufficiently interesting.
• non-attenders of dance events were classified as ‘hesitants’ – those who were cautious about attending events and only did so very occasionally, and a similar group who had not been sufficiently interested yet to attend any dance events.
• age was not a factor between the groups, and 9 out of 10 ticket buyers were general arts attenders at a range of events at the venue.
• the research also found that a single demographic profile of dance audiences across Scotland does not help to identify potential dance audiences as age, socio-economic status and ethnicity simply reflected the characteristics of audiences at each venue.

1.18 The study concluded that most venues are good at developing new ticket buyers for dance in any one year, but that they don’t retain the same ticket buyers year on year. The Edinburgh International Festival was found to be particularly significant in encouraging people to see events that they perceived as ‘risky’ in both dance and theatre. The qualitative research explored the barriers to people attending dance events, and found that in general these were seen as lack of time, lack of opportunity, and afraid that expectations about quality would not be met; the price of the ticket was the least important factor. Interestingly, what stopped people attending dance events for the first time, was a feeling of ‘lack of knowledge’ about dance and a fear of being seen as stupid or ignorant. Ticket buyers’ views on the advertising by venues were that it was difficult to choose a particular event as they ‘all sounded the same’, and that companies did not have effective ‘brands’ as the name of a particular company or dance group was difficult to recall after having been seen.

1.19 The research found that in a small number of venues there was a lack of understanding of the box office computer systems, there was a poor data collection system and programmes and events were based on a ‘highly inaccurate’ picture of audiences. The researchers concluded that the culture within the organisation was important, and that if data were regularly used to make decisions, the data capture tended to be high and the information accurate; amongst recommendations made, they considered that there was a need to improve the standard of data collection through understanding the value of data, using it to the benefit of the organisation, putting it into practice and ensuring that staff had the skills to collect the data.

1.20 The evidence found in this research resulted in the production of Research Guidance Notes for venues - ‘Twelve Top Tips for Bigger Audiences for your Dance Company available at www.scottisharts.org.uk/nonhtdocs/TwelveTopTips.pdf.
1.21 However, this research did not focus on how to include under-represented groups at dance events, and involved interviews with people who regularly attended cultural events of some kind. The output of the research mainly focused on how venues and providers of dance events could increase their audience, but not how to include those who seldom or never attend or participate in cultural events.

**Galleries**

1.22 A 2002 research study\textsuperscript{12} looked at the impact of late opening of 9 galleries in London (part of the Love Art Later initiative), one of the aims of which was to attract a wider audience, as well as raising awareness that galleries are ‘sociable places’ to visit and to increase visitor numbers after the usual closing time of 6pm. The research was robust, using both quantitative and qualitative methods to achieve its aims. Quantitative methods comprised a mini survey data collection at each gallery event across the 9 venues, and a post-visit e-survey of attenders at these events. The mini survey provided a demographic profile of attenders and e-mail addresses for the follow up e-survey. The e-survey was weighted so that it was representative of all attenders and not just those with access to e-mail/internet. Total samples collected were 3,306 for the mini survey and 313 for the e-survey, providing a large quantity of information for analysis. Qualitative research consisted of four focus groups recruited from the initial data collection, that reflected the range of visitors to particular venues and the range of interests in visual art. ‘Vox pop’ interviews with visitors at each event were also carried out. A population survey in the north east of England enabled the researchers to quantify the different motivations people have for visiting galleries in general –

- almost half of visitors are motivated by the social side of a visit or to ‘do the tourist trip’.
- a further 20% attend galleries to educate children or other people with them; 16% attend as a way of learning or for self-development.
- 11% attend for specific aesthetic or intellectual stimulation.
- 9% attend in order to gain a form of spiritual sustenance, inspiration or escapism.

1.23 Existing data from the galleries on daytime visits enabled the researchers to compare with evening visitors. Key findings on evening visitors were that

- the majority lived and worked in Inner London, they originated from across the city and not from any one particular area, and the south west of London was the most frequently occurring postcode for residence and place of work, which may be due to the location of the galleries.
- the majority were in full-time employment, and 22% were in the arts/cultural industries and 21% in creative/communications/media employment.

1.24 The study found a clear distinction between the population and evening gallery attenders with regard to their motivation in visiting the galleries, with the majority of evening visitors going for self-improvement or aesthetic stimulation reasons. Evening visitors tended

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{12} ‘So Many Galleries, So Little Time: The Impact of evening Gallery Opening’, Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, 2002
\end{footnotesize}
to be well informed about art, and almost half visited a gallery once a month or more. Main reasons for attending evening openings were that it was the only time available, that it offered new social opportunities, and that evening times were preferred. This of course reflected the fact that 62% of people attending were in full-time employment.

1.25 The research considered whether the provision of evening openings opened a ‘new market’, and concluded that evening openings did “uncover a possibly lost market segment of people” who now cannot find the time for such visits due to the pressures of work and domestic commitments. The research also concluded that opening in the evening can stimulate the perception amongst visitors that an art gallery is a social destination, and there is potential to augment the gallery experience with special events, music, cafes, restaurants etc. The research made various recommendations on market penetration and product development, on the basis that the study had shown there was ’strong justification’ for galleries collectively to promote evening openings.

1.26 Research published in 2003 for the Scottish Arts Council\textsuperscript{13} was commissioned to assist core funded visual arts galleries evaluate their current audience development and marketing programmes. The interim findings reflect information gathered from a representative sample of the Scottish population across seven regions to identify and quantify current and potential attenders, and qualitative research in the form of focus groups to provide further insights into motivations for and barriers to attendance.

- data gathered revealed that the current market for Scottish galleries is around 1,020,000. However, this is only 57% of the potential market, ie the people who say they would consider visiting art galleries.
- the population survey demonstrated that visiting galleries is a very popular cultural activity in Scotland. Almost half of the population would consider visiting an art gallery.
- the research also found that propensity for gallery attendance is spread fairly evenly across the country, whether rural or urban. However, actual visiting levels are lower than propensity, with 24% having attended an art gallery in the past 12 months and a further 17% in the past 5 years.
- gallery provision does not necessarily equate to high attendance in particular areas, eg Edinburgh has 6 core funded galleries, accounting for 33% of the provision nationwide, yet accounts for only 17% of current visual arts visitors in Scotland.
- the motivation driving the highest percentage of potential attenders was ‘self improvement’ (27% - higher than the London galleries research above), confirming the finding by the research that the majority of potential attenders would visit exhibitions by lesser known or new artists to improve their knowledge.

1.27 The research study found that the majority of gallery attenders are in higher income groups, with some variance across regions, eg in the Highlands and Islands and the Borders areas, the C2 socio-economic group make up 25% and 28% respectively, compared with 11% for Glasgow and Edinburgh respectively. The group most likely to visit art galleries were people between the ages of 25 and 44 (including young adults and families) (43%), followed by independent adults aged 45+(41%). Almost half of those surveyed said that local papers

\textsuperscript{13} ‘Audiences at Scottish Arts Council Core Funded Visual Arts Organisations – current profile and barriers to attendance, SAC, Interim Report September 2003
were their main way of finding out about arts events, followed by word of mouth, with other sources such as television, radio, internet etc being much less significant.

1.28 The research indicates that barriers to attendance tend to be specific to certain groups of people. For example for economically excluded people, price is a barrier for paid ticketed exhibitions. For geographically excluded people, the cost, time and availability of transport can be a difficulty. There are also social and psychological barriers such as the gallery’s attitude to diversity, whether its publicity effectively reaches new audiences, whether collections and events reflect the interests and life experiences of target audiences, and whether new technology is used to enable/encourage access. When asked about what would encourage new attenders, more than half of potential visitors said that Sunday openings and social events in galleries would make them more likely to visit. Almost half of the potential audience were employed full time, and again, like the London galleries research above, people would have more opportunity to attend outside working hours. There were high percentages indicating they would like evening opening of galleries, ranging from 37% in Grampian to 57% in Glasgow.

1.29 The research concludes that the visual arts are ‘almost’ a majority interest in Scotland and galleries should take the necessary steps to convert the potential audience into actual attenders, that galleries need to know that their visitors come from different backgrounds and are interested in lifelong learning and self improvement. Because the profiles of current audiences are very similar across all SAC-funded visual arts organisations, the study advocates collaboration between the organisations which would result in significant benefits, by encouraging current attenders of contemporary visual arts to try other similar venues. However, the galleries will also have to target non-specialist audiences, and find ways to overcome the intellectual and psychological barriers to attendance. The study recommends that galleries devote more time and resources to making their existing programmes and venues more user-friendly and more psychologically and intellectually accessible, which requires a shift in focus and a desire to be relevant to more people; and also to provide more, and more easily accessible, information for the many existing and potential gallery visitors.

1.30 A full report on the above research, including individual attendance reports for core funded organisations and additional research, will be available in September 2004.

1.31 The National Gallery of Scotland’s Education Department aims to “identify the needs of new and existing audiences and reduce cultural exclusion at the NGS caused by disability, location, age, gender, or economic, cultural or educational factors”. NGS in partnership with sponsors and arts partners, devised a programme for the 2001 Festival exhibition ‘Rembrandt’s Women’, with the clear objective to provide access to the exhibition for women who might otherwise have been excluded for reasons of time, cost or geography. A programme was set to include visits for groups of 8 women each day, including lunch and afternoon discussion, and clear business and arts objectives were set out and the budget included an element for project evaluation. The target group was women in low pay, low skill jobs who might be excluded from attending the exhibition because of lack of time, money and childcare responsibilities. An evaluation of the project14 included evaluating the process of setting up the educational programme, and the impact it had on participants. A total of 31 women completed evaluation forms and the views of the project staff were gathered.

---

14 NGS Rembrandt’s Women for women at work: Evaluation Report, Thursa Sanderson, 2002
• success ratings for each visit were very high, with the visit exceeding the women’s expectations substantially and encouraging an interest in future visits to the gallery and participation in workshops or educational activities.

1.32 Four months later, a sample group of 19 women were contacted for further feedback. Despite the lapse of four months, the participants still showed a very strong feeling of enthusiasm. When asked if they had been affected in any long-term way, the most marked change was that

• the group demonstrated an enhanced awareness of the visual arts, commenting that they were now more likely to take notice of newspaper or magazine articles or tv programmes about art.
• some also felt the experience had fundamentally changed their attitude to art, having felt previously that it was something in which they were not interested, and now it was something they could explore for themselves.
• others who were ‘lapsed’ gallery attenders, had their interest rekindled by the experience.
• some participants indicated that the opportunity to have a day away from work to do something for themselves had had a positive effect on their attitude to their work.

1.33 The evaluation concluded that all business and arts objectives had been achieved, and lessons could be learned for the future on the process of setting up such a programme. Main outcomes of the evaluation included the fact that evaluation procedures had ensured that results of the project could be used to address issues to do with attitudes held by certain social groups to NGS and art in generally, and the difficulty art institutions have in attracting audiences from these groups, and the findings would be invaluable in developing future strategies for improvements in access for target groups.

Theatre

1.34 Research work (1999) carried out for the Arts Council England\(^\text{15}\) examined why young people’s attendance at cultural venues declines as they enter their teens. Despite very real tangible barriers of cost, travel and lack of time, the study found that psychological barriers were paramount. ‘New Audiences’ projects have backed up the findings from this research and confirm the need for arts venues to consider how to sustain and manage the ‘special welcome’ they extend to young people for a one-off project, how their programmes can reflect arts and art-forms that attract young people, and how they can foster creative dialogue between ‘high’ arts and popular culture. Further action research\(^\text{16}\) found that although discounts and value for money were incentives for young people buying tickets for arts events, more significant was the ‘psychological’ barrier of young people uncertain about what they would get for their money. Using innovative ways of marketing, such as new brochures, website and partnerships with local organisations, 21 productions achieved ticket sales of around 32,000 and increased the percentage of young people in the audience from 7% to 41% in Sheffield.

\(^{15}\) ‘Crossing the Line’, Arts Council England/Gulbenkian Foundation, John Harland and Kay Kinder, 1999

\(^{16}\) ‘How Much?’, University of Sheffield & Sheffield Hallam University, 2000
1.35 Research in 2001\textsuperscript{17} tracked a project by the West Yorkshire Playhouse (WYP) over a year long period, which set out to make itself much more accessible to its most local residential community. The research involved data collection before, during and after the project, and mainly comprised interviews with residents, community workers, locally based professionals in education and local regeneration, arts workers and theatre staff. Until July 1999, the number of contacts on the WYP database from a nearby estate was in single figures only. The ‘In Our Neighbourhood’ project set out to generate a productive and sustainable relationship between the neighbouring community and the WYP.

1.36 The research describes the pace of familiarisation between the two ‘partners’, where an initial high profile engagement failed to engage the community, but once a lower key ‘person to person’ style took over, considerable confidence and trust in a significant number of local residents was released. The research cites the conventional views that “only a culturally aware elite would want to attend theatre” and those who have not been brought up with or introduced to theatre believing “that they would not be welcome over the threshold”, and that these assumptions have kept a large number of people away from the experience of theatre. The theatre envisaged that more community-oriented activities would be the main focus of developments between the theatre and the community. However, the research found that any assumption held by residents that they would not be welcome in the theatre, and any assumption held by the theatre that the residents would want something other than mainstream theatre experiences, were not borne out.

1.37 During the time of the project, mainstream theatre attendance increased at a startling rate, and the research concludes that this was one of the most unexpected and successful outcomes, and indicates residents’ interest in attending the theatre that had not previously been acted upon. This piece of research indicates how the process of establishing a relationship with a potential audience can be carried out successfully and how audience participation can increase. However, this was qualitative research, mainly consisting of interviews with those involved, and cannot be regarded as ‘rigorous’ in its methodology. Nevertheless, the research can inform other bodies on how to encourage the local community to become theatre-goers.

**Heritage**

1.38 A 2001 research study for the Heritage Lottery Fund\textsuperscript{18} examined how small and medium-sized heritage organisations might better encourage people from under-represented groups to engage with their heritage and to participate in heritage-oriented activities. The consultants prepared an overview of current audience profile and patterns of participation for the UK’s heritage and identified the main under-represented groups common across the different heritage sectors. They then, through a literature review, identified key barriers faced by these groups to becoming more involved in heritage attendance. The study involved quantitative research, identifying under-represented groups from visitor surveys undertaken by specific establishments and national organisations (which therefore cannot be regarded as comprehensive and are used in an indicative way only); a literature review; a programme of consultations with leading industry professionals; workshops attended by

\textsuperscript{17} In our neighbourhood: a regional theatre and its local community, Dick Downing, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2001

\textsuperscript{18} Developing New Audiences for the Heritage, PLB Consulting Ltd, 2001
practitioners from the heritage sector; and a number of case studies of recent audience development initiatives.

1.39 One of the key findings of the policy review was that

- many heritage organisations are not aware of, or are not actively aiming to meet their statutory obligations as regards access.

1.40 The study sets out arguments for heritage organisations to engage in audience development and socially inclusive activities, but acknowledges that not every heritage organisation or site is suited to audience development, either because they are structurally unable to change the ‘product’ (eg fixed nature of the heritage site) or unable to afford time or resources for social inclusion work if they are a smaller organisation. However, those organisations unable to change should aim to implement best practice processes for consultation, collaboration and evaluation.

1.41 Under-represented visitor groups from this survey fell into various categories – pre-school children, teenagers, young adults, young professionals, families with small children, ethnic minorities, disabled people, people without cars, C2DE socio-economic groups, unemployed, low income households and people lacking basic skills.

- of these groups, school children, teenagers, ethnic minorities and disabled people were particularly identified as being under-represented as heritage visitors.

- the review of barriers to visiting included user perceptions (especially irrelevance), lack of specific facilities, lack of information and awareness, poor physical access to the resource, poor physical access at the resource, limited intellectual access, costs of entry/participation and management ethos.

- the report makes various recommendations for the Heritage Sector to overcome barriers to engagement, including awareness training of the organisation’s statutory obligations regarding access, equal opportunities and human rights, and to provide training for staff and volunteers that ensures under-represented audiences have a high quality experience whether they are visiting, volunteering or working at the site.

- it recommends that the heritage sector learns to know its existing audience and find out what users and potential users really want from the site, and to undertake regular consultation, research, and evaluation and monitoring of new initiatives.

- the report also recommends that the heritage sector develops collaborative research and initiatives to support audience development work and “achieve access, inclusion and diversity across the heritage sector in relevant, inspiring and sustainable ways”.

**Culture, Arts and Leisure facilities in general**

1.42 The Northern Ireland Office commissioned research into barriers to participation in culture, the arts and leisure, and the results were published in 2003. A series of 35 focus groups was carried out, covering a wide geographical spread and groups in relation to social disadvantage, ethnic minority, disabled and gay, lesbian and transgender people, along with interviews with key organisations involved in the delivery of culture and the arts. People were asked to define what culture, the arts and leisure meant to them, and responses varied widely. In general however these were activities seen as something people

---

19 Barriers to Participation in Culture, Arts and Leisure, Independent Research Solutions, 2003
did in their spare time and in which they were interested, providing a form of relaxation or diversion from the stresses of modern living. The report is a useful and interesting analysis of information, dividing the relevant issues into experiences of accessing services, specific issues affecting sub-groups, and issues related to specific services, highlighting the diversity of experience, attitudes and access to cultural, arts and leisure activities.

- constraints that groups put on accessing services were **time considerations** due to work and family commitments (including criticism of the opening hours of many facilities and the need for those outside the city centre to spend time travelling to an event);
- **cost implications** (particularly for those who need to travel long distances, those on low wages/living on benefits etc, taking children/family as a group, and directed at many ‘arts’ events);
- **geographical considerations** (particularly affecting those living outwith the city where there was a view of ‘over provision’ in Belfast compared with the rest of Northern Ireland, non-car owners and limited public transport availability);
- **lack of awareness** (across all the groups there was concern over the lack of information available about services/events and in particular, the need for information tailored to those with visual and hearing impairments);
- and **perceptions of ‘eligibility’** (perceptions by some groups (eg lower classes) that some type of arts are for the ‘elite’ and not for ‘ordinary people’, and that when they had attended such events they had felt ‘uncomfortable’ and ‘out of place’, that their own ‘culture’ – eg disabled groups, LGBT communities and the elderly – was not being recognised, reflected or provided for at the facility).

1.43 The Report also provides some examples of good practice and makes several recommendations on how to increase access and participation by certain groups.
## CHAPTER TWO

### CULTURE, THE ARTS AND SOCIAL INCLUSION

**Social Inclusion**

Quantitative and qualitative research on projects on the arts, theatre, music, museums, libraries and archives and social inclusion shows the following:

- The most disadvantaged in a community are the least likely to participate, and therefore vulnerable groups should be targeted specifically.

- There is a lack of diversity and ethnic minority groups and young people with special needs should be targeted for participation in youth music in Scotland.

- The key stage to engage people in cultural activities is when they are very young (before age of 11) and social inclusion cultural programmes need to recognise the needs and cultural contexts of different groups and adopt an inclusive pricing policy, with staff reflecting diversity.

- Participation in arts activities can result in the acquisition of new skills, increase self-confidence, improve social networks and make people more employable.

- There is substantial potential for young people to participate in music activities if given the opportunity.

- Innovative and creative outreach work in museums can reach socially excluded groups and develop new skills, increase self-esteem and confidence and enhance formal and informal learning.

- Libraries can play an important social, as well as educational, role in the community, and can lead to personal development, social cohesion, community empowerment, local image and identity and well-being.

- New technology (ie internet) can attract new, previously socially excluded groups, to using and joining libraries.

**Research Issues**

- Research has highlighted the value of qualitative data, carried out within a rigorous framework, in providing valid evidence.

- There is a need for medium and long term research to assess long-term social impacts.

- Evaluation, particularly of social inclusion initiatives, requires clear formulation of project aims and should look for sustained changes in the community.

- Social impact evaluation is difficult, costly and time-consuming and must be long-term to establish change.

- There is a need for a common approach to evaluation of initiatives.
2.1 Social inclusion is a crucial strand of government policies and targets, and the National Cultural Strategy indicates how the government will seek to widen opportunities so that everyone can participate in and benefit from culture, which “can release potentials in all groups in society”\textsuperscript{20}. The following section illustrates research, reviews and evaluation of arts and cultural projects and events which relate to promoting social inclusion for those who tend not to be represented in attendance or participation in such events.

\begin{center}\textbf{Arts projects}\end{center}

2.2 A 2001 review prepared for the Arts Council of England\textsuperscript{21} aimed to gather evidence on arts projects that had aims relating to social inclusion, that could be used to inform policy and advocacy initiatives. Jermyn covered various works, setting out the challenges in measuring the impact of the arts and citing studies that have demonstrated social impact, several of which are included in this Review. She concludes that although much of the available research can be criticised in some way (eg small sample surveys, self-report measures, case studies presented in a generalist way, lack of evaluation of processes etc), the themes that emerge from recent research “have been consistent and are supported by a large body of more anecdotal evidence which should not be dismissed.” Jermyn also acknowledges that in some areas such as arts in health and education, “the evidence base is not only growing in size but also in strength”.

2.3 An evaluation of London Arts Board’s 1998/99 Regional Challenge Programme\textsuperscript{22} covered six arts projects which were directed at socially excluded communities, comprising the Eritrean community, young adults with severe learning disabilities, all ages and cultures in a deprived area, young African Caribbean people, homeless women in temporary housing and diverse cultural groups not familiar with carnival arts. Evaluation of the projects assessed the process by which each had identified its target audience, the quality of the participative processes and the artistic quality. An analysis was also made of the Regional Challenge programme itself, of its concept, delivery and effectiveness. The evaluation consisted of a strong analytical framework, with criteria to test the success of the process and participation (the ‘democracy’) of the different groups – equal value (whether the artists and audiences had equal roles in the projects); control of the agenda (extent that audiences determined the concept, design and implementation of the project); ways of participating (ways in which the audience could make their views known and influence direction of the work); and new understandings and skills (opportunities for audiences to deepen their understanding of the arts and develop or enhance their artistic skills).

2.4 The evaluation drew evidence from a range of resources including discussions with staff from each of the 6 projects, observation of key stages in each project’s development and final artistic outcomes, and interviews and group discussions from the participating audience at the beginning and end of the process, and with staff from collaborating agencies. There was also desk based research of relevant documents to provide ‘non-perceptual’ evidence of some of the learning outcomes resulting from the evaluation.

\textsuperscript{20} ‘Creating our Future Minding our Past’, National Cultural Strategy, Scottish Executive, 2000
\textsuperscript{21} The Arts and Social Exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England, H Jermyn, 2001
\textsuperscript{22} The Arts and Inclusion: Evaluation of London Arts Board’s 1998/99 Regional Challenge Programme, E Carpenter, 1999
• the study concludes that on the evidence of the projects, marketing was not a significant factor in reaching and engaging audiences, although marketing techniques had a role to play.
• it concluded that success in reaching these different groups as audiences “depended more on the quality of the arts organisations’ relationships with their audiences than their marketing technique”.
• the relationship of each arts organisation to its audience was ‘democratic’, and the more democratic the relationship, the more successful the organisation was in reaching and engaging with its audience.
• the quality of the art work and the high artistic ambitions of the artists were also found to be crucial factors in engaging the audiences and sustaining that engagement over an extensive period.

2.5 The author states “That the arts were valued as ends in themselves rather than for their instrumental social and economic benefits seemed the best explanation for the enthusiasm and commitment of the audiences to see projects through, often in the face of many practical obstacles”. The evaluation found that all those participating in the projects had

• learned new understanding and skills, including developing music skills,
• learning the skills of carnival costume-making,
• learning how to realise a theatre production,
• increasing knowledge about fund-raising, health and safety and publicity, and
• increasing personal confidence.

2.6 The study makes several recommendations for practitioners and policymakers in the field of arts programmes and inclusion.

2.7 Over 3 years, the Scottish Arts Council (SAC) has operated an Arts and Social Inclusion scheme through national lottery funding. An evaluation of the scheme (2002) was commissioned by SAC in order to refine policy and improve practice, and in light of the evaluation, SAC agreed actions, informed by the research, and has continued the scheme for a further 2 years (awards totalling £430K were made to 7 Social Inclusion Partnerships (SIPs) in February 2003, prioritising proposals that had not been accepted previously and targeting the most excluded members of the community). In the first 3 years, over 30 Social Inclusion Partnerships benefited from the scheme.

2.8 The evaluation comprised a review of all applications from SIPs to obtain information on the relevance and outcomes of arts projects, the reasons for applying for funding, the role of the projects and the degree of innovation involved; a postal survey of all SIPs eligible to take part in the scheme with an overall response rate of 78%; and indepth case studies of 10 projects in different geographical areas of Scotland. In 3 of the case studies, the project had been ongoing long enough to gauge participants’ attitudes and experiences and explore barriers to participation. Groups of participants and control groups of non-participants in these areas took part in discussions on their attitudes and experiences of the relevant projects.

• the evaluation recognised that “value derived from community participation is obtained almost irrespective of the activity”, and individual benefits include the

23 ‘Not Just a Treat: Arts and Social Inclusion’, Robina Goodlad, Christine Hamilton and Peter D Taylor, University of Glasgow Centre for Cultural Policy Research and Department of Urban Studies, 2002
acquisition of skills, self-confidence and improved social networks, possibly leading to better job prospects and further opportunities in life.

- however, the most disadvantaged groups in a community are the least likely to take part in activities, and there is a positive association between community participation and level of education.

2.9 It is with this in mind that the SIPs arts and cultural activities are attempting to target the most vulnerable members of the community. The evaluators of the scheme acknowledge that it is difficult to demonstrate long-term benefits from participation in arts activities, and that these are not easily separable from other experiences. It was not within the scope of the evaluation to determine long-term effects, but to look at the immediate effects, where possible, of participation.

2.10 Conclusions of the evaluation included that, overall,

- the funding scheme was effective, and that participants and SIPs workers had a positive view of the outcomes of the arts projects, particularly related to confidence building and skills development; however, the long-term benefits cannot yet be evaluated.
- as far as targeting was concerned, this was found to be, in some areas, ‘loose’, and there was little concern about the benefit of the project extending beyond SIPs’ boundaries into more affluent areas.
- the evaluators acknowledged however that it is very difficult to reach the more vulnerable community members and extend participation, rather than benefit all those who respond to an initiative. One way of perhaps overcoming this problem would be to work through existing groups and centres to reach the target group.

2.11 Some of the immediate benefits found from the scheme were voiced by the participants themselves – the gaining of skills and increased confidence, and a wish to continue the activities in the future. The evaluation considered that there was much untapped potential for participation by members of the community in the areas studied.

2.12 With reference to monitoring and evaluation, the evaluation found the SAC’s approach was appropriate and not onerous, with data captured for most projects and reports prepared. However, although SIPs need to gather data relevant to their own specific goals, there is a need for a common approach in data collection in order that the short and long term effects of the arts in SIPs can be evaluated. The evaluation concluded that SAC funding of the scheme generated additional leverage in cash and in kind contributions, ensured that projects happened more quickly and were more ambitious that would otherwise have been the case, and that the scheme created a positive view of SAC and its role in communities.

2.13 Following the evaluation, an evaluation toolkit24 was devised, and recent grant recipients from the Arts and Social Inclusion Scheme are piloting its use. An ‘e-mentor’ is provided to help in the use of the toolkit as the project progresses, and the kit contains an interactive toolkit to plan, design and report on evaluations and a step-by-step guide to essential steps in evaluation.

---

24 Evaluation Toolkit, Scottish Arts Council, 2003
Amateur and Community Theatre

2.14 A 2000 report for the SAC on amateur and community theatre in Scotland\textsuperscript{25} identified and described the range of amateur and non-professional community theatrical activities in Scotland and determined the size, age range, socio-economic mix and geographical distribution of participants. The study gathered information via a questionnaire survey of 73 amateur groups (a response rate of 30%), with additional questionnaires being completed by further groups (Youth Theatre and Scottish Youth Theatre) at a later stage. The survey identified over 100 youth theatre groups active in Scotland, although acknowledged that there were likely to be more in operation. 90 young respondents replied to one of the questions on their parents’ employment.

- the survey found that the majority of participants in amateur and community theatre fell into the C1 category, followed by B and C2 groups.
- only 12% of amateur youth theatre participants came from D and E socio-economic group households, whilst 70% participants in Scottish Youth Theatre came from the B parental socio-economic group, perhaps reflecting the higher costs of participating in Scottish Youth Theatre.

2.15 The report notes that “the amateur youth theatres may have as great a role to play in social inclusion work as community youth theatres”. However, the survey is clearly not a completely representative sample of all types of youth theatre in Scotland, and the findings on levels of participation and the background of participants will have to be treated with caution.

Music

2.16 A 2003 audit of youth music in Scotland\textsuperscript{26} used a quantitative questionnaire survey of organisations and qualitative research such as focus groups and interviews to gather information from young people, tutors, organisers and regional and national co-ordinators of musical activities, to compile a comprehensive account of all music-making activities in all sectors (except classroom and curricular provision) and to identify patterns, gaps and common concerns in youth music in Scotland. Response rates ranged from 18% to 100% for different categories of respondent. Quantitative data was received from 231 completed questionnaires from organisations that offer youth music activities, all 32 local authorities regarding the provision of Instrumental and Singing Instruction, and qualitative information was gathered from 83 organisers, 149 tutors, 39 co-ordinators and 182 participants, providing a broad sample of each category in the sector. The audit provides estimates of between 55,000 and 60,000 individual young people taking part in music activities each week, and concludes that 100,000 more young people would take part if given the opportunity. Although the report does indicate that the research “tried to achieve a spread of styles, deliveries and geography” in the participants’ sample, the sample was “not rigorously controlled” and the results should be treated with some caution, it does provide an insight into participants’ views and attitudes on participation.

\textsuperscript{25} Luvvies and rude mechanicals?, G Giesekam with S Knight, University of Glasgow, 2000
\textsuperscript{26} What’s going on?: a national audit of youth music in Scotland, S Broad et al, Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama, National Centre for Research in the Performing Arts, 2003
• the majority of participants took part in musical activities in order to become a better musician.
• however just under half participated ‘to meet new people’, highlighting the social aspect of participation.
• young people were overwhelmingly positive about their musical activities and the enjoyment derived.

2.17 Qualitative information gathered from co-ordinators, organisers and tutors indicated that
• there was almost uniform agreement that there are financial barriers to young people taking part in music, including fees for instrumental instruction and access to instruments or equipment.
• 15% thought that there were cultural, social or gender barriers to participating in music, with over a third of this group considering that gender stereotypes in youth music are a barrier to participation.
• also, nearly half of this group (48%) mentioned the cultural position of music in Scottish society, with musicians across all stylistic sectors feeling undervalued by politicians and the media, and this then impacting on participants.

2.18 One of the key recommendations was that further and higher education research should be encouraged to carry out medium to long-term impact assessment studies in personal/educational development through involvement in youth music. Gaps and weaknesses in existing provision were identified as lack of diversity (especially in access by minority ethnic communities and young people with special needs), and the report recommended that funding agencies should consider prioritising support for projects involving these groups and assist more musicians/volunteers from minority ethnic communities to develop skills in workshop techniques, project planning and fundraising. Various other recommendations addressed cost and gender barriers, and a need to “commission a range of longitudinal evidence-based studies on impact of youth music on social, person, education and creative development of young people”.

Museums

2.19 National Museums of Scotland piloted a project ‘Creating the Past’ (2002)27, developed as part of their Social Justice Action Plan, with the aim of including young people aged 14-21 who do not normally visit museums and galleries, due to real or perceived barriers. NMS worked in partnership with a performance art company ‘Reckless Sleepers’ to offer an alternative and more accessible mode of interpretation at the Royal Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh. They worked with 6 groups of young people, 3 of which were from SIPs areas. The Steering Group that directed the project included partnerships and organisations involved in promoting social inclusion for young people in Edinburgh. Over 100 organisations were contacted to encourage participation and 10% of the groups were visited to speak to leaders and young people about the project, and NMS visitor staff were also closely involved in carrying out the project. The methods used to evaluate the project included meetings held with youth leaders and youth groups, group evaluation exercises and self-evaluation by youth leaders.

27 ‘Creating the Past’, National Museums of Scotland’ 2002
2.20 Workshops were to develop skills of observation and communication, recording impressions of Celtic and Pictish carved stones and objects. An exhibition of the work was open to the public for one month in 2002 and Reckless Sleepers performed every hour between 19-31st August. Over 35,000 people visited the Royal Museum during this time, and it is estimated that Reckless Sleepers engaged with more than 500 visitors over the 10 days. Free hands on tours were run by curatorial staff to explore the carved stones, which was particularly suitable for visually impaired people.

2.21 As this was a small short-term project with a limited number of groups, there is no way of telling whether participation will increase young people’s participation in museum activities in general. However, there was positive feedback from participants and leaders, who found the project an unusual and interesting way to learn about the past and develop new skills. The report on the impact states that the project has established new practices for project working within the NMS – partnership working with SIPs and youth groups, developing projects with artists and performers tailored to meet the needs of the target groups, involving visitor services staff to enhance their understanding of the work, and using live performance to engage visitors and involve them in the project. Also, valuable lessons were learned that inform NMS on how carry out projects differently in the future.

2.22 Research commissioned by the Scottish Museums Council (2000)\textsuperscript{28} aimed to identify \textbf{what constitutes a successful social inclusion project in the context of Scotland’s museums and galleries}. The resulting report informed the SMC’s strategy on Museums and Social Justice. The research examined 9 case studies of museums and galleries in Scotland involving interviews with experts, and telephone interviews with managers and development officers from a sample of SIPs.

2.23 Amongst key findings were that the Museums Association’s defining principle that museums should be ‘inspirational’ was central to the core objectives of museums in their promotion of social inclusion. Those involved in promoting social inclusion wished to leave something in the community which could be sustained without further museum intervention.

- the research found that independent museums may have greater flexibility to respond to community needs;
- that museum buildings may not always be the best places to promote museum services and that libraries, pubs and buses were all found to have been successfully used by museums in the promotion of social inclusion;
- the contribution of museums to cultural inclusion is highlighted by SIPs where morale is low, where the fabric of the community is targeted and where older people were identified as most socially excluded – reminiscence work was important in this context;
- the contribution of museums to social regeneration is highlighted by SIPs in communities where economic development and the social exclusion of young adults were being addressed.

2.24 The research also found that all evaluation, and particularly social inclusion evaluation, requires clear formulation of project aims at the beginning; that it needs to look

\textsuperscript{28} Museums and Social Justice in Scotland, E Samuel, Dept of Social Policy, University of Edinburgh, 2000
for sustained changes in the community; that impact evaluation is very difficult, costly and time-consuming and must be conducted over a long period of time to establish changes; and that process evaluation is less costly.

2.25 A 2002 evaluation of the Open Museum in Glasgow\textsuperscript{29}, which is the first piece of evaluation work carried out by the HLF to “deliberately consider the gathering of qualitative evidence”, looked at the social impact on individuals and communities of the museum and engagement with its facilities. The Open Museum was developed in partnership between the HLF, Glasgow Museums and the Research Centre for Museums and Galleries at the University of Leicester and began as a pilot project in 1990. The ethos behind the Open Museum was to encourage people to visit, who for varied reasons, may not visit museums, feeling that they ‘are not for them’. The Museum also took collections out into the community, particularly working with people who had little access to museums. The aim was to ‘go beyond’ individual projects and work strategically to create pathways out of exclusion. Glasgow Museums considered that there were many good reasons for evaluation of the initiative, not least the pragmatic one of “funding agencies which share our aspirations and support them with cash have a reasonable desire to see evidence that their money is being well spent”.

2.26 The methodology involved face-to-face interviews with staff, teaching and community professionals, site visits, telephone interviews with other users of resources, and face-to-face interviews with 8 project participants. Interviews with project participants involved the tracking down of those who had been involved in Open Museum projects over the last decade. The evaluators acknowledge how difficult this was, particularly with groups that tend to be transitory and moved in and out of the community (eg young people, peace campaigners based at Faslane, the users of mental health services, elderly people etc). However, despite retrospective evaluation being limited by these constraints, “it was possible to interview people with diverse experiences and from very different backgrounds”. The evaluation looked in-depth at four case studies of individuals’ experiences over the years since participating in Open Museum activities.

- it concluded that their experiences had been really significant in terms of the acquisition of new skills and new experiences, and increasing self esteem and self confidence, and that this was not through recent experiences but extended over a much longer term.
- participation in museum activities had created new opportunities and developed more interests, and “involvement with the museum acted as a catalyst to propel the individuals into a new and more productive phase of their lives” and enabled “a process of transformation to take place in these individuals; a process that has impacted on individuals’ knowledge, skills, behaviour, attitudes, life condition, and their status”.

2.27 Although only a small number of individuals were involved in the in-depth case studies, their own reports of their experience and opportunities which led from it can clearly be established from their testimonies.

\textsuperscript{29} A Catalyst for Change: The Social Impact of the Open Museum, Research Centre for Museums and Galleries, University of Leicester, 2002
2.28 The evaluation also looked at the impact of the use of objects on various groups, and concluded that all those that took part in the research were able to articulate significant positive experience from having used objects. These included stimulating individual creativity; validating and giving recognition to minority cultures and ways of life; increasing self-expression; and enhancing formal and informal learning (such as tangible improvements in written work etc). The evaluation recommended that the next stage for the Open Museum is to ‘move away’ from being the focus on inclusion and to integrate its philosophy into the mainstream museum activity across all venues.

2.29 A 2002 review on various aspects of the impact of museums, archives and libraries\(^{30}\) concluded that “the most compelling evidence … indicates that the sector has an impact on personal development”. Wavell et al’s review looked at methods used for impact evaluation and indicates that there is widespread acceptance of the value of qualitative data to understand and assess impact. The review found that in relation to museums and galleries, various research studies had been carried out, some of which resulted in outcomes by way of some form of evaluation.

2.30 A report in 2000\(^ {31}\) carried out for the Group for Large Local Authority Museums (GLLAM) aimed to map social inclusion work across the GLLAM membership and identify the social impact of museums and galleries in relation to disadvantage, inequality and discrimination. A description of a project reports that following a museum music initiative:

- 80% of participants had learned new skills/developed a new interest,
- 47% felt more confident, and
- 40% would investigate further training opportunities.

2.31 However, the review points out that important details such as the number of participants surveyed and the methodology used are not provided. The GLLAM report nevertheless highlights seven key areas of impact – personal growth and development; community empowerment; representation of inclusive communities; promoting healthier communities; enhancing educational achievement and promoting lifelong learning; tackling unemployment; and tackling crime.

---

**Libraries**

2.32 Over the last five years, there have been three major surveys of UK public library authorities, each focusing on inclusion or community development issues – Black & Muddiman’s 1997 survey; McKrell’s et al 1997 survey; and Muddiman’s et al 2000 survey.

2.33 The 1997 Black & Muddiman’s study\(^{32}\) analysed the content of policy and service strategy documents from 74 English and Welsh public library authorities. They found that just 16% of authorities surveyed were ‘enthusiastic adopters’ of community librarianship

---


\(^{31}\) ‘Museums and social inclusion: the GLLAM Report, Research Centre for Museums and Galleries, University of Leicester, 2000

\(^{32}\) Understanding community librarianship, A Black and D Muddiman, 1997
which was innovative, popular and responsive to customer demand and which involved continuous performance measurement and evaluation.

2.34 The 1997 survey\textsuperscript{33} of community development work in 115 UK public library authorities touched on elements of impact evaluation. Libraries were asked to indicate ways in which they might contribute to anti-poverty strategies, adult education, economic development etc. Just over half of the libraries gave examples of services provided, partnerships and joint ventures with other agencies on initiatives to contribute to such strategies. Also, over half of these libraries also monitored the effectiveness of their development work with communities.

2.35 The 2000 survey of the nature and extent of activity and initiatives relating to social exclusion in UK public libraries\textsuperscript{34} concluded that only one sixth of authorities approximated to a comprehensive model of good practice. The survey found that mechanisms used for monitoring services on a regular basis were – issue statistics (60%), headcounts (38%), feedback from community groups (31%), user surveys (20%), consultative groups (12%), surveys of non users (9%), focus groups (9%) and social auditing (2%).

2.36 Wavell’s 2002 review concluded that in terms of social impact research, libraries, and in particular public libraries have, much more than museums or galleries, been the subject of extensive research studies over the last 5 years. However, interest in the social impact of museums is now growing. Research into the impact of archives has been ‘sparse’, comprising only a national audit of social inclusion work and 3 large-scale visitor surveys, although the recent Public Service Quality Group survey (2001) reveals some positive findings on the cultural and social impact of UK archives.

2.37 In 2002 the National Library of Scotland received specific data on manuscript visitors, drawn from the UK Survey of Visitors to British Archives\textsuperscript{35}. This survey collects not only information on the attitudes of visitors to their visiting experience, but gathers information on residence, whether, if a tourist, they stayed in accommodation in the area, the purpose of visiting the library, the use to which they would put their visit etc, and socio-demographic data such as age and gender. Analysis of the data helps inform the libraries on the user-friendliness and accessibility of their facilities, where improvements can be made, and who does (and therefore does not) use the library manuscripts section. For example,

- the manuscripts section had no visitors under 16 years old, and very few in the 16-24 year age group, and the over 65 year age group.
- the survey also suggests that in 76% of cases, the main purpose of the visit to the area was to visit the NLS.
- 28% of visitors would stay overnight in the area.
- 65% eat out locally, and


\textsuperscript{34} Open to all? The public library and social exclusion, D Muddiman et al, Library and Information Commission, 2000

\textsuperscript{35} ‘Survey of Visitors to British Archives 2002 Single Archive Report’ for NLS Manuscripts Section, Public Services Quality Group of the National Council on Archives, 2002
• 68% use the local shops, implying that the library may well have an economic impact and generate income for the local area.

2.38 The 2002 study by the Audit Commission\textsuperscript{36} recognises that public libraries have the potential to contribute to local priorities of social inclusion, life-long learning etc, but the study concludes that the quality of such contributions can vary. The audit found that most libraries have good links with education objectives, with around 68% of inspection reports containing positive comments, and only 18% with negative comments. However, the study highlighted concerns over links with social exclusion and regeneration strategies, with 44% of libraries receiving positive gradings, but more than one third being rated negatively. The study also found only ‘sparse’ evidence of libraries’ contribution to wider council objectives.

2.39 In a 1998 study\textsuperscript{37}, which deliberately moved away from ‘output based, quantitative measurement’, the authors evaluated the social impact of libraries in Newcastle and the county of Somerset. They sought to measure the impact of library activities in relation to the authorities’ social objectives. The study was qualitative in nature, based mainly on personal interviews and focus groups with stakeholders such as politicians, library stand and some 180 users and non-users. The research indicated that the widely recognised functions of the public library that remained important to stakeholders were that of

• culture,
• education,
• reading and literacy,
• leisure, and
• information.

2.40 However, the study also identified the social role of the library through respondents’ testimonies, as being

• personal development,
• social cohesion,
• community empowerment and self-determination,
• local image and identity, and
• health and well-being.

2.41 The study concluded that libraries enrich people’s lives and improve the life chances of individuals in terms of education and job opportunities. The authors defend their use of qualitative data in the study – “the key message of this study is that qualitative data, rigorously gathered, are valid evidence and should be treated as such by both politicians and professionals”. The authors also believe that the social audit is a practical tool that can be used by staff in public libraries to evaluate services provided.

\textsuperscript{36} ‘Building Better Library Services: learning from audit, inspection and research, Audit Commission, 2002
\textsuperscript{37} ‘New measures for the new library: a social audit of public libraries’, R Linley and B Usherwood, British Library Research and Innovation centre, 1998
2.42 In another 1998 study the researchers examined the extent and impact of public library closures and reductions in opening hours in England and Wales. One of the main aims of the study was to draw conclusions about the value of public libraries to their users. Four case study authorities that were about to close libraries or reduce hours were identified, and library users were questioned before and after the changes, using a mix of postal questionnaires, telephone and face to face interviews, to establish how they had been affected. In addition, a study was conducted on the specific impact on young children and their families. A total of 148 interviews and 663 questionnaires provided evidence that people valued the public library highly as an educational and community resource. The authors were of the view that the library acted as an ‘information junction’, binding the community together and improving the general quality of people’s lives. With regard to the impact on young children and families, there was a general consensus amongst teachers, parents and librarians that loss of a library service had a damaging effect on “functional literacy, intellectual development, imagination and educational attainment”.

2.43 The People’s Network is a major government-led initiative to bring internet and online services to the whole UK population by installing PCs and broadband throughout the public library network. One of the main aims of the initiative is to given everyone, irrespective of age, background etc, the opportunity to participate actively in the information society and particular weight has been given to the needs of groups of people who to date have been under-represented as internet users. The People’s Network is funded by the New Opportunities Fund, with additional investment from local authorities and represents the largest ever investment in the 150 years of public library service. It is being delivered by Resource in England, working in partnership with Scottish Library Information Council, and Library Information Councils in Wales and Northern Ireland, and the service is free in 80% of public libraries.

2.44 Research in 2003 has assessed the early impact of the initiative, using statistical analysis of survey returns from public library authorities and case studies from Network users. The author points out that although the evidence is not based on all library returns (86 returns were analysed) and therefore findings are indicative rather than definitive, early analysis suggests that

- the initiative is generating real benefits for the public at large and that users appear to be coming, in significant numbers, from disadvantaged groups in society.
- many people who are using the service have had little or no previous contact with computers eg in Cornwall it is estimated that 80% of the People’s Network Users have never before used the internet.
- the age range of users is wide, from schoolchildren to 90 year olds, and people who had stopped going to the public library have been attracted back.

