Progress Report on the Fresh Talent Initiative
PROGRESS REPORT ON THE FRESH TALENT INITIATIVE

Robert Rogerson, Mark Boyle and Colin Mason
University of Strathclyde

Scottish Executive Social Research
2006
## CONTENTS

**LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES**  
5

**ABBREVIATIONS**  
6

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**  
7

**CHAPTER ONE  THE ORIGINS OF THE FRESH TALENT INITIATIVE**  
11

- Introduction  
11
- Launching Fresh Talent  
11
- The aims of this research  
12
- Report structure  
12

**CHAPTER TWO  THE AIMS, SCOPE AND TARGETS OF FRESH TALENT**  
14

- Introduction  
14
- Influencing channels of migration  
15
- Defining talent: exploring the terminology  
17
- Who is the focus of Fresh Talent?  
17

**CHAPTER THREE  FRESH TALENT WITHIN SHIFTING CONTEXTS**  
20

- Introduction  
20
- FT within the Scottish policy context  
20
- Key external contexts shaping FT  
24
- The need for a FT initiative  
34
- Action points  
35

**CHAPTER FOUR  NEW OPPORTUNITIES, NEW TARGET GROUPS**  
36

- Introduction  
36
- Retaining talent in Scotland  
37
- Making global connections: constructing a ‘FT affinity diaspora’  
40
- Connecting beyond physical migration  
44
- Meeting Scotland’s labour needs from within the EU/EEA  
45

**CHAPTER FIVE  EVALUATING PROGRESS ON ACTIONS UNDER FRESH TALENT**  
48

- Introduction  
48
- Undertaking the evaluation  
48
- Evaluating FT projects  
49
- Core FT areas  
50
- Other FT related activities  
64
- Other areas within the Executive  
67
- Evaluation summary  
68

**CHAPTER SIX  KEY TARGET GROUPS: STUDENTS AND BUSINESS**  
74

- Introduction  
74
- Prospecting for overseas students in a crowded market place  
74
- Bringing talent to business  
84
- Moving beyond students and business: expatriates and returnee Scots  
92
CHAPTER SEVEN DEVELOPING FRESH TALENT

Achievements of FTI: Scotland’s global sense of place  96
Improving the quality: practical action points  97
Taking FT forward: options for future development  102

REFERENCES  108

ANNEX 1 - TIMELINE OF FRESH TALENT INITIATIVES  114
ANNEX 2 – INTERVIEWEES  115
LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figures

Figure 2.1 Fresh Talent and international migration channels 16
Figure 3.1 The wider strategic and policy contexts 21
Figure 3.2 Total population projections for Scotland, 2001 to 2031 25
Figure 3.3 Origins of migrants to Scotland 2001-2 27

Tables

Table 3.1 Projected population of Scotland (2004-based), by age group: 26
2004-2031 (000s)
Table 4.1 Number of out-migrants from Scotland to rest of UK, 2000-01 38
Table 5.1 Customers of RAS by FT target group 51
Table 5.2 Key Fresh Talent messages 58
Table 5.3 Experience of recent migrants 63
Table 5.4 Key supportive channels for migrants 63
Table 5.5 Key factors influencing retention 63
Table 5.6 Principal actions under FT 69
Table 6.1 Students in higher education at Scottish HEIs by domicile and location of 77
study 2003-2004
Table 6.2 Entrants to Higher Education in Scottish HEIs by domicile 1998-99 to 78
2003-04
# ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGCAS</td>
<td>Association of Graduate Career Advising Service (Scotland)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASC</td>
<td>Association of Scottish Colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRE</td>
<td>Commission of Racial Equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DETLL</td>
<td>Department of Environment, Transport and Lifelong Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEA</td>
<td>European Economic Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESOL</td>
<td>English for Speakers of Other Languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTWiSS</td>
<td>Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GfoS</td>
<td>Global Friends of Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEDS</td>
<td>Framework for Economic Development in Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT(I)</td>
<td>Fresh Talent (Initiative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEI</td>
<td>Higher Education Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HESA</td>
<td>Higher Education Statistics Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIE</td>
<td>Highland and Islands Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HND</td>
<td>Higher National Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSMP</td>
<td>Highly Skilled Migrant Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBO</td>
<td>International Business Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPD</td>
<td>International Projects Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPS</td>
<td>International Passenger Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHSCR</td>
<td>National Health Service Central Register</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation of Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAS</td>
<td>Relocation Advisory Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAWS</td>
<td>Seasonal Agricultural Workers Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Scottish College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCDI</td>
<td>Scottish Council for Development and Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDI</td>
<td>Scottish Development International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEGS</td>
<td>Science and Engineering Graduate Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEN</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNI</td>
<td>Scottish Networks International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SISP</td>
<td>Scottish International Studentship Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sitp</td>
<td>Scotland is the place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNCs</td>
<td>Trans-national Corporations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWES</td>
<td>Training and Work Experience Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRS</td>
<td>Worker Registration Scheme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Since the First Minister’s announcement in February 2004 of the need to address the future decline and ageing of the population, important achievements have been made in placing the notion of fresh talent onto the political landscape in Scotland. Through the formation of a Fresh Talent team, and its implementation of schemes in partnership with other agencies, there have been achievements in attracting new talent into the country, and in raising the profile of Scotland as an open, welcoming place to live, work, study and do business.

2. Further, the projects initiated under Fresh Talent have helped to re-position Scotland internationally, creating new relations with the UK government in regard to migration, with British organisations overseas in assisting key groups to come to Scotland, and with Scottish diasporans across the world.

3. Recognising that there is no direct, simple approach to competing within the international market for talent, the FT initiative has sought to generate new talent familiar with Scotland; smooth the process for fresh talent to come to Scotland to work, study, live and do business; and has developed approaches to promote the openness of Scotland to fresh talent, both within the nation and internationally.

Reviewing progress

4. After only two years it is unrealistic to expect the impact of Fresh Talent to be visible in terms of significantly increasing in-migration flows to Scotland. Nevertheless early shoots of new growth are evident, as more overseas students have been given the chance to study in and experience life in Scotland, and more than 1800 have taken up the opportunity to work here for at least 2 years under Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme.