2.45 Detailed analysis of libraries’ returns suggests that reasons for using the Network fall into the following categories –

- learning (eg Computer Driving Licence and LearnDirect);

---

39 The People’s Network: A turning point for public libraries, Professor Peter Brophy, Resource, 2003
• **finding work** (eg type up a CV, look for employment or college vacancies, learning skills that lead to employment);
• **personal identity** (eg keeping in touch with friends and family through email, refugees using internet to follow events in their own country, video conferencing link for interviews for benefits);
• **community enrichment** (eg local history, family history);
• **social inclusion** (eg housebound people having laptops on loan, elderly people with arthritis having hardware facilities adjusted to suit their needs, visually impaired people having voice-output software); and
• **culture and creativity** (eg extending horizons, leisure games, downloading news articles, biographies, book extracts etc).

Certain libraries have reported a high proportion of unemployed people using the service for job search related purposes, a higher representation of black and Asian users than for other services, a large increase in young users, particularly boys, and a high increase in elderly users.

Impact on library use has also been substantial – library authorities estimate that of those non-members of the library using the Network facilities, 40% have also joined the library.

2.46 Although these are early findings based on an analysis of a limited number of library returns and case studies, the author concludes that the evidence found so far suggests that the People’s Network is having a positive influence “and that its impacts will be both significant and valuable”.

### Young People and Cultural Services

2.47 A 2002 research study[^40] examined the changing social, emotional, personal and cultural needs of young people by investigating their needs, motivations and attitudes in relation to cultural services. The research looked at these aspects from the perspective of young people themselves. Primary research was undertaken with 75 young people from a range of backgrounds aged 3-16 years and took place in an urban and rural setting to allow comparison of these areas and of different levels of deprivation and affluence. The authors point out that the most persuasive theories on child development and the primary research undertaken in their study, reinforce the view that development does not take place in isolation, and that context is extremely important. From the perspective of social exclusion, the report indicates that

- cultural services need to engage young people before they become socially and or culturally excluded and that before age 11 is the key stage;
- facilities need to provide a welcoming atmosphere for everyone, recognising the needs and cultural context of different groups;
- staff should be diverse in ethnicity, age and disability; and
- services need to review potentially excluding pricing policies.

[^40]: ‘Start with the Child: the needs and motivations of young people’, Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, 2002
2.48 The report concludes that museums, archives and libraries need to adopt a user-focused delivery of services, by identifying the people they wish to reach, determining their needs and motivations, developing services to meet those needs and communicating and interacting with the target market through appropriate methods.

2.49 Similarly, a small-scale study in 1999\textsuperscript{41} that explored children’s perceptions of and participation in the arts, examined barriers children may encounter when they wish to take part. Five focus group discussions took place with children aged 5-12 years in urban and rural primary school in Scotland. Amongst the findings were that although most of the children said they participated in the arts and attended events to a significant extent, with regard to events such as dance, plays or music, children’s opportunities were restricted, with disinterest by parents and costs cited as barriers. Another obstacle cited by children was the fact that exhibitions and plays tend to be adult-centred, with limited if any, attention paid to children’s interests and needs. All the types of arts children said they like in particular were forms in which they had “a significant level of control”, particularly in relation to books (which they could choose when and where to read), and drawing and painting, particularly outside school. The author argues that if children’s participation in the arts is to be sustained, a child-centred approach is required. For example, few galleries and museums display children’s arts, where they could see how and what other children express through the arts. The author points out that much could be gained if children were consulted about the structure of museums and galleries. The study concludes that finding the ‘right way’ to involve children in the arts “could make all the difference between whether some children lose all interest in the arts, or remain interested no matter what other activities they pursue at the same time”.

\textsuperscript{41} A Picture in your head- Children and the arts: a study of the perceptions and participation of children aged 5-12, Dr Birgit Jentsch, for Children in Scotland, 1999

42
CHAPTER THREE

CULTURE, THE ARTS AND ETHNIC MINORITIES

Ethnic Minorities

The following findings have been made from well-conducted qualitative research projects:

Ethnic minority artists wish to be recognised for the value of their art first and foremost, and desire more inclusive events and more opportunities to promote their work.

Participation by ethnic minorities in the arts and cultural events results in an enhanced sense of pride in their own culture, and opportunity for celebration of their culture, an ‘empowerment’ of the ethnic community, the development of skills, confidence and educational and employment opportunities.

Although ethnic minority groups recognise the valuable role played by museums and galleries, they view them as elitist and ‘not for them’; there is a concern about the history presented (white colonial) and a desire for exhibitions relating to their own culture; however, recent quantitative research has found that almost a third of ethnic minority groups in England have visited a museum or art gallery within the past year.

Main barriers to cultural and arts participation/attendance are lack of time, cost, lack of interest, lack of awareness, lack of understanding, language, feeling out of place, social barriers and irrelevance.

Partnership working and collaboration with other agencies helps to lever additional funding and deliver a successful project.

3.1 Although ethnic minority groups are covered to a certain extent in the previous chapter on Social Inclusion, they are such an important group in the realm of culture and the arts that they merit a sole chapter. The National Cultural Strategy makes specific reference to the diversity within Scotland’s cultural domain, where new generations of Scots, particularly those from the Indian subcontinent, have influenced and enriched Scotland’s culture, yet they still tend to be under-represented in participation and attendance at mainstream arts and cultural events. The following section cites research on issues specifically relating to minority ethnic groups with a view to promoting their participation in cultural activities.

Arts activities

3.2 The Scottish Arts Council is committed to creating wide opportunities for all Scotland’s artists and to offer best quality experiences for audiences. Research was carried out for the SAC in 2001 by the Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/Edinburgh College of Art, to investigate issues related to increasing access and participation for and by minority ethnic groups, in the arts. The study made various findings and recommendations.

42 ‘Sharing the Spotlight: increasing access and participation in the arts by Scotland’s minority ethnic communities’, G Netto et al, 2001
on how to increase participation by these communities. The study was qualitative in nature, and consisted of focus groups of Pakistani, Chinese, Indian and African communities, and interviews with artists from these communities, and representatives of various bodies involved in the provision and promotion of the arts. A short postal survey also took place of local authority departments to establish the type of cultural activities provided and whether they related specifically to minority ethnic groups.

- findings indicated that ethnic minority artists wished to be recognised first and foremost by the value of their work, but there was a desire for more inclusive events and more opportunities to promote their work.
- interviews and the postal survey indicated that it was recognised that there were potential opportunities for expanding work with minority ethnic communities and widening the programmes provided.
- interviews with SAC showed that it was agreed that audience development was critical in the implementation of any cultural diversity policy, and this research has now been commissioned and a scoping study is ongoing.\(^{43}\)

3.3 Research in 2000 into ethnic minorities and the arts\(^{44}\) involved **collating statistics about ethnic minorities and conducting a literature review of research exploring inequalities in arts attendance and participation**. Also, qualitative research by way of 13 groups discussions held with African, Caribbean, South Asian and Chinese people explored definitions and perceptions of the arts, arts attendance experiences and barriers limiting arts attendance.

- the qualitative research found that the dominant images of art were of opera, ballet, Shakespearean theatre, classical music and art in galleries (particularly abstract modern art). Many of the groups found this off-putting and elitist and considered that such events were for white, ‘posh’ people over the age of 35.
- people who were not interested in mainstream arts were though, interested in arts relating to their own cultural heritage, which they did not tend to regard as ‘arts’.

3.4 Creative activity was common in the ethnic minority communities, including:

- arts activities as part of larger social, religious or cultural occasions (eg weddings, festivals);
- attendance at arts events involving artists from their heritage;
- dramas in their mother-tongue performed in community centres or town halls;
- plays derived from the experiences of Black and Asian people in Britain;
- young people frequently involved in hip-hop, bhangra and other music of Black or Asian culture, and saw this as part of British Black or Asian culture;
- the Black, Asian and Chinese arts in various forms provided a sense of cultural continuity, and served to bring the community together across generations; and
- arts events which people felt related to their own cultural heritage provided a “sense of pride, ownership and belonging” and accessed deeper emotions than mainstream arts.

\(^{43}\) ‘Audiences Scotland’, Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (in progress)


44
3.5 The factors which appeared to limit attendance at mainstream arts and cultural events were

- **lack of time and money** (eg not wanting to ‘waste’ money on something they didn’t enjoy);
- **availability/location; lack of information** (eg lack of awareness of what was going on in their area);
- **language** (some of the Chinese and Asian respondents had little or no English);
- **social barriers** (especially important for younger people and women, when disapproval for discouragement came from their family/husbands);
- **feeling out of place** (young people, those from working class background and Black people felt they would look out of place at mainstream events, and publicity materials by arts venues etc sometimes reinforced the view that ethnic minorities are not found either in the artists or audiences);
- **lack of understanding** (many felt specialist knowledge was needed to ‘decode’ and appreciate the arts);
- **irrelevance** (the perceived mainstream arts were assumed to have little to do with the lives of ordinary people and difficult to relate to);
- **the audience experience** (particularly young people felt this would be passive and unengaging).

3.6 The study made several recommendations for venues and arts organisations to develop ethnic minority audiences for mainstream arts. These included producing promotional materials that reflect ethnic diversity; promoting ‘word of mouth’ recommendations amongst communities; produce creative programming and ticketing arrangements such as family discounts and women only performances; develop an understanding of the arts through community outreach, workshops, opportunities to meet arts and backstage tours; and create engagement for young people in particular, as interactive events will have more appeal.

3.7 A 2003 survey was carried out to establish the attendance, participation and attitudes of different ethnic groups in England, who comprise 9.1% of England’s population (2001 data). The research provides “the first national information on how our culturally diverse population engages with the arts and culture”. The report presents some interesting findings, including the extent of attendance and participation in cultural activity among all ethnic groups. In total, 7,748 people from ethnic minority groups were interviewed through an omnibus survey, face-to-face in their homes, using computer-assisted interviewing, thus providing a robust and representative sample of ethnic minority groups in England.

- The results of the survey showed that although there were some differences between individual ethnic groups, there were very high levels of engagement with and support for the arts and other cultural activities, with high proportions believing that arts and cultural projects should receive public funding and that the arts play a valuable role in the life of the country.
- similarly, the vast majority of all ethnic groups thought that ‘arts from different cultures contribute a lot to this country’.

---

• going to see a film in the previous year was the most widespread activity reported (58%);
• however, much lower percentages reported having attended a play or drama (26%) or art, photography or sculpture exhibition (19%).
• just over one-third of all respondents had visited a museum or art gallery in the previous year, and almost half of all respondents had visited a library.
• Asian respondents were most likely to have attended a culturally specific festival and the highest proportions of those visiting or using libraries were found amongst Black African, Pakistani and Bangladeshi respondents, and the lowest among Black Caribbean people and people of mixed ethnicity.
• levels of attendance varied by age and gender, with attendance more likely to be by the younger age group of 16-44 years, and for particular ethnic minorities (eg Black African) more men than women attending arts events (and for Indian groups, more women than men attending arts events).

3.8 The majority of respondents in all ethnic groups said that they would be interested in attending more events and when asked about barriers, the most common reason was ‘lack of time’ followed by ‘cost’, and less frequently ‘not interested’ and ‘lack of transport’. Black African, Pakistani or Bangladeshi people were the most likely to say that concerns about ‘feeling uncomfortable or out of place’ prevented them from attending. Respondents were also asked about whether they took part themselves, as opposed to attendance, in artistic and cultural activities, and the results showed high levels of participation in the last year, ranging from 95% of people of mixed ethnicity to 80% of the Asian or British Asian sample. Examples of participation in artistic activities include: singing to an audience, played a music instrument, jazz or street dance, creating original work of art or animation on a computer and textile crafts. Clearly, participation in the more ‘informal’ arts activities is high by ethnic minority groups in England, but appears to be lower in ‘mainstream’ arts and cultural events.

3.9 ‘Routes across Diversity’ (2001)\(^\text{46}\) was an evaluation of 11 London Arts’ projects to support and promote the arts and cultural activities of London’s refugee communities. The projects were externally evaluated, using criteria agreed at the outset. More than 1500 refugees and asylum seekers participated in the projects. Workshops took place to jointly establish shared criteria which could be used by the projects and by the external evaluators to assess activities, and minimum data to be collected by projects were agreed.

• the study concluded that the projects “successfully involved a wide range of participant groups drawn from many different asylum-seeking and refugee communities”.
• that participants were ‘empowered’ by access to arts and activities being provided as well as opportunities to explore and celebrate aspects of culture and identity.
• the evaluation states that “projects have enabled participants to develop skills, confidence and in several instances, potential to take up education and employment opportunities”.
• initial funding of projects helped lever funding from other sources, and several new arts initiatives were created from the formation of new partnerships and new networks made to implement the projects.

---

\(^{46}\) Routes across Diversity: Developing the arts of London’s Refugee Communities’, Yvonne Field and Marietta Harrow, 2001
3.10 The evaluators considered that the projects had “left a permanent legacy” and there had been a substantial expansion in arts and cultural activities within the funded organisations which stretched well beyond the original proposals.

**Museums and Galleries**

3.11 A 1998 study\(^{47}\) examined **ethnic minority populations’ attitudes towards museums and galleries.** By means of a series of focus groups, a common image of the museum emerged across all ethnic groups –

- quiet, reverential and unwelcoming, regarded as more suitable for intellectuals and the upper classes.
- art galleries were seen as even more distant and elitist.
- the groups expressed concern about the view of history presented by museums, seen as being constructed from a ‘white, colonial’ perspective.
- Black, South Asian and Chinese people wanted to see exhibitions that related to their own lives, cultures and histories.
- barriers to participation were investigated, and these were cited as **lack of time, cost, lack of interest, lack of awareness, effort and fear of not understanding the displays.**
- however, there was also a general consensus that museums are valuable to society as a whole and that they have a number of key roles, including to preserve the past, to education (especially children), to broaden people’s horizons and increase mutual tolerance, and places where people could engage with beautiful objects.

3.12 Although this study was qualitative in nature, it clearly explored with ethnic minority groups their views and attitudes towards museums and art galleries, and why they tended not to participate. However, the study appears not to have gone beyond this, and explored what in effect would encourage ethnic minorities to visit museums and galleries, and what specifically would make them more accessible.

---

\(^{47}\) ‘Cultural diversity: attitudes of ethnic minority populations towards museums and galleries’, BMRB International, 1998
CHAPTER FOUR

CULTURE, THE ARTS AND REDUCTION OF YOUTH CRIME

Reduction in Youth Crime

Robust quantitative, qualitative and case study research has demonstrated a positive association between participation in arts activities and a reduction in offending; however, causality has not been demonstrated.

Programmes of activities for young people in high crime areas provide activities that young people would otherwise not be able to engage in, and create enthusiasm and enjoyment for this group.

Summer activities are not sufficient to detract young people ‘at risk’ from being involved in criminal activities, and a longer-term strategy should be developed for youth crime prevention.

Participation in arts activities can facilitate key skills in literacy and numeracy, social skills, provide routes into further education and employment and establish suitable mediums for working with offending behaviour.

Research Issues

There is a need for more robust monitoring and tracking of young people at risk as there is little evidence from follow-ups and possible increase in crime rates following completion of the activities.

More robust research is required which attempts to identify causal links between participation and reduction in crime.

There is a need for a consistency of approach to evaluation, using control groups, quantitative and qualitative approaches, using longitudinal research resulting in robust outcomes.

4.1 Arts (and sports) events and activities have often been used as a vehicle to assist in the reduction of criminal activities, particularly by young people, and their likelihood to re-offend. The following section describes evaluations of various programmes that have had as one of their objectives to promote attendance of young people in arts and cultural activities and to reduce the level of crime in deprived areas.

4.2 In the summer of 2002 the New Opportunities Fund supported Splash Extra, a programme providing activities for young people in high crime areas and targeted at those thought most at risk. More about this programme and the findings can be found under the section on Sport and Social Inclusion in this review. However, amongst the activities provided (33% sport related) in almost 300 diversionary schemes in high crime neighbourhoods in England, were arts, cultural and educational activities (accounting for 20% of the activities). An indepth evaluation took place of five areas, focusing on two schemes in each, one neighbourhood based and the other urban48.

• the arts/cultural activities were well attended, including multi-media production, and reports back from young people indicated how access to specialist equipment and artists offered experiences not normally available and resulted in a real sense of excitement and achievement.

• the Arts Council England and the Reading Agency supported delivery of the arts activities and were found to have effectively integrated themselves into the programme and helped schemes deliver a more diverse range of activities, using high quality facilities and professional artists experienced in working with young people at risk.

• the evaluation concluded that arts activities are particularly well suited to directly addressing risk factors.

• overall, Splash Extra 2002 was found to be a success and in the majority of areas where it took place, crime was seen to reduce drastically over the summer activities period (see under Sport and Social Inclusion in Section 2 for more details).

4.3 However, in a paper prepared for the Evaluation Sub Group of the Positive Activities for Young People Official Steering Group (2003) lessons learned from the programme were highlighted, including “sustainable youth crime reduction cannot be achieved in just one summer. Splash and Splash Extra-type initiatives need to be tied to a long-term strategy for youth crime prevention” and that having activity throughout the year, rather than one-off schemes over the summer, would have more of an impact. Also, all evaluations of such programmes had pointed out that better monitoring and tracking of target groups was required, and that some kind of evaluation ‘tool’ was needed to assess the personal development of the young people involved.

4.4 In a 2003 review demonstrating the value and role of the arts in criminal justice programmes, the authors examined 15 case studies between 1989 and 2002, including the Splash Extra programme 2002 referred to above. Case studies covered involved music, popstars, poetry and theatre workshops for community residents and young people in areas of high crime (Hull Cop Shop); drama, music, creative writing, film and theatre focusing on young fathers, fathers of teenagers and fathers with legal issues (Father Figures); and a film project with young people at high risk of offending on a deprived estate (The Openshaw Uncovered Project). Respectively, outcomes suggested that

• there has been a 60-80% burglary reduction and 65-78% reduction in youth causing annoyance, with positive relationships built between young people, adults and police;

• single fathers have found new friends, relationships between fathers and children are less confrontational, fathers feel more supported in dealing with problems and men continue to meet and value their meetings; and

• the film project had a direct and indirect impact on the social and psychological aspects of young people’s experience of social exclusion and supported them in developing a sense of self-worth.

4.5 The review also examined interventions in custody and in the community including:


50 Arts in Criminal Justice Settings: Research and Evaluation, The Unit for the Arts and Offenders, 2003
• the Ceramic Water Garden where young offenders worked in a residential care home for the elderly and helped three ceramic artists to create a ceramic water garden in the courtyard – key findings were that 14 participants began the project, 13 completed it and none had re-offended in the 6 month period following completion.

• the Stoke-on-Trent Youth Offending Team Interactive Intervention Programme for Sex, Violent and Persistent Offenders ran 3 programmes with the overall aims of reducing the risk of re-offending and improving attitudes and behaviour in the community – reconviction data on all participants over 18 months were collected and main findings were that across the 3 programmes 100% of non-completers were re-convicted within a year, 58% of all completers had not re-offended within a year; on the ‘Star’ programme (focusing on victim empathy) 75% of completers were re-convicted within a year, but committed 55% less offences than before the group.

• on the ‘Echo’ programme (focusing on anger management and violent behaviour) completers were convicted for 50% fewer violent offences than the non-completers; and for the ‘Safe People’ programme (focusing on sexual behaviour issues), 100% of participants had not been re-convicted.

4.6 **A pilot project of incorporating a number of forms of drama to the 9 weeks course developed by the Airborne Initiative**\(^{51}\), took place in 2002. The Airborne Initiative provides residential courses for offenders with the aims of reducing offending behaviour and enhancing employment and training prospects. It includes outdoor activities and structured support aimed at developing self-esteem, teamwork, self-discipline, group values and the work ethic. Although unpublished, an evaluation of the pilot by Queen Margaret University College, indicates that those taking part in the drama achieved standards in their course faster, and that participation helped them ‘confront’ what they had done and resolve other areas in their lives. The evaluation also showed that community theatre was the art form that worked best in this particular context, with the young offenders relating well to, and often building up relationships with, the community theatre students. A previous evaluation of the Airborne Initiative\(^{52}\) (before drama was integrated into the course) showed that reconviction rates were significantly lower among offenders who completed the programme than among non-completers and a comparison group of offenders who received alternative sentences.

4.7 **In Miles’ paper**\(^{53}\) in 2003 for the Institute for Public Policy Research he acknowledges that there is a wealth of evidence suggesting the arts play a significant role in contributing to the resettlement of offenders. However, he also states that for this role to be properly recognised, the arts in criminal justice sector needs to address the requirement to provide robust outcomes, and to demonstrate that the arts can make a difference “rooted in substantial, longitudinal evidence”. Miles indicates that arts can contribute to offender rehabilitation by

- facilitating key skills in literacy and numeracy;
- supporting personal, social and life skills development;
- providing routes into further education and employment;

---
\(^{51}\) Airborne Initiative (Scotland)  www.airborne-initiative.co.uk
\(^{52}\) Evaluation of the Airborne Initiative (Scotland), McIvor et al, University of Stirling and A Netten, University of Kent, Crime and Criminal Justice Research Findings No 45, Scottish Executive Central Research Unit, 2000
\(^{53}\) ‘What works in offender rehabilitation?: including the arts’, Discussion paper prepared for the Institute for Public Policy Research Arts in Society Seminar Series, Dr A Miles, University of Manchester, Sept 2003
• establishing a context and an adaptable medium for working with offending behaviour.

4.8 Miles states that at root, the problem is one of evidence, particularly disagreement about the appropriateness and use of quantitative approaches in establishing impacts.

4.9 A ‘think tank’ – REACCT (Research into Arts and Criminal Justice Think Tank) was established in late 2002 by the Unit for Arts and Offenders and has recently commissioned a literature review to support the development of a theory base to bid for research council funding to examine the impact of arts interventions in criminal justice settings. The main research phase will combine an analysis of data from ongoing projects, a case study of a prison-based programme and a project of post-custodial work with ex-offenders.

4.10 Miles cites studies that have attempted to bring a more systematic and rigorous approach to research in the arts and offender rehabilitation area, including the 2001 study in the USA which compared the parole outcomes of a group of people who had participated in an arts programme at least once a week for at least 6 months, with all people leaving secure establishments in California over a 5 year period. The study showed positive outcomes in that re-offending rates were lower. However, as Miles points out, although an association between participation and the likelihood of offending is demonstrated, the issue of causality is not addressed. Miles considers that the ‘failure’ of the arts sector to adequately demonstrate how it can influence re-offending factors raises several research questions – how to distil and accurately measure impacts using appropriate indicators; how to establish the link between behaviour change and offending; and how to explain the changes that have occurred. An appropriate research design to address these questions should be rooted in ‘critical realist methodology’ emphasising mechanisms and context; recognises the need to integrate qualitative and quantitative approaches using tightly specified analytical frameworks; is longitudinal, following up transition, progression, re-offending and reconviction; and is able to make clear theoretical propositions about the relationship between different types of arts intervention and change. There should be a consistency of approach, establishment of adequate control and comparison groups, and data quantity and quality.

54 An Evaluation of the Core Arts Programme 1998-2001- Executive Summary, W Cleveland, Minneapolis Minnesota, 2001
CHAPTER FIVE

CULTURE, THE ARTS AND DISABILITY

Disability

There appears to be little research on the arts and disability that demonstrates the impact of participation by these groups.

A quantitative survey of UK libraries found there has been little progress on meeting the needs of visually impaired people, and from data available it is difficult to assess how effectively they can use library services.

Research on Scottish museums concluded that the specific needs of people with learning disabilities should be targeted, as often this group only benefits from promotion of inclusion for other types of disabled groups, and not from being targeted themselves.

The experience of families with disabled children visiting arts and cultural venues found various difficulties in relation to access and facilities so that children could not fully enjoy their visit.

Access difficulties by visually impaired people to the performing arts have still not been addressed, and there is a need to share good practice on a national basis.

5.1 First rights of access under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 came into force in 1996. Further rights of access came into force in 1999 and the final rights of access will come into force in October 2004. Duties of service providers under Part III of the Act include having “to consider making reasonable adjustments to the way they deliver their services so that disabled people can use them” and the final stage in 2004 will mean that service providers “may have to consider making permanent physical adjustments to their premises” to meet the needs of disabled people. It is no longer optional therefore, for cultural service providers to take into account the needs of disabled people, and cultural services must be accessible to all, including those with physical and mental impairment. This chapter will therefore review research or literature that has examined provision and accessibility for disabled people in the area of arts and culture.

5.2 There is literature and documentation on promoting the inclusion of disabled artists in arts and performance sectors (e.g., issues on training and professional development opportunities for disabled artists by the Scottish Arts Council), however there appears to be little on the evaluation of projects/events directed particularly at disabled groups as an audience or participants and at measuring any resulting social impact. The following section describes research that has been found on disability issues in attending, visiting or participating in cultural and arts activities or events.
5.3 A survey in 2000\textsuperscript{55} looked at current provision by UK public libraries to visually impaired people, and found there had been little progress since a previous survey in 1997. The survey found that 42% of authorities surveyed did not have a specific policy statement on meeting the needs of visually impaired people. It was established however that 70% of library authorities used some form of evaluation of their services to the visually impaired, with user satisfaction surveys and performance indicators the most frequent form used. The survey concluded however that it was difficult, from the data provided, to assess how effectively visually impaired people could use general library services.

5.4 INTACT (the Intellectual Access Trust) published the results of research in 1998 that examined the accessibility of museums and galleries for people with learning disabilities.\textsuperscript{56} Through interviews and observational visits to museums, mostly in the central belt of Scotland, it was found that although much had improved in access for people with learning disabilities, this was often as a result of developments designed to improve access for other types of disability, such as being visually impaired, or from attempts to include more visitors from ethnic minorities and from a wider social background. The report concluded that the specific needs of people with learning disabilities should be recognised by museums and galleries and catered for. A copy of the report was sent to every registered museum and gallery in the UK and a subsequent evaluation\textsuperscript{57} found that the report had had an effect on raising awareness of the needs of visitors with learning disabilities amongst museums in Scotland and that this had resulted in a number of improvements to facilities. However, the majority of responding organisations stated they had no plans to implement an access policy or to carry out an access audit, and the authors concluded that the level of awareness of disability issues in museums and galleries is still “very uneven”.

5.5 A 2003 report by Mencap\textsuperscript{58} focuses on the experiences of six volunteer family groups who all have one or more child with profound or multiple disabilities. Each family was asked to act as ‘researchers’ and visit arts and cultural events at venues in and around London. The report is drawn from the personal experiences of the families at the venues they visited. Although not a robust, quantitative piece of research, the reports by the visiting families are valid and informative accounts of their experiences of venues in a particular area, and the difficulties of access encountered. Common findings and themes in the families’ accounts led to recommendations including:

- training and awareness campaigns should promote understanding about learning disability and families’ particular needs;
- venues should provide better information through helplines for families with disabled children;
- venues should provide information about disabled badge holders’ parking when people book tickets and parking spaces should be linked to tickets;
- venues should have more accessible toilets;
- arts venues should actively promote their performances to encourage disabled children and their families (eg by having integrated seating for wheelchairs allowing families to sit together); and

\textsuperscript{55} Public library services for visually impaired people’. M Kinnell et al, Loughborough University, 2000
\textsuperscript{56} Access in mind: towards the inclusive museum, A Rayner, Intellectual Access Trust, 1998
\textsuperscript{57} Did anyone notice? An evaluation of the INTACT Project, S Mitchell and A Rayner, 2000
\textsuperscript{58} ‘There’s nothing that can’t be done’, Arts for All (UK), Mencap, 2003 www.mencap.org.uk/html/news/arts_for_all.htm
• there should be more supported arts workshops in community venues for young people to access, and wider publicity and promotion of groups employing disabled performers.

5.6 A 2002 report on increasing access for visually impaired performers and audiences in London to the performing arts used qualitative research to explore the barriers that prevent or inhibit visually impaired people from attending performance arts events, and how these could be removed. Cultural barriers found included:

• visually impaired people have low expectations about how they will be welcomed and treated at performing arts venues;
• as a result, many believe that theatre, opera and dance are ‘not for them’;
• sighted people make incorrect assumptions about the abilities, needs and interests of visually impaired people; and
• visually impaired people sometimes encounter fear and hostility if frontline staff have not been properly trained.

5.7 Other barriers included: cost, since more visually impaired people are unemployed and on lower incomes than sighted people (concessionary tickets are not always accessible to visually impaired customers); transport to and from the venue is an issue; communication and awareness (eg there is a lack of non-visual information at venues); and the number of audio-described performances is still low.

---

59 Changing the scene: increasing access to the performing arts for visually impaired performers and audiences in London, I Jentle, 2002
CHAPTER SIX

CULTURE, THE ARTS AND REGENERATION/COMMUNITY IMPACT

Regeneration and Community Impact

An Australian longitudinal example found that community-based arts activity developed feelings of identity and confidence in the community, developed social networks and helped the community appreciate the value of the arts.

Robust research in the UK (although not longitudinal) has found that individuals have reported change for the better by way of personal change, social change, economic change and education change, through participation in community-based arts activities.

Specific changes that have been reported are a greater sense of confidence in individuals, the creation of friendship in the community, a reduced sense of isolation, a strong sense of community identity, people feeling better about where they live, people feeling safer and less fear of crime in the community, improved learning/education, an increased organisational capacity at local level, reduced truancy at school and reduced offending, increased social capital and participation leading to further training or employment in the creative industries.

Research Issues

There is a dearth of longitudinal research in this area, and therefore very little evidence of long-term impacts of culture on the community as part of the regeneration process.

6.1 In a report to the Social Exclusion Unit in 1999\(^{60}\) it is suggested that the arts (and sport) can contribute to neighbourhood renewal by improving issues within the community related to health, crime, employment and education. This approach has moved away from the ‘urban regeneration’ approach to a more ‘people centred’ approach, focusing on enhancing the quality of life for people in the community, the community’s organisational capacity, and creating social capital by strengthening social cohesion and networks within the community.

6.2 In February 2003 the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport hosted a conference on culture and regeneration\(^{61}\), from which recommendations arose that the quality of evidence and measures of impact needed to be improved, and that there was a need to take a more long-term view of social and economic impacts, recognising that these often take time to emerge. Presently, the Department for Culture, Media and Sport are preparing a consultation document\(^{62}\) on the role of culture in regeneration, to be launched in June 2004. The document will set out the background and policy context of the role of culture in tackling social exclusion and promoting regeneration in communities, provide examples of where this has successfully occurred, and raise questions to be addressed through the consultation exercise.

---

\(^{60}\) Policy Action Team 10: Report to the Social Exclusion Unit – Arts and Sport, DCMS, 1999

\(^{61}\) “Building Tomorrow: Culture in Regeneration”, The Lowry Centre, Salford, February 2003

\(^{62}\) ‘Culture at the Heart of Regeneration’, Consultation Paper, DCMS, due to be launched late June 2004
6.3 The following section examines evidence that has been found, through research and evaluation, on the role that arts and cultural activities have played in community development, and what work requires still to be done in order to demonstrate robust outcomes.

6.4 A 2003 report\textsuperscript{63} carried out for DCMS looked at \textit{evidence of the different effects of culture on regeneration, including environmental, economic and social impact}. Although acknowledging that although “there are as yet no universally agreed measures of social impact or social regeneration in relation to cultural activity”, and different measures are used according to the context in which they take place, the authors found action research projects and reports of formative evaluation processes that provide the potential for more relevant and robust data collection and analysis of social impact. The authors indicate that culture in social regeneration can be evidenced by –

- a change in residents’ perceptions of the place in which they live;
- greater individual confidence and aspiration;
- clearer articulation of ideas and needs;
- an increase in volunteering;
- increased organisational capacity at local level;
- a change in image or reputation of the area;
- stronger public-private-voluntary sector partnerships;
- reduced school truancy or offending behaviour;
- higher educational attainment;
- new approaches to evaluation, consultation and representation; and
- increased social capital.

6.5 The study looked at 10 case studies in the UK that provided evidence of environmental, economic and social impact, finding 7 with evidence of each type of impact, although only three having carried out robust evaluation. In the authors’ consideration of gaps in evidence, they indicate that regeneration is a “fragmented process taking place over several years, perhaps a generation or more”, whilst monitoring and evaluation tend to focus on shorter-term, quantitative outputs. They state that measuring impacts and evaluating beyond a project’s immediate objectives is not generally the responsibility of cultural organisations or funders, but that a sample of longitudinal impact studies is essential, given the dearth of evidence of this type.

6.6 The authors also cite an \textit{Australian study completed in the late 1990s}\textsuperscript{64} that looked at the long-term impact of community-based arts activity carried out by the Community Arts Network for the Australia Council 1994-95. Methods used were a questionnaire survey and observer focus groups in 232 projects/organisations to collect information on people who became involved in or supported community-based arts projects, their motivations and what long-term benefits were gained. Social benefit indicators were graded and respondents asked to give examples in each case. Overall, 65% rated social benefits as significant, the highest factors being the appreciation of the value of community arts; the

\textsuperscript{63} The Contribution of Culture to Regeneration in the UK, E Evans, P Shaw, K Allen, London Metropolitan University, 2003 (unpublished)

\textsuperscript{64} Creating Social Capital. A study of the long-term benefits from community based arts funding, D Williams, 1996
development of community identity/confidence; and the development of community networks.

6.7 A 2001 review of literature on **social gains through community-based arts projects**\(^{65}\) examined evaluations of arts projects as interventions which were community based, carried out over a minimum 6 month period and intended to facilitate social and economic change. Evaluations examined had been clear about the methodology used, and involved either a control group or drew on multiple sources of data eg views of volunteers or other observers as well as participants. Eight robust evaluations were examined, although the authors indicate that they largely “failed to meet the most demanding methodological criteria” eg as to how study populations were sampled, how respondents’ views were measured, how claims of better health were not supported by corroborating evidence. However, the authors indicate that in relative terms, they encountered many well structured and ambitious attempts to map change in highly complex situations, although self reports by participants of perceived changes to relatively ‘intangible’ environmental factors inevitably lack evidential weight when judged by conventional standards.

6.8 Self reports of positive change were common across the majority of studies examined, and these included:

- **personal change** (making new friends, being happier, more creative and confident, reduced sense of isolation, higher numbers taking up training);
- **social change** (more cross-cultural community understanding, stronger sense of locality, bringing different groups together, improvement in organisational skills);
- **economic change** (impact on number of new jobs and people finding work, improved image of community helping inward investment, increased sales of art work and more investment in arts programmes); and
- **educational change** (some evidence of improved school performance).

6.9 The authors conclude that when arts programmes claim that participation will lead to improvements in health, reduction in youth crime, increased employment prospects or economic renewal, they must of course be tested and properly evaluated. However, they also state that “neither the simple measurement of inputs and outputs, nor indeed the reduction of outcomes to quantitative measurements of personal satisfaction or growth are always sufficient to capture the collective, as well as the individual impact, of an artistic experience”. The authors recommend the approach of agreeing with a community the indicators of cultural health, which can be assessed over time, and having quality of life factors chosen and reviewed by the community itself. They also state that useful, as opposed to accurate, evaluation reports need to consider not just the aggregated impacts of arts programmes on individuals, but their effect on the communities in which individuals live, and the extent to which the effect can be sustained.

6.10 Similarly, in a 2003 briefing paper for Arts Council England\(^{66}\), Shaw reviews and cites various outcomes of arts-based awards or projects, and found that the social outcomes related to

---

\(^{65}\) Do community-based arts projects result in social gains? A review of literature, T Newman, K Curtis and J Stephens, 2001

\(^{66}\) What’s art got to do with it? Briefing paper on the role of the arts in neighbourhood renewal, P Shaw, 2003
• **personal development** (being more confident/ambitious, developing knowledge and appreciation of art forms, developing creative abilities and skills, feeling a sense of pride/greater self esteem, and improved social skills);

• **stronger communities** (a sense of pride for local people, a sense of local identity, improved quality of life for local people, better understanding of other cultures, enhanced sense of community belonging, pride in own culture, better understanding of other generations etc);

• **employment and skills** (skills acquired eg team-working, communication, self-motivation, flexibility, creativity etc leading to training and employment opportunities in the creative industries);

• **crime** (people feeling safer in their community, trusting each other more, improvement in academic performance and teaching discipline and teamwork in offenders, and developing an ability to deal with own anger and that of other people);

• **health** (people taking part in arts projects feeling better or healthier and happier, participation lowers blood pressure and reduces stress levels, an increase in well-being and self-esteem).
CHAPTER SEVEN

CULTURE, THE ARTS AND HEALTH

Health

Several rigorous hospital-based studies involving control groups have shown that participation in arts activities, or being placed in a well-designed environment can result in:

- Reduced stress levels
- Improvement in mood
- Distraction from medical problem
- Reduction in medication
- Quicker recovery rates
- Reduction in patients suffering depression
- Less visits to the GP
- Improved communication skills in those with special needs
- Development of new skills by carers and increased confidence
- Managers being aware of the benefits of creativity in a hospital-based setting
- Development of interpersonal skills, new friendships and increased involvement by those participating in the activity, leading to an enhanced sense of well-being

A Swedish robust and longitudinal study demonstrated that regular attendance at cultural events prolongs longevity

Research Issues

Researchers and reviewers have commented that:

- There is a need for a more formal outcome evaluation of the role of arts in health
- There is no consistent method of evaluating impact so that information can be critically amassed and compared
- Evaluators are struggling to find appropriate evaluation methods
- Evaluation of actual health criteria is infrequent
- Few projects explicitly aim to have a direct effect on health
- It is difficult to demonstrate the effects of arts projects on mental health, as most are too small-scale for rigorous statistical analysis
- There is a lack of research looking at the social value and benefit of good architectural design

7.1 The following section reviews evidence found from the evaluation of arts projects and the architectural environment in hospitals, health centres and community-based projects, which have all had an impact on the physical and/or mental health of individuals. Such studies, particularly in hospitals, tend to be rigorous in methodology and health improvements scientifically measured, using control groups for comparison purposes.
7.9 A 2002 paper\textsuperscript{67} reviews evidence that demonstrates specific health outcomes through arts interventions. The authors had already carried out a scoping review to identify published examples of formal outcome evaluations of the role of arts in social inclusion and health, and found ‘very few’. The paper indicates that the use of the arts in promoting social goals is not new, and for the past 4 decades artists and arts organisations have been involved in ‘community arts’, to create greater access to the arts and to reflect a community of interest. However, more recently, a role for the arts in developing social capital, promoting social inclusion and public health has been articulated, thus the growing policy commitment to the arts and social inclusion has led to a demand for more and better evaluation. The paper indicates that although the arts have value irrespective of any presumed health effects, there is a need to examine what evidence exists to support the introduction of such services, and to assist organisations in making decisions about the type of arts initiatives they set up – the paper concludes that “in the health field proper recognition of the health effects of interventions, and resources, are likely only to follow from good evidence that they achieve their intended health and wellbeing outcomes”.

7.10 A recent paper (undated) on the role of arts in health indicated that evaluation of funded projects is essential and should be integrated in all projects. “…the primary value of the arts in healthcare is as a balance to the process of medicalisation, as a humanising and socialising force. Its evaluation should reflect these values”\textsuperscript{68}. A 2001 review on the arts and social exclusion\textsuperscript{69} indicates that one study taking place at the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital, aims to produce a “quantitative analysis and critical evaluation of the effect of the arts on patients, staff and visitors at the hospital”. The research, using scientific methodology such as randomised, double or single blinded controlled groups, aims to measure physiological responses in patients in the presence or absence of visual arts and/or live music. Data collected show that two thirds of the staff, patients and visitors participating in the study felt that live performances significantly helped to take their minds off immediate worries or medical problems, thus diminishing their stress level and improving their mood.

7.11 At an Arts and Health Conference in 2001, Dr R McDonald reported a 2000 study on creativity and music education\textsuperscript{70}. The study showed how structured music workshops for adults with special needs could facilitate developments in musical and communication skills for participants. Workshops, with strict objectives for the participants in terms of social skills and actual musical development were carried out. A control group, also with special needs who had been involved in non-musical group activities, was used for comparison. The study found that participants in the musical workshops not only developed their musical abilities but improvements were seen in a range of communications skills – this was not the case with the control group.

\textsuperscript{67} Arts for health: still searching for the Holy Grail’, C Hamilton and S Hinks, CCPR, University of Glasgow, 2002

\textsuperscript{68} Francois Matarasso, Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts. Comedia, 1997. in paper by Scottish Arts Council, Strategic Development Discussion Paper, Arts and Social Inclusion (unpublished)

\textsuperscript{69} The Arts and Social Exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England, H Jermyn, 2001

\textsuperscript{70} Creativity and Music Education: The Impact of Social Variables, Dr Raymond McDonald, Dept of Psychology, Glasgow Caledonian University, International Journal of Music Education, 2000, 36, 58-68
A study on the effect of ‘Clown Doctors’ on children with respiratory problems at the San Camillo Hospital in Rome, Italy, took place in 2003 and the results reported in a major Italian newspaper. The study was carried out on 43 children aged 6 to 12 years, using a control group for comparison. One group of children was given the intervention in the form of one afternoon visit per week from a Clown Doctor lasting three hours, whereas the other was used as a control, being treated in the traditional way. The children all underwent a variety of physiological tests (blood pressure, temperature, heat beat frequency and respiration) as well as psychological and attitudinal tested based on recognised models.

A final analysis of all the data demonstrated an improvement on all variables for the experimental group compared to the control group, with children who had seen the Clown Doctor recovering faster (on average 2 days earlier than the control group), their fever lasted on average 1.33 days compared to 2.38 days in the control group, and psychological scales measured a reduction in pain and an immediate sense of relaxation following a visit from the Clown Doctors.

Two, much more ‘informal’, evaluations of Clown Doctors in Scotland have recently taken place (2004) – the Evaluation of Clown Doctor Service in Glasgow’s Yorkhill Hospital and Observation of Songlines Activities. Yorkhill assessed questionnaires completed by 24 children, 16 parents and 42 staff on their responses to the Clown Doctors and whether they found them enjoyable and beneficial entertainment. The majority of children felt ‘happy’ after the Clown Doctors’ visit and said they would like to see them again. Parents gave reasons for their child benefiting eg most felt that their child laughed, smiled or cheered up after the visit, whilst 5 reported that the visit took their child’s mind off being in hospital. Staff felt that children benefited from Clown Doctor visits for 3 main reasons – ‘they were cheered up’, the Clown Doctors ‘provide distraction for the children’ and the visits ‘break up a long day’.

The evaluation concluded that overall, the Clown Doctor service is popular and is appreciated by children, parents and staff. Parents and most staff also felt that the service benefited the children and would like the service to continue or expand.

The observation of Songlines Activities (footnote 73) took place in Calareidh House, Edinburgh. The main focus of the observation was the deployment of musical resources and ideas with four children with multiple disabilities in a residential unit. The observer was “highly impressed” with the different ways in which the Clown Doctors used various instruments and their voices, and with the “artistic quality” of the interaction with the children. The observer found the sequence of events and experiences “inspiring” and will continue to discuss further ideas with the Clown Doctors on working with music and children with multiple disabilities.

As stated above, although neither of these ‘evaluations’ are robust in methodology (ie no control groups, no ‘hard’ data collected) they have been included in this section because they demonstrate that the Clown Doctor service is at least an enjoyable service, making children laugh and distracting them from their healthcare environment, and the Italian

---

71 “To all young patients, clowns will bring your temperature down”, translated article obtained from Hearts and Minds, Scotland
73 Observation of Songlines Activities led by Hearts&Minds Clown Doctors Pete Vilk and Maria Oller, James Robertson, Moray House School of Education, March 2004 (unpublished)
evaluation which was rigorous in its research methods, shows that the Clown Doctor service can have a positive, beneficial impact on children’s health and emotional well-being.

The Effect of the Environment in Healthcare

7.18 At the Arts as Medicine Conference in 2001\textsuperscript{74}, research on the impact of the architectural environment on patient recovery was presented. The report indicates that two different types of groups of patients were moved from an old setting into a new healthcare setting, and the extent to which both groups benefited from the moves was measured. All other variables were cut out, so that they still had the same staff, same drug regime and same form of treatment – everything was identical except the environment itself.

- the group of elderly orthopaedic patients required fewer pain-killers (they didn’t ask for them as much in their new setting).
- both groups (the other was psychiatric patients) rated the treatment they were receiving as better in their new setting, even though the treatment was identical to what they had before.
- the average length of stay in the new psychiatric unit was 14% lower than when in the old unit.
- staff morale received a ‘tremendous boost’.

7.19 An example was also provided of how, in a burns unit in Washington specialising in patients suffering from very severe burns, a virtual reality studio was used to ‘treat’ patients, where a sequence of the weather getting cold and dark in the Antarctic, followed by a blizzard, helped patients ‘feel cold’ with actual goose pimples rising on the surface of their skin. It proved the point that there are ways in which the environment can manipulate and assist in patient recovery.

7.20 At a conference in 2002\textsuperscript{75} Ulrich’s paper reviewed scientific research on the influences of gardens and plants in hospitals and other healthcare settings. The paper discussed health-related benefits that patients realised by simply looking at gardens and plants, and addressed other advantages such as lowering the costs of delivering healthcare, and improving staff satisfaction. Ulrich indicates that most healthcare administrators and physicians consider evidence from health outcomes research to provide the most sound and persuasive bases for assessing whether a particular treatment or service is medically beneficial and financially sensible. Ulrich states that

- several studies of both patients and non-patients have ‘consistently shown’ that simply looking at ‘green’ environments compared to ‘built’ scenes lacking nature is significantly more effective in promoting recovery or restoration from stress.
- laboratory and clinical investigations have found that viewing nature settings can produce alleviation from stress within less than 5 minutes, indicated by positive changes in blood pressure, heart activity, muscle tension and brain electrical activity.
- hospital gardens that are well designed, do not only provide calming and pleasant views of nature, but can also reduce stress and improve clinical outcomes through

\textsuperscript{74} The Arts as Medicine, John W Thorpe, South Downs Health NHS Trust, Conference Synopsis, 2001

\textsuperscript{75} Plants for People, International Exhibition, Floriade 2002 – ‘Health Benefits of Gardens in Hospitals, R G Ulrich, PhD
other mechanisms, eg facilitating social support and privacy and providing opportunities to ‘escape’ from the stressful clinical environment.