5. This progress review reaches behind these headlines to consider key questions as to whether there is still a need for a Fresh Talent initiative, what “talent” means and which groups of talent should be attracted. It also reviews the monitoring and evaluation being undertaken of the schemes implemented, and provides an ‘external’ assessment of the impact of Fresh Talent to date. In looking forward, the review also asks about whether there are sufficient resources and capacity to continue to make a sustainable and meaningful contribution to addressing the talent needs of Scotland.

The rationale for Fresh Talent

6. In the last 2 years, Fresh Talent was viewed by the Executive, in different degrees of importance, as addressing the pressures of a declining and ageing population, future labour needs for a growing economy, and creating a culturally diverse society. This was to be achieved through seeking new talent, attracted to Scotland as migrants. Since then, changes in the demographic trends in Scotland, the new proposed migration policy in the UK, limited skills shortages and growing debates over the importance of culture within the economy have reshaped the context in which FT is located.

7. Despite these shifts, the fundamentals of an ageing population, the importance of migration to population growth, and the associated future labour market needs remain
important. There is still a need for Scotland to attract new talent – but some of the immediacy of the pressure has been released.

**Key target groups**

8. Under Fresh Talent, 5 key groups of talent were identified and the Executive has adopted an approach which aims to roll out projects targeting these sequentially. International students and people wishing to work in Scotland have received most attention to date, along with some interventions to assist business in Scotland to recruit overseas. Less attention has been given to entrepreneurs, the self-employed or to returnee Scots.

9. Whilst there is logic to this selection of target groups, especially as they include many who can be amongst the most mobile, the changing contexts around Fresh Talent raise opportunities for other target groups to be identified.

10. First, targeting the retention of talent in Scotland is important because out-migration, to the rest of the UK and overseas, has averaged 55,000 per annum. As many of those leaving are at the early stages of their working lives, reducing this out-flow can contribute to reducing the demographic pressures already a rationale for the Fresh Talent initiative.

11. Second, using more productively the talent which has left Scotland, but which retains a strong affinity with and recent experience of Scotland as a place to live and work, is also important. Conceiving of this ‘affinity diaspora’ as a target group, and bringing together some of the networks already in place, offers opportunities to enhance its advocacy role for Scotland.

12. Third, attracting talent has to be conceived of as more than the physical relocation of people. In a modern, highly connected world, the mobility of talented people also involves for example short-term exchanges within companies, and movement associated with international contracts and global business. Recognising that each of these creates flows of talent and can be advantageous to retaining people in Scotland; those involved therefore form a further target group.

13. Fourth, and reflecting the changing UK landscape of managed migration, there is a strong case for a geographically defined target group within the EU/EEA. It is increasingly from here that many talented people, including those that are lower skilled, will be drawn to meet labour needs in Scotland.

14. There is thus an opportunity to redefine the nature of talent which is being prioritised as Fresh Talent responds to need in Scotland.

**Evaluation and monitoring**

15. More than 15 projects have been implemented under Fresh Talent, ranging in size and complexity from the formation of the Relocation Advisory Service and the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme for international graduates, through to offering postgraduate scholarships under the Scottish International Scholarship Programme in partnership with the British Council, to supporting Universities in Scotland in assisting international students to link with business in Scotland under the Challenge Fund.
16. Each of the projects has been or will be subject to evaluation. To this end, the Fresh Talent team in the International Projects Division of the Executive has devoted considerable time and resources responding to external scrutiny. Across the FT agenda, there are clear objectives and measurable targets set for each project. There is scope for improvement in some schemes which operate in conjunction with partners – mainly in aligning projects with Fresh Talent priorities - and in ensuring that the information is gathered to enable monitoring and evaluation. This is most acute in those projects where Fresh Talent contributions have been added to existing activity.

Measuring impact

17. Looking beyond the individual projects, to date, priority has been given to two target groups and the impact of Fresh Talent to each has been assessed in this review.

18. Recognising the size and significance of the opportunities to attract international students and the high esteem with which higher and further education in Scotland is held, Fresh Talent initially focussed on supporting this target group. Working alongside the British Council, Universities and Colleges, a variety of schemes have been funded: this ranges from competitive scholarships (Scottish International Scholarship Programme), through to support for students whilst in Scotland to gain access to employment (Challenge Fund, DARE, EDGE, Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme), to the expansion of contact networks with international graduates who leave Scotland (Scottish Networks International).

19. Under these schemes:

- High quality and experienced graduates have been recruited under the SISP, with all 22 students funded in 2005 involved with SNI;
- 12 imaginative projects funded within Universities and Colleges in 2005-06 to support international students in career planning and access to employment;
- More than 1800 international graduates given leave to remain and work in Scotland for 2 years without a need for a work permit under Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme.

20. Inevitably, the numbers involved in most schemes form only a small proportion of the market. However, the ‘ ripple out’ impact of these schemes has wider and longer-term benefits, including promoting Scotland, raising further the profile of higher education opportunities, and highlighting employment opportunities in Scotland. It is impossible at this stage to quantify these benefits, but importantly they arise only if the experiences of those attracted to Scotland are positive. Evaluation of this component remains to be undertaken and must take into account whether those assisted under FT are able to fulfil their personal ambitions in Scotland.

21. But there are some minor implementation issues which may limit the sustainability of some of the schemes:

- Graduates retained in Scotland under FTWiSS need to be supported in gaining permanent residency through other in-migration schemes;
Universities need to provide more resources to internal support services (e.g., Careers Offices, International Student Offices) to support overseas students in staying in Scotland;

Employers in Scotland need to have a greater involvement with FT schemes such as those under the Challenge Fund.

22. This latter point in part reflects the limited but growing emphasis FT has placed on businesses within Scotland. The early complaints that business was not consulted sufficiently prior to the launch of the Fresh Talent initiative are now being addressed, as FT focuses on business.

23. With limited evidence of an imperative for business to seek out overseas labour and with language difficulties cited as the principal barrier to overseas recruitment, there are real challenges in encouraging business to embrace Fresh Talent.

24. The ultimate success of both the student and business components of FT will rest on changing employers’ attitudes and engagement with international labour and their overall expectations of FT. This could involve:

- Greater involvement of business within global networks to make them aware of skill levels;
- More work placement links for overseas graduates, as their linguistic abilities could alter employer perceptions, and assist retention of talent;
- Development of a web forum connecting employers seeking to recruit with talent considering relocation to Scotland;
- A high skilled entrepreneur programme amongst international students studying in Scotland.