7.21 Clearly, the environment in a health-care setting can have an impact on improved health, and studies reported or carried out by Ulrich have been rigorous, using control groups in order to compare outcomes, and scientifically measuring the medical benefits.

7.22 A 2003 review of ‘non-technical’ research on the social value and benefits of good architectural design⁷⁶ produced a database resource of information on relevant research studies carried out in Scotland and to a lesser extent, the rest of the UK and Europe. The information can be accessed at http://www.scottisharchitecture.com/education-content/resources/research. The authors found that whilst there was a large amount of interest in the idea of research on the social value and benefits of good design, and much social science research which touched on the built environment, there was “a relative dearth of research tackling such issues directly”. The review found that relatively little socially oriented research in the UK is carried out in departments of architecture and that public participation and research on participation are “neither popular in mainstream architecture nor particularly encouraged by institutional systems in the UK compared to case study countries in Scandinavia and the Netherlands”.

### Community-Based Arts and Health

7.23 A 1999 Review of good practice⁷⁷ in the field of arts and impact on health, indicated that although the number of interventions using the arts to promote health or social objectives increased rapidly throughout the 90’s, there was “no single sound and established set of principles and protocols for evaluating outcomes” and disseminating recommendations for good practice to workers in the field. The research was based not on an evaluation of reported direct improvements to physical health, but on factors that help towards achieving improved health, such as the importance of increased well-being and self-esteem, on participation and social networking that build social capital and enhance people’s health. The research involved a mapping exercise that identified more than 200 projects in the UK that dealt with social or health-related issues through intervention using the arts, and a database was created, detailing the responses of 90 projects to an extensive questionnaire. Interviews were carried out with experts in the field, representatives from funding bodies, the medical profession, arts and health practitioners. Also, 15 projects were identified as representatives of good practice in the field and site visits and case studies were carried out.

- in more than half the projects, it was found that the ‘space’ in which the arts activities took place was crucial in facilitating social interaction and networking, acting as a social ‘drop-in’ centre for people, and ensuring high levels of participation.
- participation was often seen as the key to providing a link between arts activity and health – many projects surveyed highlighted the development of interpersonal skills (72%), opportunities to make new friends (64%) and increased involvement (57%), all of which were perceived to contribute to health.

---

⁷⁷ Art for Health: A review of good practice in community-based arts projects and interventions which impact on health and well-being, SHM Productions Ltd, 1999
• not all models of participation worked well, and the key models that emerged as successful tended to be in a more ‘rigorous’ learning format, where quality was important.
• funding came from many different sources but the picture of dominant funders tended to be fairly uniform, with a mixture of local authorities (53%), charitable trusts (50%) and regional arts boards (43%), and the optimum financial package was seen to be a 3 year programme.
• the majority of projects were run by people from the local area (80%); however, many projects were able to offer only a finite investment in the local area through artist support (49%), job creation (46%) and training (43%).
• it emerged that the most effective partnership working outcomes occurred through the establishment of a clear understanding of the projects’ objectives, to enable a range of agencies to provide tailored support for the target group.

7.24 The review found that evaluation tends not to occur on a formal basis as projects seldom have the money, time or inclination to do so, although the majority of projects had carried out some kind of evaluation. Evaluation on health criteria was infrequent. The research concluded that there is a danger of looking for a ‘prescriptive’ solution which would work for projects, as well as an inclination to ‘bolt on’ arts projects to health initiatives. The authors considered that “to do so would be completely at odds with the nature and value of best practice in arts projects which impact health and well being”. The review made various recommendations on how to sustain, provide and promote arts projects in the future, that an evaluation model for meaningful and rigorous analysis of health benefits did not yet exist, and that future evaluation in the field should include a certain set of evaluative criteria, including congenial atmosphere, organic connection with participants, cross-sectoral working; improved physical/social environment; high profile and high impact artwork; clear mission statement; improved education; and self-evaluation and reflective practice.

7.25 A later review (2002) of evaluation of community-based art for health activity\(^\text{78}\) examined more than 150 documents describing 64 separate projects on community-based art, including 34 in community settings, 13 in community-based health organisations, 5 in care homes and 14 in hospitals. The review concluded that the majority of people working in community-based art for health recognised that it is important to evaluate their activity. However, although many were attempting to evaluate, they are “struggling to find appropriate methods” and the evaluation carried out is therefore frequently inadequate. The review found that many projects did not have clearly stated aims, very few explicitly aimed to have a direct effect on health, and it is inappropriate to assume that ‘art for health’ should use medical models of health and wellbeing, measurement and assessment. The review made several recommendations including:

• that community-based art for health work needs to show its effectiveness in addressing issues around health and wellbeing by improving evaluation practice used;
• that evaluation practice needs to be based on explicit models of health and wellbeing, stating aims and rationale for how these will be achieved and distinguishing between the different aims according to type of work carried out;
• and key agencies should support consensus building on appropriate evaluation models.

\(^{78}\) A review of evaluation in community-based art for health activity in the UK, J Angus, CAHHM, for HDA, 2002
7.26 Research in Sweden\textsuperscript{79} published in 1996 indicated that regular attendance at cultural events prolonged life. Dr. Lars Olov Bygren and co-workers studied 12,675 people, selected as a random sample of the Swedish population. The age range was 16-74 years. They were interviewed first in 1982-83 and were tracked until the beginning of 1992. When all other variables were controlled, the authors found that involvement in cultural events, reading and music were related positively to longevity and health.

\textbf{Arts and Mental Health}

7.27 A 2003 examination of \textit{evaluation and collection of evidence on the arts and mental health}\textsuperscript{80} indicates that a common failure in the evaluation process is to state and agree clear aims when planning for a project, and therefore it is inevitably difficult to measure outcomes. Everitt & Hamilton’s study looked at five community-based art and health projects in various parts of England.

- they found that developing the skills and confidence for people to communicate and share stories was a key part of some projects.
- participation in art and health projects helped people feel ‘part of a team’ and reduced social isolation.
- the study found that some individuals move from being a user, to a volunteer, and then a paid worker.
- the study also claims that participation in community arts projects leads to less visits to GPs, with local surgeries reporting a reduction in visits from patients with depression and a reduction in medication.

7.28 However, Everitt & Hamilton also point out that there is a lack of quantitative evidence of the social, clinical and cost benefits of participation in arts in mental health programmes, and there has been little cost comparison analysis with other interventions. Much qualitative evidence on the benefits of arts projects is available, “where anecdotal evidence from participants is becoming moving and valid testimony”. They state that evidence can be supplied to show that art and health projects are addressing mental health and social participation, and this work can be described, “but it is more difficult to provide evidence that these projects have an effect on mental health, social exclusion and civic participation”. The authors conclude that individually, arts in mental health projects are too small-scale and too modestly resourced “to yield statistical and cost comparative results that can be validated, and that some serious pilot research is required. Good quality measurement tools are required that are sensitive to the process of the work, but robust enough to define outcomes”. The paper points to the need for arts in health, as a collective body, to agree on the common aims and issues, evaluation methods, collating and sharing the results, resulting in the achievement of a “critical mass of information”.

\textsuperscript{79} Lars Olov Bygren, University of Umea, Sweden, 1996, BMJ (1996; 313; pgs 1577-1580).

\textsuperscript{80} ‘Evaluation and Collection of Evidence: an example’, Art, Health and Community, A Study of Five Community Arts in Health Projects, A Everitt and R Hamilton, Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine, 2003
7.29 **Evaluation of a recent cultural project**\(^81\)**(drama)** in a healthcare setting** (reported at 2002 conference) involving a client group of older people age 65+ with mental health problems, showed that 60% of clients experienced a reduction in anxiety levels, carers developed new skills and increased self-confidence and managers became aware of the benefits of creativity, all due to participating in the drama project. The aim of the project was to expand creative opportunities for this group of patients and to promote greater understanding of mental health issues. Evaluation techniques used informed feedback from participants plus hospital anxiety ratings and depression scales. The evaluation also found that the project had been extremely good value for money, working out at £127.50 per 2 hour session for 33 sessions over a period of 10 weeks.

---

\(^{81}\) The Forthview Drama Project, Lesley O’Hare, Arts Co-ordinator, Fife Council in Arts for Medicine conference synopsis
Culture, the Arts and Education

Education is an area where some largescale, robust quantitative and longitudinal research has been carried out. Such research has found:

- There is an association between cultural possessions and culture in family background and educational performance
- There is a link between cultural participation and increased literacy
- Arts and sports schools have achieved a sharper improvement in results than maintained schools, and such schools perform better over time and at a given point in time
- Participation in music and visual arts link to being above average in maths, reading and behaviour
- Teachers consider arts activities have a positive educational impact on 3 out of 4 children and creativity benefits 9 out of 10 children

Participation in arts education can develop –

- Arts knowledge and skills
- Knowledge in social and cultural domains
- Creativity and thinking skills
- Communication and expressive skills
- Personal development

From the same above study however, analysis of a larger, more representative sample found no sound evidence to support the claim that arts boost educational performance at GCSE level

A 10 year longitudinal study found that arts pupils in schools:

- were more satisfied with themselves and confident in their ability
- more likely to plan to continue education after high school
- more likely to attend school regularly
- more likely to win an award for academic achievement

Analysis of the British Cohort Study concluded that:

- Participation in cultural activities at a younger age leads to increased economic capital when older (independent of social background)
- Students with high levels of arts participation perform better than those without (independent of socio-economic status)
- Arts participation makes a more significant difference to students from low SEGs
Sustained involvement in music and theatre highly correlates with success in maths and reading.

A national scheme aimed at encouraging parents to share books with their children from a very young age and lay the foundations for literacy, has increased library use and membership by both parents and children, increased the number of parents who look at books more with their child, and made parents more aware that children can benefit from books at an early age.

Several studies suggest that moving image education:

- promotes cultural diversity, and provides a means by which sensitive issues such as racism, personal identity and culture can be explored; fosters creativity and ‘empowers’ pupils.
- video based groupwork is effective in improving behaviour in disruptive and truanting pupils and helps pupils deal with communication and confidence issues.
- develops technical skills and personal relationships and improves teachers’ relationships with pupils.
- the use of media texts in education builds on one of the first cultural experiences of young children (TV and video) in the UK and can create conditions for literacy learning.

There is international concern about the relative status and value of arts subjects in schools.

**Research Issues**

- More longitudinal studies with larger samples and different age ranges need to be carried out to test the apparent association between creativity and improved academic performance.
- Data gathered from the evaluation of small scale projects cannot be generalised and more largescale research is required to provide better evidence about the effectiveness of moving image education.
- New monitoring and measurement systems need to be devised to capture the evidence of creativity in school’s contribution to education and the economy (and that measuring the contribution of creativity to the economy is a difficult process).

8.1 Arts and education is a theme which covers a multitude of different areas. The following section covers firstly the more ‘generic’ aspect of creativity and its role in education, followed by the relationship between art, culture and educational attainment, and concludes with research carried out on the role of the moving image in education, all of which are relevant to the general role that the arts play in the educational process.

**Creativity**

8.2 Learning and Teaching Scotland explore in their 2001 discussion document a range of issues about the nature and importance of creativity in education, and the ways it can be nurtured in young people. One of the national priorities in education in Scotland is to encourage creativity and ambition, and the document discusses how creativity is seen as a

---

82 Creativity in Education, the ides network, Learning and Teaching Scotland, 2001
key outcome of every young person’s learning, “contributing to education for personal growth, productive working life and for active and responsible citizenship”. It also indicates that all areas of the curriculum and every aspect of school life have the potential to contribute to learning for creativity. The document discusses various aspects of creativity, such as ‘understanding creativity’, ‘nurturing creativity’ and the implications and challenges for teachers, schools and the education system in the years ahead to incorporate creativity in the education system. The document reflects on the growing role of creativity in personal, social and economic life, and how it can be nurtured in young people in Scottish schools. A website, called Creativity OnLine, is available\(^\text{83}\), demonstrating case studies which share good practice from across Scotland on how to develop creativity in the curriculum. Interestingly, the case studies include one on how to evaluate a creative activity - ‘A Device for Evaluating Creative Working and Problem Solving’.

8.3 A 2002 qualitative research project carried out for the National Endowment for Science Technology and the Arts (NESTA)\(^\text{84}\) extensively reviewed published literature on the barriers to the realisation of creative ideas, and carried out in-depth interviews with senior individuals with a variety of perspectives on creativity and innovation (advisors), and 3 focus groups involving a representative sample of practitioners, derived from NESTA’s awardees. The authors stress that the study threw up a number of hypotheses rather than facts, that would require to be qualified through some form of quantitative measurement in order for a robust basis for the formulation of policy to be provided. However, the research revealed some common views on perceived barriers to the realisation of creative ideas which are worth considering in the realm of creative policy. Government organisations, business advisors in the public arts bodies and many quangos came in for substantial criticism, as did the private sector and the education system. The authors indicate how creativity has come to be seen as the “key to economic competitiveness in advanced economies” yet to date there is little evidence to suggest that this is so. There was unanimity between the literature, the advisors and the practitioners in the research that “creativity is present within all of us and that the debate is about how best to unlock it”.

8.4 The research suggested that there are two most important aspects to enhance the creativity inherent in most individuals – the first, that creativity is a progressive, iterative process often undertaken with others and therefore sharing ideas, questioning and exploring in an atmosphere where there is no one single right answer is most likely to boost creativity; the second, that creativity often involves applying knowledge gained in one situation to a new situation, and being exposed to a wide variety of disciplines ideas and people from an early age is more likely to develop individual creativity. In relation to the education system, this was seen to require a major overhaul in resources, attitude and understanding in order to make progress in valuing creativity and becoming a creative society. The literature on education and skills indicated that the drift of UK education policy towards greater inspection, targets and measurement runs counter to an environment likely to produce creative individuals, and that there is little or no recognition given to creative thinking as opposed to the ‘creative’ subjects such as art or design.

8.5 The authors recognise that measuring the contribution of creativity to the economy, is ‘fraught with difficulty’ and that it is important to design new monitoring and measurement systems that “capture the relevant data as a necessary means of providing evidence to justify

\(^{83}\) www.ltscotland.org.uk/creativity

\(^{84}\) Barriers to the realisation of creative ideas, New Media Partners for NESTA, 2002
improved support for creative activities”. They conclude that there is a compelling need to provide politicians with evidence that creativity is of value, that it can take a long time to manifest and provide a return to society, whether it be commercial, cultural, social or environmental.

8.6 Following on from this qualitative research, a quantitative piece of research\(^{85}\) (2002) was carried out for NESTA to quantify the key issues that emerged from the earlier study. The research consisted of a CATI (computer assisted telephone interviewing) survey of 164 NESTA awardees, whose interests and expertise ranged widely across science, technology and the arts. It has to be borne in mind however, that when the sample is broken up into different categories (eg awardees in education, technology etc) the numbers are relatively small and therefore must be treated with caution. The main findings of the research include:

- Creative individuals perceive they are hindered by a significant number of barriers in their quest to bring their ideas to fruition, and most barriers are seen to stem from an insufficient understanding of the creative process, and the value of creativity to culture and the economy;
- The barriers include institutional hurdles such as the education system, and wider societal barriers;
- The interviewees had used a number of different ways (including NESTA) to achieve their objectives, and being prepared to fail was a fundamental factor in their achievements;
- Some of the things that encouraged respondents to achieve their goals were family, peers and job, and mostly their personal motivators tended not to be financial, but linked to their personal desire for success;
- NESTA played an important role in enabling the respondents to succeed, with a ‘risk-taking’ mentality in its approach and the broad support given which goes beyond mere financial backing.

8.5 In 1997 HI Arts launched the Stimulating Creativity programme, a year long pilot project to explore the potential benefits of linking the arts and childcare worlds. Benefits anticipated included the enhancement of children’s social, intellectual, personal and physical development; increased access for communities in rural areas to arts activities, opportunities and resources; improved level of skills in the childcare sector and professional development for artists; and increased employment opportunities for artists in their own communities. The project was evaluated in 1999\(^{86}\), covering a wide variety of case studies, and reported that

- Participation in the project by childcarers had increased their confidence,
- Broken down barriers between non-artists and artists,
- Encouraged partnership, cooperation and community building,
- Increased practical experience of the artists,
- Contributed to life-long learning, reduced isolation, and
- Enhanced the parents’ role in their child’s education as well as exposing children at an early age to creative artistic and creative activities.

\(^{85}\) Barriers to the realisation of creative ideas, ICM Research for NESTA, 2002

\(^{86}\) Stimulating Creativity: a project to link the arts and the voluntary childcare sector, S Arthur and L Thompson, 1999
8.6 In 2000 follow-up research was carried out to ascertain how much influence the project had had, and whether there were any ongoing activities resulting from that influence. The research concluded that the project had had a lasting effect on participants’ confidence and had influenced training within the childcare sector. It had raised awareness and promoted a policy of social inclusion through partnership, training and participation. In particular, it highlighted restrictions in the educational curriculum and lack of resources, especially in music tuition and illustrated the importance of bringing in arts specialists to work with educators and childcarers to ‘develop an ethos’ that would encourage, assist and release individual creativity.

8.7 A 1999 report by the National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education (NACCE) argues that a national strategy for creative and cultural education is essential to the process of ‘unlocking the potential’ of every young person as “Britain’s economic prosperity and social cohesion depend on this’’ (White Paper on Excellence in Schools, 1977). NACCE’s report sets out the challenges for education in promoting creativity and the need for a systemic approach. The report indicates that tensions exist between current priorities and pressures in education and the development of pupils’ creative abilities. The report recognises that outside organisations such as museums, theatres, galleries, orchestras etc, have a great deal to offer the formal education sector and there is a ‘compelling argument’ for closer working partnerships, for which there was much enthusiasm. The report argues for a new balance between learning knowledge and skills and having the freedom to innovate and experiment, and indicates that the priorities for education, including the need to overcome economic and social disadvantage, can be realised through a systematic approach to creative and cultural education.

8.8 Following this report, an international study of the arts, creativity and cultural education in 2000 was carried out on behalf of the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) in England. The report drew on information from 19 education systems. The study found that many countries shared the same beliefs and priorities for the arts, creativity and cultural education, including:

- the recognition that creativity is important and its development in schools should be encouraged;
- that cultural education is an essential component in helping pupils feel included and valued; and
- that arts in the curriculum play a key role in developing creativity as well as cultural understanding.

8.9 The study also showed a new recognition of the key role of creativity in contributing to economic competitiveness and that cultural education is important to preserve diversity and promote inter-cultural understanding. Although the arts were compulsory subjects in all 19 education systems, ten countries whose representatives attended the seminar discussion,

---

87 Stimulating Creativity Follow-up Report; Influence and Developments, L Thompson, 2000
88 All our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education, NACCE, DfEE, 1999
89 The Arts, Creativity and Cultural Education: An International Perspective, C Sharp and J Le Metais, NFER, 2000
90 Australia, Canada, England, France, Germany, Hong Kong, Hungary, Italy, Northern Ireland, Republic of Ireland, Japan, Republic of Korea, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Singapore, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland the the USA
expressed concern about the relative status and value accorded to arts subjects in schools. The different educational systems agreed that amongst the key issues were that more specific aims required to be developed with regard to

- creativity, cultural education and the arts;
- effective ways to embed these aims within the curriculum and its delivery had to be developed;
- they had to monitor how well the aims were being delivered; and
- identify and act upon the factors that assist or impede their realisation.

8.10 Clearly, then, the education systems recognise the role of evaluation, which would identify the aims of the subject areas at the beginning and monitor and evaluate whether the aims are achieved, and learn from the process.

8.11 Following on from this work, the QCA investigated how schools can promote pupils’ creativity through the national curriculum, a project which is ongoing and which has developed a website with guidance and information on promoting creativity in schools 91. The QCA worked with 120 teachers in England to investigate how they could develop pupils’ creativity through their existing schemes of work and lesson plans. The definition of creativity was adopted from the NACCE report, falling into the categories of imagination and purpose, originality, and value. Teachers in the participating schools chose lessons they thought had potential for promoting pupils’ creativity and then adjusted their planning to maximise this potential, recording what happened and collecting evidence of pupils’ creativity. Based on these findings, QCA developed information sheets and examples – Creativity: Find it, promote it – and sent these to 1000 teachers, headteachers, advisers, teacher educators and others who work with schools, asking them to complete a questionnaire with their views on the material.

8.12 In the light of feedback, the materials were refined, and a website developed. QCA indicate that gradually, as the project progressed, teachers began to realise that “being creative has as much to do with the quality of thought taking place and the process or journey as with what is ultimately produced”, and that creativity did not happen in a vacuum but that pupils needed subject-specific knowledge and skills for creativity to flourish. Many of the teachers involved believed that if creative thinking and behaviour are to become part of pupils’ school life, as concepts they must be valued by the schools as a whole. The website set up as part of this project invites contributions from teachers of examples of how creativity in the classroom and in the schools has been promoted, and the website therefore makes available practical examples on how to promote pupils’ creative thinking and behaviour.

### The relationship between culture, the arts and educational attainment

8.13 A recent review carried out by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport 92 reviewed available evidence on the impact of cultural/creative and sporting activities on wider social and economic issues such as education, employment, crime and health. The

---

91 National Curriculum in Action, [www.ncaction.org.uk/creativity/about.htm](http://www.ncaction.org.uk/creativity/about.htm)

92 Evidence on Cultural/Creative/Sporting Effects’, Economics Branch, Analytical Services Division, DCMS, 2000 (unpublished)
paper indicates that the evidence of impact on education achievement is ‘relatively clear’. The Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) 2000\(^{93}\) project focused on 15 year olds in education in leading industrialised countries. PISA found that cultural possessions in the family home are closely related to literacy, and across the countries, reading performance increased by 27 points for each one unit increase in the cultural possession index (for the UK alone the increase was 29 points). The study found that participation in cultural activities explained 5.7% variation in reading performance across the countries, with a rise of 18 literacy points for each unit increase in the participation index (for the UK there was a 70 point difference between average literacy performance of students in the bottom national quarter of cultural participation and those in the top). A one unit rise in cultural participation is associated with an increased literacy score of over 29 points. The fact that the effects are even higher in reading than in mathematical and scientific literacy, “emphasises that there is education benefit in home-based access to literature and other cultural possessions”. And finally, analysis shows that the more frequently ‘cultural communication’ was reported, the higher the literacy scores, with cultural communication showing on average a stronger relationship with reading scores than ‘social’ communication.

8.14 A 2001\(^{94}\) report on specialist schools since 1995 showed that the increase in GCSE/GNVQ points scores was fastest in Arts schools and Sports schools, although results for 2001 showed that pupils at the Arts Colleges had very similar average attainment to those of all maintained schools, while pupils at Sports Colleges had slightly lower attainment. Nevertheless, both Arts and Sports Colleges achieved a sharper improvement in results between 2000 and 2001 than all other maintained schools. A 2001/2002 study\(^{95}\) on the UK’s specialist schools (ie arts, sports, language and technology) found that such schools perform relatively better than non-specialist schools, both over time and at a given point in time.

8.15 Matarasso, in his 1997 research report\(^{96}\) cites research studies that have demonstrated the educational benefits of arts participation. For example, in a 1996 study in the USA, it was noted that there were improvements in the school performance of 5-7 year olds who participated in a music and visual art curriculum –

- 75% were at, or above, grade level in mathematics, compared to 55% in control groups; progress was also made in reading and behaviour, and this level was sustained the following year.

8.16 Matarasso also cites the example of ‘Learning by Art’:Portsmouth Schools, where in 1997 a season of arts activities in the city’s schools was promoted by the City Council. This promotion involved over 30 schools from infants to 6\(^{th}\) form, and some 20 artists or performance groups. The core of the programme was a series of participatory activities aimed at creating new work (eg a mural for a Nature Reserve). A random sample of 88 pupils was drawn and teachers were asked to consider progress made in the areas of developing language skills, physical co-ordination, observation skill, creativity and imagination and social skills development for these pupils.

\(^{93}\) Knowledge and Skills for Life, First Results from PISA 2000, OECD in ‘Evidence on Cultural/Creative/Sporting Effects’, Economics Branch, Analytical Services Division, DCMS, 2000 (unpublished)

\(^{94}\) Specialist Schools: An Evaluation of Progress’, Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Schools ,2001

\(^{95}\) ‘Educational Outcomes and Value Added Analysis of Specialist Schools for the year 2000, Jesson and Taylor, 2001 and ‘ Value Added and the Benefits of Specialism’, 2002

\(^{96}\) Use or Ornament? The social impact of participation in the arts, Francois Matarasso, Comedia, 1997
teachers were found to consider that the arts activities had a positive educational impact on most children (in at least 3 out of 4), and in the area of creativity and imagination, 9 out of 10 children were viewed as having benefited.

8.17 The 2000 DCMS report on cultural/creative/sporting effects cites a ‘high quality small scale’ in-depth evaluation exercise which examined the impact of the ‘Transformation’ project which involved staff from the National Theatre working with pupils in a small number of primary schools in Tower Hamlets. The evaluation matched two of the schools taking part with two control schools and assessed progress between the end of 1999 and the summer of 2001. Around 100 pupils were covered, and a self-concept questionnaire revealed that pupils in the Transformation schools had significantly more positive attitudes about themselves. The DCMS report concludes that although such small scale exercises should be treated with caution, “the method used was robust”.

8.18 In the field of arts education, a 3 year longitudinal study was undertaken in English and Welsh secondary schools in 1997, and reported in 2000. The study was welcomed by Professor Eric Bolton CB, Chairman of The Arts Matter Steering Group, as “an authoritatively objective voice, in a sphere of interest and activity frequently driven by conviction and passion and ruled by anecdote”. The study involved 5 in-depth case studies of arts education in secondary schools and included annual interviews with two cohorts of pupils, with school managers, art teachers, observation of art lessons, and analysis of information on a total of 27,607 pupils from 152 schools in 3 cohorts of Year 11 pupils. Analysis of questionnaires completed by 2,269 year 11 pupils in 22 schools also took place, along with related information on their GCSE results, prior attainment scores and key stage 3 national test results. A ‘typology’ model was developed in light of pupils’ accounts of the learning outcomes derived from arts-related provision. The model identified two broad types of arts education outcomes: effects on pupils and effects on others.

8.19 Also, the research does not suggest that the progress from intrinsic to extrinsic outcomes happens in a linear fashion, but that the outcomes result from a “complex series of cyclical interactions.….depending on the type of provision experienced”.

8.20 A 2001 longitudinal evaluation on the impact of the Study Support programme of out-of-school learning for secondary school students, found that non-examined leisure activities including sport, music and drama were found to have an effect on academic

---

attainment as well as on attitudes and attendance, and all types of study support had indirect effects on motivation and self-esteem. Shaw\(^99\) quotes a 10 year study focusing on 120 community based organisations in 34 locations, which suggested a link between arts participation and academic achievement. The initiatives were located in impoverished neighbourhoods and fell into an athletic-academic, community services or arts-based category. A sample of 300 young users took part in the longitudinal survey and the results were compared with those of a national sample of students.

- the study found that participants in non-school hours arts programmes were more likely than students in the national sample to report feeling satisfied with themselves, more confident about their ability and planned to continue education after high school. They were also 3 times more likely to win an award for school attendance and twice as likely to win an award for academic achievement.

8.21 In Robson’s 2003 paper\(^{100}\) on youth and cultural capital, she uses a unique data set in the analyses, using data from a British birth cohort from which data were collected at several points in their lives. Reports of cultural capital participation during youth were collected from the respondents during a 4 day period in which they kept activity diaries. Robson indicates that the data allow for a direct assessment of cultural capital participation in youth and an examination of outcomes several years later. The British Cohort Study collected data from the full cohort (17,196 births and families in the UK from 1970) at ages 5, 10, 16, 26 and 29. Robson’s research looks specifically at cohort members at ages 16 and 29 years. The final sample covered about 5,000 cases. Definitions of cultural capital participation were - taking an evening class, going to museums, zoos or exhibitions, going to a library, going to the theatre, going to a concert or opera, reading books, participating in artistic or music-related activities and writing.

- four of the eight cultural leisure activities had a statistically significant and positive effect on economic capital at age 29 independent of the effect of control variables (eg family background) – these were participation in artistic or music-related leisure, having attended theatre, reading for pleasure and writing for leisure.
- similarly, having participated in art and music-related leisure, taking an evening course, reading for pleasure, going to the library and writing at age 16 all increased the odds of having a degree at age 29, and suggested that there is more to that relationship than “a simple predisposition to academic achievement”.

8.22 Robson indicates that given that these leisure activities during such a restricted period at age 16 contributed to adult outcomes, independent of the effects of controlled variables, is “evidence of the effect of cultural investment over time on adult economic and social capital”.

8.23 The aim of the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) is to serve students by advancing the role of the arts in K-12 public education. CAPE catalyses and supports school improvement through the creation of partnerships that integrate the arts into

\(^{99}\) The Arts and Neighbourhood Renewal, A literature review to inform the work of PAT 10 (unpublished), P Shaw, 1999

the overall educational programme of Chicago public schools. A longitudinal programme evaluation of the CAPE initiative was carried out and reported in 2000.\textsuperscript{101}

- analysis of the Department of Education’s database of 25,000 students demonstrated that students with high levels of arts participation outperform ‘arts poor’ students by almost every measure, even when taking socio-economic status into account.
- the analysis also demonstrated that arts participation makes a more significant difference to students from low-income backgrounds than for high-income students.
- the research also found clear evidence that sustained involvement in particular art forms (music and theatre) are highly correlated with success in mathematics and reading.
- CAPE had developed innovative arts-integrated curricula in 14 high poverty schools and evaluation showed that there had been an ‘inspiring turnaround’ of this district.
- when schools across Chicago are compared to arts-poor schools in the same neighbourhoods, the CAPE schools advanced even more quickly and have now developed a significant gap in achievement along many dimensions.

8.24 The evaluation also indicates that research over 10 years studying dozens of after-school programmes for disadvantaged youth, found that

- the youth in all these programmes were doing better in school and in their personal lives than were non-participant young people from the same socio-economic categories.
- however, the youth in the arts-programmes were found to be doing best, and researchers found that characteristics particular to the arts made those programmes more effective and they had a greater impact on young lives.
- other studies found evidence that learning in the arts has significant effects on learning in other domains, and that student achievement is heightened in an environment with high quality arts education and a school ethos supporting of active and creative learning.

8.25 The initiative ‘Bookstart’\textsuperscript{102} is a UK scheme that provides a pack to parents/carers of babies under a year old that includes free books, advice on sharing books information about library facilities and an invitation or ticket to join. An evaluation of the scheme in 2002 in Enfield, where 4,000 packs were issued, covered almost 400 two year old children who had been taking part in the scheme. Findings were obtained from completed questionnaires by parents/carers, which were heavily weighted towards those living in the more affluent area of the borough (70%). Main findings were that

- 66% of parents said that they looked at books everyday with their child, and 150 parents (37%) felt they looked at books more with their child as a result of Bookstart.
- more than half of the respondents agreed that they were more aware of the fact that children can enjoy and benefit from books at an early age.
- across the borough of Enfield as a whole, 32% of children and parents had joined the library as a result of receiving the Bookstart pack, ranging from 10% in more deprived areas to 43% in more affluent areas.

\textsuperscript{101}This evaluation and others in ‘Champions of Change: The Impact of Arts on Learning’, E B Fiske (ed) 2000
• the percentage of those who said they never use the library dropped significantly from half the sample of parents of babies in the previous survey, to between 7-20% of parents of 2 year olds.

8.26 As one of the main aims of Bookstart is to lay the foundations for literacy by encouraging parents to share books with their children from a very early age, it clearly has had an impact on membership of libraries and reading activity between parent and child. It is of course too early to say whether Bookstart will have a longer term impact, but it is planned that an annual survey will take place to monitor development of the children and evaluate the longer term impact of the scheme.

Moving Image Art and Education

8.27 Young People Speak Out (YPSO) is an outreach service that works in partnership with local community centres and schools. An 2003 evaluation on the YPSO video-based groupwork service to schools was carried out to underpin applications for continued funding with evidence of its success. Methods used consisted of a combination of questionnaires to 34 participating schools, interviews with 20 young people who had previously participated and some of their parents, observation and documentary analysis. The video-based work targeted young people who were disaffected or having difficulties, and involved groupwork techniques and also the added value of the production of a video by the group, culminating in the showing of the finished film in their schools and at a formal occasion in the Edinburgh Filmhouse.

• the evaluation concluded that the video-based groupwork is effective in improving behaviour in disruptive and truanting pupils, and is one kind of useful intervention with young people facing and presenting difficulties in secondary school.
• many young people interviewed said they felt there had been some positive change in their lives because of being in a YPSO group, and those who had now left school reflected that the project had helped them deal with issues such as communication and confidence.
• the most positive aspects reported were often linked to development of technical skills and to personal relationships.
• schools rated the programme as very good/good for the vast majority of pupils, and teachers indicated that taking part in the project had improved their relationships with pupils.

8.28 The authors indicate that they make no claims to the ‘generalisability’ of the data but that the evaluation components provide robust data and qualitative insights on the effectiveness of school based projects.

8.29 In a 1999 report which proposed consistent standards of UK-wide moving image education accessible to everyone, the authors called for research to provide better evidence about the effectiveness of moving image education. The report cites the findings of the British Film Institute’s 1998 Audit of Media in English, revealing that

103 Young People Speak Out Video work in schools, University of Edinburgh School of Education, June 2003
104 Making Movies Matter – Report of the Film Education Working Group, British Film Institute, 1999
although 91% of the sample of 718 secondary English teachers in England and Wales were enthusiastic about media teaching, and 43% claimed to devote between 10% and 25% of curriculum time to it, most of this work was likely to relate to print texts.

almost half the respondents wanted the curricular requirement clarified and 75% wanted more training in how to teach it.

also, a third of the sample did not feel confident in assessing pupils' media learning.

8.30 The following year, the British Film Institute published a secondary teachers’ guide to using film and television as an educational tool – ‘Moving Images in the Classroom’, 2000.

8.31 A British Film Institute 2003 publication indicates how television and video are among the first cultural experiences of most children in the UK in the 21st century and that “it makes sense for schools to capitalise” on the knowledge and enthusiasm gained from these activities. The report offers five key arguments, backed by academic research, which make the case for building moving image education in to the learning experiences of all three to eleven year olds – the necessity for active learning; the power of linking home and school; deepening understanding of texts; creativity and the moving image; and understanding of culture and society. The report cites how research and practice demonstrate that using media texts can motivate children and create the necessary conditions for engagement with literacy learning. Children who are able to draw on connections and parallels between film and print “are more likely to become confident and critical readers across different media, including print”.

a case study demonstrated that a teacher with a class of 8-9 year olds considered that the effect that using moving image texts had on the children’s writing was clear, and that there was more sustained individual writing, a greater use of paragraphing and a ‘distinct visuality’ to their work – the children picked up detail from the film and translated it into their writing.

8.32 The report indicates that literacy underpins the whole curriculum, and the more literate children are, the more effectively they will access learning in all curriculum areas. The report argues that moving image literacy and print literacy are closely related, and that children’s access to the whole curriculum will be enhanced if their critical and creative skills with moving image media are well-developed.

8.33 In January 2003 Learning and Teaching Scotland, in association with Scottish Screen, commissioned research into the role of moving image in education in Scottish schools, particularly in the primary sector. A detailed review and analysis of existing commercial and academic research was undertaken, and a qualitative approach using 14 in-depth interviews with teachers, head teachers, council officers and industry representatives resulted in the report making various recommendations on how to incorporate moving image education in schools. The report cites an initiative in Maine, in the US, to provide the majority of school children with laptops, where the results “have produced a marked improvement in achievement and a corresponding decline in discipline problems and absenteeism”.

105 “Look Again”, BFI, 2003
106 Pockets of Potential: Moving Image Education in Scottish Schools, D Fie Foe and Metadigita, 2003
• interviews with teachers showed that they believed that moving image education empowers pupils and fosters creativity, because it accommodates different learning and teaching styles.
• film was also seen as a particularly powerful technique to encourage discussion of more sensitive topics such as racism or areas of personal development such as identity and culture.

8.34 The report indicates that anecdotal evidence provided by teachers is borne out by academic research, including studies that showed that when students become actively involved in technology productions they

• develop learning skills, communication skills and visual analysis skills.
• that use of computers and a visually rich software programme in a constructivist classroom environment showed an increase in volume and linguistic complexity in children’s writing skills.
• that feature films are effective instructional tools, particularly when teaching concepts of human development to students.

8.35 Interestingly, as part of the Shetland Innovation in Languages Project, promoted by the Scottish Executive Education Dept, Shetland Island Council are intending to run a short season of French and German films for staff and pupils in conjunction with the Shetland Film Club. This project is intended to support the more traditional methods of learning and teaching of modern languages. The films will be shown in the evenings and it is hoped that a guest speaker will attend each one, give a presentation and lead discussion in the foreign language concerned. The project aims to develop linguistic ability in Modern Languages staff; provide an activity which combines socialisation with real use of language; give pupils the opportunity to explore films in the language which they are studying; introduce pupils to aspects of the culture of the relevant country through the guest speakers and the subsequent discussions; and allow pupils and staff to take part in real discussion in the language. An evaluation will be undertaken by the local authority once it has completed.

### Employment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture, the arts and Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>There is very little evidence available which demonstrates the impact of participation in arts or cultural activities on the creation of jobs or finding employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research that has been carried out suggests that the arts develop skills in pupils that are transferable to employment, with arts believed to develop teamwork and personal confidence in the individual; and that due to its flexible, open and inclusive approach, a small-scale arts and regeneration projects is now a community business and one of the largest employers in the region</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8.36 The appears to be little evidence on the impact of participation in cultural or art activities and individuals’ employment. There is however evidence to suggest that participating in the arts can develop skills that are useable in the world of employment.
8.37 The DCMS report on evidence of cultural effects cites a ‘small but well specified study’\textsuperscript{107} which found that most employers and employees interviewed confirmed the views of teachers and pupils that the arts develop skills in pupils that are transferable to future employment. Notably, it was the transferable skills developed by the arts which were believed to enhance employability, rather than specific arts-based skills. Involvement in both drama and music was seen by the majority of employers to develop more ‘rounded’ people, and arts activities were also seen to develop teamwork and personal confidence. The Learning through Culture Report\textsuperscript{108} identified three examples where the impact of specific programmes has led to the creation of education posts or funding for freelance educators to ensure the sustainability of the benefits of the museum’s programmes. The report stresses however that it is important to continue monitoring where and why sustainability is maintained in programmes.

8.38 Shaw’s 2003 paper\textsuperscript{109} cites the example of the Arts Factory in the Rhondda Valley, which was initially formed as a small-scale arts and regeneration project and is now an award-winning community business, providing training and employment opportunities for local people. The Arts Factory is now one of the largest employers in the region, and Shaw indicates that “the open door policy, the team work approach, the integration of deaf and disabled and non-disabled people and the creative nature of the jobs on offer have combined to create a strong sense of local identify for the project and a commitment to its continued success”.

\textsuperscript{107} Arts Education in Secondary Schools: Effects and Effectiveness, Harland et al, 2000
\textsuperscript{108} Learning through culture. The DfES Museums and Galleries Education Programme: a guide to good practice, A Clarke et al, 2002
\textsuperscript{109} What’s art got to do with it? Briefing paper on the role of the arts in neighbourhood renewal, for Arts Council England, P Shaw, 2003
CHAPTER NINE

ECONOMIC IMPACT OF CULTURE AND THE ARTS

Definition of Economic Impact

9.1 Any event, whether it is cultural or sporting, a tourist attraction or the establishment of a new building or centre, can have an economic impact on the local and wider economy. Most commonly, this is measured in terms of additional employment or additional expenditure generated.

9.2 The economic impact in terms of increasing output, expenditure or employment in a given target area is usually assessed in terms of its ‘additionality’ – its net, rather than gross, impact after having made allowances for what would have happened in the absence of the intervention.

9.3 Additionality is calculated with consideration of:

- ‘leakage’ – this benefits those outside of the spatial area or group which the intervention is intended to benefit
- ‘deadweight’ – this refers to outcomes which would have occurred without the intervention
- ‘displacement’ and ‘substitution’ – these measure the extent to which the benefits of a project are offset by reductions of output or employment elsewhere

9.4 To identify the economic impact of an event or intervention, an economic appraisal should be carried out, which takes into account all costs and benefits resulting from the event, such as economic, social, environmental or regeneration impacts.

Economic Impact of the Arts and Culture

Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre
Evaluation of the DCA considered immediate, cumulative and potential economic impact of the centre; the evaluation demonstrated a positive economic impact that extends beyond the boundaries of Dundee; comparison with other major arts centres in the UK cannot be carried out, as this was the first economic impact evaluation of its kind; however, the evaluation concluded that the DCA provides very good value for money when compared with other economic development projects in other sectors; it has had a major impact on business development in Dundee and has created a successful cultural sector in the city

London’s West End Theatre
The ‘financial survey model’ was used to analyse data from over 50 theatres; theatre in London’s West End is a major economic activity and generates private-sector expenditure and jobs in London and indirectly elsewhere in the UK

Arts, culture and visitor attractions
The longterm impact of 50 Capital Projects, Festivals and Award Scheme (Millennium Commission) is the creation of 13,300 FTE employment. The Star Trek Exhibition in Edinburgh generated an economic impact of over 250K and 21 FTE jobs in Edinburgh, almost £300K and 25 FTE jobs in Lothian and over £400K and 59 FTE jobs in Scotland
Cultural Sector in the UK – key data 1998-99
647,000 people have their main job in the cultural sector, representing 2.4% of employment in main jobs in the UK; there are 70 million registered or regular users of national libraries; there are 2.4 million users of higher education libraries and 34.4 million users of public libraries; there are between 80-114 million visits to museums and galleries

The Arts in the Highlands and Islands
The arts in the H & I area support more than 1,600 direct f/t equivalent jobs – 18% is attributable to venues and galleries, 27% to work by individual artists, 23% to arts-related teachers and tutors, 10% to tourist visitors, 11% to the creative content industry and 11% to other impacts

Cultural Industries in Yorkshire and the Humber
Music and combined arts are the largest sub-sectors; turnover of cultural industries in the area is £3.8 billion (3.3% of the combined turnover of all enterprises in the region); information provided from the evaluation is consistent, systematic and valid and will assist in developing effective regional policy in the area; indications that the projects had an impact on the regeneration of surrounding areas

Arts and cultural industries in Wales
Direct and indirect economic contributions of the industries calculated using an input-output model of the Welsh economy; the Welsh arts and cultural industry provides employment for 28,600 people (2.6% of the Welsh economy); an output impact of £1.6m is generated by libraries, museums and heritage

9.5 The following section provides several recent examples of economic evaluations and their findings that have been carried out in a variety of cultural sectors, including a major arts centre in Dundee, London theatre, cultural industries in an English region and the general cultural sector of museums, archives, libraries and galleries. The Chapter does not cover a comprehensive sweep of economic evaluations, but describes examples where the economic impact of the sector is shown, both in the local area and beyond. Criticisms of conventional economic impact analyses are also described, although the economic impact evaluations cited in this Review appear to have used fairly rigorous methodology in their analysis.

Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre
9.6 For the first time in Scotland, an economic impact evaluation of a newly established major arts centre was carried out and reported in 2003. The evaluation of Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre considered detailed quantifiable financial information available, and supplemented this with more qualitative information from staff, senior representatives of supporting organisations, local institutions and businesses. Almost 200 interviews were also carried out with arts trainees, print studio users, exhibitors, cinema users and a sample of late summer exhibition visitors to gauge the social impact of the arts centre on users and visitors.

9.7 The Dundee Contemporary Arts centre (DCA) opened early 1999. Establishment of the DCA involved considerable funding from the Scottish Arts Council National Lottery Fund (£5.4m) and from Scottish Enterprise Tayside, Dundee City Council, European Regional Development Fund and University of Dundee. The economic impact evaluation

focused on the financial year 2001-2002 and also considered cumulative impacts until 2003, and potential future impacts. The new centre developed in partnership with the Council, University of Dundee and Dundee Contemporary Arts (a newly formed company). It was conceived as a unique facility within the UK with galleries, cinema, facilities for artists and a Visual Research Centre for academic researchers. Economic findings were compared to original expectations and impacts were assessed net of the previous cinema, printmaking and community arts facilities that were absorbed into the new Centre.

9.8 Findings clearly demonstrated a positive economic impact that extended beyond the boundaries of Dundee.

- analysis showed that the DCA’s payroll of £561,507 generated a net impact of an additional £3,620,000 in the Tayside economy – a leverage ratio of almost 6.5 to 1.
- the evaluation estimated that 258 full time equivalent jobs had been generated, compared with the original estimate of 58, and business development accounted for approximately two-thirds of all additional jobs generated.
- several local craft producers benefited from the shop, with 39.5% of its turnover being craftwork.
- the café bar significantly exceeded expectations by a huge margin, and provided turnover-based loyalties of over £120,000 in 2001/2 compared to the original projection of £9,000.
- the multifunctionality of the DCA appeared to be key to its economic success.