25. The third main area of FT activity, returnee Scots, is at an immature stage. Activity to date has been focused primarily on web-based contacts and the development of information networks – Scotland is the Place, Global Friends of Scotland and SNI. In addition, engagement with selected diasporans has been undertaken to support specific events such as Tartan Week. This diverse group of many millions of people remains underused.

**Developing the Fresh Talent initiative**

26. Over the last 2 years, an important and significant start has been made in rising to the challenge of attracting talent to Scotland. With limited financial resources and a small team of staff in the Executive, supported by partner agencies, Fresh Talent to date has pushed forward action which in other countries is undertaken by single government departments and a larger resource base.

27. Attracting talent into Scotland will never be easy and is a long-term task. ‘Talent’, or human capital, itself has become a valued commodity, competed for by governments and companies across the world. Fresh Talent schemes therefore have to compete in already crowded market places – and to do so will require the continuing provision of resources, both human and financial. Without further and expanded funding, the Fresh Talent unit on its own will not have the capacity to meet all aspects of this challenge. The review identifies four
different scenarios which, depending on the level of resources available, can result in Fresh Talent: continuing to roll out adding new initiatives as it targets new groups; rolling forward from one area of activity to another; operating on a more focussed basis; or becoming a skills led approach to matching migration with labour shortages.
CHAPTER ONE  THE ORIGINS OF THE FRESH TALENT INITIATIVE

Introduction

1.1 Many European governments have, since the early 1990s, become concerned about skills shortages and demographic change. This concern is about first the ‘greying’ of the population, and second, asylum, multi-cultural citizenship and national identities. In contrast to a ‘fortress’ approach, which dominated government responses in the early 1990s to such issues, the business case for the liberalisation of migration has become more influential in recent years. As a consequence, many European states have shifted away from migration policies focussed on control and restriction in favour a twin-track approach:

“that simultaneously loosens in a regulated way, the control of labour migration, tightens the control of asylum and clandestine migration, and establishes a framework for the promotion of social cohesion and an inclusive national identity around a set of core or irreducible values” (Lewis and Neal, 2005, 428).

1.2 In the UK, the government has moved towards this ‘managed migration’ approach, allowing the admission of migrant workers in accordance with business needs for labour and skill shortages, while at the same time imposing ever increasing restrictions on asylum seekers (Flynn, 2005).

1.3 In Scotland, although governed by legislation on migration set by Westminster, there too has been a specific response to anxieties over demographic trends (low fertility, population decline, ageing population) and skill gaps in the labour market on the one hand and, on the other, to recent academic studies – notably the work of Richard Florida (2002; 2005b) – which has argued that the places that will prosper in the knowledge economy are those who are able to attract and retain ‘creative workers’ and pools of talent.

Launching Fresh Talent

1.4 It is in this context that the Fresh Talent initiative was launched. It arose from the ‘demographic challenge’ identified by the First Minister at the City Challenge Conference in February 2003. Aware of the results from the 2001 Census and the prediction that the national population would decline below 5 million by 2009, the First Minister announced the formation of an implementation group to consider how to make Scotland more appealing as a place to live, work and study. Over the next year, following contact with the Home Office, a steering group under the chair of George Calder of the Scottish Executive was formed to take forward this challenge. Their report, New Scots: attracting fresh talent to meet the challenge of growth was endorsed by the First Minister in February 2004 and became the cornerstone of the Fresh Talent Initiative (FTI). The policy statement reported on actions already taken, set out the main agendas and identified a wide set of future areas for action (Scottish Executive, 2004a).

1.5 Within New Scots, action anticipated under Fresh Talent (FT) was to focus on: promotion, marketing and branding of Scotland; the provision of advice services, including the formation of a Relocation Advisory Service (RAS); an enhancement of international
contacts and relations; entrepreneurs and business; and, in particular, actions aimed at attracting international students.

1.6 Since then, these strands have materialised and evolved into a set of concrete projects and actions. A Fresh Talent team has been recruited within the Executive and has spearheaded the Initiative to bring about actions (Annex 1). This Fresh Talent team is located within the International Projects Division (IPD) of the Finance & Central Services Department of the Executive. The division has four main teams: FT policy; International Image; RAS; and Scotland is the Place which includes Global Friends of Scotland and the diaspora strategy. The Division has seconded members from elsewhere in the Executive, from elsewhere in the Civil Service and externally, in part to source staff with specific skills in immigration advice, business expertise and marketing and promotion.

1.7 Whilst this dedicated team aims “to drive forward and oversee progress”, the Executive has consistently over the past 2 years stressed that the FTI is not a stand-alone initiative, but one that will inform and shape actions across the Executive and beyond.

The aims of this research

1.8 The aim of the research reported here was to provide a progress report on Fresh Talent as it nears the end of its second year. To this end, this study seeks to answer the following questions:

- Is there still a pressing need for a Fresh Talent initiative?
- Could the current strategy of sequentially addressing target groups be supplemented?
- Are the monitoring and evaluation procedures in place fit for purpose?
- What are the assessments of its impact by stakeholders?
- Is there the capacity and resources to ensure the initiative’s sustainability?

1.9 In answering these questions, the research involved a mapping exercise collating evidence expressed in terms of measurable targets and outcomes to review progress in implementing each FT objective. Dialogue with, and review of practices within, a sample of key agencies involved in the Initiative has also been undertaken to augment the output from previous reviews and secondary statistical evidence of the wider context in which FT has been positioned.

Report structure

1.10 After outlining the aims and scope of the Fresh Talent initiative in the next chapter, the report considers the wider contexts in which FT is located in Chapter 3. These include other strategies of the Executive which connect with FT and other contexts and debates that influence FT directly: Scotland’s demography; migration policy in the UK, economic prosperity and labour markets in Scotland; and the appeal of cosmopolitanism and the social impact of migration. Together these enable the review to assess the current rationales for FT and to identify the continuing necessity of the initiative.

1.11 Under FT, 5 target groups have been identified. Chapter 4 reviews the significance of these within the context of projects initiated to date by the Executive. Recognising that these
groups represent only some elements of a pool of ‘talent’ which could be attracted to Scotland, the chapter also outlines some further groups which it is argued could supplement the current context. In particular, this chapter develops the argument that FT can make greater use of Scotland’s own, unique assets and position within a highly competitive international market for talent.

1.12 However, the core of the report is about evaluating progress to date in addressing the aims of FT. Chapter 5 brings together evidence on how each initiative and project under FT contributes to the overall goals, examining first the core projects at the heart of FT, those supported through FT and finally some aspects of the wider setting for FTI. In so doing, it provides an account of progress to date and an assessment of the evaluation methods already in place. For each project practical suggestions for future monitoring and evaluation are outlined.

1.13 In Chapter 6, attention is focused on the two main target groups which have been central to FT to date. Through an examination of the attraction of international students to Scotland and FT’s involvement in supporting business to employ talent from overseas, the chapter evaluates the impact of FT, drawing on views of external partners as well as secondary evidence. Recommendations are made about how, in building on current achievements, deeper relationships with partners can be developed.

1.14 The final chapter turns attention to the future shape of FT and considers whether it has the capacity and resources to meet current and future challenges. The considerable achievements of the FT team are acknowledged, and a summary of the practical action points arising from the research is outlined. Issues about whether there are sufficient resources – human and financial – to fulfil the current remit remain. The chapter concludes by offering some different options for the development of FT, depending on the resource base to be made available and the number and nature of the target groups selected in the future.
CHAPTER TWO  THE AIMS, SCOPE AND TARGETS OF FRESH TALENT

Introduction

2.1  While the New Scots policy statement lists a series of actions cross-cutting a variety of policy areas, it does not in itself set the scope or targets associated with FT. As the 2005 review by the Europe and External Relations Committee of the Scottish Parliament Europe commented in this respect, “the Executive [needs to] set out clearly the purpose, direction and expectations of the Initiative” as “this will help to ensure a better understanding of how the initiative fits into economic strategy in Scotland” (Scottish Parliament, 2005). The purpose, direction and scope have been clarified as the initiative has developed.

2.2  From its inception, the Initiative has been identified as having 3 primary aims:

- to address the projected falling population and increasing age demographic in Scotland by encouraging and enabling people to relocate to Scotland, allowing ongoing stays by students, and other measures;
- to bolster the dynamism and cosmopolitanism of Scottish life and the economy; and
- to promote Scotland as an ideal place to live, study, work and do business.

2.3  At its heart, action has been targeted towards specific audiences who will: assist meeting these aims; ensure that Scotland attracts and retains “bright, talented, hard working people who can make a positive contribution to the Scottish economy and society”; and support a diverse population base. Five groups have been identified as targets:

- students
- people seeking employment
- entrepreneurs and the self employed looking to start up businesses in Scotland
- Scottish business looking to recruit from overseas
- expatriate Scots looking to return home

2.4  Under FT’s remit – the attraction and retention of people from outwith Scotland – activities have been implemented both within Scotland and in association with partners elsewhere in the UK and overseas to encourage and enable migrants to enter Scotland. FT has broadly attempted to influence migration through 5 sets of actions:

a) provide information in countries of origin about opportunities in Scotland and specifically about the support provided to enable talented individuals to come and work in Scotland. This has been both targeted at particular countries (eg postgraduate students in India, Malaysia, Singapore and China, and workers in Poland) and, more generically, through partners such as British Council and Scottish Council for Development and Industry (SCDI);

b) advice and support to assist applicants to gain entry into Scotland and, through interaction with the Home Office, reduce some of the barriers to entry into Scotland for talented migrants;
c) encouragement to specific groups of international migrants (especially international students) to remain in Scotland and gain access to and experience of the Scottish labour market;
d) encourage employers to engage more with channels of international migration as part of their employment strategy; and
e) enhance the quality of the welcome and information returnees can access on entry into Scotland.

Influencing channels of migration

2.5 International migration between Scotland and the countries of origin can be portrayed as a variety of ‘channels’ along which people and information flow. Figure 2.1 illustrates how the actions and interventions associated with FT can be located in shaping different aspects of the migration process.

2.6 Existing channels (shown in yellow in Figure 2.1) relevant to Fresh Talent are in place, along which migrants can find “entry pathways” into Scotland. These include:

1. internal labour markets of trans-national corporations who offer employment and relocation opportunities within their own organisations or through related businesses. By their very nature these can be highly restricted and can involve short to long term relocation of talent into Scotland;
2. international recruitment agencies operating to assist employers in identifying potential overseas employees and to provide overseas re-locators with advice, support and services to assist their coming to Scotland. Although relatively limited in comparison to the London and south east of England area, there are a number of agencies in Scotland who perform this task, many of whom are members of the Association of Relocation Agents, the professional body for relocation agents in the UK.
3. Scottish universities and colleges attract approximately 37,700 students from outside of the UK per annum and, in alliance with a host of local agencies overseas, International Offices open up clear channels for talent to enter Scotland.
4. personal and family ties, either through connections with people already resident in Scotland or through connections with members of the Scots diaspora overseas, remain arguably the principal channel by which talent is attracted to Scotland. However, there is little quantifiable evidence for the importance of this route.

2.7 In turn, there are other channels (or networks) along which information flows out of Scotland which can assist in attracting talent. Figure 2.1 illustrates 4 of these which impact on Fresh Talent: the formal networks of Scottish Networks International (SNI), Global Friends of Scotland (GfoS) and GlobalScot; and, again importantly, personal family and ties linked to all residents in Scotland.

2.8 Fresh Talent has been active in deepening and widening some of these channels and has also been involved in reducing the barriers – real and imagined – which may inhibit flows of people into Scotland. In so doing, the FT team has worked with partners in the country of origin and taken action in Scotland and the UK to enhance the flows of migrants (eg advice on gaining entry permission and, under FTWiSS, the removal of the need for such permits) and the flows of information (eg enhancing the quality of information on employment, living and studying).
Figure 2.1: Fresh Talent and international migration channels

- Support for trade development and entrepreneurs
  - Scottish universities
  - Action to assist crossing barriers of entry: work permits, visas

- Action to inform potential migrants in selected markets/population groups:
  - British Council Trade/education fairs
  - St. Andrews Day Tartan Week
  - Information at points of entry
  - International student scholarships and support
  - Research to understand migration process and experience

- Support for international advocates and networks
  - Scottish Networks International
  - Develop employer awareness of recruitment opportunities

- Countries of origin
  - Countries of origin

- Internal labour markets of TNCs
  - International recruitment agencies
  - Personal family and ties

- Personal family and ties
  - Scottish Networks International
  - Global Scot
  - Global Friends of Scotland

- Country of destination - Scotland
2.9 All of these actions have the ultimate aim of encouraging more people to relocate into Scotland. However, at this early stage of this long-term initiative, it is unlikely that this aim can be measured directly. Consequently, this research utilises the relationships shown in Figure 2.1 to examine progress made to date under the FT initiative that will encourage greater flows of people and information through these channels.