9.9 Qualitative research examined the role of DCA as a cultural and social creative hub and networking venue; the development of a centre of international excellence in exhibitions and cinema; a boost in confidence to Dundee; the role of DCA in the development of a ‘cultural sector’ in the area; and its synergy with Dundee’s two universities and colleges. The research found that

- exhibition visitors had exceeded the original target in the first two years, but were 24% below in the third, this drop in attendance being partly attributable to a reduction in funds since the centre first opened for mounting and displaying exhibitions.
- visits to the Visual Research Centre also dropped by the third year, but this resource continued to be well used by researchers and students in term-time.
- Tayside residents were 60% of all visitors.
- cinema attendees continued to exceed original expectations, and community and educational work played a significant role in activities, with young people in particular benefiting from opportunities to participate.
- print studio usage was particularly important in helping more than 30 artists to become established professionally.
- Duncan of Jordanstone art college in Dundee and other university and college students have had value added to their courses by using the VCR facilities and attending international exhibitions and quality films.

9.10 As this was the first economic impact evaluation of its kind of a major arts centre it could not be compared to other arts centres in the UK. However, overall the evaluation concluded that the establishment of the DCA provided very good value for money when compared with other economic development projects in other sectors, and that lessons could be learned by other Scottish cities/towns on reasons for its success and its use of a partnership
approach in identifying culture as a potential source of urban regeneration. A further point made by the evaluation was that often studies are not realistic in assessing the economic impact of arts facilities and events, as this usually complements artistic and social impact rather than being the prime purpose of public expenditure. However, the DCA is unusual in having had a major impact on the way business has developed in Dundee. The evaluation found that the cumulative impact should continue, provided Dundee retains and improves the infrastructure to support the DCA now that a successful cultural sector has been established.

**West End Theatre in London**

9.11 The main purpose of a 1998 study of the economic impact of London theatre\(^{111}\) was to provide a detailed and impartial estimate of the impact West End theatre makes on both London and UK economies. The study collated data from over 50 theatres, and involved a survey of audiences, and used a ‘financial survey model’ to analyse the data gathered. Main findings were that

- the economic impact of West End Theatre on the UK economy in 1997 was estimated at £1,075 million;
- West End theatregoers spent £433 million on restaurants, hotels, transport and merchandise;
- 41,000 jobs depend on West End theatre, 27,000 directly and 14,000 indirectly; and
- the West End is one of the UK’s biggest tourist and leisure attractions, with more theatres, shows and larger audiences than Broadway.

9.12 The study concluded that theatre in London’s West End is a major economic activity and generates private-sector expenditure and jobs in London and indirectly elsewhere in the UK. Reeves’ review assesses this study as “high-quality, astute research with appropriate and robust methodology that concludes based on evidence”. However, she also points out certain limitations eg lack of sampling information and details of response rates, which make it difficult to assess the representativeness of estimates.

**Arts in the Highlands and Islands**

9.13 A 2001 report\(^{112}\) examined both the economic and social impact of the arts in the Highlands and Islands. This was a comprehensive review, providing quantitative and qualitative data for the year 1999-2000 and compared with the findings of a similar study carried out 10 years previously. The authors drew from information from secondary sources such as reports on arts activities and impact in the Highlands and Islands, information from the Scottish Arts Council and Local Enterprise Companies, a telephone survey of venues, promoters, organisations, groups and individuals in the region, interviews with galleries, touring companies and record labels, and indepth case studies. Activities in relation to museums and libraries were excluded, as these related to ‘culture’ more than the arts, and the

---


\(^{112}\) The Economic and Social Impact of the Arts in the Highlands and Islands, Independent Northern Consultants, 2001
crafts and creative industries that do not fall within the remit of the SAC were excluded as these had been covered by other studies.

9.14 Principal economic impacts found included:

- the arts support more than 1,600 direct full-time equivalent jobs, equating to 2,500 full-time equivalent jobs (direct, indirect and induced), including multiplier effects.
- 18% of this total is attributable to venues and galleries, 27% to work by individual arts, 23% to arts-related teachers and tutors.
- 10% to the spending of tourist visitors to events and exhibitions other than at the venue, 11% to the creative content industry and 11% to other impacts.
- the increase since 1991 was estimated at around 33% in full time equivalent jobs.
- the study identified 250% more attendances at events and exhibitions than the 1991 study, and 130% more box office income. Much of the increase was due to a wider coverage by the new study, but here had clearly been real increases over the past 10 years in visits to galleries (due to increased number of galleries), attendances at concerts of traditional music, classical music audiences, the number of overall attendances at festivals, and the total number and proportion of tourists visiting both exhibitions and events.

9.15 The study found that relatively few artists resident in the Highlands and Islands are full-time, whose families tend to be supported by income from other work that pays more than art work. However, artists who become full-time or wish to pursue a career in the arts, tend to leave the area (especially in drama, dance and certain forms of music), which is beneficial for the individual artist but not to the local economic and social impact on the community. The study examined economic impact by area, and where impacts were low, these areas tended to lack promoters and suitable venues – where venues had been developed in local areas, impacts had increased, due to both the increased capacity to hold events, and to the new projects generated by such a local base.

9.16 Included in the recommendations to increase economic and social impact, the authors suggest that “a clear and accepted format for self-evaluation and independent evaluation of arts organisations and events in terms of social and economic impact” should be introduced as an “integral part of public sector financial support”. They also suggest that increased collaborations within the arts sector with other creative industries and the tourism industry will assist in developing innovative projects that will attract support funding and allow larger projects to take place; and that the arts community should develop new audiences through programming that will attract young people, people with an interest in popular art and entertainment, elderly people, and initiatives that address social exclusion.

9.17 A further high quality report in 2000, based on a transparent and robust methodology\textsuperscript{113} analysed the economic impact of cultural industries in Yorkshire and the Humber. The study analysed data from a representative sample of 3,075 enterprises in the area. Amongst its key findings were that music and combined arts are the largest sub-sectors, and the turnover of cultural industries, excluding education and training, is £3.8 billion –

\textsuperscript{113} Cultural Industries Key Data, The Cultural Industries in Yorkshire and the Humber, B Hall, 2000
3.3% of the combined turnover of all enterprises in the region. Reeves’ concludes that the report makes available for the first time consistent, systematic and verifiable information to assist in developing effective regional policy in the area.

**Museums, Archives, Libraries and Galleries**

9.18 Wavell et al’s review in 2002 (*Footnote 30*) on available evidence of economic the impact of museums, archives and libraries covered several studies on **the economic impact of arts, culture and visitor attractions**. In 2001 an economic impact assessment of Millennium Commission projects was carried out\(^{114}\). The research was based on a questionnaire survey of almost 50 Capital Projects, Festivals and Award Schemes, with additional interviews with key project representatives. The study estimated the combined short-term and long-term impacts of the projects to be the creation of 13,300 full time equivalent jobs. There was also evidence suggesting that the projects had had an impact on the regeneration of surrounding areas, although this was not measured directly.

9.19 In 1998 the economic impact of the arts and cultural industries in Wales was carried out\(^{115}\). Data were collected from almost 190 individuals, firms and organisations in the arts and cultural industries by way of a questionnaire survey, and in addition over 70 indepth interviews were conducted. The direct and indirect economic contributions of the industries were calculated within an input-output model of the Welsh economy. The study established that the Welsh arts and cultural industry provides employment for 28,600 people (2.6% of the workforce in Wales) and supports an estimated 6,674 jobs in other Welsh industries. The impact of particular sectors was looked at separately, and the study estimated that a final output impact of £1.6m was generated by the libraries, museums and heritage sector.

9.20 In 2001 Selwood\(^{116}\) presented a number of key findings from the largest survey of cultural sector organisations 1998-99 ever undertaken in the UK, including 647,000 people had their main job in the cultural sector, representing 2.4% of total employment in main jobs in the UK; there were 70 million registered or regular users of national libraries, 2.4 million of higher education libraries and 34.4 million of public libraries; and there were between 80-114 million visits to museums and galleries. However, Selwood points out that beyond such key facts, data in the cultural sector are often “incomplete, inaccurate or unavailable”, and that government policy and initiatives are rarely based on an accurate picture of the sector.

9.21 The most recent economic evaluation of an exhibition held in Edinburgh is the **economic impact assessment of the Star Trek exhibition in 1995**\(^{117}\). Random sampling of 535 visitors (representing a total of 1,457 people in total) was conducted over 13 interviewing days. School parties were excluded from the survey. The survey found that

- visitors were likely to be male and aged between 12-44 years old, in contrast to the previous exhibition (Gold of the Pharaohs) which attracted a predominantly female and older audience.

---

\(^{114}\) ‘Economic Impact Assessment of the Millennium Commission’s Programmes’, Jura Consultants and Gardiner & Theobald, 2001

\(^{115}\) ‘Assessing the role of the arts and cultural industries in a local economy’, J Bryan et al, 2000


\(^{117}\) *Star Trek: The Exhibition: Visitor Survey and Economic Impact Assessment*, Scotinform Ltd, Jones Economics, 1995
• over one fifth of visitors to the Star Trek exhibition were under 14 years old, reflecting the likelihood of adult visitors being accompanied by children.
• visitors were found to be fairly affluent, with 78% in employment and 65% in the ABC1 SEG.
• a surprisingly low % of visitors came from Edinburgh (17%) and 47% came from Scotland excluding Edinburgh and Lothian and 24% from England, with 4% from overseas.
• for day trippers, 58% said the exhibition was their only reason for coming to Edinburgh.
• a quarter of visitors could be classed as tourists (staying at least one night away from home).

9.22 In order to assess the extent to which the exhibition had attracted non or infrequent gallery visitors, respondents were asked when they had last visited a museum or gallery in Scotland – almost a quarter had visited a museum or gallery within the last month, with women, people aged over 55 years and Edinburgh residents being much more likely than average to have done so. The survey obtained data on exhibition related expenditure in Edinburgh, Lothian and elsewhere in Scotland, and these data were used to estimate employment and income impacts in these three areas – these sums include day trippers and those staying overnight.

• additionality and displacement expenditure were taken into account, and the net visitor expenditure in Edinburgh was estimated to be almost £0.7 million with the figures for Lothian and Scotland being £15,000 and £126,000 respectively.
• the total net expenditure in Scotland as a whole was estimated at £0.84 million.
• for income and employment generation, it was estimated that the exhibition generated £253,000 in income to the Edinburgh area and created 21 FTE jobs.
• for Lothian, the impacts were £297,000 and 25 FTE jobs and throughout Scotland, the exhibition generated £404,000 and 59 FTE jobs.
CULTURAL TOURISM AND MAJOR CULTURAL EVENTS

Cultural Tourism

Culture and tourism are inextricably linked and sites of culture and cultural events play an important role in impacting economically and socially on the community, and attracting UK and international visitors to Scotland.

Cultural tourism is increasingly becoming an important aspect of tourism in the USA, with ‘cultural shoppers’ from outwith the USA contributing more to the economy than tourists visiting to merely shop.

Highest increases in numbers visiting cultural sites in Scotland between August 2002 and 2003 were recorded by historic heritage sites, gardens and the church/abbey/cathedral category; the museum or art gallery category saw a decline of some 8%.

A review of several case studies in Scotland showed that cultural events have made an economic and social impact on the local area.

- The review highlighted a number of issues, including the shortage of skilled people in marketing and selling events, and that developing partnerships to share skills is essential in achieving success;

- Successful projects had recognised that rigorous evaluation is essential, both to learn from failings and build on success and to provide evidence for funders and sponsors for future investment.

There is still substantial scope to promote cultural tourism in the Highlands and Islands, and develop ‘niche’ tourism aimed at travellers specialising in visiting for arts and heritage reasons.

A case study of Romania indicates how a Cultural Tourism Initiative set up a few years ago with the prime aim of promoting this as a factor in tourism to the country, shows how through collaboration between academics and tourist related organisations, specific cultural-tourist services and tailor-made itineraries are now offered throughout Romania.

Economic evaluation of the Eden Project in Cornwall indicated that over half a million holiday visitors to Cornwall said their trip was influenced by the existence of Eden; they spent £111 million in the region; and each visitor stayed an average of 5.6 nights.

Economic evaluation of the Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao concluded that it is having a significant positive impact on Bilbao, with visitors to the museum accounting for 54% of growth in tourism in the Basque country over a 3 year period.

An assessment of arts and economic development in New York City’s boroughs found that arts and culture is a major employment creator and is a crucial contributor to the city’s economy and has renewed economic growth in several neighbourhoods.
Cultural facilities in the Highland area account for 5% of the 10.7 million annual bednights spent in the area, and independent museums represent 25% of this provision; independent museums equate to £5.35m of visitor expenditure

Research Issues

There is a lack of robust examples of good practice in cultural tourism and/or robust evaluations carried out on cultural events attracting tourists.

Conventional economic evaluations and appraisals of cultural projects do not take into account the ‘immeasurable’ impacts such as enhanced quality of life, sense of place, improved image of an area, and thus its ability to attract investment and employment as a result.

“Cultural tourism is based on the mosaic of places, traditions, art forms, celebrations and experiences that portray a region (or country) and its people, reflecting its diversity and character”118

10.1 Although it is not within the remit of this Review to examine the social and economic impact of tourism per se, culture and tourism are inextricably linked, with cultural events, the existence of heritage sites etc attracting visitors to the country in which they are located. Such sites of culture, and cultural or sporting events, can play a major role in impacting economically and socially on the community. This Chapter is of course linked very closely with the previous chapter on the economic impact of culture and the arts, and also covers evaluation of major cultural events which are, in themselves, closely linked to cultural tourism. There therefore follow some examples, both national and international, of the impact of cultural tourism revealed through research and evaluation.

10.2 According to The Scottish Tourist Board119 (now VisitScotland) in 2001 cultural tourism accounted for 37% of world travel, growing at the rate of 15% each year. Tourism makes an important financial contribution to Scotland, sustaining 215,000 jobs and contributing £4.5 billion to the economy120. The latest figures for 2002121 indicate that

- UK residents, for whom cultural tourism formed the main purpose of visit for their holiday trip, spent a total of £208 million, took approximately 800,000 trips and stayed for 3 million nights in Scotland.
- almost half of holidaymakers for whom visiting cultural attractions was the main purpose of their visit came from Scotland (49%) with a further 48% from England.

10.3 When the number of overseas holiday trips in Scotland that include visiting museums, art galleries and heritage centres and watching performing arts is taken into account, cultural tourism is clearly an important factor in contributing not to just the local, but national, economy in Scotland. The social impact can be measured by way of visitors’ enjoyment of the activity, their desire to visit more cultural sites and activities, and can also be found in a heightened ‘sense of place’ and pride in the community by those resident in the area. Latest

118 The Economic and Social Impact of the Arts in the Highlands and Islands, p 79
119 Culture and Tourism in Scotland, The Scottish Arts Council and Scottish Tourist Board, 2000
120 Latest figures provided by Tourism Unit & ELLD, Scottish Executive
121 Activity Holidays in Scotland: UK Residents’ Cultural Holidays in Scotland 2002 (taken from the United Kingdom Tourism Survey (UKTS), 2003
figures for visitor attractions in Scotland (August 2003)\textsuperscript{122} are based on data provided by some 386 attraction operators for the month of August 2003 (a response rate of 95%). When the figures recorded are compared to August 2002 they show that the highest increases were recorded by Historic Heritage Sites, Gardens and the Church/Abbey/Cathedral category. The Museum or Art Gallery category saw a decline in visitors of some 8%.

10.4 As part of ongoing research into \textit{cultural tourism} by VisitScotland, a consumer omnibus survey\textsuperscript{123} of a representative sample of 951 British adults, was used to investigate people’s perception of culture in general and relating to Scotland, and their involvement in cultural activities at home, on holiday and on any holidays in Scotland. The results suggest that people have a fairly consistent view of what culture is –

- most view it as the ‘arts’, theatre/opera/ballet/classical music/museums/galleries, followed by history and heritage and people’s national identity.
- fewer people associate the word ‘culture’ with more modern aspects, such as popular music festivals and events, suggesting that culture may not be the ideal word for all occasions, having possible negative connotations for people interested in these activities.
- when asked about cultural activities at home and on holiday, 75% of respondents indicated that they would participate in cultural activities at home, 68% whilst on holiday, and 40% saying they would go on holiday specifically to participate in cultural activities.
- when asked what were the main features of culture in Scotland, castles/historic sites and history/heritage had the strongest associations with Scotland’s culture.

10.5 Profiles of people interested in culture on holiday vary slightly for each activity focused on. However, overall, with the exception of festivals and events, they are more likely to be aged between 35 and 64 years old and in the higher socio-economic groups. People who are less likely to be interested in cultural activities on holiday are aged 18-24 years old, in the C2DE social groups, living in the North of England or Scotland, and who have no access to the internet. Although these figures only provide a ‘snapshot’ of people’s perceptions of and participation in cultural activities, and VisitScotland acknowledges that further research into specific segments of the market has to be carried out, they provide an initial picture of potential cultural tourists.

10.6 In order to address the lack of clear, robust examples of good practice in cultural tourism, RGA\textsuperscript{124} were commissioned by the Scottish Arts Council and Scottish Tourist Board in 1999 to research and document a \textit{set of case studies in culture and tourism and identify areas of good practice}. The report cites the outcome of several case studies including:

- \textit{the Ceolas week-long music school in South Uist}. Through partnership between the Gaelic Arts Agency and the local community, Ceolas has grown into a highly successful cultural initiative that demonstrates social and economic benefits for the area. Attendances at events in 1998 over the week amounted to 3,466 (the total population of South Uist is only just over 4,000). Data showed that 32% of

\textsuperscript{122}Visitor Attraction Barometer, \texttt{www.scotexchange.net}

\textsuperscript{123}Culture and Holidays, UK Consumer Omnibus Analysis of Results, Susan Dickie, VisitScotland – internal document, unpublished

\textsuperscript{124}Case studies in Culture and Tourism in Scotland, RGA Consultants, 2000

93
participants were from the H & I area, whilst 68% were from the rest of Scotland and beyond. Direct expenditure attributed to the event was estimated at £23,000, and an average of 44% of participants extended their stay by an extra seven days, generating an estimated £5,500 in additional spending:

- **The Highland Festival is a showcase of Highland culture** hosting local arts activity and a range of cultural events. In 1997, almost 68,000 people attended the Festival spending over £4.5m in the area.

- **The Stirling Initiative Cultural Programme** brought together organisations involved in arts, tourism and economic regeneration. Initially the purpose was to mark the 700th anniversary of the Auld Alliance and the Battle of Stirling Bridge, to attract more visitors to the area, and also to make Stirling a more attractive place to live, work and visit. Investment of £456,000 by the local agencies levered a further £375,000 from the European Regional Development Fund. Evaluation by the Stirling Initiative of the first two years showed definite impacts – revenue generated in the local economy amounted to £2million, and 28% of visitors came to Stirling because of the events programme. Since then, partners have realised the benefits of collaborative marketing and have formed a Marketing Consortium. The events programme has continued with funding from the ERDF and the Millennium Festival Fund.

10.7 The review of these and other case studies highlighted some important issues, including the shortage of people skilled in marketing and managing events, especially in smaller organisations, and that developing partnerships to share skills in essential to achieve success. On evaluation, the authors concluded that records were too often not kept, nor results effectively monitored, and that successful projects had recognised that evaluation is essential, to learn from failings and build on successes. Furthermore, funders and sponsors need evidence to convince them that their investment will have an impact.

10.8 The 2001 study on the economic and social impact of the arts in the Highlands and Islands points out that mass marketing in tourism is now giving way to one-to-one marketing tailored to the interests of the individual consumer (eg traveller) and that a growing number of visitors are becoming special interest travellers who rank the arts, heritage and/or other cultural activities as one of the main reasons for travelling. However, the authors indicate that cultural tourism has not yet been embraced or put into practice in any significant way in the Highlands and Islands and in general the cultural visitor is attracted to the area for its environment or heritage rather than artistic reasons. They point out that the arts complement the cultural and heritage facilities that are key aspects of the distinctive tourism ‘product’ of the area in general, and in particular through the Gaelic/Celtic dimension. The study found that the economic impact of arts-related tourism is substantial but there is scope for improvement through promotion and product development for ‘tomorrow’s cultural tourist’. The authors stress the need for the area to develop ‘niche tourism’ which is especially important to the remoter areas and those areas most highly dependent on tourism; they point out that the potential longer term benefits from cultural tourism are important but difficult to quantify, and include: repeat visits for future holidays by people attending festivals and other cultural events, and moves into the Highlands and Islands by people attracted by a range of factors including its artistic environment.

125 See Footnote 117
10.9 The study provides a case study example of a cultural and tourism initiative in Romania, and how a focused approach to cultural tourism can develop an active commercial enterprise benefiting an area’s economy and culture. Cultural tourism in Romania has been developed over the past few years by the Cultural Tourism Initiative (CTI). CTI is directed by a group of Romanian academics and scholars and has worked with History, Geography and Fine Art Institutes and collaborated with specialists in government tourism and culture. In 1997 and 1998, CTI organised short courses on cultural tourism, mainly attended by undergraduates proficient in foreign languages. These young trainees have now become professional guides in heritage tourism or do research work in CTI. By the end of 2000, CTI’s services had been used by over 650 visitors from 19 countries and feedback was processed and incorporated into CTI’s research projects. CTI is now an independent tour operator whose main goal is to highlight Romania as an attractive cultural tourist destination, whose perceived strengths are flexibility, constant care for customer satisfaction and reasonable prices.

10.10 Wavel et al’s (2002) examination of available evidence, cites evidence from the 1998 DCMS report on the local impact of tourism. The economic ‘Cambridge Model’ was used to estimate the impact of particular visitor attractions, such as the Eden Project in Cornwall. The model is designed to use local data (eg local tourist board survey information) and/or nationally available information (eg the UK Tourism Survey and International Passenger Survey). The Eden Project study used existing regional and county data and also included its own surveys of 4,500 visitors, 530 tourism related business and almost 50 Eden Project suppliers. Amongst its findings were that

- just over half a million holiday visitors said their trip to Cornwall was influenced by the existence of Eden;
- they spent an estimated £111 million in the region; and
- each visitor stayed an average of 5.6 nights.

10.11 The DCMS report notes that the Cambridge Model, along with the Scarborough Tourism Economic Activity Monitor, whilst both having acknowledged weaknesses, provide estimates which would otherwise not be available.

10.12 A 2000 study that examined the influence on tourism of the Guggenheim Museum in Bilbao, used visitor numbers data from the Guggenheim Foundation and data on visitors to the Basque Country and overnight stays from the Basque Government’s Statistical Authority. Dependent variables such as number of incoming travellers, overnight stays and levels of occupation were regressed against time trends, seasons and number of visitors to the Guggenheim. The study concluded that

- the Guggenheim is having a significant positive impact on Bilbao, with visitors to the museum accounting for 54% of the growth in tourism experienced by the Basque Country over a 3 year period.

126 ‘Measuring the local impact of tourism’, DCMS, 1998
127 ‘Evaluating the influence of a large cultural artefact in the attraction of tourism: the Guggenheim Museum Bilbao Case Study, B Plaza, 2000
• Anderson and Nurick\textsuperscript{128} in an article on cultural impact, indicate that in 2000 only 18\% of visitors to the Guggenheim were local (ie the Basque country), 36\% were from elsewhere in Spain and 46\% were from other countries.

• furthermore, more than 80\% of tourist visitors surveyed said that the Guggenheim had either prompted their visit to Bilbao or had caused them to plan a longer visit than would have been made otherwise.

10.13 Clearly, the existence of the museum has had a significant impact on tourism and the economy of Bilbao.

10.14 A further \textit{international assessment of arts and economic development was carried out in 2002 on New York City’s five boroughs}\textsuperscript{129}, examining in depth seven city neighbourhoods. The report’s key findings were that

• arts and culture is a major jobs creator, with over 150,000 jobs in the creative economy, having grown 52\% over the past 9 years and being probably the second most important sector in the economy behind the financial sector;

• at least seven neighbourhoods outside of central Manhattan have experienced renewed growth based in large on arts and culture assets;

• very few economic and community organisations are linked in to business and there is much scope for such working in the creative sector;

• a number of very good examples of affordable and collaborative working environments for artists and cultural organisations were found in the study;

• cultural development needs to better integrate the creative sector into already dense residential and business communities, rather than ‘displace’ community residents;

• funders rarely make the connection between arts and culture and local economic development, although this is beginning to change and some are now making the connection between funding and culturally-based economic development;

• although a number of arts economic impact studies have been done, New York has yet to comprehensively analyse how jobs in the creative economy fuel other industries;

• other cities elsewhere in the States have begun to realize the importance of the creative economy and have established action plans to provide it with targeted support.

10.15 \textit{On cultural tourism in the USA}, a 2003 paper by the Economic and Technology Policy Studies Unit \textsuperscript{130} highlights the importance of cultural tourism to the US economy. International tourism is one of the country’s largest service exports and in 2001 international travellers spent over $73 billion in the US, with cultural tourism being an important component of tourism with a significant impact on the national and state economies. Figures for 1997 indicate that more than 7.8 million visitors from outside North America took part in shopping and cultural and/or ethnic heritage tourism activities, including visits to art galleries, museums, national parks, historical places and cultural and ethnic heritage sites.

\textsuperscript{128} Cultural Impact: measuring the economic effects of culture, D Anderson and J Nurick, Locum Destination Consulting, in Locum Destination Review, Winter 2002 (10) pp15-17

\textsuperscript{129} The Creative Engine: How Arts & Culture is Fueling Economic Growth in New York City Neighbourhoods, N S Kleiman et al, Centre for an Urban Future, 2002

\textsuperscript{130} Issue Brief: How States are Using Arts and Culture to Strengthen Their Global Trade Development, Economic & Technology Policy Studies, NGA Centre for Best Practices, 2003
'Cultural shoppers’ spent more on average than those who identified shopping as their main reason for visiting the US, and as a result, tourism and transportation offices are now promoting their own cultural and heritage attractions as traveller destinations.

10.16 Closer to home, part of a 1999 assessment of Highland Independent Museums for the Scottish Museums Council, Highland Council and Highlands and Islands Enterprise examined the economic impact arising through the museums’ role as tourist attractions (defining tourist as any person visiting an area for a leisure day-trip or staying away from home overnight). The analysis concluded that cultural facilities in the highland area accounted for 5% of the 10.7 million annual bednights spent in the area. Independent museums covered in the audit were taken as representing 25% of this provision, with the value of the museums in relation to cultural tourism equating to some 133,750 bednights and £5.35m of visitor expenditure.

The ‘immeasurable factors’ in evaluating the economic impact of culture and the arts

10.17 In an interesting article by Anderson and Nurick, 2002, the authors consider that the conventional economic appraisal of cultural projects only focus on the ‘measurement of the measurable’ (ie visitors attracted, jobs created, income generated etc). However, they argue that they do not reflect ‘immeasurable’ effects on the places and regions in which cultural projects are located, and the challenge lies in how to measure the changed image and aspirations of a place and the quality of life of its residents due to the impact of culture. They indicate that “there is increasing evidence that quality of life, or ‘quality of place’ is becoming a more and more important factor in the locational decisions of both skilled workers and of investors”, and that cultural projects can greatly strengthen a city or region’s ‘brand’ or image and cause it to be perceived more favourably.

10.18 They use the sculpture of the Angel of the North and its economic impact on Gateshead as an example. Despite it not attracting a great many people to Gateshead in its own right, not providing any real incentive to stay in Gateshead any longer, no-one employed to manage it and it not generating any visitor spend, “its real economic impact has been enormous”. The multi-million pounds activity at Gateshead Quays, including a contemporary art gallery, music centre and private investment in residential, commercial, leisure and office space, has resulted following the ‘big, bold gesture’ of erecting the sculpture. Yet had the economic impact of the sculpture been conventionally evaluated, “the Angel would be – statistically speaking – next to nothing”. The authors argue that cultural projects are among the most powerful means of reinforcing local and regional identity, and the degree to which such projects can help to build the ‘sense of place’ can ultimately determine the extent of their contribution to the local or regional economy.

---

131 Assessment of Highland Independent Museums, S Westbrook, S Callaghan, B Burns, 1999
**Major Cultural Events**

An economic impact study of the MTV Europe Music Awards held in Edinburgh in November 2003,
Found that the Awards yielded a total net additional expenditure of £6.4 million in the Edinburgh economy and £8.9 million in Scotland.

The latest economic impact study carried out on the Edinburgh’s various Festivals was in 1996. The study found that the festivals generated an additional spend of £136 million, supporting an estimated 2,777 full-time equivalent jobs in Edinburgh and Lothian.

Evaluation of cultural festivals in the East Midlands covered 11 festivals; total income of the festivals was just under £1 million, with more than 40% being earned income, including membership fees; box office takings were £300K.

- Total spend for 10 of the festivals was £990,000, which made a further contribution of around £570,000 to the regional economy and direct expenditure could support 29 FTE additional jobs;
- The crucial role of local support was highlighted, with volunteer help estimated at £165K;
- Audience expenditure contributed almost £7m to the economies of the host areas, which generated up to £4.16m additional income for the regional economy;
- About a third of businesses indicated that festivals increased the number of their customers and turnover, thus providing economic benefits; however similar numbers indicated that festivals were not important and even disruptive to their business, and overall 45% did not think of festivals as a source for new business;
- The vast majority of local businesses saw festivals as being good for the community, contributing to tourism and enhancing the image of the area;
- Festival organisers need to explore ways of developing a wider audience profile, of implementing new approaches to programming and marketing to promote inclusion of diverse groups such as young people, ethnic minorities, and those in lower socio-economic groups.

Festivals in the UK have a cultural, social and economic impact on the areas in which they take place.

Evaluation of the economic impact of the 2002 Nottinghill Carnival found that the overall impact was £93 million, translating into up to 3,000 full time equivalent jobs per year, and that less tangible benefits on the regional and national economy include its importance in promoting London’s image as a tourist destination; the boost to Carnival products (eg Caribbean food, clothing); opportunities for business and skills development; and social cohesion benefits.

Garcia and Miah’s work on the Winter Olympic Games in the US emphasises how the sustainable and long-term impact of an event is related to its ability to be presented as a cultural experience, and that a combination of sporting and cultural/artistic events is more likely to place the city on the global map.

**Research Issues**

Evaluation of cultural events is often not rigorous, records are often not kept or results monitored effectively. Criticism of conventional economic impact studies highlights how many do not take additionality and opportunity costs into account.
Major Cultural Events

10.19 Scotland has a number of world-class events, such as the Edinburgh Festival and the Open Golf – that draw hundreds of thousands of visitors to Scotland and promote it as a key player on the international stage. The Scottish Executive now has in place a Major Events Strategy 2003-2015 to build on Scotland’s success and establish it by 2015 as one of the world’s foremost events destinations. Research and consultation that took place before the strategy was established, indicated key areas to be addressed in order for Scotland to achieve its aim –

- improved co-ordination between events organisers and funders in Scotland;
- better links between major events and other strategic priorities such as marketing, tourism and business;
- better use of existing and new infrastructure throughout Scotland;
- better knowledge about international events and agreed mechanisms for appraising and evaluating their impact;
- build expertise to reduce the risk of unsuccessful event bids;
- build best practice partnerships between public and private sectors to maximise the benefits of hosting events in Scotland;
- and better return on investment and economies of scale from developing a portfolio of events.

10.20 Impact evaluations of major events are therefore important in order to learn the resulting economic impact and where lessons can be learned to do things better in the future.

10.21 In November 2003, the MTV Europe Music Awards took place in Edinburgh, and in January 2004 an economic impact study\textsuperscript{132} was published. Research methods involved desk research based on previous economic impact studies and information from MTV, face to face interviews with 150 spectators and a programme of consultations of various attendee groups and Edinburgh businesses. The study found that the MTV Awards yielded a total net additional expenditure of £6.4 million in the Edinburgh economy and £8.9 million in Scotland. The figures take into account displacement and multiplier effects. When the economic returns are compared with the investment of £750,000 made by the public sector agencies, a return rate of 1:8.9 is given in the Edinburgh and Lothians area and 1:11.9 at a Scottish level, significantly exceeding the estimates of impact calculated at the appraisal stage.

10.22 The MTV Awards were not only successful in bringing in additional expenditure to Edinburgh and Scotland’s economy, but put Edinburgh ‘on the map’, with the Awards receiving 77 hours of coverage on MTV and watched by around 12-14 million people in Europe. The heightened profile of the city has the potential to provide opportunities for tourism (especially with young people), the event has shown that Edinburgh is capable of successfully hosting a major world class event, and the event has raised the profile of the city as home to some innovative creative businesses.

\textsuperscript{132} MTV Europe Music Awards Edinburgh 03, Economic Impact Study, SQW and NFO World Group, 1994
10.23 The latest economic impact study carried out on the Edinburgh’s various Festivals was in 1996. The study found that the festivals generated an additional spend of £136 million, supporting an estimated 2,777 full-time equivalent jobs in Edinburgh and Lothian\(^{133}\). An estimated 464,000 overnight visitors stayed in Edinburgh in August 2002 and audience figures for 2003 were estimated at 2.2 million, an increase of £0.3 million from the previous year. The Edinburgh International Festival’s Annual Review 2003\(^{134}\) indicates that ticket sales income was a record £2.628 million, up 12% on 2002; that income from sponsorship and donations was over £1.7 million – 24% of the Festival’s income - (the EIF is the UK’s second most successful performing arts organisation at raising general business sponsorship); that 57% of the visitors were on an independent holiday; and that for 85% of visitors, the Festival was either the only or a very important reason for visiting Edinburgh. Clearly, the Edinburgh International Festival is a major international cultural event and attracts both visitors and thus income to the city of Edinburgh and its surrounding areas.

10.24 The economic and social benefits of cultural festivals in the East Midlands were reported\(^{135}\) to the Arts Council England and co-sponsors in 2003. The study was the first comprehensive study of festivals in the East Midlands and centred on 11 festivals, reflecting the range of events that took place throughout the region including the location, cultural diversity and cultural form. The study found that

- the total income of the 11 festivals was just under £1 million, with more than 40% (over £415,000) being earned income, including membership fees.
- the largest source of earned income was box office takings at just over £300K. Public funding accounted for more than 40% of income.
- Arts Council England was the largest single funder, providing 24% of the combined total income of the 11 festivals (including lottery funding), followed by local authorities, sponsorship in cash and kind, and charitable trusts and individual donations.
- volunteer help, calculated at £5 per hour, was estimated at £165K, highlighting the crucial role of local support.
- total spend for 10 of the festivals was just under £990,000, and economic analysis estimated that this made a further contribution of up to £570,000 to the regional economy and that direct expenditure by the festivals could support almost 29 full-time equivalent additional jobs.
- money spent by audiences contributed almost £7 million to the economies of the places hosting the 11 festivals.

10.25 The authors concluded that the amount spent by audiences generated up to £4.16 million additional income for the regional economy, which could support almost 210 additional FTE jobs. Impact on local business was examined, by gathering the views and information from local businesses in 7 of the 11 festival areas. Some of the companies indicated that festivals provide economic benefits to them, ie in an increase in the number of customers (30%) and turnover (30%). However, similar numbers indicated that festivals were not important (28%) and even disruptive (20%), and overall 45% did not think of festivals as a source for new business. Nevertheless, the vast majority of local businesses

\(^{133}\) Summary of Key Statistics on the Edinburgh Festivals, Edinburgh & Lothians Tourist Board

\(^{134}\) Edinburgh International Festival, Review of 2003, Edinburgh International Festival Society

\(^{135}\) Festivals and the creative region: The economic and social benefits of cultural festivals in the East Midlands, De Montfort University, Leicester
thought that festivals were good for local communities, made a good contribution to the
development of tourism, and enhanced the image of the area as a place to live.

10.26 These views are supported by findings from the survey of festival attenders, the
majority of whom felt more positive about the place where the festivals happened, felt more
inclined to attend other festivals, and almost half saying that they had become more interested
in the arts as a result. Further analysis of questionnaires indicated that Asian and Black
communities were only ‘over-represented’ at festivals relating to their culture (2 out of the
11) and that at other festivals their attendance was some three times lower that the actual
weight of these two ethnic groups in the region’s social composition, suggesting a need for
festivals to broaden their appeal to Asian and Black audiences. Similarly, the majority of
festival goers were over the age of 45 years, highlighting a need for further developing
festivals’ appeal to young people. Festival goers were also under-represented in the manual
and less skilled occupations and over-represented in professional occupations.

10.27 The study concluded that cultural festivals in the East Midlands would benefit from
being promoted jointly with other tourism attractions aimed at people of different ages, to
sustain the interests of visitors, and that these attractions could be specific to the area (eg
traditional crafts, food and folklore) and could be exploited, and that festivals would benefit
from joint publicity through different media. Festival organisers also needed to explore ways
of developing a wider audience profile, including implementing new approaches to
programming and marketing that would bridge race, age and class divides.

10.28 Previous to this study, the British Arts Festivals Association (BAFA) commissioned
research136, which reported in 2000, into the contribution that arts festivals make ‘to the
cultural, social and economic life of the UK’. Research methods included a review of
existing research, a postal survey of 137 arts festivals (a response rate of 45%), analysis of
programmes, annual accounts and audience research, discussions with 57 festival staff,
funders, policy makers, researchers, artists and arts managers, and feedback from the Steering
Group for the study and BAFA membership. Analysis of the programmes found that

- the 137 festivals presented at least 5,500 events, with a very broad range from
  performing and literary arts to visual arts, film, video and digital arts.
- recent developments have been the large-scale community event, site-specific
  commissions, street art and the increasing cultural diversity of festival programmes.
- festivals provide not only opportunity for commissioning new work from artists and
  providing opportunities for amateur artists, but provides audiences with ‘a different
  kind of cultural experience’.
- data showed that 50% of festival attenders lived within 5 miles of the venue and 71%
  came from within 10 miles, making it more likely “that festival events will become
  part of the shared memory of local people and help to increase the sense of
  community”.

10.29 The authors conclude that the celebratory atmosphere of many festivals, the inclusion
of free events and education and audience development programmes make festivals more
accessible to people who might not otherwise consider attending a live arts event. The
authors cite examples of particular festivals (eg two schools, one mainstream and the other
Asian, working together in a deprived area to create a piece of performing art in the summer

---

136 Festivals Mean Business: The shape of Arts Festivals in the UK, K Allen and P Shaw, 2000
festival; and a theatre company working with school pupils, connecting with children’s parents and older people) which have had a social impact on those who participate and on the local community. A further social impact is the provision of work for thousands of volunteers, and during the festival period the volunteer workforce is more than double the size of the paid workforce (excluding artists).

10.30 The authors of this study calculated that festivals which took place in the UK in 1998/99 employed on a full-time, part-time or casual basis at least 7,540 people per year; that the total income of 101 arts festivals in the same period was £39.1 million, and that the total ticket sales amounts to 6.89 million.

10.31 In 2002, the London Development Agency commissioned a review of the economic contribution of the Notting Hill Carnival to the local and regional economy. Using a robust methodology, the researchers carried out a literature review, a random sample survey of 944 visitors, a telephone survey of 65 local businesses, a postal survey of licensed traders at the Carnival, discussions with a number of stakeholders in the event, indepth interviews with 12 groups participating as performers in the Carnival, and identified best practice models from selected comparable international festivals.

- the visitors’ survey suggested that spend over the 3 days by Carnival attendees was over £45 million, despite the vast majority of visitors saying that they had not anticipated spending anything at the Carnival.
- more than half of the visitors (29% of them being White British/Irish) said they were likely to buy more Caribbean food items and products that were launched at the Carnival.
- findings suggested that 90,000 of the visitors were visitors from abroad and 316,000 from the UK but outside London.
- of those who were staying away from home, 71% said they had planned their trip so that could attend the Carnival.
- the majority of Carnival-goers were young with almost one third under 25 years old and over one third aged between 25 and 34 years.

10.32 Of the 65 business surveyed, 23 closed over two days of the Carnival, so there was therefore a loss in business for some businesses. However, this loss was probably outweighed by the increase in business for traders that stayed open, and in addition, one third of food retailers and newsagents who were closed over the Carnival period felt that their sales had increased in the 4 weeks before the Carnival. Almost all the business that stayed open felt their sales were higher than usual, with more than a quarter believing their sales to have been more than 50% higher. The evaluators found however, that there was ‘a dearth of detailed costings’ from stakeholders in the event. The Police Service estimated they spent £6 million on training, policing etc and the council was unable to provide a total cost figure for their contribution. The evaluators also found that the links between creative skills developed at the Carnival and their commercial application was ‘under-developed’.

10.33 The study concluded that

---

137 The Economic Impact of the Notting Hill Carnival, Mann Weaver Drew and De Montfort University, 2003
• the overall direct economic impact of the Carnival was a spend by visitors of £45 million with a further £2 million spent on the infrastructure and grants given to groups involved.
• further indirect and ‘induced’ economic impacts produce an estimate of the overall income impact of the Carnival of £93 million, suggesting that the Carnival supports up to 3,000 full-time equivalent jobs per year.

10.34 These estimates are ‘cautious’ and do not include increases in spending in shops before and after the Carnival, or the less tangible economic benefits on the regional and national economy, including its importance for London’s image as a tourist destination, promoting Carnival products, opportunities for business and skills development in creative industries, and the social cohesion benefits.

### Criticism of conventional economic impact studies

10.35 However, conventional economic impact studies and their findings have been criticised by various authors, including Puffelen\(^ {138} \) (1996) and Crompton\(^ {139} \) (1995). Puffelen argues the ‘counterfactual’ case that if, in the unlikely event of the cultural sector ‘disappearing’, all spending linked to these institutions would not stop. He illustrates the example of whether, if the Amsterdam Rijksmuseum were to suddenly close, only a small number of foreign visitors would be dissuaded from visiting Amsterdam and those employed by the museum would eventually relocate elsewhere and only temporarily curtail their spending. He describes the argument that most conventional impact studies exaggerate the economic impacts because they look at gross consumption, employment etc rather than any new additional consumption or additional jobs.

10.36 Crompton also criticises many economic impact analyses (on sports events), citing eleven major contributors to the inaccuracy of many findings, including, as stated by Puffelen, claiming total instead of marginal economic benefits, omitting opportunity costs (ie not taking the value of the best alternative when deciding to invest funds in a particular event) and measuring only benefits while omitting costs. There are therefore, criticisms that can be directed to certain economic impact evaluations carried out, but most of those included in this Review appear to have been carried out in a rigorous manner, and have taken costs and additional benefits to the economy into account. Many have also ascertained, through social research, that the main reason people visited (and thus spent money in) the area was due to the occurrence of the particular event taking place.

---


\(^ {139} \) Economic Impact Analysis of Sports Facilities and Events: Eleven Sources of Misapplication, J L Crompton, Texas A&M University, in Journal of Sport Management 9, pp14-35, 1995
Cultural legacy of events

10.37 As part of an academic panel looking at the social and cultural programme of the Salt Lake Winter Olympic Games, Garcia (2002) observed that there tended to be a “disassociation between the most media friendly aspects of the event…and the cultural and arts activities organised by the locals”. In her report which made recommendations on the sustainability of the event’s cultural legacy, Garcia stressed that a major constraint on securing effective cultural legacies from events is due to the lack of interaction between event organisers and local communities, and the poor level of support for promoting distinctive local features in the media. Garcia states that beyond economic success and media impact, “it is fundamental that the host-city conveys an image that is both distinctive and representative of the locals” and that events should allow cultural and arts events within the main official venues in order to reach the international media.

10.38 Garcia and Miah’s views are that the Olympic Games, both in winter and summer, are regarded as a key opportunity for a city to demonstrate its cultural heritage on the global stage, and this mainly becomes manifest through the cultural and artistic programme accompanying the sporting events. The authors indicate how the Salt Lake event was stronger than previous Olympic events in placing culture before its audience, making it visible and accessible to attenders. The Olympic Games in Salt Lake capitalised on its many ‘local’ cultures (eg Native American artefacts and large exhibitions of a famous sculptor). The authors also cite how an important strand of this particular event was “its emphasis on community reach to ensure a feeling of ownership by the locals”. Garcia’s view is that the long-term success of an event is related to its ability to present itself as a ‘cultural experience’ and to present a combination of sporting and arts activities. The authors conclude that the Games in Salt Lake demonstrated that it is possible to combine sporting excellence with the culture and arts of the area, but that it remains to be seen whether the event will “provide lasting legacies to the city”.

140 Exploring events and their cultural legacies: Salt Lake Winter Olympic Games 2002, Beatriz Garcia in ‘Major Events’, CCPR website, www.culturalpolicy.arts.gla.ac.uk/research; and ‘The Olympics is not a Sporting Event!’, B Garcia and A Miah, 2002 in CCPR website
SECTION 2

SPORT AND PHYSICAL ACTIVITY
CHAPTER ELEVEN

SPORT AND SOCIAL INCLUSION

**Participation in Sport and Social Inclusion**

*Participation*

Girls participate less in sporting activities than boys

Those from higher income households and with educational qualifications are more likely to exercise more than those from deprived areas and with lower educational attainment

*Reduction in Crime*

There has been a significant reduction in crime figures where sport and arts activities programmes have been run in high crime areas

No evidence has been found of a causal relationship between participation in sport and a reduction in offending

Sport alone does not reduce offending but can result in personal and social outcomes that may improve offending behaviour

‘Bottom up’ approaches, where young people are involved in influencing the provision and management of the activity, appear to work best; programmes aimed at at-risk youth are unlikely to succeed if they are run along conventional/traditional lines

*Costs*

Concessionary fare schemes have the ability to increase general levels of use of sporting facilities

Cost is only one factor deterring potential users of sport facilities, and location is important in increasing participation by people in low income groups

A leisure card scheme in Highland has increased participation and attendance at sporting facilities generally, and by the number of people on social benefits (including disabled people, unemployed, low income etc)

*Education*

Specialist sports (and arts) schools have been shown to achieve a sharper improvement in results than maintained schools, and tend to perform relatively better than non-specialist schools, both over time and at a given point in time

A national initiative of Study Support Centres located in professional football clubs and other sports venues has made a real educational and personal impact on (underachieving) pupils attending and has significantly improved scores in numeracy, reading comprehension and ICT

Although there is no evidence to demonstrate a causal relationship between sport and improved educational attainment, there is evidence to suggest that participation in sport does not have any negative effects on education and brings about physical and personal benefits

*Employment*

Coalter (2001) provides evidence that two-thirds of participants in a sports-related programme were still employed one year after having completed the programme, and its focus on personal and professional development was important in developing transferable skills; also, in a sports-centred programme in a community school, the underachieving pupils who participated either secured employment or progressed to further education
Barriers to participation

Main barriers cited by people in Northern Ireland to participation in leisure/sport facilities were: time constraints; costs; geographical issues; and level of awareness. Issues specific to certain communities were lack of sport programmes for disabled people; changing room issues for the LGBT community; the perception by elderly people that sports programmes were geared towards young people; and time and cost of travel for people in rural communities to access facilities was a major barrier.