Defining talent: exploring the terminology

2.10 Which groups of people are being referred to when the notion of talent is invoked? Clearly, there are a number of hierarchical systems through which the skills and competencies of people can be measured. These systems generally pivot around levels of education and educational qualifications, possession of transferable skills, degrees of training and abilities to perform certain kinds of roles in the workplace.

2.11 Whilst hierarchical evaluations tend to imply that talent is an absolute quality which individuals possess, talent might also be thought of as a relative concept. Talent cannot be understood outside of the labour (or other) market it is being defined against. More specifically, talent might be thought of, at least in part, as being a function of the shortages of certain skills, no matter how lowly these skills rank in any given hierarchies. If any economy (or community or society) badly needs bus drivers or bricklayers or cleaners then in a sense these are ‘talents’ which are at least as essential as those exhibited by doctors, lawyers and accountants.

2.12 The difficulties of identifying talent precisely can be witnessed in recent debates over the importance of the so-called ‘creative class’. According to Richard Florida, the creative class represent the most important constituency, within pools of talent more generally, which nations need to attract if they are to be successful in the future. The creative class is comprised of a ‘super creative core’, which consists of a new class of scientists and engineers, university professors, poets, actors, novelists, entertainers, artists, architects and designers, cultural worthies, think-tank researchers, analysts and opinion formers, ‘whose economic function is to create new ideas, new technology, and/or new creative content’ (Florida, 2002, 8). Beyond this core group, the creative class also includes a wider circle of talent working in knowledge intensive industries such as high tech sectors, who ‘engage in complex problem solving that involves a great deal of independent judgement and requires high levels of education or human capital’ (Florida, 2002, 8).

2.13 Whilst recognising that ‘there are grey areas and boundary issues’, Florida asserts that the notion of the creative class ‘has a good deal more precision than existing, more amorphous definitions of knowledge workers, symbolic analysts, or professional and technical workers’ (Florida, 2002, 8) and on this basis confidently asserts that around 38 million or 30% of all employed people in the United States belong to this class. But is creativity not a function of every job? Is not talent a more general concept? Are there not more refined stratifications within the creative class that need teased out?

Who is the focus of Fresh Talent?

2.14 The three main aims of the Initiative (see 2.2) are not defined in terms of talent within specific population groups or in specific areas of economic activity. Indeed, it could be
argued that the desire under FT to support cosmopolitanism and to address the decline in Scotland’s total population points to a wide definition of the talent. The desire to lower the age profile points to a focus on younger age cohorts, specifically students and people of working age.

2.15 In its evidence to the Scottish Parliamentary European and External Relations Committee's inquiry, the Executive indicated a generic approach to attracting bright, talented and hard-working people:

“those people might well be plumbers or brain surgeons; instead of targeting particular skills sectors, the initiative has targeted elements such as numbers, diversity and the entrepreneurship that those people bring” (Scottish Parliament, 2005, para 42).

2.16 In reality, however, FT has defined more selectively the characteristics of its target groups:

1. through the defining of the five target groups (see 2.3);

2. with the primary focus in the early stages of FT being on students, there has been a targeting of those with higher (education) skill levels – generally at Further or Higher Education level.

3. through negotiations with the Home Office over Scotland’s position within the new UK points-based system for managing migration, there is a tacit acceptance that, at least in markets from outwith the EU, future emphasis in attracting migrants will focus on specific areas of skill shortages as well as highly educated/skilled students.

2.17 In short, therefore, the targeting of FT action on students, and especially the Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme, has created the impression that the concept of ‘talented, hard working people’ is focused on more highly qualified, higher skilled individuals which match up with shortages in the Scottish labour force. This is not to underestimate the work within Eastern Europe to attract lower skilled migrants.

2.18 This focus on those with higher skills resonates with the views of at least some of the partners involved in implementing FT programmes. In the January 2006 progress report on the Scottish International Scholarship Programme (SISP) for example, the British Council (Scotland) cast FT as “aimed at attracting talented entrepreneurs to Scotland” (British Council, 2006, 1). In the interviews with partners conducted as part of this research, there was a sense too that the focus of FT was specific: for example “FT is all about high skilled workers and the graduate visa extension” (interview comment from Federation of Small Businesses).

2.19 Whether such a population cohort can address all the diverse needs associated with a “growing, dynamic economy”, with “enriching our culture”, and meet the demographic challenge of population decline is open to debate. Certainly, as analyses of the 2001 Census and from the Home Office indicate, there is little evidence that migrants have higher fertility levels than non-migrants, even if they remain in the UK, and thus are not likely to alter long-term birth rates. And there are questions to be asked about whether higher skilled people are
likely to address key skills shortages in the labour market arising from an ageing population. The issue of whether to widen or narrow the focus of FT is considered in Chapter 7.
CHAPTER THREE FRESH TALENT WITHIN SHIFTING CONTEXTS

Introduction

3.1 As with all new initiatives, Fresh Talent has been positioned within an existing and far from static set of contexts. FT is located within a set of wider strategies and policies of the Scottish Executive, which meld together to focus on improving the quality of life in Scotland. Identified as a cross-cutting policy, FT has therefore helped to inform recent strategies and has itself been located alongside existing strategies.

3.2 FT has also identified contexts within which it is to be positioned. Its rationale is based around the need to: address demographic issues of declining population and an ageing profile; focus on migration and enhancing cultural diversity and cosmopolitanism; and emphasise talent to secure economic growth. FT therefore prioritises a number of challenges which need to be addressed.

3.3 In this chapter, FT is firstly placed within the policy context of action by the Executive. In mapping this, the wider significance of FT is highlighted across economic, social and cultural dimensions of life in Scotland. Second, the chapter reviews the changing significance of demography, migration policy, economic growth and cultural diversity. Together, this analysis offers some answers to questions over the necessity of the FT initiative and its principal rationales.

FT within the Scottish policy context

“Immigration yields the most significant benefits when immigrants are effectively integrated into the labour market and general society of the host country” (Hiebert and Ley, 2006, 4).

“The Commission for Racial Equality is concerned that there has been little focus on wider issues, such as: the readiness and capacity of Scottish business to attract and retain migrant workers; the impact of increased migration on public services and on existing ethnic minority communities; and the wider implications of Fresh Talent for Scottish society”. (Commission for Racial Equality, 2005, 3)

3.4 Although Fresh Talent specifically addresses the attraction of New Scots and returning Scots, it nests into a variety of other strategies and policies launched by the Executive which aim to integrate migrants into Scottish society, and address some of those areas of concern raised by the CRE. Consequently Fresh Talent can only effectively be reviewed in its wider context – alongside approaches which focus on:

a) making Scotland a more attractive place to work and live and promoting these assets more effectively,

b) retaining and harnessing talent which exists within Scotland and nurturing new talent within the population of Scotland.
3.5 Figure 3.1 illustrates the main connections between the strategies of the Executive and these two approaches, with the Executive’s strategies (in brown) nested under these two foci.

Figure 3.1 The wider strategic and policy contexts

3.6 Under this focus, the Executive’s approach has been two-pronged; improving the welcoming impressions of Scotland to visitors and migrants; and second enabling those coming to Scotland to live and work to be more integrated into Scottish communities.

First impressions

3.7 As part of the commitments in the New Scots document, the Executive commissioned a study into the First impressions of Scotland experienced by visitors. The Milligan Report provided recommendations relating to the quality of the welcome to Scotland experienced by visitors and how this might be improved at key international gateways (eg airports, road border crossings, main railway stations). In receiving this report, the Executive accepted all the review’s recommendations and announced an Action Plan in May 2005. Under this, responsibilities and action were divided between Departments of the Executive, VisitScotland (the promotional arm of the Tourists Boards in Scotland), and by groups outside of government and its agencies. Each was to report in December 2005 with the intention of moving forward each element prescribed.

3.8 This strand is important in the context of Fresh Talent, as the Minister for Finance and Public Service Reform acknowledged in responding to the review:
“First Impressions leave a lasting impression and are crucial in helping us decide whether or not we will visit again - or, just as importantly, recommend that place to our friends and family” (Scottish Executive, 2005a).

3.9 There is also evidence pointing to the importance of previous, short stay visits in shaping future migration moves (see TNS System Three, 2006) and the strong impact of word of mouth from those experiencing a country in shaping others’ consideration of this country as a migration destination.

A welcoming place to live and work

3.10 Moreover, other strategies and policies of the Executive impact on making Scotland a more attractive place for international migrants to live and work, especially in ensuring that such migrants are welcomed into an open, diverse society and are supported and assimilated into communities. To these ends, there are links to be made between Fresh Talent and:

- the Adult English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) strategy published for consultation in July 2005 which, for the first time, offered a national approach to the provision of publicly-funded ESOL across Scotland to complement the commercial English as a Foreign Language (EFL) courses. The provision is aimed at assisting asylum seekers, refugees and members of the settled ethnic minority communities to integrate more fully into Scottish life. The strategy document is expected in 2006.

- strategies aimed at enhancing race equality. One Scotland: Many Cultures: working together for race equality and the 2005 Executive’s Review of Race Equality work in Scotland both emphasise the importance of developing this aspect of cosmopolitan Scotland, albeit that neither explicitly refers to Fresh Talent.

- support for refugees and asylum seekers through the Scottish Refugee Integration Action Plan and funding from the Refugee Integration Fund.

- strategies aimed at reducing sectarianism and bigotry within Scottish society. The Executive published in 2005 its strategy on Reducing Sectarianism in Scotland following its high profile ‘Summit on Sectarianism’.

- building inclusive communities which enable all members to benefit from opportunities. The Closing the Opportunity Gap objectives launched in 2004 aim to improve access to services for all and to reduce vulnerability in low income families. Although there is no single mention of FT, talent, retention, migrants or community integration, the Executive’s Community Regeneration strategy is about responding to the needs of local people and creating opportunities from which they can benefit in terms of jobs, skills, training and employability.

Enhancing talent within Scotland

3.11 In relation to the second focus above – harnessing and nurturing talent within Scotland – the Executive has pointed to two key strategies. The Employability framework is being developed as part of the announcement in July 2004 to meet targets to help Close the Opportunity Gap. Intended to be an action plan at a national and local level, the framework
will lead to a more coordinated response amongst Government agencies to getting people into work, and to stay within employment. The focus will be on increasing the chances of those vulnerable and disadvantaged groups throughout Scotland to gain and retain employment.

3.12 The second and existing strategy – A Smart, Successful Scotland (SSS) - provides direction to the Scottish Enterprise Networks (SEN) under the wider 2000 Framework for Economic Development in Scotland (FEDS). It is designed to provide an integrated and coherent framework within which the promotion of Scottish economic development may be taken forward (Scottish Executive, 2004b). The emphasis under SSS is on growing businesses, developing learning and skills, and enhancing global connections. The priorities of the SEN are fostering business within Scotland; helping new businesses get underway; supporting and developing existing businesses; and helping people gain the knowledge and skills they will need for tomorrow's jobs.

3.13 In informing the working of the Enterprise Networks, SSS has been implemented in different ways within Scottish Enterprise (SE) and Highland and Islands Enterprise (HIE). Of relevance to FTI, both:

- have set up International Business Opportunities (IBO) as a new online tool, designed to help companies find overseas partners. These aim to link overseas organisations with talented Scottish companies as partners and to provide assistance in making these connections work.
- publish a Global Connections Magazine for Scottish-based organisations interested in international trade.
- have developed GlobalScot as part of a new drive to build Scotland's international connections. This global network harnesses the talents, expertise and commitment of the many Scots and Friends of Scotland who are active in international business around the world.
- formed Scottish Development International (SDI), a joint body run between the Scottish Executive and Scottish Enterprise. It replaced the agency’s Locate in Scotland and Scottish Trade International operations. Under SDI, TalentScotland has been formed, offering information to the Design Electronics and Life Sciences industries in Scotland. This includes information about living and working in Scotland – “where to find a great job, company and academic activities, the lifestyle and practical help to make the move to Scotland”.
- formed a Business Gateway; a partnership between SEN, Scottish Executive and Local Authorities, to support economic development in Scotland through an effective one stop shop to help grow or start businesses. This Gateway has a specific area on its website linked to Fresh Talent.
- offer awards and financial support to entrepreneurs and especially young entrepreneurs to develop ideas into realities. The Social Entrepreneurs Fund, SPUR and SMART awards, and Proof of Concept funding have all been made available to this end.