Research Issues

There is a lack of systematic monitoring and evaluation of the impact of sport or physical activities – evaluations tend to be short-term, unsophisticated and with limited funding, where defining and measuring outcomes are complex.

There is a need for long-term evidence on the impact of sport on social issues such as inclusion and reduction in criminal activities.

There is a lack of data on the frequency of attendance and the intensity of participation in sport and physical activity by different groups.

There is a lack of robust monitoring on the effectiveness of low concession schemes to encourage participation by socially excluded groups.

There appears to be a dearth of evidence on sport/physical activity programmes that have the particular purpose of leading to employment.

11.1 The following section deals with the various impacts of participating in sport and/or physical activity. Sport is defined by the Council of Europe’s European Sports Charter as:

“all forms of physical activity which, through casual or organised participation, aim at expressing or improving physical fitness and mental well-being, forming relationships or obtaining results in competitions at all levels”. Coalter (2000) considers that “it is best to regard sports as a series of social relationships and social processes in which it is assumed that certain types of learning, or ‘socialisation’, occur”.

11.2 This section of the Review therefore examines various research and evaluation of sports and physical activities and the findings on the resulting impact of participation on social exclusion (including youth crime and employment) and the success of concessionary schemes designed to increase access by normally excluded groups. It also examines the barriers to participation by certain communities.

Participation in sports in Scotland

11.3 Since 1987, sportscotland has collected data, by way of a large omnibus household survey, on adult and young people’s sports participation in Scotland. The most recent publication (2003) provides data collected between 1999 and 2001, with trend data.

---

141 (in) The Role of Sport in Regenerating Deprived Urban Areas, F Coalter with M Allison and J Taylor, Centre for Leisure Research, University, 2000 (p9)

142 Sports Participation in Scotland 2001, Research Digest No 90, sportscotland, 2002
providing a picture of change over time. The sample size is 6,000 adults and 1,450 young people per annum. The data indicates that 64% of the adult population in Scotland (aged 16 years and over) took part in some type of sport or physical recreation in the previous month, and the participation rate for young people (aged 8-15 years) is 99%. The two most popular activities for adults are walking and swimming, and these activities plus cycling are those which have increased most in popularity over the last 13 years. The most popular sports amongst young people are football, swimming, cycling, running/jogging and basketball/netball/volleyball.

- there are significant differences in sports participation by gender, with women’s participation dominated by the activities of walking, swimming, keep fit/aerobics and dancing.
- men on the other hand participate in a much wider range of sports, including walking, football, swimming, golf, snooker/billiards/pool and cycling.
- for young people, football dominates all other sports for boys, as swimming does for girls.
- there is a steady decline in participation in sport by age, with 45% participation by the over 55s in all sports, and only 29% in selected sports (excluding walking, dancing, snooker/billiards/pool).
- there is a higher participation in all sports by AB and C1 socio-economic groups than C2 and DE adults, and although there has been an increase in participation by all groups over the last 13 years, the greatest increase has been in C1 and C2 groups.

11.4 However, although the rate of participation by young people in the previous month is high, only around 78% of boys and 66% of girls currently reach the recommended level of physical activity, with physical activity by those aged 14-15 years only 65% for boys and 35% for girls. Government targets for 2007 therefore include that 80% of primary schoolchildren and 85% of 13-17 years olds are taking part in sport, in addition to the school curriculum, more than once per week. Also, because of the lower frequency and participation of older age groups in sport, a target has been set that 43% of those aged 45-64 years old take part in sport at least once a week by 2007.

### Sport and Social Inclusion

11.5 A 2003 survey of 62 secondary schools, and collection of data from 1,543 pupils aged 11-16 years showed that participation in sport amongst school pupils differs significantly by gender.

- one in three boys participate in sport or physically active games at least once per day, compared to 1 in 7 girls.
- boys are also more likely to say they take part in sports in their own time than girls (51% v 31%), whilst girls are twice as likely as boys to say they have some kind of lessons (swimming, dancing, music) – 31% v 15%.
- the same research, which interviewed a representative sample of 17-25 year olds found that young people of this age group from higher income households (£20K+),

---

144 YouthLink Scotland State of The National Survey:Schools Omnibus and Young People Survey, MORI, 2003
from non-deprived areas and those with degrees or qualifications are more likely to exercise several times a week, than those in lower income households, living in deprived areas, and educated to a lower level.

- similarly, school children from families where parents are not in work are less likely to take part in sport/games/fitness in their spare time.
- furthermore, school children who say they often feel sad or depressed are less likely to say they take part in sport or physical activities in their spare time.

11.6 It would appear that, in tune with the findings from the recent arts participation survey in Scotland, it is similar types of groups that tend to participate less, or not at all, in sporting activities as in cultural activities. There are groups of people (including young people) who appear to be ‘socially excluded’ from participating in sport and physical activities, and research work has been carried out to explore these issues and investigate the barriers to exclusion.

11.7 In a 2000 study on the role of sport in regenerating deprived areas, Coalter explored wider evidence that showed that sport can contribute positively to urban regeneration and social inclusion. The methods used were a literature review on the potential contribution of sport on various aspects of social life, including health and mental health, reducing crime, providing employment and improved social inclusion, focusing on minority ethnic groups. Sporting activity provides a focus for social networking and reduces social isolation. Coalter (2001) points out that this concept relates closely to ‘social capital’ – “the existence of a participation in community networks together with a sense of local identity, solidarity and equality with other community members”. The study also covered 10 case studies and looked at the extent to which outcomes were defined, achieved, how the initiatives were monitored, the lessons learned, best practice etc. Information for the study was gathered through the examination of relevant documents, indepth interviews, group discussions and a telephone survey.

11.8 The literature review illustrated the clear theoretical arguments for the positive contribution that sport can make to a range of social issues. However, it showed that there was a “lack of systematic monitoring and evaluation of the outcomes of sport or physical activity-based projects (with a widespread reliance on ‘output’ measures)”, mainly due to the short-term nature of many projects, the complexity of defining and measuring outcomes, a lack of expertise in doing so, and limited funding.

11.9 Related to the area of sport and social inclusion, is a current project commissioned by Sportscotland. The aim of the research is to provide practical advice on how public-private partnership contracts and other funding arrangements can ensure that the management of sports and cultural facilities in secondary schools results in maximum benefit to both community users and extracurricular pupil users. The research will explore examples of good (and not so good) practice and determine the extent to which these resulted from contractual and managerial arrangements.

145 ‘The Role of Sport in Regenerating Deprived Urban Areas’, Fred Coalter with Mary Allison & John Taylor, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh, 2000
11.10 The Future Learning and Teaching Programme (FLaT) has been established to support and encourage pilot projects that challenge the current concepts of schools and explore new ways of learning and teaching. All FLaT projects will be independently evaluated by one of a number of specialist evaluation teams to assess the impact of the projects on helping to deliver the National Priorities in Education in new and innovative ways. The evaluators will not only evaluate how the project has impacted on teaching approaches and young people’s learning, but on the local community also. One of the many projects to be evaluated is the Sports Comprehensives Pilot\textsuperscript{147}, where sport is used to encourage inclusion and promote self-esteem. The project will pilot inclusive sports comprehensives, involving three high schools in the North Lanarkshire area. The pilot is looking at new ways of using participation in sport to improve ethos and attainment; to build self-esteem; and to promote social inclusion by integrating more sport within the school curriculum and encouraging more involvement out of school hours. Project outcomes aimed for are

- to increase participation in sport by young people in the authority area;
- increase learner attainment, achievement, confidence and self-esteem, an enriched curriculum through enhanced sports’ provision and opportunities; and
- make a contribution to narrowing the gap between higher and lower levels of attainment and the wider regeneration of the area.

11.11 The project is due to complete in summer 2005 and an evaluation of its outcomes will be carried out.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sport and Reduction in Youth Crime</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11.12 Coalter et al’s study 2000 (see footnote 145 above) looked at the role of sport in diverting young people from criminal activities, or rehabilitating them and reducing the amount of crime in local areas. The study found that most large-scale diversionary projects had ‘vague rationales’ and limited understanding of the complex and varied causes of criminality. Sport was most effective when combined with programmes addressing wider social development.

11.13 A study\textsuperscript{148} of programmes targeted at rehabilitation from crime concluded that evaluation and performance indicators ranged from simple attendance numbers to a few that estimated reconviction rates. The authors considered that there was a problem for programme managers in finding qualitative evaluation techniques which were possible with limited funding but which adequately monitored and measured outcomes. All the programmes agreed that sport alone does not reduce offending, but that there are a range of personal and social outcomes which may at some point improve offending behaviour. The study indicated that the ‘success’ of programmes often related to their length, with longer programmes the most successful. In Coalter’s paper (2001), he cites the analysis of 180 papers on sport and social inclusion\textsuperscript{149}, which showed that only 11 studies had carried out

\textsuperscript{147} North Lanarkshire Council Sports Comprehensives Pilot, \url{www.flatprojects.org/sportspilot.asp}
\textsuperscript{148} ‘Demanding Physical Activity Programmes for Young Offenders under Probation Supervision’, P Taylor, I Crow, D Irvine and G Nichols, 1999
\textsuperscript{149} ‘Sport and Social Inclusion: A Report to the Department of Culture, Media and Sport’, M Collins et al, Institute of Sport and Leisure Policy, Loughborough, 1999
‘anything approaching rigorous’ evaluations and even some of these did not provide data for excluded groups.

11.14 Coalter’s study (2000) showed that there appears to be an assumption that because participation in sport can create a sense of self-respect, self-esteem, confidence etc, that this in turn will contribute to a reduction in the likelihood to participate in criminal activities. However, no studies have demonstrated evidence of a linear effect between the two. This is not just a ‘British’ problem of the difficulty of measuring clear outcomes from participation in diversionary programmes – in a USA review of 120 programmes for at risk youth, the review found that 30% undertook no evaluation at all, and only 4% evaluated changes in behaviour related to participation in the programme. Even where studies have found apparent short-term effects in the reduction of crime, there appears to be no evidence on the long-term impact of participation in sport programmes and subsequent attitudes and behaviour.

11.15 The most common form of evaluation in the UK is to attribute a reduction in recorded crime figures – especially at local level – to projects. The Youth Justice Board (2001) monitored over 100 Summer Splash Schemes that provided sports and arts activities for 20,000 13-17 year olds during the summer of 2000. The research reported

- a 36% reduction in domestic burglary and an 18% reduction in ‘youth crime’ in the areas concerned, compared to reductions of 6% and 8% respectively in similar high crime areas.

11.16 Similarly, in 2002, monitoring of the Summer Splash Extra programme, which involved 91,000 young people aged between 9-17 years old identified as at risk of offending (exceeding the original attendance target by some 90%), took place. It found for the 6 police force areas for which comparative data was available for July and August 2002 and 2001,

- significant reductions in robbery of between 9% and 31% compared to non-Splash areas which in some areas rose to over 50% increase in robbery.

11.17 The authors of the Splash Report acknowledge that the data does not prove that Splash Extra had successfully reduced crime in these areas, “but it does at least show that crime fell significantly in areas in which Splash Extra ran”. The data also shows “that the Splash Extra schemes were successful in the key aim of targeting high crime areas, thereby reaching young people at risk of offending”.

11.18 Following on from the success of Splash and Splash Extra, in 2003 a new programme of Positive Activities for Young People was launched, targeting vulnerable young people aged 8-19 years, to help ‘steer them into a positive direction in life’. The programme will provide a broad range of school holiday time activities in quality arts, sports and cultural activities, designed to “develop interests, build self-respect and help them into further education or employment – key factors in preventing criminality”.

---

150 ‘Recreation Programs that Work for At Risk Youth’, P A Witt and J L Crompton, 1996
152 Delivering summer activities in high crime neighbourhoods: the intensive evaluation of Splash Extra 2002, Cap Gemini Ernst & Young for NOF, 2003
153 DCMS, News release, 13 January 2002
154 DCMS Press Notice 15 July 2003
11.19 A UK scheme based on the American model of ‘Midnight Basketball’ (Coalter 2001), has been developed in association with National Playing Fields Association. The project is aimed at 13-18 year olds and combines basketball with compulsory ‘lifestyle’ workshop discussions and focuses on communication skills, citizenship, employment training and health awareness. Forty young people were trained in youth/sports leadership awards complemented by recreational activities organised and facilitated by young people themselves. The outcomes (1999) were reported as having had an impact on crime in that

- there was a 40% reduction in crime in the area, a 30% reduction in ‘trouble’, £200K reduction in vandalism and 70% reduction in calls to the police.
- the project was seen to be successful because it used an integrated approach, combining other aspects of personal and social development apart from participation in sport.

11.20 Coalter indicates that the evidence available suggests that the best way to achieve success in getting young people to participate in sport programmes is by way of a ‘bottom up approach’ where young people are involved in influencing the nature of provision and in its management – this ‘empowers’ the participants and allows them to take ownership of the programme and responsibility for their activities. The key to successful programmes has often been the type of staff that have operated it, using peers or ‘streetworkers’ to reach at-risk youths. Programmes aimed at including at-risk young people are unlikely to succeed if they are promoted along conventional and traditional lines.

11.21 However, no form of evaluation has been used which can clearly link participation in sport to a reduction in crime, and a causal relationship cannot therefore be demonstrated. Evaluations at present may be too underdeveloped and not sufficiently sophisticated or indeed long-term to confirm such a link. This problem of being able to disentangle the effects of sport participation from other ongoing social influences and processes, makes any evaluation of the long-term effects of participation difficult. A reduction in crime in the area may well reflect other processes such as increased policing, CCTV or wider environmental improvements, particularly in regeneration areas where both structural and social improvements are continually taking place. Crime reduction could also of course reflect a true reduction due to young people being diverted from criminal activities whilst they are participating in the sporting activity, but there is no follow-up evidence to demonstrate that this diversion is sustained when participation in the activity is complete.

11.22 In the October 2003 issue of ‘Leisure Management’, a representative of the Chief Cultural and Leisure Officers Association comments that leisure providers have opportunities as well as responsibilities to provide leisure options that respond to the needs of young people when not in school, and “that all too often funding from government initiatives to develop better, more targeted out-of-school activity programmes has been focused on the summer holiday period”. He points out how young people want activities after school, at weekends and during school holidays, and that local authorities need to create a ‘joined up service’ of activities for young people supported by other programmes such as education, housing, social services and regeneration.

---

155 Realising the Potential: The Case for Cultural Services: Sport, Fred Coalter, 2001
156 ‘The Contribution of Arts and Sport to Neighbourhood Renewal and Reducing Social Inclusion’, ILAM, 1999
Coalter’s work (2001) indicates that **sport participation has the potential to improve physiological and mental health, increase a sense of well-being, personality development and assist in social learning.** It is possible that these in turn might transfer to changed behaviour and relationships that lead to a reduction in the likelihood to take part in anti-social behaviour, improve education performance and result in more positive relationships in the community and reduce social exclusion. However, the lack of empirical evidence on such outcomes makes it difficult to illustrate the number of people from different communities participating, and the social outcomes for these groups. There is also a lack of data on the frequency of attendance by individuals and the intensity of participation, both of which affect levels of fitness, health, reduction in social exclusion etc. There is clearly a need for a better understanding of how to define and use outcome measures and for long-term monitoring and evaluation before clear evidence is demonstrated that there is a causal relationship between participation and effect.

---

**Concessionary Schemes**

In a 2002 review of evidence on **the relationship between entrance charges to sports facilities and participation,** Coalter shows how a policy based solely on low entrance charges may not be an effective approach to encourage new participants, particularly targeted groups on low-income. Various surveys of non-participants in sport have found that cost is only one, and mainly not the most important, factor for non-participation, and it is generally **time constraints** and **location** (accessible facilities) which are the most important. Coalter indicates how there is a lack of systematic research evidence on local populations on which to base the apparent policy assumption that a proportion of the population who are already predisposed to participation are prevented from doing so by the cost of entrance fees. Coalter reviewed the evidence on the impact of concessionary schemes, and again, found a “general absence of robust monitoring information on the effectiveness of such schemes” with little detailed information about participants’ and thus the schemes’ social effectiveness. Where evidence does exist, the quality of the methodology is variable and often lacks rigour, raising questions about representensiveness.

However, although there is a lack of systematic monitoring and evaluation of data relating to concessionary schemes, Coalter finds some indication that they have the ability to increase general levels of use. **Evaluation of two Glasgow free swimming schemes** indicated that numbers increased significantly initially, and then ‘tapered off’, but there was no information on the nature of new participants, or increased frequency by previous participants and thus the social effectiveness of the approach. Coalter concludes that entrance charges alone may only act as a constraint for a minority of people, and those on low income will have several constraints, similar to the rest of the population, with time consistently being the most important constraint for participants and non-participants. Clearly the decision to participate or not “is not a simple economic one” and entrance charges are only one component of a complex set of factors, with lifestyle factors and personal preferences being significant barriers to participation. Coalter also indicates how location is an important factor, with centres located in areas of deprivation appearing to be the most successful in attracting participants from lower income groups.

---

157 Let’s make Scotland more active: Entrance Charges and /Sports Participation, A Review of Evidence, F Coalter, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh, 2002
11.26 Data provided in 2003 from the ‘High Life’ leisure card scheme in Highland area\(^\text{158}\), which promotes access to sport and leisure facilities by reducing the cost, suggests that the scheme has been extremely successful in increasing participation. The scheme set out to achieve various objectives at the onset, including increasing the regularity of participation and overall usage of facilities by attracting new clients, and to target those economically disadvantaged to ensure access to leisure. For people on Income Support, Job Seekers Allowance, Disability Living Allowance or Attendance Allowance it allows entrance to any council run sport and leisure facility for only 50p per activity. For people not covered by these groups there are two further options of affordable prices for individuals and families (£13 and £18 per month respectively) allowing as much use of facilities as and when desired. The card also ‘stores’ money using a ‘pay as you go’ system, meaning adults and children don’t have to carry money with them when using facilities. Latest figures indicate that

- over the last two years, attendance at traditional swimming pools has increased by some 29%, and attendance at leisure pools has also increased at a rate of 1,829 attendances per 1,000 population.
- there has also been a significant increase in the number of attendances to indoor sport facilities, with an increase of almost a third (29.8%) over the past year.
- in its first year, the High Life leisure card had resulted in a 60% increase in customer activity income, and a 32% increase in participation levels at leisure centres, with many people accessing them for the first time.

11.27 On examining the figures in more detail, it can be seen that the total number of people using High Life cards amounted to 11,299 people at the end of March 2002, and almost 70% of these were people on benefits entitled to the 50p admission charge, whilst at the end of March 2003 this figure increased to a total of 19,716 with almost 60% of people on benefits using the facilities. Although the percentage for people on benefit is lower than the previous year, when numbers are examined, the number of people on benefits using leisure/sport facilities in the Highland area increased from 7,863 in 2002 to 11,450 in 2003. There are unfortunately no benchmark data available on types of users before the scheme began, but comparison can be made between the years once the scheme was in operation.

**Education**

11.28 As indicated in the Arts and Education section, a 2001 report\(^\text{159}\) on specialist schools since 1995 showed that the increase in GCSE/GNVQ points scores was fastest in Arts schools and Sports schools and that both Arts and Sports Colleges achieved a sharper improvement in results between 2000 and 2001 than all other maintained schools. A 2001/2002 study\(^\text{160}\) on the UK’s specialist schools (ie arts, sports, language and technology) found that such schools perform relatively better than non-specialist schools, both over time and at a given point in time.

---

\(^{158}\) Provided by Highland Council by e-mail, December 2003  
\(^{159}\) ‘Specialist Schools: An Evaluation of Progress’, Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Schools, 2001  
A four year evaluation\textsuperscript{161} reported in 2003 on the success of a national initiative established by central and local government and sports clubs, which aims to contribute to raising education standards by setting up \textit{Study Support Centres in professional football clubs and other sports venues}. The medium and environment of sport is used to support work in literacy, numeracy and ICT, with a focus on addressing the needs of underachieving young people. The evaluation involved gathering data from all 58 Centres and pupil outcome data from 12 Centres during 2002. The views of 1,132 pupils, 351 parents and 91 teachers were gathered, and pupils’ attitudes were captured at the beginning and end of their time at the Centre. Nationally standardised tests of numeracy and reading comprehension were used to assess pupils’ progress. Progress was compared to a control group of pupils who did not attend the Centres.

Key findings of the evaluation were that

- the young people who participated had made significant progress in basic skills.
- pupils made “substantial and significant progress” in numeracy, with primary pupils improving their scores by about 17 months and secondary pupils by about 24 months.
- gains in numeracy brought the performance of under-achieving young people much closer to the level expected for their age-group.
- although primary pupils’ reading comprehension did not significantly improve, that of secondary pupils improved by the equivalent of about 8 months.
- pupils’ ICT skills also improved significantly during their time at the Centres, and pupils’ attitudes showed evidence of significant improvement in many respects, including independent study skills and self-image.
- teachers and parents also noticed particular improvements in pupils’ self-confidence and ICT skills.
- despite sessions being held after school, most pupils attended for 80% or more of the course.
- the vast majority of pupils, parents and teachers thought the Centre to be a good idea and rated it highly.
- the initiative was found to have benefited pupils, regardless of gender, deprivation, ethnicity (a quarter of pupils were from ethnic minority backgrounds) or their fluency in English.
- the location of the Study Support Centres in professional football clubs and other sports venues was particularly attractive to the young people attending and was a strong element in motivating pupils to become involved.

\textbf{Employment}

Coalter’s study (2000) found little research had been done on the regenerative potential of investment in sport or the long-term benefits to communities. One of his case studies looked at \textit{partnership working between a development agency and a city council},

\textsuperscript{161} Playing for Success: an evaluation of the fourth year, C Sharpe et al, National Foundation for Education Research, RR No 402, 2003
to offer opportunities to long-term unemployed people to train as playworkers and sports coaches. Eighteen ‘workers’ were recruited each year; there were no gender quotas but most playworkers were women and sport workers men, reflecting the nature of the industries. Successful applicants were given a contract for up to a year and were paid £126 per week whilst allowing them to retain benefits such as housing and Family Credit. They were also provided with a weekly zone card and essential clothing and footwear allowance. The participants took part in coach education courses and there was continual support for professional and personal development. The personal development provided opportunities for participants to increase their self-esteem and confidence. The average cost per participant was £12,000. Each worker was given £250 personal development budget, from which many took driving lessons or trained in aerobics or aquarobics. Each placement was important in the context of networking, providing access to potential employers and employment networks.

11.32 The performance requirement of the programme was 65% rate of exit employment.

- less than 1 in 10 participants dropped out of the scheme.
- about 80% of the 70 participants obtained exit employment (60% were women as there were better employment possibilities for playworkers).
- however, such employment was not necessarily long-term, but it was estimated that 65% were still employed one year after leaving the programme.

11.33 Coalter concluded that certain issues still needed to be addressed eg the limited opportunities for full time employment in sports related jobs, competition with sports graduates, only sessional work available which was not sufficient to provide a living wage, and the increased emphasis on formal certification. However, the programme developed self-esteem, self-confidence and enabled the long-term unemployed to gain work experience which was transferable to other sectors. Coalter considered that the focus of the programme on personal and professional development was important in developing such skills for future employment.

11.34 Similarly, in the same study, Coalter describes the outcome of a sports-centred programme in a community school, made available to pupils who were not expected to get standard grades and likely to leave school early – amongst other components, the programme included a job preparation programme. Evaluation of the programme found that all 12 young people on the programme had obtained ‘positive’ results – 5 had secured ‘apprenticeships’ (3 with the recreation department facility in their community), 1 found permanent employment and 6 went on to further education.

**Barriers to participation by specific communities**

11.35 Research in 2003\(^{162}\) conducted for the Department of Culture, Arts and Leisure, explored barriers to participation in certain activities. Different levels of accessibility were important in the extent of participation, but as the authors point out “care must be taken over generalisations and stereotypes” – running alongside specific needs such as those for disabled people or geographical location, were people’s “past or current level of interest in a specific aspect of culture, arts or leisure and how easy they felt it was to become involved”. Perceptions of ease of use of facilities were related to the level of interest held. General

\(^{162}\) Barriers to Participation in Culture, Arts and Leisure, Independent Research Solutions, 2003
barriers by all groups were perceived as **time constraints; cost implications; geographical considerations** (particularly outwith the city centre and in rural areas); and **level of awareness of services**.

11.36 For specific communities, there were perceptions that facilities and services were not geared to their needs. For example,

- lack of physical activity or sport programmes for disabled people;
- facilities in leisure centres do not meet the need of lesbian, gay, bi-sexual and transgender people (eg issues relating to changing rooms, lack of privacy, feeling ‘threatened’ by the presence of heterosexual people in the same changing room, and the exclusivity of changing rooms for either men or women);
- elderly people felt sports programmes/events were aimed at the young, or they would feel self-conscious participating when young people were present;
- and for people in rural communities the time and cost involved in travel to leisure centres was cited as a major barrier.
CHAPTER TWELVE

SPORT AND ETHNIC MINORITIES

Sport and Ethnic Minorities

Participation levels by ethnic minority groups in sport and physical activities are lower than mainstream groups.

Barriers to participation relate to how strongly people relate to their own ethnic culture.

‘Bottom-up’ initiatives built on the tradition of the ethnic minority group work best.

Research has produced examples of good practice in how to promote sport participation by ethnic minorities.

Research Issues

There appears to be limited systematic information about minority ethnic groups and participation in sport.

There needs to be greater clarity in setting outcomes at the start of a programme and these should be agreed with the ethnic community before the programme takes place.

12.1 There appears to be limited systematic information about minority ethnic groups and participation in sport (Coalter, 2000). On examining various sport initiatives to promote inclusion of this group, Coalter concludes that bottom-up initiatives built on the tradition of the group and using workers from the relevant community are most likely to succeed. He also concludes that there is a need for greater clarity about outcomes and these should be agreed with the community before the programme takes place.

12.2 A 2001 report carried out for sportscotland[^163] lists 35 examples of good practice in Scotland and England in projects that help overcome various barriers to participation in sport by people from minority ethnic communities. The main aim of the report was “to provide direction for increasing access to sport amongst people from ethnic minority communities in Scotland”, furthered by gaining an understanding of the barriers faced by people from ethnic communities, providing examples of good practice and listing key indicators of good practice. A further aim was to produce guidance on future research needs in terms of collecting baseline data for monitoring participation levels amongst the target groups. The research used a qualitative approach, complemented by a desk research component. A series of in depth interviews were conducted with respondents from ethnic minority communities and amongst professionals working in the area. Interviews were carried out with 40 people covering 4 different ethnic minority groups, and the size of their population in Scotland as well as the prevalence of health conditions within different communities were taken into account in determining the sample structure. Interviewees covered a range of criteria, including age, gender, non-participants and low-participants in sport, a small number of elite athletes, and social class.

[^163]: Sport and Ethnic Minority Communities: Aiming at Social Inclusion, Scott Porter Research and Marketing Ltd, 2001
12.3 **Participation levels in sport by ethnic minorities in England (2000)** had already been shown to be lower than that of the adult population as a whole – 40% for ethnic minorities and 46% for the general population respectively. The study for sportscotland explored the barriers that people from ethnic minority communities face in accessing sport, and clear divisions emerged across the sample. These tended not to be related to which ethnic community the individual was from, but to how strongly they identified with their ethnic culture. The researchers divided the respondents into three categories –

- Security Seekers (whose ethnic origin, culture and religion is a fundamental part of their life),
- Harmony Seekers (who are somewhat similar to Security Seekers but tend to be more integrated into Scottish life), and
- Independence Seekers (who view themselves and conduct their lives as primarily Scottish).

12.4 The strength therefore of the individual’s relationship to his/her culture and beliefs drives and influences their potential to participate in sport. The study went on to recommend targets and actions to achieve these aims for each type of group, taking into account the difficulties and cultural barriers in place.

12.5 The study concluded by indicating that it was important to acknowledge the long-term nature of the strategy to increase participation in sport by ethnic minority groups. It was also important to not only quantify levels of participation, nature and frequency of participation, but to explore and assess attitudes held and reasons behind non-participation. The study recommends the type of methodology and sample to be used in future research into these groups.

---

CHAPTER THIRTEEN

SPORT AND DISABILITY

Sport and Disability

Participation
Young disabled people are far less likely to participate in extra-curricular and out of school sport or physical activities than non-disabled young people

Participation in sport/physical activity is 24% lower for disabled adults than for non-disabled adults

Walking and swimming are the most popular activity for disabled and non-disabled adults

9 out of the 10 top activities for disabled people are individual activities and the only team sport mentioned is football

Disabled people are deterred from sport participation due to personal reasons such as lack of confidence, feeling different etc, and external reasons such as lack of information on how they could participate, lack of physical and emotional support, appropriate facilities etc

Unmet demand
65% of disabled adults who took part in sport in the previous year indicated that they would like to play more sport

20% of disabled adults who did not take part in sport in the previous year indicated that they would like to do so

School Experience
More than half of disabled adults felt that their disability at school had limited their participation in sport/physical activity at school

Almost one-fifth of disabled adults were never or only sometimes given the opportunity to participate in physical activity at school

More than one-fifth of disabled adults had been discouraged from taking part in physical activity at school

Low rates of participation in sport/physical activity among disabled adults are significantly influenced by their experience of sport participation at school

13.1 Research (2001)\textsuperscript{165} was commissioned by Sportscotland to “\textbf{provide direction for increasing access to sport amongst people with a disability in Scotland}”. Further aims of the study was to provide an understanding of the barriers faced by disabled people with regard to participation in sport and to provide guidance on future research needs in terms of collecting baseline data in order to monitor levels of participation by this target group. The study included a desk research of literature and workshop days and individual depth interviews with disabled people and professionals involved in the field, along with

\textsuperscript{165}‘Sport and People with a Disability: Aiming at Social Inclusion’, Scott Porter Research and Marketing Ltd, 2001
parents/carers of younger disabled people and organisations that were involved in the provision of sport. Respondents covered a range of criteria, including a mix of participants and non-participants in sport, a range of levels of severity of disability, a range of ages, a mix of gender and social class, and covered both rural and urban locations.

13.2 The study explored internal barriers to sport participation, including feeling ‘different’ from the majority of the population, unable to fit in, self-consciousness or lack of confidence and a fear of failure; and external barriers, including lack of information, of physical and emotional support, appropriate facilities, transport problems, financial constraints, attitudes of others and lack of time.

13.3 A 2001 survey for Sport England\(^{166}\) found that young disabled people were far less likely to participate in extra-curricular or out of school sport, eg 16% of the sample had taken part in extra-curricular sport compared with 45% of the general sample of young people, and 47% of young disabled people had taken part in sport at the weekend compared with 74% of the overall sample of young people.

13.4 Barriers found in Finch’s study were also found in the study commissioned by sportsScotland. The authors of this study used a ‘model of consumer change in social marketing’ to illustrate the different stages leading from non-participation to participation in sport by disabled people. The study identified three key behavioural types –

- dependants (who are characterised by their lack of confidence and who consider their disability as a severe restriction in their lives);
- unconfidents (who are more confident than dependants but still hesitant about participating in sport);
- and independents (characterised by their independent attitude and feel that it should not limit their approach to life).

13.5 The authors indicated different ways in which each group could be encouraged to participate in sport that were appropriate for that particular group and recommended future methodologies to be used to gather data on disabled people’s participation in sport.

13.6 A 2002 ‘headline’ report by Sport England\(^{167}\) draws from a main report by the Office for National Statistics, which was viewed as “breaking new ground providing the first ever nationally representative statistics on the levels of participation, attitudes and barriers to involvement in sport experienced by adults with a disability”. The evidence provided by the research will be used by Sport England to adapt and develop policies and programmes to increase access to sporting opportunities for disabled adults. The survey sample used in the report was a sub-sample identified from the 2000-2001 Labour Force Survey and the General Household Survey, consisting of adults aged 16-59 years who reported having a limiting long-standing illness. A very good response rate of 71% was achieved, resulting in interviews with 6,564 adults, which enables a wide range of statistical analysis for different sub-groups within the sample. Analysis showed that

---

• 71% of adults had a disability related to pain, 58% to vision, 46% had a cognitive disability and 37% an emotional disability.
• when asked about participation in sport/physical activity, 51% of disabled adults had participated in at least one activity, including walking in the 4 weeks before the interview.
• including walking the participation rate was 24% lower than for non-disabled adults.
• walking (two miles or more) was the most popular activity for disabled and non-disabled adults.
• excluding walking, swimming was the most popular sport with disabled and non-disabled adults.
• the next most popular activities among disabled people were cue sports and cycling.
• 9 out of the top 10 activities were ‘individual’ activities and the only team sport mentioned was football.
• of those disabled adults who had a health problem when at school, 56% felt that this had limited their participation in sport or physical activity whilst at school, and 19% were never or only sometimes given the opportunity to participate in sport at school.
• only 12% had been encouraged to take part in certain sports because of their health whilst 21% were discouraged from taking part in certain sports because of their health.

13.7 The study looked at ‘unmet demand’ for participation in sport by disabled people, finding that

• 65% of disabled adults who participated in sport in the previous year would like to play more sport, with swimming being the most popular, followed by walking and cycling.
• furthermore, 20% of those who had not participated in any sport in the previous year would like to do so.
• barriers to participation were cited as health limitations (the main reason) followed by lack of time or lack of money.
• the majority of disabled adults who had participated in sport in the previous month said they needed help or adapted facilities to take part in sport – having ‘someone to keep me company’ was the type of help most frequently mentioned.

13.8 The report concluded that sports participation rates for disabled adults are significantly lower than for non-disabled adults (as was found in Finch’s survey of young disabled adults), and that past interventions aimed at increasing participation have failed to reduce inequity in participation rates across England generally. Responses from the survey indicate that rather than focusing on the traditional responses of increasing the provision of adapted equipment or suitable facilities, more needs to be done on providing information to disabled people on the sports and physical activities that they could do, given the nature of their disability. The study also concluded that there should be provision of ‘competent support’ eg trained volunteers, sport centre staff, carers etc, to enable disabled people to have confidence to participate. The report recommends that direct interventionist measures should target disabled people, especially those on a low income, more effectively, with the use of ‘leisure credits’ being one idea to increase access. And finally, the report concludes that the low rates of participation amongst disabled adults (as with disabled young people) are significantly influenced by their experience of sport participation in their school years.
CHAPTER FOURTEEN

SPORT, PHYSICAL ACTIVITY AND HEALTH

Sport, Physical Activity and Health

**General Health**

The most robust evidence on the impact of physical activity is found in the area of health.

People with active lifestyles have lower risks of coronary, cardiovascular and respiratory disease than those who have inactive lifestyles.

Participation in sport and physical activity can have a beneficial effect on mental health, and relate to an improved sense of wellbeing and self-esteem.

There is a link between inactivity and types of cancer.

A physical activity programme through GP referrals for those with coronary heart disease resulted in a reduction in blood pressure, anxiety and depression in participants, social networking and an improved sense of well-being.

Sport cannot eliminate health inequalities amongst different groups.

**Young People**

The relationship between physical activity and health in young people is less clear, mainly due to the fact that main morbidities have not had long enough to develop.

The link between physical activity (or lack of) and obesity in young people is clear.

A curriculum based and after school club physical activity programme in primary schools has resulted in more than 80% of children being more physically active.

There has evolved a ‘polarisation’ of groups of young people across European countries, with an increase in the % reporting vigorous activity, but also an increase in the number of inactive young people.

Girls are less active than boys and activity levels decline in adolescence.

Young people from lower socio-economic groups are less active.

‘High quality’ PE is important to enhance young people’s enjoyment of participation.

Provision of facilities after school and at weekends are crucial and should be designed around the needs of young people; interventions that build on young people’s ideas on sport and physical activity (especially less traditional activities such as dance and aerobics) have not yet been sufficiently evaluated.

Young people need support (eg from parents) in being active, and interventions that engage parents in supporting and encouraging their children’s physical activity work most effectively.

**Ethnic Minorities**

Black and ethnic minority groups suffer disproportionately higher levels of certain health conditions that can be improved by physical activity.
Particular barriers faced by ethnic minority groups are: they are unaware of the availability, cost and hours of facilities; they fear for their personal safety; no-one else from the same community participates; they experience racism; there is a lack of single gender provision, a lack of privacy and no recognitions of dress codes.

Guidelines developed by the HAD in 1999 set out examples of good practice in promoting inclusion of black and ethnic minority groups and provide guidance on monitoring and evaluating programmes.

Research Issues

There is a need for further well-controlled studies to clarify the benefits of sport and physical activity amongst different groups in the population.

There is little large-scale longitudinal research into the relationship between sport, fitness and health in an everyday context.

Many of the evaluations carried out on the health impacts of sport and physical activity rely on self-reported improvements.

There is a lack of tracking of physical activity and its effects from youth to adulthood.

There are few evaluated health promotion interventions that address physical activity beyond school-based physical education.

There has been little evaluation of children’s physical activity amongst socially excluded children.

There are few evaluations that use pre and post intervention data and equivalent control groups for comparison purposes.

14.1 The impact of participation in physical activity on health is the area that includes the strongest and most systematic research evidence. Expert panels such as American College of Sports Medicine 1990, Surgeon General 1996, WHO/FMS 1995 and the Health Education Board of Scotland 1997 have demonstrated the clear link between physical activity and improved health. Coalter (2001)\textsuperscript{168} indicates that the case for health is the most clear and that “people with active lifestyles are at lower risk of contracting coronary, cardiovascular and respiratory diseases than those who lead sedentary lives”. He cites evidence from previous longitudinal studies that demonstrate the health benefits from taking part in sport and physical activity, including a study of over 9,000 male civil servants aged 45-64 years in the UK over a 9 year period\textsuperscript{169}.

- The study found that those who participated in sports had lower rates of heart attack, death from coronary disease and all causes of mortality compared with those who did not participate in sports or physical activity. The more active an individual was, the lower was the incidence of heart attack.

\textsuperscript{168} Realising the Potential: The Case for Cultural Services: Sport, Fred Coalter, 2001

\textsuperscript{169} ‘Exercise in Leisure Time: Coronary Attack and Death Rates’, Morris et al, British Heart Journal 63, p325-334
14.2 Similarly, a study of the physical activity and lifestyles of almost 17,000 students at Harvard\textsuperscript{170} found that the greater the level of physical activity, the lower the mortality rate, in particular the incidence of death by heart or respiratory disease.

14.3 Coalter also illustrates that there is much evidence available to show that participation in sport can have a positive effect on mental health – for example, on anxiety, depression, mood and emotions and self-esteem. These effects derive from various social and physiological factors eg ‘time out’ from daily routines and changes in body temperature leading to reduced muscle tension and stress reduction.

14.4 A 2001 \textit{review of cross-sectional and longitudinal studies}\textsuperscript{171} confirmed the belief that exercise has both antidepressant and anxiolytic effects and mitigates against the negative effects of stress. The outcomes of a Finnish study (2000)\textsuperscript{172} involving 3403 participants were shown as significantly less depression, anger, cynical distrust and stress for individuals who exercised at least two or three times per week.

14.5 Grant’s \textit{review (2000)}\textsuperscript{173} of the scientific evidence on physical activity and its effects on mental health, found that the greatest effects of moderate physical activity are related to an improved sense of well-being, self-esteem and the reduction in symptoms of anxiety and depression.

14.6 A 2003 \textit{review of literature on mental health and health living}\textsuperscript{174} concludes that although results indicate consistent associations between and increased sense of well-being and physical activity, there remains a need for further ‘well controlled’ studies to clarify the mental health benefits of exercise among various populations.

14.7 However, Coalter points out that much evidence on sport participation’s effects on health relates to the benefits of general physical activity and is often clinical evidence. There is little large-scale longitudinal research into the relationship between sport participation, fitness and health within the everyday context of people’s lives. The conclusions of the only UK study (1992) of 7,000 people in 6 cities\textsuperscript{175} and the role of sport in the promotion of health and fitness were ‘ambivalent’. Although the study found that health benefits were evident in all socio-demographic groups – additional to other benefits resulting from other lifestyle practices – at a ‘low level of sport activity’ only self-reported improvements increased statistically, and participation in sport did not eliminate or reduce health inequalities associated with age, sex and socio-economic group; all improved but inequalities remained. Even when those in low socio-economic groups were regularly participating in sport, their ‘well-being’ remained affected by low income, poor housing and working conditions. Roberts and Brodie’s study concluded that although sport participation had an impact on health, it “offers no solutions to socio-economic health inequalities”.

\textsuperscript{170} ‘Physical Activity, All-Cause Mortality and Longevity of College Alumni, Paffenbger et al, New England Journal of Medicine 314, p605-613

\textsuperscript{171} ‘Effects of Physical Exercise on Anxiety, Depression and Sensitivity to Stress: A Unifying Theory’, P Salmon, Clinical Psychology Review, 2001

\textsuperscript{172} ‘Physical Exercise and Psychological Well-being: A Population Study in Finland’, P Hassmen et al, 2000

\textsuperscript{173} ‘Physical Activity and Mental Health: National Consensus Statements and Guidelines for Practice’, T Grant, 2000

\textsuperscript{174} ‘Mental Health and Healthy Living: A Review of Literature’, School of Sports Science & Psychology, paper prepared for Social Exclusion Unit, 2003

\textsuperscript{175} ‘Inner-city Sport; Who Plays, and What are the Benefits?’, K Roberts and DA Brodie, 1992
14.8 In a 2003 review for the Department of Culture, Media and Sport\textsuperscript{176}, the authors cite various studies that provide evidence on the relationship between sport and health. A 2002 study by Farrell and Shields\textsuperscript{177} uses Health Education Monitoring Survey data covering adults aged 16-74 living in England. Surveys of the same 2,318 respondents in 1996 and 1997 allow changes in health status, behaviour and other factors to be tracked. Sport intensity as well as participation was measured. Results showed that a significantly greater number of sporting participants reported ‘very good’ health (42%) than non-participants (29%), other things being equal. Although the largest effect comes from participation, increased intensity of sporting participation was also significant. For example, a person participating in 15 minutes of sport per day has a 6% higher probability of reporting ‘very good’ health than a non-sporting participant; for someone participating for 60 minutes, there is an increase of almost 11%.

### GENERAL PHYSICAL ACTIVITY

14.9 It has to be borne in mind the difference between sport per se and ‘physical activity’, where sport is a more defined, often organised, area of activity where facilities are provided and is a ‘sub-activity’ of the more generic ‘physical activity’. In the area of physical activity, which constitutes any form of exercise taken, such as walking, cycling for leisure, hill-walking, dancing, games, play, structured exercise etc, there is less known about its effects on health.

14.10 The following section therefore describes interventions, the relationship between physical inactivity and disease, physical activity and minority ethnic groups, and the physical activity of young people. Much of the literature has been found in European and North American Health Papers.

#### General Physical Activity Interventions

14.11 The independent US Task Force on Community Preventive Services\textsuperscript{178} carried out a systematic review (2002) of the effectiveness of selected population based interventions, designed to increase levels of physical activity focused on three areas: informational approaches to increasing physical activity; behavioural and social approaches to increasing physical activity; environmental and policy changes to increasing physical activity. The review found that

- for informational approaches, there was strong evidence that particular types of intervention worked - for community-based campaigns, school-based physical education and non-family social support interventions.

---

\textsuperscript{176} Evidence on Cultural/Creative/Sporting Effects, Economics Branch, Analytical Services Division, DCMS, 2003 (unpublished)

\textsuperscript{177} The Relationship between Sporting Participation and Health: Evidence from the Health Education Monitoring Survey, L Farrell and M Shields, Department of Economics, University of Melbourne, 2002 (unpublished)

\textsuperscript{178} Guide to Community Preventive Services: Systematic Reviews and Evidence Based Recommendations, 2002 www.thecommunityguide.org
• for behavioural and social approaches to increase physical activity, there was strong evidence to show that individually-adapted health behaviour change interventions worked.
• for environmental and policy approaches, there was strong evidence that the creation and/or enhanced access to places for physical activity combined with informational outreach activities worked.

14.12 A GP Exercise Referral Scheme\textsuperscript{179}, which was recently evaluated (2002), was established in 1997 to “increase physical activity levels amongst sedentary adult patients identified in Primary Care practices and to support physical activity adherence for patients completing Phase III cardiac rehabilitation”. The referral scheme was set up by joint planning between Greater Glasgow NHS Board and Glasgow City Council Cultural and Leisure Services Department.

4.13 The scheme was evaluated after it had been running for 4 years and after more than 10,000 patients had been referred; 76% of Greater Glasgow NHS Boards GPs had referred one or more of their patients to the scheme; and the scheme is delivered by a specifically recruited group of physical activity counsellors (PACs). The evaluation comprised analysis of 5,173 patients’ files, surveys of 518 patients and 76 GPs, and seven focus groups, 5 with patients and 2 with PACs. Patients with established Coronary Heart Disease are referred to the scheme, along with those who the GP considers would benefit from increasing physical activity. Patients jointly agree their activity goals with the PAC and enrol onto the scheme for one year, receiving a reduced price access to any of the local authority leisure centres, and patients with CHD can attend specific classes led by qualified staff. Patients are invited back for follow-up exercise consultations at 3 month intervals, during which baseline information is revisited and recorded.

• of the 5,173 people who were referred on to the scheme between 1997 and 2000, 46% did not return for a further assessment.
• of the 31% who continued on the programme, 12% attended until the 3 month assessment, 5% until the 6 month stage, 5% until the 9 month stage and 9% at the final 12 month assessment.
• the vast majority (96%) of referrals were classified as low risk, and it was those with high risk that were more likely to complete the 12 months programme.
• however, the evaluators point out that not attending the scheme for the full year does not necessarily indicate that the scheme ‘failed’, and some participants left the scheme for reasons such as buying equipment to exercise at home or finding alternative forms of exercise, and some felt their health had returned.

14.14 The evaluation points out that all data gathered by the evaluation indicated that

• the scheme had positive benefits to personal health, including the fact that the duration of physical activity per week increased with participation on the programme.
• there was a reduction in systolic and diastolic blood pressure in those who participated, and the scheme contributed to a reduction in depression and anxiety for those who moved beyond the baseline stage.
• self perceptions by patients of themselves all improved – in general health, general fitness and how they felt about themselves.

\textsuperscript{179} Glasgow GP Exercise Referral Scheme: Evaluation Report, FMR Research Ltd, 2002
• additional benefits seen by patients were the social side of the programme which facilitated social networking.
• the scheme had given them the confidence to exercise independently.
• And almost 80% of the participants stated they had continued to exercise after attending the programme.

14.15 The evaluation made various recommendations for continuance of the scheme, including trying to move participants beyond the baseline stage, as the evaluation found that the scheme had positive impacts on actual and perceived health and wellbeing if people participate to any point beyond baseline level; to consider a ‘value for money’ study carried out from a health economist’s perspective; build on the social dimensions of the scheme; to focus effort on non-referring GPs; and to promote the scheme more strongly.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Physical activity and prevention of disease</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

14.16 Physical inactivity is highlighted in the NHS Cancer Prevention Resource 2003\(^{180}\) as a risk factor which can contribute to the development of cancers and that promotion of physical activity can therefore have benefits for a range of diseases, including cancer, cardiovascular, diabetes and mental health. The Plan indicates how evidence has shown there is a link between inactivity and a variety of cancers, and a systematic review of evidence shows that there is an overall level of scientific evidence to indicate that increased physical activity levels will reduce the risk of colon cancer, and ‘probable’ and ‘possible’ evidence for breast and prostate cancer. The criteria used for categorising the evidence were strict and supportive of a causal relationship between the two factors. The Plan points out how a “substantial population-wide benefit is to be gained from increasing physical activity”.

14.17 The Strategy for Physical Activity for Scotland\(^{181}\)(2003) defines physical activity as “movement of the body that uses energy” and states that the health of two thirds of the Scottish adult population are now at risk from physical inactivity. Physical inactivity is the most common risk factor for coronary heart disease in Scotland and accounts for over one third of deaths from heart disease. The Strategy aims to change this situation and reach targets of physical activity in the next 20 years. The document points out that the benefits will be “reduced healthcare costs through the reduction of chronic disease and the potential contribution of physical activity to support the delivery of major social, economic, environmental and community policies is enormous”.

14.18 The Scottish Health Survey\(^{182}\) (1998), which informs the Strategy for Physical Activity for Scotland, indicates that most people in Scotland are not active enough eg 72% of women and 59% of men, and 27% of boys and 40% of girls do not meet the activity guidelines for health. For females, activity drops from the age of 12/13 years, rises and then declines after 35 years. For males, there is a gradual decline from 10/11 years onwards. Furthermore, the proportion of sedentary adults (30 minutes or less of physical activity on one day a week or not at all) in the lowest socio-economic groups is double that of those amongst the highest socio-economic groups, reinforcing health inequalities between certain

\(^{180}\)Cancer prevention: a resource to support local action in delivering the NHS Cancer Plan, HDA, 2003,
\(^{181}\)Let’s Make Scotland More Active: A Strategy for Physical Activity, Physical Activity Task Force, Scottish Executive Health Dept, 2003
\(^{182}\)Scottish Health Survey, Volume 1, Scottish Executive Health Department, 1998
groups of the population. The Strategy sets out the risk of physical inactivity, the benefits of activity, barriers to participation in physical activity for adults and children, and makes recommendations and proposals for the future in Scotland, so that through partnership working, strengthening the national and local infrastructure and raising awareness on the benefits of physical activity, Scotland’s population will become more active and healthy in years to come.

14.19 Research published in 2001 into physical inactivity was conducted in Northern Ireland\textsuperscript{183} to inform the Strategy Action Plan of the Northern Ireland Physical Activity Strategy Implementation Group (NIPAIG). One of the recommendations in the Plan was that “research should be carried out to evaluate and compare the cost of investing in physical activity programmes against the cost of treating preventable illness”. The research used an established statistical model and latest available health statistics in Northern Ireland, to attribute risk to the population due to physical inactivity. The study found that

- more than 2000 people in NI die each year due to an inactive lifestyle.
- if the Physical Activity Strategy is successful in reducing inactivity in the adult population from 20\% to 15\%, deaths related to sedentary lifestyles would fall by 365 each year.
- if this target was achieved, the study estimated that the Northern Irish Health Service could directly save around £0.62 million annually, and result in a net economic benefit of around £131 million.

14.20 Using a similar model to Northern Ireland, the Physical Activity Task Force in Scotland responsible for the put Strategy for Physical Activity, commissioned research on the possible cost benefits to the economy of increasing physical activity in the population\textsuperscript{184}. The study estimated the cost of savings to the economy if physical inactivity was reduced, and focused on Scottish data for coronary heart disease, colon cancer and stroke. The study estimated the economic effects, based on a goal of reducing the level of inactive Scots by 1\% each year for the next 5 years. It points out that although the estimates are ‘cautious’ they are consistent with other economic benefit studies of physical activity.

- the study found that 2,447 people in Scotland die prematurely each year due to physical inactivity – 2,162 from coronary heart disease, 168 from stroke and 117 from colon cancer.
- if the goal to reduce inactivity levels over the next 5 years was achieved, the study predicts that the number of deaths due to inactivity will fall by 157, and the economic benefit to Scotland is estimated at £85.2 million, with possible yearly cost savings to the NHS estimated at £3.5 million.

14.21 These studies are good examples of translating the social (ie health) impact of physical inactivity into economic benefits, ‘measuring’ the economic effect of increasing activity (or reducing inactivity) in the population.


\textsuperscript{184} Let’s Make Scotland More Active: The Economic Benefits of a Physical Activity Strategy for Scotland; Preliminary Analysis, Analytical Services Division, Scottish Executive Health Department, 2002
14.22 In this regard, the Physical Activity Strategy points out that “it is widely accepted that these figures present the tip of the iceberg in terms of possible economic benefits if the population became more active. There are many other benefits of increased physical activity….(such as) reduced medical costs from treating other conditions such as depression, fractures due to falling, hypertension and diabetes can also be seen.” The Strategy recognises that measurement of cost benefits due to improved wellbeing and other areas of quality of life is ‘complicated and difficult’ and recommends that the economic study is extended so that the “true cost benefits of an active nation are known”.

14.23 **Data from the 1998 Health Survey for England** found 37% of men and 25% of women met the current guidelines for activity (30 minutes of activity per day on at least 5 days of the week). These levels drop with age and participation amongst many black and minority ethnic groups is lower. The Plan indicates that effective interventions should be appropriate to the target group (eg older people, disabled people or specific ethnic groups), developed with community involvement and focus on addressing barriers to participation and how these may be overcome. The paper provides guidance on evaluating a prevention programme or intervention, which should comprise three components – process evaluation, impact evaluation (immediate benefits) and outcome evaluation (longer-term effects), and that data where possible should be analysed by key variables ie age, gender, socio-economic status, ethnicity, disability and income level, in order to measure differential impact and address inequalities targets.

### Physical Activity and Minority Ethnic Groups

14.24 **Guidelines published by the Health Development Agency**\(^{185}\) in 1999 indicated how black and minority ethnic groups suffer disproportionately higher rates of certain health conditions that can be improved by participation in physical activity, and that targeted strategies were needed due to cultural differences that may make more general approaches inappropriate, where language may provide a barrier to effective communication, and where ‘mass’ media may not communicate effectively to all sectors of the population.

14.25 The Guidelines were based on a 1995 study by Rai et al, exploring attitudes to physical activity amongst Caribbean, West African, South Asian, Indian, Pakistan, Bangladesh and East African groups. Most of the major barriers to physical activity identified by African-Caribbean and South Asian people were no different from those of the general population in England ie **lack of time, energy, or an appropriate companion, a desire to relax in their spare time or a self-perception of not being sporty**. However, some particular barriers were identified that differed –

- being unaware of availability, cost and opening hours;
- fears for personal safety in public open spaces;
- absence of other people from one’s own community using facilities; and
- actual or potential experiences of racism.
- further barriers identified by South Asian respondents were dress codes, lack of privacy in changing areas and lack of single gender provision.

---

\(^{185}\) Guidelines: Promoting physical activity with black and minority ethnic groups, Active for Life, HEA, 1999
14.26 The Guidelines point out that initiatives to encourage minority ethnic groups to participate in physical activity have worked best where

- there was a commitment at a strategic level;
- the programme is not just a one off;
- black and minority ethnic groups have been involved from the onset and understand and perceive the potential benefits of the programme;
- there is trust and respect in the deference of people from different cultures;
- programmes are well thought and planned;
- they meet with culturally specific quality standards;
- there is continuous feedback to communities of successes and failures; and
- professionals from black and minority ethnic backgrounds are involved in the development and delivery of programmes.

- the Guidelines also include the need to monitor and evaluate programmes, and provide guidance on how this should be conducted.

### Physical Activity and Young People

14.27 There is growing concern about the inactivity of young people in the UK (and in the western world), with increased numbers of children being driven to school, engaging in ‘inactive’ activities such as computer games and watching TV, and linked to this the growing number of children with weight and obesity problems in their youth.

14.28 A paper was published in 2001 in the context of the European Heart Health Initiative\(^\text{186}\) with the intention of promoting physical activity measures as a way to reduce cardiovascular disease. The paper was produced in the context of the dramatic increase in levels of overweight and obesity observed in European children and adolescents. The paper indicates that a physically active lifestyle has direct and indirect health benefits for young people, and participation in exercise and sport can also enhance social integration, cultural tolerance, understanding of ethics and respect for the environment. The paper discusses the nature of the problem, and that the direct relationship between physical activity and health is less clear for young people (with the exception of obesity), partly due to methodological problems, but mainly because the main morbidities that affect adults have not had long enough to develop.

14.29 Chris Riddoch in his 1998 paper\(^\text{187}\) on the relationship between physical activity and physical health in young people concludes that there is a lack of ‘definitive evidence’ on physical activity and its association with the physical health in young people and that methodological and conceptual problems may partly explain the weak evidence. Riddoch concludes however that “at least for the foreseeable future, we must rely at least as much on theory, common sense, observation and expert opinion as on hard evidence”. However, the link between obesity and physical activity is clear, as studies tracking obesity from youth into adulthood have shown that physical activity combined with diet, has been shown to be an


187 Relationships between physical activity and physical health in young people, Chris Riddoch, University of Bristol, in Young and Active? Young people and health-enhancing physical activity – evidence and implications, 1998
effective treatment, where young people’s psychological health, as well as physical, has improved.

14.30 The EHHI paper (above) does however point out that there is a lack of tracking of activity from youth into adulthood. The paper reviews **patterns and prevalence of activity in the EU member states**. However, results have to be treated with caution as the data is gathered by different measurement measures, but an overall picture can be gained of levels and types of activity. A survey of patterns of activity across Europe found that

- the majority of 11 year olds reported exercising twice a week or more, but with a great variation between countries.
- television watching was also measured, and at least 1 in 3 young people aged 11-15 reported watching TV for as much as four hours or more per day.
- the overall level and types of activity showed that many young people are very active and enjoyed a great deal of sport and recreation.
- however, in some countries, the ‘polarisation’ of activity was observed – whilst the overall number of inactive young people grows, there is an increase in the proportion reporting vigorous activity, leading to polarised groups of very active and very inactive adolescents. The paper suggests that this could in some cases be due to the growth of organised activities at the expense of informal play or recreation.

14.31 The review looked at the **incidence of physical education in schools**, with a survey of England showing that there had been a sharp decline in the amount of PE that schoolchildren were receiving in the previous 5 years. The proportion spending 2 hours or more in PE lessons each week fell from 46% to 33% between 1994 and 1999, with the decline in primary schools being even sharper, from 32% to 11%. Levels of obesity were also examined, showing that among young people in England, it is estimated that 20% of 4 year olds were overweight, and 8% were obese. For 16-24 year olds, 23% of young men and 19% of young women were overweight and a further 6% and 8% respectively were obese.

14.32 Another study had shown that the **rate of obesity** had increased dramatically over recent years, and from 1984-1994 overweight among 4-11 year olds increased from 5% - 9% in English boys, and 6% - 10% in Scottish boys. Values for girls were 9%-14% and 10%-16% respectively, and the prevalence of obesity increased correspondingly, with 2% of English and Scottish boys, and 3% of English and Scottish girls being classed as obese.

14.33 In nearly all surveys of physical activity amongst young people, **girls are less active than boys, and activity levels decline in adolescence**. It is therefore crucial that activities are promoted that appeal to girls and young women, as identified by young people in consultation. Riddoch states that “consultation is crucial to ensuring that needs are adequately met’. The paper indicates how it is not only important to provide community sports and facilities, but to make environmental improvements which made it easier for young people to enjoy sport and activity, such as safe walking and cycling routes, access to countryside and open space. The provision of facilities after school and at weekends are crucial, and must be designed around the needs of young people. Parents can also help to influence activity participation by their children, and research in this area has shown that young people need support in being active eg being taken to a sports field, or being shown the safest route to walk or cycle to school.
Available data on physical activity participation by social class indicate that young people from lower socio-economic groups are less active, and have less access to sports and exercise facilities, and in the light of this, policies should offer opportunities for appropriate physical activity for people from disadvantaged backgrounds. The paper also discussed how physical education in schools is a crucial area, and qualitative research has shown that badly delivered PE can put someone off physical activity for life. School-based promotion of physical activity therefore needs to ensure that it is ‘quality PE’ that is properly designed and delivered to enhance young people’s enjoyment of participation. It also needs to extend beyond the PE curriculum, where there should be a ‘whole school approach’ to health and physical activity promotion.

A recent project by Glasgow City Council (Kool Kids) has been running in 19 primary schools in the Greater Pollok area of Glasgow for 2-3 years, with the aim of increasing physical activity and healthy lifestyle choices amongst children, via curriculum-based workshops and an after school club. Evaluation of the project in 2002 incorporated a number of approaches, including in-depth stakeholder interviews; a survey of all primary 5 pupils at the end of the school year; a survey of parents; 3 focus groups with pupils; and focus groups with teachers, coaches and curriculum workers. The evaluation found that:

- 91% of children involved had learned more about eating well;
- 95% about the dangers of smoking;
- 91% stated that they had become more active as a result of the project;
- four out of five children took the information they had learned home to discuss with their parents;
- parents rated Kool Kids very highly overall – 93% felt their child had learned about healthy choices and 81% of children had become more active; and
- two-thirds of children had also taken up new physical activities in the past year.

A 2003 systematic review of research on barriers and facilitators to children (aged 4-10) and physical activity in the UK indicates how low levels of physical activity in childhood have been linked with low levels in adulthood, and those at greatest risk of inactivity belong to groups considered to be ‘socially excluded’. Evaluations of interventions to promote physical activity amongst children were carried out from around the world, and non-intervention research aiming to describe factors relating to children’s physical activity participation in the UK was also examined.

The review found that there are “few evaluated health promotion interventions which address physical activity beyond school-based physical education” and that even fewer have been rigorously evaluated. However, in one rigorous study interventions that engaged parents in supporting and encouraging their children’s physical activity and multi-component, multi-site interventions using a combination of school-based physical education and home-based activities were found to have been effective. Views of children identified barriers to their participation in physical activity – restricted access to opportunities for physical activity (eg busy traffic, poor quality of playgrounds, and the need for local accessible facilities). The review points out however that whilst there has been a substantial amount of

---

189 Children and physical activity: a systematic review of research on barriers and facilitators, Evidence for Policy and Practice Information Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI), University of London, 2003
evaluation activity related to promoting children’s physical activity, little of this has been conducted in the UK or amongst social excluded children.

14.38 The same type of review on children aged 11-16 years in 2001 and focusing particularly on young people from socially excluded groups, reviewed a total of 28 studies including international studies evaluating the effectiveness of interventions, and UK studies examining young people’s own views about physical activity and how it might be promoted. The review found that

- in terms of young people’s views, the vast majority saw physical activity as beneficial for both health and social reasons.
- young women particularly valued the role of physical activity in maintaining weight and a toned figure, but found that physical activity did not fit in well with their leisure time.
- ideas for promoting physical activity included increasing practical and material resources eg creating more cycle lanes; making activities more affordable; increasing access to clubs for dancing; combining sports with leisure facilities; and providing more ‘non-traditional’ activities to choose from in school physical education.

14.39 The review concluded that there were major gaps for research and development, and that the effectiveness of interventions “that address or build on young people’s ideas” have yet to be sufficiently evaluated. This is particularly the case for less traditional school-based activities, including dance and aerobics, for modifications to PE organisation and teaching, and for additional community and personal resources or materials. The review considered that only 4 out of 12 outcome evaluations were methodologically sound, and that particular methodological problems were failure to report pre and post intervention data on all individuals; non-equivalent study groups; and not reporting the impact of the intervention on all outcomes targeted.

---

190 Young people and physical activity: a systematic review of research on barriers and facilitators, Evidence for Policy and Practice Information Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI), University of London, 2001
The Economic Impact of Major Sporting Events

It is possible to calculate the short-term impact of a major sporting event, using additional expenditure in the area due to the event taking place; however, longer-term economic impacts require longer-term research.

The methodology used to calculate visitors’ expenditure, reasons for visiting the area, number of nights spent etc., should include a random sample survey of spectators at the event; sampling of businesses in the area should also be conducted so that ‘hidden data’ can be revealed.

All of the evaluations of major events covered above demonstrated a clear economic impact on the local (and sometimes beyond) economy; even where there was a shortfall in the costs of setting up the event and monies earned, the additional expenditure generated in the local economy was much greater than any shortfall that occurred.

Research Issues

Economic impact evaluations of major events should make clear the sampling methodology used, whether random sampling was carried out so that a representative population are covered and that any problems occurring in this area are taken into account by the researchers and adjusted accordingly.

A way of evaluating the social costs and benefits of major sporting events should be found, examining the negative as well as the positive effects on the local community.

There is a need for longer-term research/evaluations of major events to assess whether and in what way the short-term economic impact has been sustained.

15.1 It is generally understood and believed that major sporting events result in economic benefits to the local, and sometimes beyond, community and region. The following section will illustrate several economic impact evaluations that have been carried out on national and international sporting events, and the outcome results.

15.2 A report in 2002\(^{191}\) analysed the economic impact to Scotland and Edinburgh of the Six Nations Rugby Tournament, where previously no independent estimate of such economic benefits in Scotland had been carried out. Information was gathered from more than 2,500 spectators by way of mainly face-to-face self-completion questionnaires, at two matches in 2002. Additional information was gathered from a survey of 53 Edinburgh businesses in the hotel and pub trade. The main conclusion of the report was that:

- the immediate impacts of each international match on the Scottish economy were substantial and estimated to be at least £20m, with impacts of over £12 for the Edinburgh economy.

---

\(^{191}\) The Economic Impact of the Six Nations Rugby Tournament on Edinburgh and Scotland, R McQuaid and M Greig, Employment Research Institute, Napier University, 2002
• the survey found that over 97% of visitors were in Edinburgh primarily for the match, and almost 75% of those who stayed overnight for the England game stayed in Edinburgh, and over 90% of visitors for the France game.
• when expenditure on food and drink, accommodation, shopping etc was broken down by residence, overseas visitors were found to spend almost 5 times as much as Scottish residents (unsurprisingly) and about twice as much as English residents.
• the survey of businesses showed that the effect of both matches on turnover was positive, with more than half of the businesses reporting an increased turnover of 25% or more during the rugby weekend.
• just under half of hotels and pubs in both matches employed some extra temporary part-time and full-time staff.
• further potential outcomes of the event were longer term opportunities such as the promotion and targeting of tourism; using the profile of Edinburgh and Scotland to lever in further investment; and the creation of partnerships with the long term aim of maximising wider economic benefits from such major events.

15.3 However, it is not clear from the report the methodology used for the survey of visitors eg random sample, quota sample, response rate etc, although clearly a substantial number of spectators were interviewed and broke down into almost 50/50 for Scottish and English spectators at the Scotland v England match and 44% from France, 39% from Scotland and 12% from the rest of the UK for the Scotland v France match, providing a reasonable sample coverage from which comparisons could be made.

15.4 An earlier study\textsuperscript{192} evaluated the economic impact of six major sports events that took place in England and Scotland in 1997. The research was carried out for the UK, English and Scottish Sports Councils. The 6 events studied were World Badminton Championships and Sudirman Cup, Glasgow; European Junior Boxing Championships, Birmingham; 1st Cornhill Test Match England/Australia, Edgbaston; International Amateur Athletics Federation Grand Prix, Sheffield; European Junior Swimming Championships, Glasgow; and Weetabix Women’s British Open Golf, Sunningdale. The authors of the study point out that there is “no set way of evaluating the costs, benefits or impacts” of a major sporting event; any research into the effects that events have must be customised to suit the objectives of those who need the information, and many possible lines of enquiry cannot be measured in the short term and require long term, academic studies which are expensive. However, they indicate that it is possible to calculate in the short term, the additional expenditure generated in a city by an event, using research methodology of self completion questionnaires, desk research and qualitative interviews.

15.5 A sample survey of visitors can be carried out, and the information gathered from this, together with ticket sales information, is used to provide population estimates of additional expenditure by visitors from outside the local economy. The authors of this study also highlight the importance of pre-planning for the survey, establishing the type of visitors who will be attending and whether there are any circumstances unique to this group that may effect the research (eg Eastern Bloc countries have less to spend than Western European nations, young people will have less to spend than older etc). The other underlying principle in collecting meaningful information from the questionnaire is an appreciation of sampling theory so that the data, upon which overall estimates are based, are well grounded. The authors indicate that a programme of random sampling needs to be implemented.

\textsuperscript{192} Economic Impact of Major Sports Events, Leisure Industries Research Centre, 1997
Complementary information also requires to be collected, from organisations, businesses etc involved in the setting up of the event, so that ‘hidden’ data can be revealed.

15.6 Clearly, the methodology used for this economic evaluation was sound, and the processes and outcomes were as follows:

- **World Badminton Championships and Sudirman Cup** – 788 questionnaires were completed covering a variety of respondents. Total attendance at the event over two weeks was 21,702, substantially less that the 30,000-40,000 expected. 97% of day visitors indicated that the badminton championships were the main reason for their visit to Glasgow. For those spending at least one night in Glasgow, 32% were combining their visit to the championships with a holiday in Scotland, with the Highlands the most popular destination and Edinburgh second. Also, 32% of those staying overnight were British and 53% other European. 92% indicated that the main reason for their visit to Glasgow was the championships. Hotels reported a significant impact on bookings as a result of the event. The study concluded that the economic impact of the event was considerable with over £2m additional expenditure in Glasgow as a result. The biggest contribution of this was from players, officials and media, mostly from overseas, followed by a significant contribution from spectators generating additional expenditure of £609,396.

- **The European Junior Boxing Championships** - the total sample size was 254, significantly less than the 500 target. However, the authors indicate that the sample size provides a fair reflection of those typically at the event and the total number of visits to the event was lower than expected. 73% of all spectators sampled were visitors to Birmingham. The survey revealed that 40% of spectators stayed overnight in Birmingham. The study concludes that the Boxing Championships generated just over £0.5m of additional expenditure in the local economy, with about half generated by visitors to Birmingham for the event (competitors, officials, coaches and spectators) with the other half as additional expenditure by the organisers in Birmingham on staging the event. The event itself made a loss of overall about £70,000 due to low spectator interest and lack of media and sponsorship interest.

- **The 1st Cornhill Test Match: England v Australia** – in total, 1060 questionnaires were completed via a random sample of spectators over the four days of the event. Expenditure by Birmingham residents was not included in the economic impact analysis. From the sample it was estimated that 8% of spectators were from Birmingham, out of the total attendance of 72,693 people. The results indicate that 77% of all visitors only visited the Match as day visitors. The Test Match drew visitors from all over the UK to Birmingham. Whilst the average spectator visited for just over one day, the average Australian spectator visited for 4 days as part of an extended trip in the UK or Europe. Similarly, the group of media representatives stayed for an average of 4.5 nights and had a high level of daily expenditure. The contribution of spectators to additional expenditure in Birmingham was £4.2m over 4 days. Hospitality guests made a contribution of £0.8m of expenditure and a ‘large economic boost’ was given by the team and officials themselves. A total of 48,394 bednights were generated in the Birmingham area as a direct result of the event and the majority of the economic impact from the Test Match was seen in Birmingham’s hotel, catering and retail distribution sectors. The study concluded that there was an additional £4.6m expenditure in the local economy of Birmingham. The total cost of
staging the Test Match was just under £0.5m. There was an overall Test Match
surplus of around £0.9m, with additional income of about £2.3m from the sale of
broadcasting rights. The study highlighted the benefits to the organisers in having the
experience of organising similar events on an annual basis, making it easier to predict
levels of attendance and provide catering arrangements to meet demand.

- **The IAAF Grand Prix** - random sample of the spectators, officials and athletes
took place resulting in 1,417 completed questionnaires. It was also possible to check
respondent type by numbering questionnaires to relate to particular seating blocks in
the stadium. Responses from Sheffield residents were filtered out so as to include
their expenditure from the final analysis. For the spectators, 74% were not from
Sheffield. Analysis of the data showed that only a minority of respondents stayed in
Sheffield overnight and the group with the highest proportion staying overnight was
athletes/officials, with 66% spending at least one night in Sheffield. Most of the cost
of staging the event fell to Sheffield City Council, who spent in total £67,000 and
their total income from the event was £27,500 leaving a shortfall of £39,000. There
were also hidden costs calculated at £30,000. The study concluded that for a one day
event, the Grand Prix 1 athletics generated a considerable impact, at £177,000
additional expenditure in the local economy as a direct result of the event. Sheffield
City Council made an operating loss of £39,500 illustrating the normal pattern for
many major sporting events ie the event itself makes an operating loss but this is the
cost of generating additional economic activity in the local economy. In addition,
there was also a marketing benefit made to the city from the Channel 4 coverage of
the event.

- **The European Junior Swimming and Diving Championships** – these championships
took place in Glasgow and Edinburgh and the impact study for this looked at the
impact of the swimming championships solely in Glasgow and used the basis of the
findings to estimate the impact of the diving championships held simultaneously in
Edinburgh. A unique feature of the championships was that it was one of the first
events in the UK to receive financial assistance from the National Lottery, through the
Scottish Sports Council’s lottery fund under the Major Events Programme. The City
of Glasgow invested about £80,000 in kind in the event. The report on the study
indicates how there were practical problems in carrying out the survey of attendees
and participants, and with teams from 39 countries, many of them from the former
Eastern Bloc, it was not economically viable to have questionnaires translated into all
languages, and therefore the results were biased in favour of English, French, German
or Spanish speakers. The author acknowledges that a better method of interviewing
would have been before the championships took place. However, despite this
problem the number of competitors, team managers, technical officials, spectators and
the media amounted to 279, and exact records of additional expenditure on
accommodation were made available. No questionnaires were completed by
spectators who were from Glasgow, having been filtered out initially. Analysis
showed that 582 visitors from 15 different countries stayed for a total of 3,830 nights
at three local venues, generating £185,938 in expenditure, which accounted for 70%
of the total economic impact of the event. In total, additional expenditure in Glasgow
and the surrounding area by all groups attending or participating in the event totalled
more than £0.25m, and the cost of staging the event was, at minimum, £140,000. An
estimate of the economic impact of the diving championship in Edinburgh was based
on these findings, totalling almost £84,000 of which 81% was expenditure on accommodation.

- **The Weetabix Women's British Open Golf Championship** – the impact analysis on this event was ‘more difficult’ than the other events to delimit, especially in terms of boundaries and of inputs into and leakages out of the local economy. A random sample of respondents was carried out over 4 days of the event. In total 508 questionnaires were returned from non-Sunningdale residents. It was estimated that day visitors to the event were 83% with only 17% of visitors staying overnight in the area. The largest of groups were the spectators, followed by players, caddies and families, and then media representatives and events organisers. Of all the groups, the players and event organisers had the longest average stay in Sunningdale, Berkshire and Surrey, the average length of stay being 7 nights. Most of the additional expenditure made as a result of the golf was made by spectators (£1.48m), with additional expenditure by visitors totalling £1.65m. Together with expenditure by organisers a total of £2.1m was generated as additional expenditure by the event. A total of 2,039 additional bed nights were created in the area as a direct result of the event. The costs of staging the event amounted to £0.5m.

15.7 Two 1999 robust economic impact studies\(^{193}\) on motor-racing in Great Britain and in Europe (the Grands Prix) found that the local economy and beyond were greatly impacted by the hosting of the events. For the former, the study found that

- the Network Q Rally of Great Britain hand pumped £11.1 million into the local economies, £6.7 million or 60% of it from outside the impact area.
- the most impacted and most benefited types of business were local hotels, motels and campgrounds, local eating and drinking establishments, local retail stores, local transport businesses and the special stages and their attendant facilities.
- the Rally occurs in November when there would otherwise be a lull in the number of visitors to the region and is one of the largest spectator sporting events in GB.
- almost 8,000 local companies benefit from rally week business, and these employ more than 81,000 workers annually.
- more than 500 temporary jobs are created during the week and virtually all are local and the money earned stays in the local community.

15.8 The impact study did not quantify the amount of indirect spending stimulated by the event, nor the subsequent tourist spending, and only spectators actually purchasing tickets or paying for parking were included in attendance and spectator spending figures. The findings therefore may be an underestimate of the actual, direct and indirect economic impact of the event, which is clearly substantial.

15.9 The same authors evaluated the economic impact of the Grands Prix in Europe. They refer to the study as a ‘first’ in that it measured “every conceivable facet of the economics of the sport”, by race and by host locality, thus producing a study that ‘is a statistically accurate measurement of how much local wealth is created by the Grands Prix’. Major findings of the study were:

---

\(^{193}\) The Economic Impact of the Network Q Rally of GB and the Economic Impact of the European Gran Prix, W Lilley III & L J DeFranco, InContext Incorporated, Political Economic Analysis, Washington, 1999
• more than 2 million spectators attended just 11 events;
• almost $500 million was spent by spectators; and
• spending took place in more than 127,000 local businesses with more than 700,000 employees spread over the European area.

15.10 The authors compared the Grand Prix races in Europe to the economics of the premier American sporting events, including the closest motorsport rivals and concluded that the European Union Grands Prix are probably unrivalled in the sporting world for creating economic benefits at the local level.

15.11 A 2003 report provided financial information about the cost of hosting the Mountain Bike World Cup in Scotland, and established the impact of the event on the local area’s economy. This event is part of “the most prestigious mountain bike series in the world” and was held in the UK for the first time in 2002. The ticketed event attracted over 8,000 spectators to the course on mountain slopes near Ben Nevis. A World Cup Village was erected on the Nevis car park and the finish arena, and included a range of Expo stands offering the latest mountain bike equipment, demonstrations, competitions, food and drink, live music and other entertainment. The objectives of the study were to establish the amount of additional expenditure generated to the local area that could be directly attributable to the event. A survey of all visitors to the event was carried out, interviews with local businesses and services suppliers took place, and an analysis of the event organiser’s income and expenditure records was conducted.

• the study took into account additional hidden event costs such as policing costs, and found that the total cost of hosting the event was £285,000.
• the total income was £275,000 including income from sponsorship, grant aid, ticket sales, race entries, merchandising etc.
• local businesses were positive about the impact of the event, with one campsite owner indicating income for the weekend was £3,500 compared with £300 he would normally expect for a typical weekend at this time.
• expenditure by visitors (which was the report indicates is probably an under-estimate) was estimated at generating over £0.5m additional expenditure to the local area.
• when event expenditure and income are compared, there is a shortfall of a few thousand pounds. However, total additional expenditure to the local economy as a result of the Mountain Bike World Cup was £613,000.
• it was also estimated that as a result of visitors taking a longer holiday in Scotland solely because of the event, generated additional expenditure of £59,000 outside the local area.

15.12 Clearly, the hosting of the event had economically benefited both the local and outside area.

15.13 A report on the potential social and economic impact of the Manchester 2002 Commonwealth Games on the city, the wider region and the nation, shows how the Games contribute to enhancing regeneration both in Manchester and the North West. The impact of the Games compares favourably with reported impacts from other international

sporting events in the UK and place them on a par with the rate of return for economic benefits achieved by host cities of the last four Olympic Games. Manchester’s hosting of the games provides a mechanism for “uniting a coalition of interests including private sector and national government, inducing investment in infrastructure and facilities of importance, and provides a basis to engage with people, businesses and regeneration initiatives”.

15.14 The report cites how the Games in Manchester will

- generate a total of 16,000 jobs that will last from a few months to over 10 years;
- would bring an additional £22m expenditure into Manchester;
- provide the basis for £36m for business opportunities generated by trade missions and inward investment; and
- encourage 300,000 additional visitors to Manchester in the future.

15.15 Additional employment impacts, including direct and indirect effects, will be greatest in the East Manchester area, which was the focal point for the Games. The study points out that although new economic activity tends to displace economic activity elsewhere, because of the wider role and function of the Games, the loss is much less than would have been expected. Additional employment for East Manchester amounts to 2,320 jobs, for the City of Manchester 2,400 jobs, and for the North West 1,920 jobs, and over 420 jobs in the whole of the UK. The legacy of the Games has resulted in a planned extension of the Metrolink system and environmental works, linking the city centre to Sportcity, planned new housing and new businesses. Sportcity is creating new jobs in its sport facilities and associated catering and retail uses, and will bring new sporting events to Manchester (eg some half a million swimming sessions have been sold at the Aquatics Centre in its first year of operation, exceeding the anticipated target by 10%). Tourism spend from Games participants and visitors is estimated at £22m for Manchester. As yet, there is no post-evaluation of impact of the Games to compare estimates with actual achieved results.

| Negative aspects of hosting mega events |

15.16 In a 2003 article by Spring\(^ {196}\), he points out that **there are sometimes downsides to using sport for regeneration purposes, and that often the ‘negative’ issues raised by such mega-sports events are not addressed.** He indicates that arguably, mega events such as the Commonwealth Games in Manchester, can act as a catalyst for community, economic and social regeneration, and there is much evidence coming out of Manchester to support this belief. However, Spring cites research undertaken through studies on the perceived benefits and costs to the people of Manchester of hosting the Games, and other major events and regeneration projects associated with sports. Key benefits determined by the research included

- new facilities;
- increased tourism;
- economic benefits;
- better infrastructure;
- increased standing for the city;
- improvement to the area;

\(^{196}\) The Social Impact in Recreation 62 (6), pp 36-38 July 2003, Charles Spring, University of Derby
• a kickstart for local businesses that have been struggling; and
• a strategy for sport.

15.17 Notwithstanding these benefits however, the research also found key costs (or disbenefits) including

• overcrowding in the city;
• noise pollution;
• unused facilities;
• increase in council tax;
• concerns that it could all be a failure;
• damage to local shops and businesses;
• concerns about effect to economy from the games; and
• increased crime rate during the games.

15.18 Spring points out that the benefits of new facilities may be counteracted by the removal of old facilities eg through closure or moving to other areas, and the new facilities do not directly replace them (he uses the example of 2 swimming pools being closed in East Manchester during the build up to the games). Also the increase in tourism to the area clearly brings a positive financial benefit, but it is not clear that such economic benefits equate to social benefit for much of the population. Spring argues that preliminary discussion is needed to look at earlier applications of cost-benefit research and determine if they may be applied in the context of social benefits and costs, and whether indeed, social costs can be analysed in the same way. It is difficult to measure or apply quantitative theory to certain aspects of social benefit or cost (eg how can the cost of noise pollution be measured?). Spring calls for further research and analysis of these issues to provide a better understanding of the actual costs and benefits brought to the community as a result of a major sporting event.

15.19 Similarly, a 2003 review of a book that provides a sociological and political critique of the Sydney Olympic Games 2000197 indicates how there can be ‘hidden’ social costs of hosting a mega-event, such as “police actions, urban sanitisation programmes, labour strife, attacks on the homeless, race relations and the overt power of the media” which are sometimes the ‘harsh realities’ for the most vulnerable members of communities caught up in the processes leading up to hosting a mega event. The book highlights the impact of hosting the event on marginalised groups including Aboriginals, the political left and specific interest groups such as the tenants who suffered massive rent increases leading up to and during the games. The review considers that the book provides a particular insight into the effects of new laws and measures aimed at ‘cleaning up’ Sydney and policing ‘undesirables’, and that it explores “the imposition of dominant forms of culture on unwilling participants”. The book does not however, include explicit analyses of the benefits to citizens, the economy, business etc and is not a rigorous evaluation of the social impacts of the Sydney Olympics; however it does provide an alternative look at some of the negative impacts on certain communities as a result of the city hosting a major sporting event.

SECTION 3

CONCLUSIONS
16.1 The main aim of this Review was to establish what cultural and sport research has been carried out that provides sound evidence of real benefits, both economic and social, to communities and individuals, with a view to informing future policy and investment and strategies in these fields.

16.2 Further objectives were to:

- review research evidence in the context of PABs priorities eg participation, diversity, health/disability, diversion from crime, social inclusion, education and economic impact/employment.
- critically review research evidence on the impact of arts, culture and sport on other policy domains eg health, social justice, education
- assess methods currently used by the main SE sponsored bodies to appraise and evaluate projects
- highlight research that has investigated the reasons for the under-representation of certain groups in culture and sport eg young people, women, disabled people, older people, ethnic minorities, urban and rural dwellers
- explore international research examples of the cost benefits and social impact of cultural tourism and major events to inform the strategy to Promote Scotland
- establish key gaps in the existing body of research where robust, measurable evidence is lacking
- recommend future research required to inform the policy areas of culture and sport
- recommend best approaches the NDPBs can use to achieve robust, measurable outputs from their research activity and approaches to partnership working.

16.3 Although this Review has had to be limited in scope in any one particular research area due to timetable requirements and a wide coverage of several different fields of study, it is clear from the findings that there is a wealth of research that has been carried out on the social and economic impact of culture, sport and the arts. The research covered by this review is robust in its findings and methodology, whether consisting of quantitative and/or qualitative approaches. All of the research covered will be held on a database for future reference. However, due to the often ‘ad hoc’ nature of the research and evaluations in these fields, many of them having been carried out for a specific purpose or to inform a particular initiative or programme, they tend to be dispersed across a wide spectrum of national and local organisations, academic institutions, central and local government departments, and can be found in the Scottish, UK and international context. This therefore makes comparison between studies and evaluations, or drawing from them to inform other types of initiative, difficult if not impossible, due to different collation and analysis methods for each study. The Review however, provides an overview of the type of research and evaluation that has been carried out in recent years and draws together the findings which, when illustrated ‘en masse’, builds up a body of research evidence which produces clear and consistent themes across different projects and across different communities, demonstrating the general, common impact of participation.
16.4 The Review has drawn together the most recent (or most important) findings of research into the areas of culture, art and sport, and has focused on the Scottish Executive priorities of social inclusion (including diversion from crime, disabled access, participation by ethnic minorities), health and education. The following sections relate the Review findings to the relevant objectives outlined in the research specification.

**Research Objectives**

- review research evidence in the context of PABs priorities eg participation, diversity, health/disability, diversion from crime, social inclusion, education and economic impact/employment.
- critically review research evidence on the impact of arts, culture and sport on other policy domains eg health, social justice, education
- highlight research that has investigated the reasons for the under-representation of certain groups in culture and sport eg young people, women, disabled people, ethnic minorities, urban and rural dwellers

16.5 Key findings from each of the respective areas are as follows:

**Social Impact**

**Personal and Community Development**

16.6 Participation in cultural and sporting activities has been shown to result in the gaining of new skills, improve informal and formal learning, increase self-confidence, self-esteem and a feeling of self-worth, improve or create social networks, enhance quality of life, promote social cohesion, personal and community empowerment, improve personal and local image, identity and a sense of well-being. For young people in particular, participation can reduce truancy/bad behaviour at school, reduce the propensity to offend and lead to better educational/employment prospects. For ethnic minority groups, all of the above personal and social aspects can occur, and in addition participation in cultural activities relating to their own culture can result in an enhanced sense of pride in, and ‘empowerment’ of, the ethnic community; and for disabled people, participation can reduce isolation, increase social networks and enhance quality of life.

**Social Justice**

16.7 Although no research has demonstrated a causal effect between participation in arts, culture and sport activities and a reduction in offending behaviour, national and international research and evaluation has demonstrated a link between the two. Where sport and arts activities have been targeted at young people at risk, or actual offenders, there has occurred a significant reduction in crime figures in these areas and a reduction in re-offending. Programmes of activities can not only create a ‘diversion’ from criminal behaviour, but can facilitate key skills in learning, develop personal and social skills and provide routes into further education and employment, all of which can lead to the propensity not to re-offend or participate in criminal behaviour.
Health

16.8 Research (including clinical research) has shown that participation in cultural or sporting activities (including physical activity) has led to improved physical and mental health (e.g., reduced stress levels, reduction in anxiety and blood pressure, reduction in visits to GP etc). Clinical, hospital based research has provided hard, undisputed facts on the improvement of health. However, ‘softer’ more qualitative outcomes have been shown to include improved communication skills in those with special needs; ‘carers’ having developed new skills and confidence; and improved interpersonal skills and increased social networks having led to an improved sense of well-being amongst the target population.

Education

16.9 Robust and longitudinal research studies have shown that there is an association between cultural possessions in the home/culture in family background and educational performance; that there is a link between cultural participation and increased literacy and that participation in music and visual arts is linked to being above average in reading, maths and behaviour; and it is believed by educators that arts activities and creativity in education have a positive educational impact on the majority of pupils. Research has also demonstrated that sports and arts schools perform better over time and at a given point in time than maintained schools. Participation in arts education can lead to not only the development of arts and knowledge skills, but to increased confidence and the development of communication skills, an understanding of diversity and transferable skills for future employment.

Participation and Under-represented Groups

16.10 Various quantitative research projects have provided information on the level and extent of participation by the general population in culture, the arts and sport. Such studies have shown that certain groups are under-represented in participation in every area – low socio-economic groups, young people with low educational attainment, disabled and mobility impaired people (e.g., the elderly in particular and those living in rural areas) and ethnic minority groups, young males post-education (in the arts), teenage girls (in sport) and school children and teenagers (visiting heritage organisations).

Barriers to participation

16.11 Research has investigated the reasons for under-representation of these groups and has found that the main, common, barriers are: lack of time and money (particularly the cost issue for families); availability and location; lack of, or inaccessible, public transport (particularly for those living in rural or peripheral areas); lack of understanding, lack of understanding and perception that the activity is ‘not for them’; irrelevance to their everyday lives; and ‘management ethos’. In addition to the above, for ethnic minority groups there are barriers such as lack of diversity in representation of the arts and in sport, lack of their own culture portrayed, language barriers, fear of racism and social constraints. For disabled and mobility impaired people, lack of appropriate access to and at facilities; lack of programmes geared to their needs; lack of emotional and physical support; and a sense of ‘feeling different’ constrain their participation in cultural and sport activities. For the lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender community, the small number of plays and arts events that reflect their own culture, despite the fact that a considerable number of people in the arts world are
from their communities; the lack of books on subjects related to their communities in libraries; and the lack of privacy in changing rooms in leisure centres.

**Audience Development**

16.12 Research into audience development has been carried out on a variety of cultural and art activities, has mainly been quantitative (combined with qualitative) in nature and provides robust findings on the type of audience that attends and the potential audience that does not at present attend. Research has demonstrated that some venues lack understanding of box office computer systems, have poor data collection systems and events are based on an inaccurate picture of audiences; that partnership working and engaging with the local community can increase audience attendance at the theatre, particularly when the programmes reflect art forms that attract the target audience; and that psychological barriers are foremost in deterring young people from attending cultural venues and innovative methods of marketing are required to increase attendance by this group.

16.13 Research on gallery audiences has shown that evening opening of galleries can catch a group of people who normally cannot find time for such visits during the day; can stimulate perception of art galleries as a social destination; and there is potential to augment the gallery experience with special events, music, cafes etc; and that Sunday openings and social events in galleries would encourage more attenders; similarly, research on museums found that people would like to see evening opening hours, to have more ‘innovative’ displays and to be more child friendly. Findings also suggest that arts and cultural facilities need to devote more time and resources to making existing programmes more user-friendly and psychologically and intellectually accessible, and should provide more and easily accessible information to raise awareness. It has been found that specifically targeting a particular group and organising an event with educational content can create future interest in and attendance at art exhibitions. However, research has also found that arts provision (eg the number of galleries in an area) does not necessarily equate to high attendance.

**Economic Impact**

**Research Objective**

- explore international research examples of the cost benefits and social impact of cultural tourism and major events to inform the strategy to Promote Scotland

16.14 The economic evaluations covered by this Review have been robust in their methodology, demonstrating additionality by way of additional expenditure and employment, direct and indirect impact, and revealing ‘hidden’ costs and taking them into account when providing the net outcome.