**Beyond the two key strands: Other strategies**

3.14 Recognising the impact of an ageing population, in areas such as pension, work, and services, along with contributions to society from older people, the Executive is currently consulting (as of March 2006) on key questions and issues arising from Scotland’s
demographic position. The focus is on issues associated with age and experience, and will inform a **Strategy for a Scotland with an Ageing Population**. This will sit alongside the Fresh Talent response to the changing demographic profile of Scotland.

**Key external contexts shaping FT**

3.15 This section considers these contexts, exploring not only their significance in shaping the formation of the Fresh Talent policy but also how evidence and debates in each are likely to shape the future trajectory of FT. These contexts are:

- the projected demographic shape of Scotland’s population
- the UK wide approach to managing migration
- the economic and labour market in Scotland
- the nature of cosmopolitanism and relationships between cultural diversity and economic growth.

**The demographic imperative**

“Our first target must be to avoid our population falling below 5 million.”

3.16 In presenting the Fresh Talent initiative to the Scottish Parliament in February 2004, the First Minister underlined the economic importance of population decline. He did so against the backdrop of a projected population decline below 5 million by 2009 (General Register Office for Scotland, 2004). Whilst there is widespread acceptance amongst those involved with FT that this threshold is more symbolic than economically important, the demographic imperative behind the FT announcement was stark:

“There will be fewer and fewer people of a working age. If left unchecked, this trend will have a serious impact on our country. Public services will become less sustainable, communities will become weaker, and our economy will suffer. This is a long-term problem that could affect every Scots family.” (First Minister speech to SCDI, Spring 2003).

3.17 Since then, however, the demographic picture has altered. Based on the latest 2004 mid-year estimates, the Registrar General for Scotland has indicated that no longer is there the same immediacy to the reduction of the total population below the 5 million threshold. Commenting on the population projections published in 2005, Duncan Macniven said that:

"Scotland’s population is projected to rise over the next 15 years – thanks to slightly more births, slightly fewer deaths and more people coming to Scotland than leaving. But we will still be an ageing nation, because our birth rate has declined since the 1980s. And our population is likely to fall from 2020, while the rest of the UK is on a rising trend."

Within these latest projections (GRO(S), 2005), three issues are most pertinent to FT.

3.18 First, migration flows into and out of Scotland have a significant impact on the total population of the country. Between 2003 and 2004, for instance, there has been an increase
of 21,000 in Scotland’s population on the previous year. The natural decrease of about 4,000 (more deaths than births) was more than counterbalanced by an estimated net migration gain of around 26,000. The 2003-4 figures are also significant because, as the Registrar General for Scotland noted this year, they witnessed the highest net gain since 1952 when records were first kept in the current way. The key migration points for 2003-4 are:

- around 61,900 people came to Scotland from other countries in the UK and around 46,400 people moved in the opposite direction;
- including asylum seekers, around 36,300 people came to Scotland from overseas and around 24,600 people moved overseas.

3.19 The net gain in migration is thus composed of 57% movers within the UK and 43% from overseas. The extent to which such migration gains are related to short-term factors (such as the A8 entering the EU) or reflect specific initiatives is impossible to identify from these figures.

3.20 There is an assumption in the population projections that migration will continue to contribute positively to the Scottish population over the next few decades. Whereas the assumption in the projections at the time of the launch of FT (2002) had been for a decline of 1,500 per annum, net migration has been revised in the 2004-based projections to increase by 4,000 per annum. This assumption is based on the patterns for the last few years, the evidence of the International Passenger Surveys, and the forecast of continued in-migration from new member states of the EU. However, discussions with the Registrar General for Scotland revealed that this projection is based on a “mid-range estimate” and is significantly influenced by the recent net in-migration of the last few years. As he acknowledged, predicting migration levels is more difficult than predicting either fertility or mortality components.

3.21 Second, as Figure 3.2 below shows, the latest projections suggest that in the next decade the total population of Scotland will rise. Although the projections in 2005 point to a

**Figure 3.2 Population projections for Scotland, 2001 to 2031**

![Population projections for Scotland, 2001 to 2031](image)

Source: General Register Office for Scotland (2005a)
different short and medium term population trend to that in 2003 when the First Minister outlined the FTI, these projections still point to a declining population over the longer-term. The symbolic population threshold of 5 million is now projected to be crossed in 2036.

3.22 Third, there remains a long-term trend of an ageing population in Scotland, where the proportion of children under 16 is declining and the proportion of working age (16-64/59) is also declining, from 63% in 2004 to a projected 59% in 2031. The resultant increase in those of pensionable age is marked (Table 3.1).

Table 3.1 Projected population of Scotland (2004-based), by age group: 2004-2031 (000s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>% total pop</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>% total pop</th>
<th>2031</th>
<th>% total pop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All ages</td>
<td>5,078</td>
<td>5126</td>
<td>5065</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 16</td>
<td>935</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>838</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>793</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-64/59¹</td>
<td>3175</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>3225</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>2963</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65/60¹ +</td>
<td>968</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1063</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1308</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Pensionable age is 65 for men, 60 for women until 2010; 65 for both thereafter

Source: General Register Office for Scotland (2005a)

3.23 This population ageing is set to affect most OECD countries over the coming decades, with Scotland’s increase in the ratio of 50% of people over 65 years to those of working age over the next two decades being typical. This demographic shift will be challenging for public finances, not just in tax revenues and pensions, but also in welfare expenditure as adjustments are made between support for the elderly and for schools, for example (Cotis, 2003).

3.24 In the context of Fresh Talent, the evidence indicates that it is arguable whether there is an immediate demographic imperative to overturn a downward trend in population postulated as one justification for the Initiative. On the other hand, the fundamentals associated with an ageing population remain pertinent and the population trend in Scotland is less positive than elsewhere in the UK, or much of the EU. Further, the latest projections do emphasise the long-term nature of the demographic issues being addressed by Fresh Talent and underline how even relatively small adjustments in the level of net migration to Scotland can impact on its demography. It is vital that continuing monitoring of migration flows into and out of Scotland is maintained and that FTI is informed by this.