16.15 Various economic appraisals and evaluations of the establishment of Dundee Contemporary Arts and its multi-functional provision, West End theatre in London, cultural industries and museums, libraries, galleries, exhibitions and major cultural events have demonstrated direct and indirect economic impacts on local areas and beyond. Evaluations have shown that additional expenditure and employment both locally and nationally, have often been the result of a cultural centre or major event having been staged. Social impact has also resulted from such cultural facilities or events, including the creation of a ‘cultural
sector’ in the city, enhancing the image of an area and providing the opportunity to promote the area on the international stage.

16.16 Such events and cultural facilities also highlight the importance of cultural tourism to the national economy and evaluation of international visitor attractions (such as the Guggenheim Museum) and international events (eg Winter Olympics in the US) have demonstrated the economic and cultural impact on the local community and the host nation.

16.17 Similarly, the economic evaluations of sporting events have demonstrated an economic impact on the local area by way of additional expenditure and the generation of additional employment and the potential for long-term economic gains, particularly when a major sporting event has been the catalyst for regeneration of an area. This can also result in the promotion of a city or area on the global stage, and attract visitors to a particular area they may never have visited in the past.

16.18 Evaluations of major cultural and sporting events have demonstrated that strong and close partnership working has contributed to the success of the event. For example, the evaluation of the Dundee Contemporary Arts centre concludes that other Scottish cities can learn from this example, where the use of a partnership approach in identifying a strategy using culture as a potential source of regeneration, was successful in its aims. Other examples of successful partnership working include the annual Ceolas week-long festival in South Uist, and the Stirling Initiative Cultural Programme, both of which have a definite economic and social impact on the community and have become popular events for locals and visitors alike; and the Manchester 2002 Commonwealth Games, where there was a coalition between the private sector, national and local government to provide a world class event.

Research Methods

Research Objective

- assess methods currently used by the main SE sponsored bodies to appraise and evaluate projects

16.19 Methods used for impact evaluation by the various agencies and organisations consist of a variety of designs and approaches. Large scale organisational surveys of museums, archives and public libraries provide the quantitative measures of the extent of service provision and financial and attendance data. Some studies have explored social inclusion and under-represented groups through focus groups, individual interviews, and consultation; and household surveys have been carried out to establish the number of participants and non-participants in culture, the arts and sport. Sample sizes range from very small numbers to several thousands. Traditional data collection tools such as self-completion questionnaires, face to face and telephone interviews, focus/discussion groups and case studies have been used in combination or as a single method. Surveys and interviews with cultural and sport staff and project workers have been carried out, as well as user groups.

16.20 However, it has to be recognised that the social impact of programmes, initiatives, individual projects etc, is a difficult concept to objectively measure. This Review has
examined numerous research studies and evaluations, and it would seem that very few have used all the characteristics required to measure accurately a clear impact on individuals or communities eg large representative and unbiased samples, control groups for comparison purposes and adequate time spans to evaluate a longer term impact. Some studies have consisted of large representative samples, some small qualitative pieces of research have been carried out in a rigorous way using control groups or before and after data, and some have been longitudinal in nature and examined the longer term impact of participation. Nevertheless, there is a substantial number of research projects and evaluations ‘out there’ that provide good quality, robust evidence gathered in a rigorous manner (although focused on the specific initiative being assessed) that can be used as evidence of the social and economic impact of cultural activities and sport.

16.21 There is a widespread acceptance amongst the research community of the value of qualitative data to understand and assess social impact, particularly in the arts field, where self-reported evidence from participants provides a valid testimony to the immediate, and sometimes more long-term, impact on their lives. As long as the data is gathered within a rigorous research framework then qualitative information can provide reliable information on immediate impact. However, many are of the view that many arts projects are too small-scale and too modestly resourced to yield robust results that can be quantified and validated, and that good measurement tools are required that can be both sensitive to the particular area of work, but robust enough to define outcomes.

16.22 Related to the issue of specificity of research, it would appear that sometimes organisations involved in researching issues relevant to the service they provide, may focus too narrowly on specific aspects of that service, and might therefore fail to capitalise on the potential of the research to gather better-founded information on wider, related aspects of their service, thereby providing the ‘bigger picture’. If the scope of research is sufficiently wide at the outset, it can provide a more robust set of findings in policy terms than if it only relates to single issues; it will also produce data that may be helpful to the organisation and other bodies, and more influential in policy development in the longer term.

16.23 Similarly, in relation to economic impact evaluation, critiques of conventional methodology in this area have been made, including that many do not take into account the ‘immeasurable’ (in economic terms) social impacts such as enhanced quality of life, sense of place, improved image of the host area and thus its ability to attract investment and employment as a result; such critiques of economic impact evaluations point out that often the negative costs of hosting a mega event are not highlighted, and that a way of evaluating both the social benefits and costs of major events should be found, examining the negative as well as the positive effects on the community.

16.24 This therefore brings us to the need for a common, systematic method of researching/evaluating sports and cultural initiatives and programmes, that will provide comparable and meaningful data for those involved in developing policy in these fields. This is particularly important in the evaluation of arts and sports programmes specifically developed to promote social inclusion, and have an impact on well-being and quality of life. Firstly, the rationale for a particular programme should be set out clearly by the organisation at the outset, with clear aims and objectives for the target audience, so that research can relate outcomes to objectives, and whether these have been achieved. There is then a need for a common evaluation approach that firstly captures the rationale for the project (or the ‘theory’ behind the initiative), monitors the programme process (to enable the development of good
practice and to learn where improvements can be made) and evaluates both the short-term and long-term outcomes. It is also important to evaluate, on completion of a project, any ‘unintended outcomes’ that may not have been foreseen when setting specific objectives.

16.25 At present, it would appear that there is no single and established set of evaluation principles, and it is clear from the Review that the most successful evaluation of projects, and something which produces the most effective partnership working, occurs through the establishment of a clear understanding, at the outset of the project, of the objectives desired outcomes and actual outcomes. Evaluation should include a set of evaluative criteria (which could be transferred to other projects and tailored according to need) that can then be measured on conclusion of the project and later on to establish longer-term impact. Research reviews have shown that evaluation carried out is frequently inadequate and that a common mistake is to fail to state and agree clear aims for a project, thus making it inevitably difficult to measure outcomes. Evaluation often tends to occur on a more informal basis, particularly for smaller projects, as the agencies responsible for the provision of the activity seldom have the necessary funding or time to rigorously and systematically evaluate.

Towards a common evaluation framework

Research Objective

- recommend best approaches the NDPBs can use to achieve robust, measurable outputs from their research activity and approaches to partnership work

16.26 Many research reviews covered in this Review have illustrated the clear theoretical arguments for the positive contribution that sport or arts and culture can make to a range of social issues. However, as Reeves (2002) points out, there is a “lack of systematic monitoring and evaluation of the outcomes …(with a widespread reliance on ‘output’ measures”, mainly due to the short-term nature of many projects, the complexity of defining and measuring outcomes, a lack of expertise in doing so, and limited funding; and as Coalter (2000) indicates, evaluations at present may be too underdeveloped and not sufficiently sophisticated or indeed long-term to confirm causal links between participation and impact.

16.27 However, there has recently been a move by some organisations to develop ‘evaluation toolkits’ (eg, Scottish Arts Council, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, Scottish Museums Council, Information Management Centre for libraries, Woolf for arts education activities) to assist the providers of the activity in evaluating outcomes. The Department for Culture Media and Sport and Arts Council England also initiated evaluation research programmes in the light of a report on social inclusion. There is widespread consensus that there is no ‘one model’ that will fit all, but that there is a need for a common and consistent framework of the evaluation process, that can be tailored to meet the needs of the individual organisation conducting the evaluation. Reeves indicates that a number of key requirements are required to effectively evaluate impacts, including: clear, comprehensive and comprehensible frameworks and measures; meaningful and rigorous analysis combined with flexibility; a multi-level approach (eg evaluation at national, organisational, local and project levels); and indicators that capture the complex, holistic, dynamic and long-term nature of potential impacts, including ‘soft’ as well as ‘hard’ indicators. The recent ‘Magenta Book’

---

Evaluation is defined in the MB as using:-

“a range of research methods to systematically investigate the effectiveness of policy interventions, implementation and processes, and to determine their merit, worth, or value in terms of improving the social and economic conditions of different stakeholders”.

16.28 The Magenta Book points out that policy evaluation uses quantitative and qualitative methods, experimental and non-experimental designs, descriptive and experiential methods, theory based approaches, research synthesis methods and economic evaluation methods. The two types of evaluation that are commonly used (and often together) are process (or formative) evaluation and impact (or summative) evaluation. Process evaluation examines the contextual factors and processes underlying a policy’s success or failure, from which the commissioners of the policy can learn what works best and why. Impact evaluation seeks to provide estimates of the effects of a policy, either in terms of the initial objectives of the policy, or compared with some other intervention, or with doing nothing at all.

16.29 Although its focus is on policy evaluation in government, it could also be used by external analysts and users of evaluation. The MB “endeavours to provide guidance on social research methods for policy evaluation in readable and understandable language”, and provides examples of evaluations that have used methods appropriately and effectively. An evaluation ‘toolkit’ for the agencies, based on the Magenta Book and others, could also contain general advice to agencies carrying out research into aspects of their service, ensuring that they maximise the scope of any research and capture wider issues that will provide robust evidence for the development of future policy.

16.30 In reviewing research into participation in the areas of culture, the arts and sport, it is evident that a common thread runs throughout the findings on social impact – increased self-esteem and confidence, enhanced sense of well-being and improved ability to communicate are brought about as a result of participation in such activities. When taken on their own, qualitative studies can only demonstrate the ‘local’ effect on a sometimes small number of participants in an activity. However, when various studies are drawn together, the general, common impact of participation becomes more apparent and ‘tells the same story’.

Gaps in Evidence

Research Objective

- establish key gaps in the existing body of research where robust, measurable evidence is lacking

16.31 One of the main objectives of this Review was to identify gaps in evidence that, if filled, would inform and assist sport, arts and culture policy development, particularly in light of the National Cultural Strategy, Sport 21 and the Partnership Agreement for a Better Scotland. On examining the available evidence, and from discussing gaps in research with the various NDPBs, it would appear that there exist gaps in evidence in the following areas:

- Data collection: there needs to be research on participation (and therefore non-participation), views and attitudes to culture and sport on a national, large-scale basis
in a consistent way, so that information can be disaggregated down to regional, and possibly, local level in order to target policy. Sportscotland are about to commission such a survey on issues relating to sport. There are also discussions ongoing at present for a large-scale survey on culture, the arts and sport participation to be conducted, involving all the countries in the UK, and Scottish Executive Social Research and DCMS are taking these forward.

- **Longitudinal studies:** very few longitudinal studies have been carried out on both the social and ongoing economic impact of cultural and sport initiatives, programmes and major events. There is a need to measure beyond an initiative’s immediate objectives, but it is not generally the responsibility of cultural/sports organisations to carry out such studies, as they are time-intensive, require expertise and are costly. There may be a role for the Scottish Executive in this case, to be responsible for prioritising which initiatives should be evaluated, selecting the appropriate consultants to carry out the evaluation, and managing the research, results and dissemination centrally.

- **Under-represented groups:** there needs to be more research, particularly at a Scottish level, on attitudes held and behavioural reasons behind non-participation in sport and culture. Some research studies (on sport) have focused on this issue, and have recommended the type of methodology and sample to be used in future research into these groups. The same type of methodology could be used for non-participation in cultural activities and recommend good practice on how to include those normally socially excluded from participating in or attending cultural activities/events.

- **Well-being and Quality of Life:** these concepts are often cited by participants as the outcome of participation in cultural and sporting activities. However, more research requires to be carried out on a) the definition and analysis of the qualities of ‘well-being’ and ‘quality of life’ and the measurement of these outcomes; and b) measurement of the relative contribution of arts, culture and sport activities.

- **Physical activity:** although there has been substantial evaluation of programmes relating to promoting children’s physical activity, most of this has been conducted abroad, and little has occurred in the UK on a large-scale basis, or has focused on socially excluded children. The effectiveness of physical activity interventions that have built on young people’s ideas (especially for the less traditional school-based activities such as dance and aerobics) has yet to be sufficiently evaluated. However, the New Opportunities Fund evaluation of sport activity in schools goes some way to addressing this gap in information.

- **Arts and Prisons:** there appears to have been little evaluation of arts projects and programmes in UK prisons or rehabilitation centres in recent years, particularly in the longterm, and how these may contribute to a reduction in re-offending, learning life skills such as literacy, and increasing employability; and, in addition to plugging this gap, more longitudinal research requires to be carried out in this area to ascertain whether immediate impacts are sustainable over time.

- **Arts and Health:** there is a need for a more formal outcome evaluation of the role of arts in health, with many projects being too small-scale for rigorous analysis; there is also a need, where appropriate, for the social and economic impact of the benefits of arts interventions in healthcare to be assessed, with financial savings to the National
Health Service demonstrated by economically evaluating the beneficial impact to patients’ health

• **Creativity in Education:** there have been recent interest and developments in this field in both the educational and arts sector, and longitudinal research requires to be carried out on the role of creativity in education at primary and secondary levels, and how it can contribute to problem-solving skills, cognitive and social development, and the effects it may have on life outwith school, and in future employment.

• **Employment:** there has been very little research into the social impact of participation in the arts, culture or sport interventions and how this impacts on future employment. Research has demonstrated that participation in arts activities, particularly at school, can develop skills that are transferable and can be used in various types of employment. It has also shown that self-esteem and personal confidence and development can occur, which could in turn lead to becoming more employable, but there is a dearth of evidence in this area to suggest a clear link between the two areas. Research requires to be carried out that follows through participation in cultural or sport interventions and actual employment gained as a result.

• **Art as itself:** some of the national institutions consider that a major gap in research is on the social impact of art itself eg what do the national collections and promotions in museums and art galleries say to people from ethnic minority groups, and what type of collection would they wish to see in the national galleries. Research on the intrinsic nature of art and its capacity to provide meaning to different individuals and different cultures would assist art providers in understanding more about what art means to target audiences, and perhaps encourage more participation/attendance.

• **Monitoring and Evaluation:** there are now available, on-line, by certain organisations, evaluation ‘toolkits’ to assist those funded by the organisation to evaluate the individual projects in which they are involved. However, there is clearly a gap in the availability of a consistent, common evaluation framework which can be used by all sectors to evaluate programmes and initiatives. There is a need to ensure that the evaluation guidance provides the capacity to adapt to suit the organisation’s particular needs, but at the same time to evaluate in a rigorous and consistent method that can be used by the different sectors in the arts, culture and sport fields. There is therefore a need for the developing of one (or more) of the existing evaluation toolkits, using the evaluation guidelines in the government’s ‘Magenta Book’\(^{199}\) as a starting point. Use of HM Treasury’s ‘Green Book’\(^{200}\) for economic evaluation of major cultural and sporting events

• **The Bigger Picture:** organisations and agencies involved in cultural and sport research should be encouraged to capitalise on the potential of the research to gather robust information on wider, related aspects of their service, rather than focusing too narrowly on specific aspects of that service. This would then ensure that findings related to wider policy issues and would produce data that would not only be helpful

---


\(^{200}\) The Green Book, [www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/media/05553/Green_Book_03.pdf](http://www.hm-treasury.gov.uk/media/05553/Green_Book_03.pdf)
to the organisation and other bodies, but be more influential in policy development in the longer term.

- **Combined Social and Economic Impact Evaluation:** there appear to be very few evaluations that combine the social and economic impacts of arts, culture and sports participation (particularly long-term), yet findings from such evaluations can illustrate how social impacts can be beneficial in the long term to the economy. It would be useful to government departments and delivery organisations if, in substantial and relatively expensive programmes, firstly, an economic appraisal takes place prior to the start up of the programme; secondly, evaluation of the process and social outcomes/impacts of the programmes is carried out; and thirdly, economic evaluation is carried out on the cost effectiveness, or ideally, the cost benefits of the programme, measuring the economic benefits of the social outcomes, in the immediate and longer term.

- **Major Events:** conventional economic impact methodologies evaluating major cultural or sporting events tend not to take into account the social impacts such as enhanced quality of life, sense of place, improved image of the host area and thus its ability to attract investment and employment as a result; they also often do not highlight the negative costs as a result of the event taking place. A method that evaluates both the economic and social benefits and disbenefits should be found, and that examines the economic contribution of certain social impacts on the community.

- **Dissemination of information:** many organisations visited during the course of this Review, mentioned the need for a ‘central’ point of information, such as a website or publication, on the basic statistics and information on level of attendance/participation in sport, arts and culture, the frequency and the intensity of use of facilities and participation, across Scotland. At present, certain information is held by the various bodies on their own websites/in their own publications, but they do not have the ability to compare and contrast with other sectors in their field, due to the lack of a central site or publication that disseminates such information.

- **Partnership Working:** the Review cites examples of successful projects where partnership working has taken place, and there are many examples of good practice for future use. There is much scope for more partnership working to take place between delivery organisations on research and evaluation of initiatives and sharing findings. All organisations interviewed for this Review were of the view that there was scope for more co-operative working, which would be beneficial from a policy and cost point of view.

This Review has found that there does exist a wide body of evidence on the impact of culture, the arts and sport on individuals and communities, but that there are various gaps in research which, if filled, would contribute significantly to a robust evidence base for these policy areas. Particularly noticeable is the lack of longitudinal research on social outcomes of participation in culture, the arts and sport, and the link between participation and outcomes such as improved physical and mental health, higher educational attainment, employment and a reduction in offending. The Scottish Executive is currently considering the way ahead in light of the Review’s findings, and the wider research community may also be interested to
note the gaps in research and the potential for future collaboration in addressing these evidence requirements.
BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Allen, K and Shaw, P

*Festivals Mean Business: The shape of Arts Festivals in the UK, 2000*

Anderson, D and Nurick, J


Angus, J

*A review of evaluation in community-based art for health activity in the UK*, CAHHM, for HDA, 2002

Arthur, S and Thompson, L

*Stimulating Creativity: a project to link the arts and the voluntary childcare sector*, 1999

Arts for All (UK)

*There's nothing that can't be done*, Mencap, 2003

Audit Commission

*‘Building Better Library Services: learning from audit, inspection and research*, 2002

Black, A and Muddiman, D

*Understanding community librarianship*, 1997

BMRB International

*‘Cultural diversity: attitudes of ethnic minority populations towards museums and galleries’, 1998*

British Film Institute


British Film Institute

*“Look Again”, 2003*

Broad, S et al

*What's going on?: a national audit of youth music in Scotland*, Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama, National Centre for Research in the Performing Arts, 2003

Brophy, Professor P


Bryan, J et al

*‘Assessing the role of the arts and cultural industries in a local economy’, 2000*

Cambridge Policy Consultants Report

*The Impact of the Manchester 2002 Commonwealth Games Executive Summary*, 2002

Cap Gemini Ernst & Young for NOF

*Delivering summer activities in high crime neighbourhoods: the intensive evaluation of Splash Extra 2002*, 2003
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title and Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland, W</td>
<td><em>An Evaluation of the Core Arts Programme 1998-2001- Executive Summary</em>, Minneapolis Minnesota, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalter, F</td>
<td><em>Realising the Potential of Cultural Services</em>, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalter, F</td>
<td><em>Realising the Potential: The Case for Cultural Services: Sport</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalter, F</td>
<td><em>Let’s make Scotland more active: Entrance Charges and Sports Participation</em>, A Review of Evidence, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalter, F with M &amp; Taylor, J</td>
<td>‘<em>The Role of Sport in Regenerating Deprived Urban Areas</em>’, Centre for Leisure Research, University of Edinburgh, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collins, M et al</td>
<td>‘<em>Sport and Social Inclusion: A Report to the Department of Culture, Media and Sport</em>’, Institute of Sport and Leisure Policy, Loughborough, 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCMS</td>
<td><em>Policy Action Team 10: Report to the Social Exclusion Unit- Arts and Sport</em>, DCMS, 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCMS</td>
<td>‘<em>Measuring the local impact of tourism</em>’, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCMS</td>
<td><em>News release</em>, 13 January 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCMS</td>
<td><em>Evidence on Cultural/Creative/Sporting Effects</em>, Economics Branch, Analytical Services Division, 2003 (unpublished)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCMS</td>
<td><em>Press Notice</em>, 15 July 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De Montfort University</td>
<td><em>Festivals and the creative region: The economic and social benefits of cultural festivals in the East Midlands</em>, Leicester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downing, D</td>
<td><em>In our neighbourhood: a regional theatre and its local community</em>, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 2001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Economic & Technology Policy Studies

Issue Brief: How States are Using Arts and Culture to Strengthen Their Global Trade Development, NGA Centre for Best Practices, 2003

Economics Branch, Analytical Services Division, DCMS,


Edge, M et al


Evans, E, Shaw, P, Allen, K

The Contribution of Culture to Regeneration in the UK, London Metropolitan University, 2003 (unpublished)

Everitt, A and Hamilton R

‘Evaluation and Collection of Evidence: an example’, Art, Health and Community, A Study of Five Community Arts in Health Projects, Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine, 2003

Evidence for Policy and Practice Information Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI)

Children and physical activity: a systematic review of research on barriers and facilitators, University of London, 2003

Evidence for Policy and Practice Information Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI)

Young people and physical activity: a systematic review of research on barriers and facilitators, University of London, 2001

Farrell, L and Shields, M

The Relationship between Sporting Participation and Health: Evidence from the Health Education Monitoring Survey, Department of Economics, University of Melbourne, 2002 (unpublished)

Fie Foe, D and Metadigita

Pockets of Potential: Moving Image Education in Scottish Schools, 2003

Field, Y and Harrow, M

Routes across Diversity: Developing the arts of London’s Refugee Communities’, 2001

Finch, N et al


Fiske, E B (ed)

‘Champions of Change: The Impact of Arts on Learning’, 2000

FMR Research


FMR Research Ltd

Glasgow GP Exercise Referral Scheme: Evaluation Report, 2002

Garcia, B

Exploring events and their cultural legacies: Salt Lake Winter Olympic Games 2002, in ‘Major Events’, CCPR website
Garcia, B and Miah, A

‘The Olympics is not a Sporting Event!’, 2002 in Centre for Cultural Policy Research website

Giesekam, with Knight, S

Luvvies and rude mechanicals?, University of Glasgow, 2000

Goodlad, R, Hamilton, C and Taylor, P

‘Not Just a Treat: Arts and Social Inclusion’, University of Glasgow Centre for Cultural Policy Research and Department of Urban Studies, 2002

Grant, T

‘Physical Activity and Mental Health: National Consensus Statements and Guidelines for Practice’, 2000

Guide to Community Preventive Services

Systematic Reviews and Evidence Based Recommendations, 2002

Hall, B

Cultural Industries Key Data, The Cultural Industries in Yorkshire and the Humber, 2000

Hamilton, C and Hinks, S

Arts for health: still searching for the Holy Grail’, CCPR, University of Glasgow, 2002

Harland, J et al


Harland, J and Kinder, K

Crossing the Line’, Arts Council England/Gulbenkian Foundation, 1999

Harland, J et al

Arts in their View: a study of youth participation in the arts, National Foundation for Educational Research, 1995

Harland, J et al


Hassmen, P et al

‘Physical Exercise and Psychological Well-being: A Population Study in Finland’, 2000

HEA

Guidelines: Promoting physical activity with black and minority ethnic groups, Active for Life, 1999

Health Development Agency

Cancer prevention: a resource to support local action in delivering the NHS Cancer Plan, 2003

ICM Research for NESTA

Barriers to the realisation of creative ideas, 2002
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/Institution</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independent Northern Consultants</td>
<td><em>The Economic and Social Impact of the Arts in the Highlands and Islands</em>, 2001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Research Solutions</td>
<td><em>Barriers to Participation in Culture, Arts and Leisure</em>, 2003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Leisure and Management</td>
<td>‘<em>The Contribution of Arts and Sport to Neighbourhood Renewal and Reducing Social Inclusion</em>, 1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jentle, I</td>
<td><em>Changing the scene: increasing access to the performing arts for visually impaired performers and audiences in London</em>, 2002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jentsch, Dr B</td>
<td><em>A Picture in your head- Children and the arts: a study of the perceptions and participation of children aged 5-12</em>, for Children in Scotland, 1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jermyn, H</td>
<td><em>The Arts and Social Exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England</em>, 2001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jesson and Taylor</td>
<td>*Educational Outcomes and Value Added Analysis of Specialist Schools for the year 2000, 2001 and ‘Value Added and the Benefits of Specialism’, 2002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jura Consultants and Gardiner &amp; Theobald</td>
<td>‘<em>Economic Impact Assessment of the Millennium Commission’s Programmes</em>, 2001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinnell, M et al</td>
<td><em>Public library services for visually impaired people</em> Loughborough University, 2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning and Teaching Scotland</td>
<td><em>Creativity in Education, the ides network</em>, 2001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Leisure Industries Research Centre  
*Economic Impact of Major Sports Events*, 1997

Lilley, III, W & DeFranco, L J  
The Economic Impact of the Network Q Rally of GB and the Economic Impact of the European Gran Prix, InContextIncorporated, Political Economic Analysis, Washington, 1999

Linley, R and Usherwood, B  

London Borough of Enfield Annual Report  

MacBeath et al  

Maitland H & Baker T  
*Profile of Dance Attendees in Scotland*, 2002

Maitland H & Baker T  
*Twelve Top Tips for Bigger Audiences for your Dance Company*, 2002  
[www.scottisharts.org.uk/nonhtdocs/TwelveTopTips.pdf](http://www.scottisharts.org.uk/nonhtdocs/TwelveTopTips.pdf)

Mann Weaver Drew and De Montfort University  
The Economic Impact of the Notting Hill Carnival, 2003

Matarasso, F  
*Use or Ornament? The social impact of participation in the arts*, Comedia, 1997

McDonald, Dr R  

McIvor et al, University of Stirling and A Netten, University of Kent  
*Evaluation of the Airborne Initiative (Scotland)*, Crime and Criminal Justice Research Findings No 45, Scottish Executive Central Research Unit, 2000

McKrell, L et al  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>McQuaid, R and Greig, M</td>
<td><em>The Economic Impact of the Six Nations Rugby Tournament on Edinburgh and Scotland</em>, Employment Research Institute, Napier University, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miles, Dr A</td>
<td>‘What works in offender rehabilitation?: including the arts’, Discussion paper prepared for the Institute for Public Policy Research Arts in Society Seminar Series, University of Manchester, Sept 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORI</td>
<td><em>YouthLink Scotland State of The National Survey: Schools Omnibus and Young People Survey</em>, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORI</td>
<td><em>Visitors to museums and galleries in the UK</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morris et al</td>
<td>‘Exercise in Leisure Time: Coronary Attack and Death Rates’, <em>British Heart Journal</em> 63, p325-334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morris Hargreaves McIntyre</td>
<td><em>Start with the Child: the needs and motivations of young people</em>, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morris Hargreaves McIntyre</td>
<td><em>Audiences Scotland</em>, (in progress)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muddiman, D et al</td>
<td><em>Open to all? The public library and social exclusion</em>, Library and Information Commission, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACCE</td>
<td><em>All our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education</em>, DfEE, 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Museums of Scotland</td>
<td>‘Creating the Past’, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netto, G et al</td>
<td><em>Sharing the Spotlight: increasing access and participation in the arts by Scotland’s minority ethnic communities</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Media Partners for NESTA</td>
<td><em>Barriers to the realisation of creative ideas</em>, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFO System Three</td>
<td>‘Attendance at, participation in and attitudes towards the arts in Scotland 2001/02’, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’Hare, L</td>
<td><em>The Forthview Drama Project</em>, Arts Co-ordinator, Fife Council in Arts for Medicine conference synopsis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author/Institution</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Schools</td>
<td><em>Specialist Schools: An Evaluation of Progress</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plaza, B</td>
<td><em>Evaluating the influence of a large cultural artefact in the attraction of tourism: the Guggenheim Museum Bilbao Case Study</em>, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLB Consulting Ltd</td>
<td><em>Developing New Audiences for the Heritage</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Services Quality Group of the National Council on Archives</td>
<td>‘<em>Survey of Visitors to British Archives 2002 Single Archive Report</em>’ for NLS Manuscripts Section, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reeves, M</td>
<td><em>Measuring the economic and social impact of the arts: a review</em>, Michelle Reeves, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Centre for Museums and Galleries</td>
<td>‘<em>Museums and social inclusion: the GLLAM Report</em>, University of Leicester, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Centre for Museums and Galleries, University of Leicester</td>
<td><em>A Catalyst for Change: The Social Impact of the Open Museum</em>, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RGA Consultants</td>
<td><em>Case studies in Culture and Tourism in Scotland</em>, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riddoch, C</td>
<td><em>Relationships between physical activity and physical health in young people</em>, University of Bristol, in Young and Active? Young people and health-enhancing physical activity – evidence and implications, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roberts, K and Brodie, D A</td>
<td>‘<em>Inner-city Sport; Who Plays, and What are the Benefits?</em>, 1992</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanderson, T</td>
<td><em>NGS Rembrandt’s Women for women at work: Evaluation Report</em>, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotinform Ltd</td>
<td><em>Star Trek: The Exhibition: Visitor Survey and Economic Impact Assessment</em>, Jones Economics, 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Porter Research and Marketing Ltd</td>
<td><em>Sport and Ethnic Minority Communities: Aiming at Social Inclusion</em>, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Porter Research and Marketing Ltd</td>
<td>‘Sport and People with a Disability: Aiming at Social Inclusion’, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Arts Council</td>
<td>‘Audiences at Scottish Arts Council Core Funded Visual Arts Organisations – current profile and barriers to attendance, Interim Report September 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Arts Council</td>
<td><em>Evaluation Toolkit</em>, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Arts Council</td>
<td><em>Strategic Development Discussion Paper</em>, Arts and Social Inclusion (unpublished)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Executive</td>
<td><em>Partnership Agreement for Scotland</em>, 2000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scottish Executive  *Partnership Agreement for a Better Scotland, 2003*

Scottish Executive  *Let’s Make Scotland More Active: A strategy for physical activity, Physical Activity Task Force, 2003*

Scottish Executive  *Let’s Make Scotland More Active: The economic benefits of a physical activity strategy for Scotland – preliminary analysis, Analytical Services Division, Scottish Executive Health Department, 2002*

Scottish Executive  *Scottish Health Survey, Volume 1, 1998*


Shaw, P  *The Arts and Neighbourhood Renewal, A literature review to inform the work of PAT 10 (unpublished), 1999*

Shaw, P  *What’s art got to do with it? Briefing paper on the role of the arts in neighbourhood renewal, for Arts Council England, 2003*

SHM Productions Ltd  *Art for Health: A review of good practice in community-based arts projects and interventions which impact on health and well-being, 1999*

Sport England  *Adults with a Disability and Sport National Survey 2000-2001, Headline Findings, 2002*


Spring, C  *The Social Impact in Recreation 62 (6), pp 36-38 July 2003, University of Derby*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SQW and NFO WorldGroup</td>
<td><em>MTV Europe Music Awards Edinburgh 03 Economic Impact Study</em>, 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taylor, P, Crow, I, Irvine, D and Nichols, G</td>
<td><em>Demanding Physical Activity Programmes for Young Offenders under Probation Supervision</em>, 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Scottish Arts Council and Scottish Tourist Board</td>
<td><em>Culture and Tourism in Scotland</em>, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Unit for the Arts and Offenders</td>
<td><em>Arts in Criminal Justice Settings: Research and Evaluation</em>, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thompson, L</td>
<td><em>Stimulating Creativity Follow-up Report: Influence and Developments</em>, 2000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
University of Edinburgh School of Education  
*Young People Speak Out Video work in schools*, 2003

University of Sheffield & Sheffield Hallam University  
*‘How Much?’*, 2000

VisitScotland  
*Culture and Holidays*, UK Consumer Omnibus Analysis of Results, Susan Dickie,

Wamsley, K B  
*Book Review*, in Canadian Journal of Sociology Online, March-April 2003 on


Wavell, C et al  

Westbrook, S  
*Economic Impact Evaluation of Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre*, 2003

Westbrook, S, Callaghan, S, and Burns, B  
*Assessment of Highland Independent Museums*, 1999

Williams, D  
*Creating Social Capital. A study of the long-term benefits from community based arts funding*, 1996

Witt, P A and Crompton, J L  
*Recreation Programs that Work for At Risk Youth*, 1996

Youth Justice Board  
ANNEX I

KEY PLAYERS IN SPORTS, THE ARTS AND CULTURAL RESEARCH

Scottish Executive sponsored Non-Departmental Public Bodies

Interviews took place with senior representatives of each NDPB in sports, the arts and culture, and the following are synopses of their role, their involvement in research and their plans for research in the future. Specific pieces of research that each institution has found useful and referred to are in the body of the review.

Scottish Arts Council

The Scottish Arts Council (SAC) is the lead body for the funding, development and advocacy of the arts in Scotland and it works closely in partnership with the arts sector and key agencies, particularly local authorities. In 2003/04, it has a total budget of £60 million, £38 million of which comes from the Scottish Executive and £22 million from the National Lottery fund. Over 90% of this funding is distributed in grant aid and financial support to arts organisations and programmes across the country. It core funds over one hundred arts organisations (including theatres, galleries, festivals, performing arts companies and development agencies) throughout Scotland and invests in the professional development of individual artists such as writers, dancers, crafts makers, actors, visual artists and musicians.

It is currently preparing its corporate plan. Its aims are to increase participation in the arts, to support artists in Scotland to fulfil their creative and business potential and to place the arts, culture and creativity at the heart of learning. One of Scottish Arts Council’s priorities is to promote creativity and an appreciation of the arts amongst young people both through the funding of work in schools and in community settings. It also administers the Cultural Co-ordinators programme for schools funded by the Scottish Executive.

The SAC launched its Cultural Diversity Strategy in 2002 with three strategic aims – to increase the number and range of practising artists from culturally diverse communities; to improve access to a wide spectrum of arts and cultural activities for minority ethnic people and the general population; and to provide employment opportunities in the arts for people from minority ethnic backgrounds.

The SAC has a particularly strong development and advocacy role in promoting the wider impacts of the arts in relation to the social and economic benefits they bring. Over the past few years, it has encouraged evaluation methods (particularly in relation to arts and social inclusion) by providing support and advice on setting up initiatives and evaluating them. An evaluation toolkit has been developed\textsuperscript{201} with a view to encourage and improve evaluation methods and to develop greater consistency across the sector. One of the difficult issues in the process of detailed evaluation is demonstrating causality, and social impact requires long-term monitoring and evaluation. However, major programmes of arts provision/initiatives can be and are evaluated, against clear objectives set to measure intended outcomes. The process of developing a 5 year corporate plan is designed to ‘sharpen up’ aims and objectives and a revised research strategy will be integral to the new plan. The collection of routine data relating to attendance and participation is gathered from each core funded organisation and trends can be examined by different types of art form and

\textsuperscript{201} Evaluation Toolkit, Scottish Arts Council, 2003
initiative. Early in 2004 the SAC will meet with these organisations to discuss revisions to this annual audit taking account of new issues including Scottish Executive targets. In addition, from 2004 the SAC will gather more information on all grants distributed, including estimated audiences and participation, whether the project created ‘new’ work, whether new voluntary opportunities resulted and how much funding had been levered from other sources. This is in response to an acknowledged need to improve reporting on outcomes.

Since 1991, the SAC has undertaken a general population survey into attendance, participation and attitudes towards the arts in Scotland. The purpose of the research is to identify and profile audiences and participants in terms of demographic and artform specific data and to assess attitudes towards a number of arts-related issues amongst the adult population. It is likely that this research will be expanded in 2004 to gather more information about under-represented groups’ participation in the arts.

Other research and data sources are used by the SAC; for example, the recent Midlands social and economic impact of festivals was useful in informing the arts sector about the potential for widening audiences for the arts. Collaboration also takes place with the Arts Councils in England, Wales and Northern Ireland where the SAC’s Research Officer regularly attends meetings where information is disseminated and liaison on initiatives and research takes place. The SAC not only commissions its own research but funds other organisations to commission research and evaluation. The results of such research are used to inform policy, fill gaps in knowledge and increasingly to establish baselines for future measurement of participation by under-represented groups. The SAC has a dedicated research budget, but considers that it is not now sufficient to cover large representative surveys in Scotland required to capture data and carry out longitudinal studies on, for example, under-represented groups.

Currently, the SAC is commissioning research and evaluation on the impact of the arts on older people, on the arts contribution to the creative industries in Scotland and the publishing sector. It is also working in partnership (at its final stages of development) with Glasgow Health Board to establish a three year programme on the social and economic impact of the arts on health. The SAC believes that working in partnership with organisations such as Glasgow Health Board is particularly beneficial, combining areas of expertise and providing clear evidence of impact. It also has a longstanding development programmes with local authorities in Scotland to build capacity in areas of low provision in order to increase opportunities for people to participate in the arts. Areas which have benefited from the Local Authority Partnership scheme include Scottish Borders, East Dunbartonshire, West Dunbartonshire, Moray and Aberdeenshire. The Rolling Programme started in 1992 and has seed-funded the appointment of arts officers in local authorities where no previous post existed and Orkney’s first arts officer post will be created in 2004 in partnership with Orkney Islands Council and Orkney Islands Enterprise. The relationship between arts and education is an extremely important issue, and the SAC considers that there is much scope for closer working relationships with the Education Department in the Scottish Executive, especially in learning about the influence of the arts on educational outcomes from the various datasets routinely gathered.

The SAC considers it helpful to have a broad policy framework of priorities arising from PABS and the National Cultural Strategy including, for example, having a national context for encouraging and including under-represented groups in the arts. The distribution of public money must be accountable and rigorous evaluation of initiatives must be undertaken,
whilst still maintaining the important area of research and development and the fostering of excellence in the arts. The SAC has to balance the ‘instrumental’ with the intrinsic value of the arts. It is essential that artists continue to have the opportunity to be experimental, innovative and to take creative risks to ensure the arts are dynamic and of the highest quality.

The most important area of research in the forthcoming plan is on audiences: knowing more about existing audiences, identifying potential audiences and overcoming barriers to attendance, particularly by under-represented groups. Creative industries, drama provision in education, and the needs for continuing professional development for artists are also important issues to be examined.

The Scottish Arts Council considers that there is an opportunity to improve access to statistics/data on arts and culture at national and local level. An important step to achieving this would be developing consistency in the definitions and categories used within the arts and cultural sector and consultation would have to take place to establish this.

**National Museums of Scotland**

The National Museums of Scotland (NMS) maintain and provide access to the National Collections. Access is provided through research and publication, learning services, exhibitions, loans and partnerships. Six museums make up the NMS – The Royal Museum and the Museum of Scotland, the National War Museum of Scotland, the Museum of Flight, the Museum of Costume and the Museum of Scottish Country Life. NMS delivers services at the museums, in communities across Scotland and internationally. Each museum has permanent displays and a programme of changing special exhibitions, events and learning programmes for visitors of all ages. Community based services include loans to other museums and projects such as ‘Discovery on the Move’ which is a touring project enabling people across Scotland to access the national collection in their own local area. NMS is creating digital access to its collections and services through its own website, through contributing digital records to SCrán and through links to portals such as the Scottish Executive Cultural Portal and the 24 Hour Museum.

In 2003 NMS committed to a new vision – to be “a world class museums service that informs, educates and inspires”. The NMS Corporate Plan 2004-08 recognises that through this vision NMS can and should contribute to the Scottish Executive priorities for education and inclusion, and Ministers’ objectives for increasing participation in cultural activity, particularly by specific audiences that include young and older people, rural residents and people from socially deprived areas. NMS priorities include widening access to a larger, more diverse and inclusive audience and expanding learning opportunities. NMS created a new Access and Outreach team to develop services for new audiences and based in communities.

The NMS carries out an annual visitor survey at all its museums, conducted by an independent survey company using a sampling process to record information and build a visitor profile, visitors’ reactions to their visit and satisfaction levels on general and specific exhibitions. NMS also employs techniques such as focus groups and questionnaire based surveys to inform both the development of services and their evaluation. However, NMS recognises that although such research and other data capture has provided details on input (eg staff time, resources, processes) and outputs (eg number of website visits, number of
participants in learning programmes, user satisfaction etc), this work provides limited information on the wider social impact of NMS activities. Research on impact is potentially very valuable, but by its nature it is long-term and therefore expensive to carry out. In all learning and programmes projects, which focus on making the museum more accessible to certain groups such as socially deprived, rural residents and ethnic minorities, projects have an inbuilt evaluation process to assess the outcome of the project. However, these are carried out on an individual basis, and the long term outcomes from, and impact of participation in museum activities cannot be evaluated from such research.

NMS does not operate a dedicated central budget for social research. However strategies for marketing, exhibitions and learning are being developed and these will produce a more integrated approach to understanding and developing audiences and responding to customers. A new post of a Visitors Studies and Interpretation Officer is being created within Learning and Programmes, which will provide scope for more behavioural and social research being carried out. NMS is committed to partnership working and believes that a better evidence base for culture and the arts is essential to facilitate collaboration, benchmarking and best practice. In many parts of the cultural and education sectors information tends to be shared on an informal rather than a structured basis, through networking, attendance at conferences etc. As a basic resource, NMS would like to see a shared electronic resource (ie website) with basic information on visitor numbers to all the cultural institutions, which is not available at the moment.

**National Galleries of Scotland**

The National Galleries of Scotland (NGS) comprises the National Gallery of Scotland, the Scottish National Portrait Gallery, the Scottish National Gallery of Modern Art and the Dean Gallery, with two partner galleries in Banff and Berwickshire. The aim of NGS is to preserve and exhibit Scotland’s national collections of fine art for the enjoyment and education of the public and to maintain the Galleries as a centre of excellence. NGS also promotes an extensive programme of temporary exhibitions and collaborates with other galleries worldwide. NGS mount an extensive education and outreach programme, including educational services, events and tours for people with special needs.

NGS has a rolling programme of visitor surveys, 2003 being year 2 of a three year programme, the survey and research being carried out by externally commissioned consultants. The programme has progressed from year 1 when quantitative data and a little qualitative data was gathered, to year 2 where they are tracking demographic change in their visitor profile and will be carrying out more qualitative work with non-attenders. NGS will use this information as a basis for breaking down the barriers for non-attenders and encouraging under-represented groups to attend. NGS has no dedicated research budget, and research is funded from the Public Affairs Department to cover ‘generic’ affairs, although the budget having been cut by 70% over the last two years will undoubtedly impact on what research can be carried out. NGS aim to commission an economic impact study in 2003/04 to provide a ‘persuasive tool’ for increased public investment.

The visitor survey for NGS shows that they have a low percentage of young attenders (eg 15-15yrs accounts for 8% of visitors), and that the majority of visitors are in the ABC1 socio-economic category (90%). The visitor survey indicates that 5% of NGS current attenders are people with a disability, which suggests a very high number of disabled people visit the
galleries each year. This is useful information to inform NGS on facilities they provide and how they can serve such visitors, making access as easy as possible. NGS have now set up a restructured Education and Outreach Department. Objectives and strategies for Education and Outreach include: identify the needs of new and existing audiences and reduce cultural exclusion at NGS caused by disability, location, age, gender or economic or educational factors; increase attendance by promoting NGS’s collections as a resource in all learning situations; continue developing the Education department into a centre of excellence in art gallery education; devise an effective art education marketing strategy in collaboration with other NGS departments; research and develop the creative use of new technologies in the art gallery context; research the potential of the role of education with NGS and in contributing to national strategies. Other future objectives include establishing a youth programme, continue to expand a programme of outreach activities, and fund and appoint a staff member with responsibility for access and interpretation.

NGS have collaborated with other agencies in research (eg NMS, SAC) as much as is possible, and they consider that there is scope for working together more with other national institutions to avoid duplication in research and evaluation. NGS have a policy to monitor and evaluate initiatives where possible, although have to be selective due to limited resources. They not only have a corporate plan, but also a plan within the Dept of Public Affairs to reach under-represented groups and encourage attendance. Other future priorities are to promote cross-fertilisation between galleries, so that visitors tending to visit one gallery can be encouraged to visit other types of gallery as well.

Research that would be most useful to NGS is that which would examine the obvious mechanisms to ‘trigger’ participation, and how to measure impact on a community. They consider that more socially based research is required, and that a major gap is research into the social impact of art itself eg what do the national collections and promotions say to people from ethnic minority groups, and what type of collection would they wish to see in the national galleries?

National Library of Scotland

The National Library of Scotland (NLS) is the largest library in Scotland and houses a large collection of books and manuscripts in Scotland and is the main repository of books and manuscripts relating to Scotland and the Scots, attracting scholars and researchers worldwide. It also holds many other sources such as journals, maps, music scores, and born-digital publications. NLS regularly holds exhibitions and provides an extensive programme of talks, book launches and related events, whilst maintaining a programme of travelling displays to other institutions in Scotland and elsewhere. Its main roles are to collect and represent Scottish culture through collections and support research by individuals and institutions eg academic and informal such as family history, local history, Scottish history etc. NLS recognises that there are increasingly issues about the digital revolution and international acknowledgement that libraries should archive and record and preserve electronic publications and websites. NLS play an active role in education, life long learning and research. It is presently in a period of change and recognises the need to exploit services more and open them up to under-represented groups. Their corporate plan, which is at the

202 Public Affairs Department 3 Year Plan 2002/03 to 2004/05, NGS, 2002
interim stage of developing, focuses on modernising the services provided by NLS and explore more corporate/partnership/customer oriented ways of working.

The NLS does not have a dedicated research budget at present, although plans to have one in the future. The NLS believes that there is much scope for improvement in collecting information and building a profile of its customer base. It has recently commissioned a research consultancy to make a start on a longer term research programme on customer research, in order to understand what people want from NLS and how to meet their needs. At present, services tend to be based on perception rather than evidence base, and NLS is of the view that robust quality evidence on what people want and what would provide best added value is required (eg what should be provided on the digital side of facilities). Detailed research into social inclusion issues has not yet been carried out but the planned customer research begins to address this.

NLS shares data with two or three higher education library networks, but tends not to work in partnership with other agencies in commissioning and using research. Part of the problem is seen to be that there may be other research ‘out there’ being done by other cultural agencies, but there is no systematic way of sharing the information across different institutions. The NLS acknowledges the potential benefits and usefulness of collaborating with other agencies such as NMS and NGS on social research.

SportsScotland

SportsScotland (SS) is the main advisory body on sport and physical recreation, and leads on sport and sports development in Scotland. It also has a role to implement Executive policy on sport and physical recreation. It is the lottery funding distributor in Scotland for sport (although the New Opportunities Fund (now the Big Lottery Fund) and Awards for All also contribute funding to sporting facilities, events etc). SS works with local authorities and governing bodies of sport and provides a role of expertise, planning advice, best practice etc to these bodies. SS is also the sport policy adviser to government.

SS gathers information on participation in sporting and recreational activities through the Scottish Omnibus Survey, which collects information annually from a nationally representative sample of 6,000 people in Scotland on participation in sport, and has done every alternative month since 1987 so that trends can be identified. However, at present the sample cannot provide information at local level, and SS has recently been provided with substantial funding from the Scottish Executive to quadruple the sample and carry out the survey every month for a year in order to provide local authority level information. From the enhanced survey to be carried out, SS will be able to gather information on participation in individual sports and participation by ethnic, disabled and socially deprived groups. For example, SS knows already that young girls aged 13-17 are under-represented in sporting activities, and this group will be boosted in the survey to explore barriers to participation. SS are also keen to be included in the prospective survey by the Scottish Executive of ethnic minorities to gain a better understanding of barriers to participation in sport.

SS does have a policy on social inclusion in place and ‘strongly advocates’ the role that sport can play in wider social issues, particularly in the areas of health and social inclusion. Their
policy statement on social inclusion indicated that over the next three years, they plan to work with all SIPs ‘to develop and implement a sports component to their work’.

SportsScotland has a dedicated research budget, but this is not sufficient to embrace evaluation of every programme implemented, and so SS prioritises on what is to be evaluated, such as the current evaluation priorities of Active Schools and Excellence programmes. SS does collaborate with other agencies in research but not as much as it would like to. It has already worked in a ‘modest way’ with SportEngland, the Health Education Board of Scotland, the Scottish Arts Council and VisitScotland. However, in doing so it has found examples of duplication of work, and has sought (but unfortunately did not obtain) input by the cultural agencies into the proposed enhanced national survey on sport so that information on participation in the arts and culture could be obtained.

**Scottish Screen**

Scottish Screen has both a cultural and an industrial function, promoting film and television work in Scotland including education and training, production, exhibition, information provision, location support and the Scottish Screen Archive. It is committed to supporting Scottish film and programme makers in their professional development, and runs a wide range of training programmes for newcomers to these industries, offering professional and financial help. Scottish Screen develops, encourages and promotes every aspect of film, television and new media in Scotland. Its mission is to establish Scotland as a major screen production centre and project Scottish culture on a global basis. Among its many roles, Scottish Screen is committed to developing the skills of those working in Scotland's screen industries and recognises that training and qualifications often hold the key to gaining work and developing careers. In order to help Scottish practitioners gain those skills and qualifications, they offer financial support, in the form of training bursaries, to both individuals and production companies seeking to develop their skills and businesses. Scottish Screen Training is also the Open Assessment Centre for the delivery of Skillset Professional Qualifications along with a range of other vocational qualifications for the broadcast, film & video industries in Scotland. Scottish Screen has been approved to offer qualifications in Administration, Camera, Editing, Lighting, Make-up & Hair, Management, Production, Production Research, Sound, Technical Operations and Production Risk Assessment.

Scottish Screen does commission research and evaluation, although does not have a dedicated research budget in place. They are a relatively small agency in terms of staffing and funding so do not have the resources for a specific research officer, or staffing to steer a research programme. However, their policy is that all projects funded by them are evaluated, and they are at present tracking a skills training programme and its longer term outcomes such as employment gained as a result of the training. They are also currently analysing the ‘social inclusion audit’ which has been carried out over the last two years, and will assess the effectiveness of interventions in that area and what impacts have occurred as a result, which will then be related to future actions and initiatives. The report is due to complete very shortly. Scottish Screen are also about to carry out a study on the effectiveness of funding in cinema exhibition in Scotland, and outcomes will be measured against the various aims and objectives, including its social inclusion aim. The forthcoming Chinese Film Festival is to be funded by Scottish Screen, and will be evaluated accordingly. Scottish Screen consider that research and evaluation is an important component of their work, in order to learn what works, and where improvements can be made.
Scottish Screen consider that there is much scope for the collection of meaningful statistics on the uptake of cultural activities, and that it would be useful if such a collection was not narrowly focused but included cultural participation in education, health, the creative industries etc. They are enthusiastic about a method which would capture cultural statistics that would provide the ‘bigger picture’ in Scotland. They recognise that at present, there is no common methodology used by the different agencies involved, and that this is an issue that needs to be addressed.

Other relevant bodies

Scottish Library and Information Council (SLIC)

SLIC acts as an advisory body on library and information matters, and provides policy planning and promotes and monitors standards for library and information services, developing performance indicators in these areas. Members of SLIC can access grant funding for innovation and development, consultancy support and information on best practice and knowledge management. SLIC members include all local authority, higher education, further education organisations, and library services as well as other specialist library and information organisations. SLIC is funded by organisational membership subscriptions, and it is funded partially by the Executive, the National Library of Scotland and has also received funding from the Scottish Arts Council Lottery Fund for Readership Development and recently the New Opportunities Fund to manage projects on behalf of public libraries.

As SLIC is not a large organisation, until recently the organisation relied on consultancy to monitor and evaluate strategic projects. Evaluation of significant programmes such as the People’s Network and Readership Development is done using consultants, which has resource implications, and could not be done without the NOF funding provided. However the recent appointment of a full time Network Officer, with the responsibility of evaluating projects and programmes means that this task will be easier in the future. SLIC is at present looking at innovative ways to assess the quality of services provided by library services, such as the use of mystery shoppers as part of their evaluation on NOF’s behalf of the library staff training programme in Scotland and NOF Residue project. It has also moved more towards gathering qualitative data on how people use library services, what are their needs, what would encourage them to use libraries more etc.

SLIC has three main programmes ongoing at present – the People’s Network, Readership Development, NOF Electronic Resources project and the Public Library Staff Training Programme. The People’s Network is a UK wide government-led initiative to bring internet and online services to the whole population and it is estimated that by the end of December 2002, more than 68 million hours of internet access per year will have been available to users of the People’s Network. An evaluation is at present taking place (early indications are set out later in this Review) on the impact on library services, users and encouraging non-library users and socially excluded groups to use library facilities. Readership Development is a national project to train public library staff to become skilled promoters of contemporary literature and to engage with the reading audience in new ways. Reader Development is relatively new to Scotland and a Reader Development Co-ordinator has been appointed from each of the 32 library authorities in Scotland; they are undergoing a two year programme of
training, coaching and experience in Reader Development techniques. It is proposed that this project will give librarians the skills to become active literature promoters, offering new opportunities to readers and developing new audiences for contemporary writing.

SLIC considers that there is scope for some type of evaluation tool to be developed that different agencies can use, tailored to their needs, that would gather information on individual projects in a consistent way and are happy to contribute their recent experiences to this.

Scottish Museums Council

The Scottish Museums Council (SMC) is the main channel for funding to non-national museums and galleries. It has a membership base of some 260 organisations including all local authorities, independent, university and military museums, and 343 different museum sites. These museums, ranging in size from voluntary trusts to large metropolitan services, attract more than 13 million visitors a year. SMC develops national policies and sector standards and promotes best practice. It works with museums to enable them to involve the public and local communities and provides an information service to the public through its website and a range of publications.

The SMC has a research budget of approximately £10K per annum, although received £250K in 2001 from the Scottish Executive to carry out a national audit of museums\(^\text{203}\), including a survey of buildings, collections and services, and economic impact in terms of visitor numbers, spend etc. The Report published in 2002 and showed what museums are doing (ie a snapshot of museums in Scotland in 2001)\(^\text{203}\). It was not designed to look in depth at the outcome or impact of services, although SMC would like this to form part of a Phase 2 research study. The audit did establish that with regard to learning, 64% of museums in Scotland evaluated their learning and education services, 56% had a learning or education policy, with local authority museums being least likely to have such a policy in place (45%).

The audit also established that a third of museum sites create exhibitions which link to the Scottish Schools Curriculum. SMC envisages that outcome/impact studies will be carried out in future, building on the audit and taking it forward to the next step of going ‘beyond’ the services provided and assessing the impact on users.

The Museums and Social Justice\(^\text{204}\) report drawn up by the SMC sets out what museums and galleries can do to promote social inclusion and create access for socially excluded groups. It makes various recommendations to the sector on how to develop a social justice strategy, suggesting the various steps to be taken to include such groups and the timescale to be covered. The steps involve various processes, including tackling the barriers, raising awareness, making contact with relevant organisations and groups, developing a three year plan, working in partnership with other organisations, audience development, promoting change and how to sustain working relationships.

Currently, SMC are developing a national strategy on learning and access and have a planned research programme underpinning the strategy to provide available evidence. The research phase of the strategy is now complete. The draft strategy will be circulated for wide

\(^\text{203}\) A Collective Insight: Scotland’s National Audit, SMC, 2002

\(^\text{204}\) Museums and Social Justice: How Museums and Galleries Can Work for Their Whole Communities, SMC, 2000
consultation in May 2004, with final publication in September 2004. SMC, guided by an external steering group, has also recently commissioned a scoping study to explore definitions of cultural rights or entitlement, within the museum context, and to suggest preferred and appropriate models for development. This study is assessing other national and international models such as the Museums Association’s free museum visits scheme (eg transport which is one of the key issues, especially in rural Scotland), and the Highland 2007 Cultural Pledge.

SMC work in partnership with many other organisations (for example they are commenting on the economic impact study carried out by the Centre for Culture Policy Research), but indicate that there is scope for closer working relationships in some areas. For example, the buildings in which museums are cited are most often of historical interest, and their capital needs are a significant issue. There is an integral relationship between many museums and the building in which they are located – eg the Mining Museum, Gladstone’s Land, industrial museums etc and the SMC see greater scope for working together with Historic Scotland in this regard. During 2004/5, SMC is working with a range of partners, including the Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland, Heritage Lottery Fund and Museums, Libraries and Archives, on a piece of work to develop ‘Design Quality Indicators’ for museum buildings.

SMC also consider that there is a need for an overall research strategy for Scotland, that is consistent in evaluation methods, priorities and performance indicators, so that research and evaluation is more ‘joined up’, enabling the research budget to go further.

Local Authorities

Much of cultural and sport activities is funded and administered by local authorities, who are a very important factor in the delivery of cultural and sport services to individuals and communities in Scotland. The latest survey of local authority provision for arts and culture\(^{205}\) (based on 1999 data) found a wide variation in what is provided and supported and in the value placed on arts and culture. Some authorities had made very firm commitments (eg having culture as a main corporate objective); the majority had some kind of commitment to culture, based upon the idea that participation in culture can deliver other corporate objectives such as health and social inclusion. In some of the larger authorities, cultural services are delivered by a single department (eg culture and leisure, arts and recreation) whereas in small authorities various elements are delivered by different departments. Cultural services are delivered across a wide range of structures, such as Community and Cultural Services, Arts and Heritage, Sports and Leisure, Recreation, Information Services, Commercial Services, Planning, Environment, Education and Life-long Learning. The report on current provision found that the majority of local authorities achieve good links between culture and education services, and in some authorities there is strong integration between departmental services. Most authorities had recently set out or were in the process of drawing up sports, leisure and arts strategies, although only one authority had a fully fledged ‘cultural strategy’ (the current situation in early 2004 is that two local authorities have a cultural strategy) Because of financial pressures and best value issues, local authorities had now begun to move away from providing direct services in culture and arts, towards supporting trusts or community organisations in provision, and recently in larger city authorities they had moved towards ‘empowering communities’ to manage facilities that were previously council-run.

\(^{205}\) A Survey of Local Authority Provision for Arts and Culture, Bonnar Keenlyside, 2002
Main corporate objectives of local authorities included social inclusion, health improvements, safer communities, life-long learning, economic regeneration, partnerships with both the public and the private sector – all of these priorities could be influenced or impacted upon by the provision and participation in culture, the arts and sport. Culture was being used in several authorities to deliver a programme of change in SIP areas, and most authorities held partnerships in the area of health, working with health boards to deliver active health programmes.

Not all authorities were found to measure attendance and participation, and very few measured them across all cultural activities, leaving a significant amount of cultural activity in community schools and centres not being measured. However, some measured attendances and economic and social impact, and found that rigorous evaluations assisted in improving service delivery.

The Report on arts and culture provision by local authorities found that for many authorities, the most common problem was the status accorded to the issue, where cultural services were held to be less important that other more mainstream services. Overall, expenditure on arts and culture had declined, and authorities were actively looking for new partnerships and new activities. Where there was a corporate and political commitment to arts and culture, authorities were able to deliver and support a higher level of activity. There was however, little common language or understanding of arts and culture within authorities, and little strategic planning or evaluation done in the area. Most authorities indicated that they would welcome a more consistent and cohesive framework for culture delivery and funding.

Since the Report, Guidance for Scottish Local Authorities on implementing the National Cultural Strategy was published in March 2003, which will assist local authorities and their partner organisations move forward the cultural agenda.

**Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA)**

COSLA is the representative voice of local government in Scotland, and aims to promote the role, image and credibility and address and influence key constitutional issues of local government. It has recently adopted a new organisational structure with the aim of increasing its capacity to approach issues in a coherent and holistic way. COSLA now comprises a small Corporate Management Team, four Corporate Advisers and seven interdisciplinary themed teams – Community Resourcing, Children and Young People, Environment and Regeneration, Governance and Democracy, Health and Social Care, Image, Media and Communication and Resourcing and Capacity. Clearly, there are many policy areas that require joint working between team, with culture and leisure a prime example.

COSLA was involved in consultation on the National Cultural Strategy, and called on the Scottish Executive for ‘an urgent programme of joint work’ to consolidate research and intelligence on cultural matters, to improve and ensure access to culture, to establish partnerships for creative education and life-long learning, and to ensure that culture is at the heart of inclusive communities. COSLA and the Scottish Arts Council jointly produce a survey of arts and culture expenditure by councils (although this is now being taken over by an external organisation – CIPFA). However, COSLA recognises that there is ‘very limited information’ across the full range of cultural activities in Scotland and considers there is
scope for pooling the available information into a comprehensive whole and seek to fill gaps where found. COSLA’s view is that the way local authorities operate does not leave much scope for monitoring and evaluation of every initiative, and this is generally not how decisions are informed. It sees a need for funding in research to look at the evidence base for decisions made and to support monitoring and evaluation. COSLA is to pull together examples of good practice in cultural provision in order that guidance for local authorities can be developed.

Part of the problem with research and evaluation in local authorities and government departments, is that different departments are aware of their own research projects, but there is a need to pull them together, as there is much cross thematic work going on. COSLA considers that the Scottish Executive has a role to play in pulling together research that demonstrates the social impact of cultural initiatives on communities, and that there is a need for a central website on which information can be accessed. COSLA is keen for funding to be targeted at gaps in the cultural research area, so that findings can be used by local authorities when planning cultural activities. It also considers that there is a need for a common evaluation method to be used by local authorities and cultural agencies across Scotland, so that findings are comparable and meaningful, and will be useful to all those involved in cultural provision.

Highland and Islands Arts Ltd (Hi Arts)

Founded in 1991 at the instigation of Highlands and Islands Enterprise (HIE), Hi Arts is a limited company with charitable status. HI Arts is contracted by HIE to deliver, on its behalf, an annual programme of arts development and promotion. This programme is also funded by the SAC. HI Arts is based in the offices of HIE, and employs 6 permanent staff and a range of project workers. Three full time staff are also employed by HI Arts’ sister company HI Screen (Highlands and Islands Screen Services Ltd) which was established to operate the mobile cinema, the Screen Machine. Among HI Arts’ key activities for HIE area comprehensive database of arts organisations and events in the Highlands and Islands; a three year programme of music industry development and support; advising arts groups and Local Enterprise Companies in the HIE Network on development proposals and funding applications; and advising and reporting on applications to Scottish Arts Council National Lottery Funds.

Voices of Chief Officers of Cultural, Community and Leisure Services (VOCAL)

VOCAL is the Association of senior officers of local authorities who are responsible for providing cultural, leisure and other community services. Its main role is to advocate the value of leisure and cultural services in Scotland. Currently, a team within VOCAL is developing a self-evaluation model for local authorities to evaluate their culture, arts and leisure services. The main purpose of the evaluation toolkit will be to evaluate quality assurance in the light of best value commitments. The recent document produced by VOCAL to highlight the strengths of public cultural and leisure services and their ability to contribute to the wider social policy agenda, indicates how such services have the potential to achieve greater inclusiveness and address a wide range of social issues. However, the

---

206 Realising the Potential, VOCAL, 2002
The document also indicates how investment in cultural activity by local authorities has decreased over the past few years, thus affecting the quality of community life. The document calls for local government to develop a clear policy framework for cultural and leisure services through Community Planning, Cultural Strategies and Best Value Review Programmes; to develop effective performance monitoring and evaluation for cultural and leisure services to ensure that the potential contribution to key social priority areas is realised; and to adopt an integrated approach in the delivery of the services, with links between sport, the arts, museums, libraries, play and parks strengthened. VOCAL also asks central government to recognise the potential of cultural and leisure services to contribute to social inclusion and as an integral aspect of community planning. The Association also points out that a strategic framework ‘with clearly established aims and objectives’ is required to encourage the necessary integrated approach and ensure the potential benefits are delivered.

VOCAL does not directly commission research (it has no dedicated research budget), but it draws on research commissioned by local authorities and uses this as an evidence base for future initiatives. VOCAL’s view is that there is evidence which indicates the potential impact of culture and leisure services in improving health, regeneration, community safety etc, but limited robust, hard data on actual impact that is easily accessible. It recognises that there is also a definition problem in defining ‘social benefits’, quality of life etc, therefore rendering these impacts even more difficult to measure and such ‘softer’ indicators need to be combined with harder indicators in a more balanced approach towards evaluation. There is a need for local authorities to know what information to gather, and to establish an overall means of evaluating the impact so that all information is meaningful and comparable. There is also a need for more cross-cutting, or joined up working between departments in local authorities and their community planning partners (eg culture, education, health) and departments in central government (the same). There is firstly however, a need to benchmark the data before trends, benefits etc can be measured.

VOCAL points out that where evaluation toolkits are developed they tend to be tailored to specific cultural activities eg arts, sport, museums. It considers that beyond gathering data on the numbers using services or attending cultural activities, there is limited evidence on how culture improves health, education, or quality of life. It indicates that whilst there are many ‘pockets’ of research/activity going on, cross-referencing between the activities is lacking. It considers that a systematic approach is required to gather information, and should be done in partnership with all the cultural and sport institutions. At present, some partnership working does take place, but it is limited to certain organisations, and there is significant scope to extend liaison and collaboration so that all agencies are ‘playing to the same tune’.

VisitScotland

Although this Review will not look at the impact of tourism on the economy or social life, VisitScotland were approached to gather information on aspects of cultural tourism. Cultural tourism plays an important role in attracting overseas and UK visitors to Scotland. Visiting heritage sites is a major attractor, and also major events such as the Edinburgh Festival, the Highland Games etc. VisitScotland has a dedicated research budget within its marketing department, and commissions research or uses the findings of research commissioned by Area Tourist Boards. Latest figures provided by VisitScotland indicate how UK residents took approximately 800,000 ‘cultural tourism’ trips, stayed for 3 million nights and spent a total of £208 million in Scotland in 2002, highlighting the importance of cultural tourism to
the country. Further research into cultural tourism is planned, particularly on specific groups of tourists identified by the ongoing cultural omnibus. VisitScotland has identified culture as a key element in promoting Scottish tourism and has included culture and heritage as a product within its new product portfolio. VisitScotland is currently working on identifying priorities for the development of this new product to identify key opportunities which will generate tourist visitors to Scotland. Initial thinking on this issue suggests that key opportunities exist within film and TV festivals; the built heritage; and traditional music. VisitScotland is also planning to develop a cultural website.

New Opportunities Fund

The New Opportunities Fund is a Non Departmental Public Body sponsored by DCMS. It is a lottery distributor, distributing a third of the nation’s lottery money in the areas of Health, Education and the Environment. Particularly since devolution, NOF has taken policy directions from government, distributing lottery funding to the priority areas of the Scottish Executive such as disadvantaged young people, social inclusion etc. Since 1999 some £340m has been distributed to projects and initiatives in the main priority areas in Scotland. New programmes launched in Scotland in 2004 will entail some £30m distribution. NOF is currently merging with another National Lottery distributor, the Community Fund (presently tasked with funding the charitable and voluntary sector), to form a new distributor. The new body will be responsible for 50% of all National Lottery funds raised for the good causes. It is expected that the merger will be completed by early 2005.

NOF is a learning organisation and seeks regular feedback on its initiatives. It carries out research and evaluation on programmes, and evaluation is built into the programme from the start, so that outcomes can be evaluated against strategic aims. Until recently, evaluation of programmes has tended to be carried out at UK level and not specifically directed at Scotland, although will generally include some Scottish case studies. Increasingly, as NOF programmes in Scotland are configured differently to programmes elsewhere in the UK, Scotland-specific evaluations are undertaken. The lessons learned from evaluation may not always be specifically relevant to the Scottish context, and NOF considers that there is scope for joint working with the Scottish Executive on evaluating programmes run in Scotland and the resulting impacts.

At present NOF is evaluating the social and health impact of participation in physical education in schools in Scotland, a long-term project costing some £88m in lottery funding. It is also evaluating the Out of School Hours Learning initiative, which is a £180 million UK initiative to support a range of activities, including cultural, arts and sports programmes, outside the normal school day which encourage and motivate pupils, build their self-esteem and help them reach higher standards of achievement. NOF is a particularly good example of a cross-cutting body, funding many different programmes with different aims in the areas of health, education and environment. The areas of culture, the arts and sport may be the vehicle to achieve these aims, but NOF liaises with many other government departments such as Health and Education. NOF has also funded the People’s Network Programme, providing internet facilities in every public library in Scotland, and the digital inclusion programme, and is presently evaluating and ICT training programme for public library staff designed to equip staff with skills, knowledge and confidence to use ICT effectively in their work and to benefit the users of public libraries.
NOF liaises with the Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe) following a debate in parliament which indicated that there were large gaps in knowledge of the role of NOF and their resulting work in Scotland. NOF now feeds back to SPICe the findings from research and evaluation of projects, as well as individual departments and divisions within the Scottish Executive. It also puts on seminars to disseminate the research results to better inform policy on impact and good practice.

NOF often works in partnership with other organisations – for example, in the programme on physical education it is working closely with the culture, leisure and education departments of local authorities. It also works closely with the network of other lottery distributors. NOF commissions its own research and it is conducted by external, usually academic, contractors. There is a dedicated (UK) research budget with a research and evaluation team based in London. However NOF in Scotland anticipate greater devolution of research resources.

Major gaps in research information that exist, in NOF’s view, include: there is yet no means of strategically drawing together disparate research and evaluation activities and presenting the combined impact, thus presenting the ‘bigger picture’, which would require investment by all the agencies. The newly-formed National Lottery Promotions Unit (NLPU) is currently investigating options for conducting general market research into the public’s view of lottery money spending, and general awareness of how it is spent and what their lottery ticket ‘buys’. Another area that requires developing is to have in place clear and reliable definitions used by government and other agencies of ‘deprivation’ and ‘rural’ so that when NOF distributes funding to such areas, they ‘get it right’, as the categories (particularly deprivation) are fundamental to the work they do.

Department for Culture, the Media and Sport (DCMS)

The DCMS is responsible for UK Government policy on the arts, sport, the National Lottery, tourism, libraries, museums and galleries, broadcasting, film, the music industry, press freedom and regulation, licensing, gambling and the historic environment. Over 60 public bodies receive funding from the DCMS to deliver direct sporting and cultural support to the public. Its aim is set out as ‘to improve the quality of life for all through cultural and sporting activities, to support the pursuit of excellence and to champion the tourism, creative and leisure industries’. The four strategic priorities based DCMS’s work are to enhance access to a fuller cultural and sporting life for children and young people; open up institutions to a wider community to promote life long learning and social cohesion; maximise the economic contribution to the UK of tourism, creative and leisure industries; and ensure services provided by sponsored bodies are delivered in a way that prioritise consumers’ needs. DCMS has a strategy in place to promote access for disabled people to cultural, the arts and sporting activities, the aim of which is to ensure that disabled people are able to access and participate fully in cultural, heritage, sporting and leisure activities, including employment in these fields; to ensure that disabled people, including children and young people are fully consulted and their needs considered as policies are developed; and take positive steps to promote equality for disabled people. DCMS has also developed a Research

---

207 Beyond 2004- a DCMS Framework for Action on Disability, DCMS, 2003
Strategy\textsuperscript{208} as a framework for their research and analytical activity over the next three years. The Strategy outlines the recent progress which DCMS has made in developing its evidence base, and outlines the main steps to take this forward from now until 2006. The document indicates that research and evaluation planning needs to be explicitly incorporated in the very early stages of policy/programme development. This will allow baselines to be established by including the gathering of monitoring and basic evaluation data within management systems. The strategy also sets out the benefits of working in collaboration with other research partners in undertaking relevant research and the potential benefits of working with other government departments and devolved administrations. Some of the specific steps proposed by DCMS to develop closer working relationships between policy and research staff, is to produce an annual report of research in the preceding financial year from 2004 onwards, to develop and distribute a research digest that draws together relevant research commissioned by DCMS and NDPBs, material published by external researchers and proceedings of major conferences; and create a series of regular ‘research meets policy’ seminars on key strategic priority issues, featuring invited speakers and attended by research and policy staff.

A Regional Cultural Data Framework (RCDF), drawn together as part of the research strategy by DCMS and the English Regional Cultural Consortia, aims to provide a consistent set of definitions for the cultural sector. It aims to pull all the existing data from the different types of cultural institutions and sectors, where it can be used as a tool for practitioners in these areas. The Framework is currently being developed and tested by different user groups. Discussions are presently ongoing between DCMS and the Scottish Executive on the feasibility and mutual benefits of, setting up a database or ‘directory’ of robust recent research that demonstrates the social and/or economic impact on individuals and communities, and that can be used as a reference guide by those working in the policy fields of culture, the arts and sport.

\textsuperscript{208} A Research Strategy for DCMS 2003-2005/06, S Creigh-Tyte and G Mundy, DCMS, Technical Paper No 3, 2003
CURRENT AND PLANNED RESEARCH

This annex highlights some current and planned research by various organisations, as at 28th February 2004. The annex is divided into two sections – Culture and the Arts, and Sport.

CULTURE AND THE ARTS

Cities

At present, the Centre for Cultural Policy Research (CCPR) are undertaking a three-year project on ‘Culture and Cities’. The project is exploring the nature and effects of emerging links between areas such as urban regeneration, place marketing, city tourism and cultural policy. The CCPR point out in their Annual Review that much of the existing research focuses on studying the economic and short-term effects of cultural investment in cities. The core of this project focuses on the experience of Glasgow as European City of Culture in 1990 and the legacy from that time. The emphasis of the project is not on measuring economic impacts but on exploring processes, explaining relations and describing situations so as to develop a body of knowledge that allows interpretation of how cultural investment in a city is sustained or lost in the long term.

Rural areas

The CCPR is also, in collaboration with the Crichton Tourism Research Centre, undertaking research into the impact of rural arts touring (especially theatre) on community development and arts practice. This is part of wider piece of research carried out in England and Wales by Comedia which is undertaking research into rural arts touring and the outcomes. Francois Matarasso is lead researcher and lead author. CCPR’s research comprises a study on rural touring in Scotland and CCPR/CTRC will do a literature review; arts touring companies review; and research work on English and Welsh case studies. The impact of rural arts activity on one area of Scotland (Dumfries & Galloway) will be examined. The study consider issues from a Scottish perspective – the impact of rural touring on community development and social cultural and economic role that rural arts touring plays in the area. The study is due to complete in spring 2004.

Cultural data

The Centre for Cultural Policy Research is also a present undertaking a cultural data survey in order to address the lack of accessible data with which to describe the cultural sector and track change over time. The study will investigate what can be achieved by

---

209 Cities and Culture Project, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, Glasgow University, (ongoing)
210 Rural Virtues: Impact of Arts Touring in Rural Areas, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, Glasgow University, (ongoing)
211 Cultural Statistics, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, Glasgow University, (ongoing)
exploiting the data sources that already exist (eg sources used for CCPR’s briefing papers are on cultural employment and funding), and identify a strategy for overcoming the information gaps. Part of the project will involve ‘testing’ the prototype Regional Cultural Data Framework developed by DCMS, so that statistical output about the sector will be consistent and comparable across regions and potentially across the UK.

The Centre for Cultural Policy Research have also begun work on completing the COSLA/SAC Survey of Local Authority Arts Expenditure in Scotland212 for the years 2000/01 and 2001/02. The Centre will be producing the report that covers the final two years of this survey. Meanwhile, local authority support for the arts is now to be part of a wider survey carried out by the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) and data for the financial year 2002/03 will be collected by CIPFA in early 2004.

Visual Arts

The Visual Arts and Galleries Association (VAGA) Steering Group in Scotland has commissioned CCPR to carry out research on the current condition of the visual arts in Scotland213, in order to produce a briefing document that outlines the public benefit value of the contemporary visual arts. The research will focus on producing information which will be most powerful with decisionmakers and influencers and which is easily accessible. The research approach will be quantitative and qualitative and data will be derived from analysing the literature on visual arts in Scotland, interviewing a cross section of curators of galleries, analysing existing data on income and expenditure in the arts and museums, and drawing on some international comparators. The research is due to complete in early 2004.

National Survey

The Department of Culture, Media and Sport have commissioned a Scoping Study for a Survey of Culture and Sport in the UK214. The study will scope for a cross-sectoral survey of participation and attendance in culture and sport to provide quality-assured data on participation, attendance, attitudes and related factors across the cultural and sport sectors. At present there is no single survey providing the required detail of data on participation and attendance across all the sectors, with government sponsored surveys such as the British Household Survey, ad hoc specific surveys, box office data or buying questions into existing omnibus surveys. These offer limited opportunity for cross-sectoral analysis of participation and non-participation and the under-representation of groups, and make the ‘adding up’ of the data and comparisons difficult, if not impossible. The Scottish Executive is at present in discussion with DCMS on the coverage of this survey, and is considering the possibility of ‘buying in’ to the survey in order that an adequate representative sample in Scotland is covered, which will provide relevant information for policy aims and initiatives.

212 Details found on CCPR website www.culturalpolicy.arts.gla.ac.uk
213 Details found on CCPR website www.culturalpolicy.arts.gla.ac.uk
214 Commissioned November 2003, due for completion early 2004
Economic Impact of Culture

A study on the economic impact of culture\textsuperscript{215} by The Fraser of Allander Institute, is currently ongoing, covering activities identified in the National Cultural Strategy, including museums and galleries, arts activities supported by the Scottish Arts Council and the creative or cultural industries. The study aims to compare the economic impact of different types of cultural organisations in different areas of Scotland (eg urban and rural) and the impacts of cultural activities. The study will survey a variety of organisations and will draw on existing published data, and will complete in spring 2004.

Museums

The Scottish Museums Council is currently carrying out research in collaboration with Resource on ‘understanding audiences – a qualitative account of visitor motivations’\textsuperscript{216}. The SMC recognises that the majority of research on audiences to date has examined demographic trends, spending patterns, seasonal variations, admission charges, statistical data on visitor numbers etc and there is a ‘paucity of qualitative research’ on understanding factors affecting visitor choice such as cultural inclinations/ conventions, class, taste, educational background, lifestyle etc. SMC considers that the notion of an ‘audience’ for museums still remains generally unexamined, and have commissioned research to investigate patterns of attendance and non-attendance (with a specific focus on non-attenders), clarify qualitative barriers to attendance, and identify possible/future motivations for visiting. The results of the research will be available late 2004.

The Scottish Museums Council has commissioned research to review existing and potential capability, human and technological, within museum sector in Scotland, in the use of ICT to increase public access to collections and raise awareness of learning opportunities presented through the use of museum collections. The project will recommend how sector can best realise potential of ICT – ICT can offer opportunities for study by those physically remote from museum collections eg primary and secondary schools, community and special needs groups, selfdirected lifelong learners. Research will be carried out by University of Glasgow – it will evaluate educational needs across a broad range of museum target audiences and electronically delivered museum resources. The research will also assess and evaluate human resources, hardware and software capabilities of museums in Scotland for the creation and delivery of resources via web and CD Rom.\textsuperscript{217}

Libraries

The People’s Network,\textsuperscript{218} a UK initiative to bring internet and on-line services to the whole UK population and focusing on those normally excluded from using library services, is currently being evaluated by Manchester Metropolitan University. Initial findings (reported above in the Review) have been made public, and the evaluation is due to complete in April 2004. The ICT training programme for public library staff is a related programme to The People’s Network, designed to equip staff with skills, knowledge and confidence to use ICT

\textsuperscript{215} Economic Impact of Culture, The Fraser of Allander Institute (FAI)/CCPR, (ongoing)
\textsuperscript{216} Scottish Museums Council website: www.scottishmuseums.org.uk
\textsuperscript{217} Scottish Museums Council website: www.scottishmuseums.org.uk
\textsuperscript{218} People’s Network website: www.peoplesnetwork.gov.uk
effectively in their day-to-day work and to benefit the users of public libraries. The evaluation will assess the impact of the programmes on developing library services, on library users and on meeting broader policy and organisational objectives, including promoting social inclusion. The Tavistock Institute is undertaking the evaluation, which will include a number of Scotland-specific studies, and will complete at the end of 2003.

Education

The New Opportunities Fund\(^{219}\) is at present evaluating an out of school hours learning initiative which supports a range of activities, including cultural and art activities such as film school, dance etc., and sports programmes outside the normal school day. The aim of the programme is to motivate pupils, build their self-esteem and help them reach higher standards of achievement. The evaluation is being carried out by the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER).\(^{220}\) The research also aims to facilitate an understanding of the characteristics of successful projects, as well as the challenges they face. The evaluation will complete at the end of 2003. Interim findings in summer 2002 included – many projects helped pupils in the transition from primary to secondary school; other projects had successfully supported pupils with special needs and helped raise skills and confidence; out of school activities were successful but some homework clubs had proved difficult to sustain; targeting particularly disadvantaged young people was a challenge as some are too disengaged for organised activities and there is a concern about labelling.

In addition, NFER has carried out an evaluation of 30 summer school schemes across the UK (including Scotland) and the evaluation will be complete by early 2004. Similarly, NFER is undertaking an evidence-based research programme – the Arts and Education Interface – for the Arts Council England in partnership with East Midlands Arts, South West Arts and Bristol and Corby Education Action Zones.\(^{221}\) The research programme aims to extend understanding and evidence-based knowledge of the emotional, creative, cultural, intellectual and social impact of arts interventions in formal and informal education. Data will be collected through various methods such as individual interviews, short questionnaires, observations, analysis of produced work, of existing assessments, schools’ baseline assessments, examination scores, teacher assessments, and behavioural indicators (eg attendance figures). A final report will be available in summer 2004 and findings will be presented at an international, arts educational research conference organised by Arts Council England in summer 2004.

A further study by NFER\(^{222}\) is examining the impact of arts projects implemented in Pupil Referral Units and Learning Support Units on young people, on staff and institutional outcomes and to audit the cost-effectiveness of the projects. Final findings will be available in summer 2004.

\(^{219}\) New Opportunities Fund website: www.nof.org.uk
\(^{220}\) National Foundation for Educational Research: www.nfer.ac.uk/research
\(^{221}\) The Arts and Education Interface – evidence-based research, J Harland, NFER (ongoing) www.nfer.ac.uk
\(^{222}\) A Study of Arts Activities in Pupil Referral Units and Learning Support Units for the Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, NFER (ongoing)
Planned Research - The Scottish Arts Council\textsuperscript{223} is contemplating a survey of arts provision and facilities in all Scottish schools. The arts, when introduced through integrated instruction as well as discipline-specific study, can be an essential element to school improvement. The SAC is also to commission research and evaluation of the impact of the arts on older people, the impact of the creative industries in Scotland, the impact of the publishing sector, and is working in partnership with Glasgow Health Board on the social and economic impact of the arts on health.

Creativity

\textbf{Arts and Humanities Research Board} are presently carrying out research to explore the relationship between perception, creativity and skill\textsuperscript{224}. The research is using techniques from the fields of fine art and anthropology to investigate the relationship between creative practice and the attainment of knowledge and skill. The outcomes could have important implications for the way that art is taught, and will inform education policy-makers and industry-based researchers concerned with innovation. The project will complete in 2005, when an exhibition will be held in Dundee Contemporary Arts Centre, and a number of written publications produced.

Young People

\textit{Planned Research - Youthlink Scotland}\textsuperscript{225} are at present considering a research project exploring how ‘youth friendly’ cultural services and venues are across 10 local authorities in Scotland, including cultural hubs such as Edinburgh and Glasgow as well as rural areas such as Orkney and Shetland. The project will be a piece of action research involving young people drawn from youth work groups, and will develop relationships between the sectors and provide an overview of barriers to participation in cultural activities, including related issues such as transport, and suggest innovative ideas for creating new pathways to involvement.

Health

\textbf{Arts Therapies, Creativity and Mental Health Initiative}\textsuperscript{226} (ACMI), whose aims are to explore the mental health and quality of life benefits of community based arts therapies for people with mental health problems, are currently helping local agencies establish and manage up to 4 pilot Arts Therapies services in different community settings in Scotland, and establish working and research links with up to 4 existing community based arts-in-health initiatives elsewhere in the UK who are willing to participate in the initiative. Phase 2 of the initiative is currently being set up (establishment of the four Arts Therapies services in

\textsuperscript{223} Scottish Arts Council website: www.scottisharts.org.uk
\textsuperscript{224} ‘Learning is understanding in practice: exploring the interrelations between perception, creativity and skill: Professor Murdo Macdonald, University of Dundee
\textsuperscript{225} Youthlink Scotland website: www.youthlink.co.uk/
\textsuperscript{226} Arts Therapies, Creativity and Mental Health Initiative, The Mental Health Foundation, in collaboration with the Scottish Arts Terapies Association (SATF) and Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine (CAHHM)
Scotland), and Phase 3 of the project will involve the evaluation of the initiative’s impacts on the health and quality of life outcomes for users of the pilot Arts Therapies and arts-in-health services. The project will complete in 2007.

Justice

A ‘think tank’ – **REACCT**²²⁷ (Research into Arts and Criminal Justice Think Tank) was established in late 2002 by the Unit for Arts and Offenders and has recently commissioned a literature review to support the development of a theory base to bid for research council funding to examine the impact of arts interventions in criminal justice settings. The main research phase will combine an analysis of data from ongoing projects, a case study of a prison-based programme and a project of post-custodial work with ex-offenders.

Social Exclusion

**Planned Research – Children in Scotland**²²⁸ are presently planning research to explore the social impacts of the arts on young people at risk of social exclusion. The research will target 12-16 year olds from social inclusion areas and other marginalised groups such as young travellers, refugees, black and ethnic minority and young people with special needs, throughout Scotland. The research will involve qualitative methods (including the use of self-completion diaries) and will examine a range of arts programmes to explore the impact over a 3 month period, that participation in the arts has had at a personal and social level. Key questions explored will be – what young people think about their participation in the arts, what they consider to be the personal and social impacts of their participation, do different approaches and modes of provision have different impacts, and do different levels of participation have different impacts.

Methodology

**Planned Research – Queen Margaret University College**²²⁹, in conjunction with the Edinburgh Arts and Social Inclusion Forum, plan to look at how methodology can capture and ‘measure’ different types of qualitative research such as story-telling. The idea behind this is to develop a methodology suited to measuring the processes and outcomes of participation in arts and cultural activities, and can provide the ability to carry out comparative analysis. The methodology will entail using aspects of economic and development methods of analysis such as opportunities/cost analysis.

---

²²⁷ Arts for Offenders Unit website: www.a4offenders.org.uk/new/sections/research
²²⁹ Queen Margaret University College website: www.qmuc.ac.uk/
SPORT

Sportscotland\textsuperscript{230} has commissioned studies on the following:

Participation by girls in sport\textsuperscript{231} - the study will inform the development of the Active Schools programme, to maximise the involvement of girls in sport specifically, and physical activity more broadly. The research question is ‘what will persuade girls to take part (more) in sport and get more physically active generally?’. The report due in early 2004.

The Social Benefits of Sport\textsuperscript{232} – an advocacy document on the benefits of sport to support target 11 of the new national strategy for sport: “Every local authority’s community planning process to have contributed to the targets of Sport 21 2003-2007.” The document reviews and reports on the benefits of sport within the framework of the Scottish context, available Scottish statistics, the community planning process, critical evaluations of programmes, research and reviews, and case studies of (good) practice. Publication is imminent.

Economic Importance of Sport in Scotland 2001\textsuperscript{233} – the study identifies the economic impact of sport in Scotland in terms of money and jobs, including comparisons of 2001 with 1998 data covering consumer expenditure figures, employment figures, value added data and comparisons with UK data. Publication has just taken place.

Evaluation of the Active Primary Schools Programme\textsuperscript{234} - The Active Primary School Programme (APSP) provides Co-ordinators who work with primary schools in order to increase the range and quality of opportunities for primary-school children to become more physically active. The evaluation of the programme covers a three year period and will report in February 2004.

The New Opportunities for PE and Sport (NOPES)\textsuperscript{235} programme was launched in November 2001 to build sport facilities and promote their use, and one of its aims is to divert young people out of criminal activity. The programme aims to improve PE and sport in schools and communities, improve collaboration, promote inclusion and promote innovation in facility design. In Scotland, the programme is delivered in partnership with sportscotland. The Loughborough Partnership led by the Institute of Youth Sport has been appointed to evaluate the programme. The evaluation will assess – the effectiveness of local partnerships in designing, managing and delivering projects; and the impact of projects on participation in sporting activity and on wider social issues. The is a long-term piece of research, and will explore the impact on low achieving or excluded young people. The evaluation will complete in 2009 and meanwhile, interim reports on initial findings will be produced.

\textsuperscript{230} Sportscotland website: www.sportscotland.org.uk/
\textsuperscript{231} Increasing Demand for Sport and Physical Activity by Girls, Sportscotland (ongoing)
\textsuperscript{232} The Social Benefits of Sport, Prof Fred Coalter, Institute for Sports Research, University of Stirling (ongoing)
\textsuperscript{233} The Economic Importance of Sport in Scotland 2001, Research Digest No 95, Leisure Industries Research Centre, Universities of Sheffield and Sheffield Hallam, February 2004
\textsuperscript{234} Evaluation of the Active Primary Schools Programme, Research Digest No 92, K Lowden, J Quinn and S Kirk, The Scottish Council for Research in Education, Glasgow University, February 2004
\textsuperscript{235} Evaluation of NOPES, Loughborough Partnership (ongoing)
ANNEX III

The following 50 social impacts of participation in the arts were found by Matarasso’s seminal study ‘Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in Arts Programmes’, Comedia, 1997:

1. Increase people’s confidence and sense of self-worth
2. Extend involvement in social activity
3. Give people influence over how they are seen by others
4. Stimulate interest and confidence in the arts
5. Provide a forum to explore personal rights and responsibilities
6. Contribute to the educational development of children
7. Encourage adults to take up education and training opportunities
8. Help build new skills and work experience
9. Contribute to people’s employability
10. Help people take up or develop careers in the arts
11. Reduce isolation by helping people to make friends
12. Develop community networks and sociability
13. Promote tolerance and contribute to conflict resolution
14. Provide a forum for intercultural understanding and friendship
15. Help validate the contribution of a whole community
16. Promote intercultural contact and co-operation
17. Develop contact between the generations
18. Help offenders and victims address issues of crime
19. Provide a route to rehabilitation and integration for offenders
20. Build community organisational capacity
21. Encourage local self-reliance and project management
22. Help people extend control over their own lives
23. Be a means of gaining insight into political and social ideas
24. Facilitate effective public consultation and participation
25. Help involve local people in the regeneration process
26. Facilitate the development of partnership
27. Build support for community projects
28. Strengthen community co-operation and networking
29. Develop pride in local traditions and cultures
30. Help people feel a sense of belonging and involvement
31. Create community traditions in new towns or neighbourhoods
32. Involve residents in environmental improvements
33. Provide reasons for people to develop community activities
34. Improve perceptions of marginalised groups
35. Help transform the image of public bodies
36. Make people feel better about where they live
37. Help people develop their creativity
38. Erode the distinction between consumer and creator
39. Allow people to explore their values, meanings and dreams
40. Enrich the practice of professionals in the public and voluntary sectors
41. Transform the responsiveness of public service organisations
42. Encourage people to accept risk positively
43. Help community groups raise their vision beyond the immediate
44. Challenge conventional service delivery
45. Raise expectations about what is possible and desirable
46. Have a positive impact on how people feel
47. Be an effective means of health education
48. Contribute to a more relaxed atmosphere in health centres
49. Help improve the quality of life of people with poor health
50. Provide a unique and deep source of enjoyment
A Literature Review of the Evidence Base for Culture, The Arts and Sport Policy