Migration processes and emerging migration policy

Understanding migration to Scotland: patterns and process

3.25 Given the significance of migration in shaping the future level of Scotland’s population and the focus of FT on attracting migrants to Scotland, what do we know about the migrants who have come recently to Scotland?
3.26 Migration management is a UK policy area (see below) most of the data about immigration is collected for the UK as a whole and relates to the point of entry into the UK. With most migrants having freedom to move anywhere within the UK thereafter, there is little specific data on the location of migrants within the UK. The exception to this is workers from the new Member States who for the first year of work in the UK have to register on the Worker Registration Scheme and notify the Home Office if they change employment. Consequently, other than through the national (decennial) Census, through specific surveys of samples of the population, or by National Health Service central register (NHSCR), data on migration to Scotland is very limited and most information is based on a UK picture.

**Figure 3.3 Origin of migrants to Scotland, 2001-2**

Source: 2001 National Census

3.27 Although the overall pattern of net migration has altered since then, the 2001 Census offers a unique, insightful picture of the origin of migrants into Scotland within the previous 12 months. This snapshot indicates that, in total between 2000 and 2001, 76,691 people came into Scotland. Most of these (some 62%) were from other parts of the UK, but as Figure 3.3 represents - with each box being proportional to the numbers of migrants - there were significant flows from other parts of the world too, with Europe (excluding the UK) forming the second largest origin area.

3.28 This data source also highlights that, of these migrants entering Scotland, 1 in 4 were born in Scotland. This proportion is consistent across most continents. Only in Oceania, and specifically Australia, was the proportion of return migrants as high as 40%.

3.29 Beyond the Census, little information is available on the characteristics of the people arriving in – or indeed leaving – Scotland. The GRO Scotland 2004 report (GRO, 2005) records that the 98,200 in-migrants to Scotland between 2002 and 2003 can be divided into those from the rest of the UK (61,900) and from elsewhere in and outside of the EU/EEA (36,300). In contrast, little information is available on the 71,000 who migrated from
Scotland during the same period. UK records indicate that 46,400 went elsewhere in the UK but no detailed information is available on the destination of international movers.

3.30 Research that informs part of the Executive/ESRC sponsored studies on demography in Scotland will help to understand the nature of migration from the south east of England to Scotland. Other data collected as part of the FT initiative – for example, under the Working in Scotland Scheme or from the Workers Registration Scheme from the A8 countries – may add further to our knowledge of who is migrating.

3.31 Even less is known of the motivations of migrants who relocate to Scotland. Recently commissioned research by the Executive under Fresh Talent offers some initial insights here (TNS System Three, 2006) and assists in filling this important knowledge gap. Based on interviews with recent migrants to Scotland, the study categorises re-locators into four broad groups:

- **Economic/incidental pragmatists** – for educational or economic purposes with their destination selected primarily by opportunity (place for study, job offer)
- **World citizens** – a more footloose group who take employment opportunities in Scotland to experience a new environment, but do not view this move as permanent
- **Lifestage returners** – Scots returning consciously associated with family and life course influences and opportunities, and taking up new economic opportunities
- **Lifestyle/dream pursuers** – those seeking a new lifestyle and living environment, either moving within the UK or choosing Scotland from the rest of UK as an overseas migrant.

3.32 Such categories are consistent with previous migration motivational studies and highlight the ‘pull’ factors of employment or educational study opportunities alongside quality of life factors and diasporic roots.

3.33 Together, all this evidence helps to provide, first, a rationale for the target groups within Fresh Talent and, second, some purpose for developing particular channels (Figure 2.1 above) along which to attract migrants. But it also reveals the limited knowledge about the motivations of migrants who choose to come to Scotland and the very poor quality data which is currently available to track migrants who enter Scotland. Research in this area is essential if FT is to be able to work effectively at attracting and retaining talent through migration.

**Migration policy and entry schemes**

3.34 The attraction of new talent into Scotland through migration is central to FTI. However, migration management is a reserved matter within the UK, under the auspices of the Home Office, and thus the Executive has to operate within UK and European Union (EU) migration policy frameworks.

3.35 Within the UK, migration policy has focussed on managing flows of in-migrants through a number of schemes. At present, and of relevance to Fresh Talent, there are 3 main controls over channels of migration into the UK and thus Scotland:

- the work permit system, amounting to more than 82,600 permits being issued in 2004;
• the highly skilled migrant programme (HSMP) – although attracting only c5,000 pa, Clarke and Salt (2003, 573) concluded that “the main significance of the scheme is its deliberate policy of encouraging entrepreneurs to make the UK their home and the message that conveys about the UK’s attitude towards skill acquisition and global competition in a broad sense”; and
• the worker registration scheme (WRS) which operates for citizens of the 8 central and eastern European accession states (the so-called A8) that joined the EU in May 2004. Between May 2004 and December 2005, there were 345,000 applications.

3.36 In addition, other schemes which have brought migrants to the UK include the Sectors Based Scheme (reduced since 2005 with the ending of the hospitality scheme), and more seasonal and time-limited employment under the Working Holidaymakers Scheme (c40,000 per annum), and the Seasonal Agricultural Workers Scheme (since 2004 EU enlargement the quota has been cut to 16,000 per annum). These schemes do not include the 294,000 students given leave to enter the UK in 2004. Further, there are other more selective routes: including, for the more highly skilled and qualified migrants, the Highly Skilled Migrant Programme (HSMP), Entrepreneur and Innovator schemes.

3.37 Whilst these represent the official channels for migration, there are also migrants entering unofficially and those being classified as either refugees or asylum seekers, if they apply from within the UK for leave to remain on the basis of fear of persecution.

3.38 Beyond each of these, and under EU and international agreements, migrants also have rights and responsibilities (for example, under UN Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families).

3.39 As a consequence of this political landscape, the Scottish Executive is unable to devise its own migration legislation or to manage migration into or from Scotland without agreement from the Home Office in London and without complying with national and international legislation and agreements. There has therefore been considerable dialogue between the Fresh Talent policy team and the Home Office to enable specific FT schemes to be implemented where these include conditions associated with work permits, visas and leave to remain.

Emerging policy context

3.40 Significantly, since the inception of FT a major review of the UK’s migration policy has been conducted by the Home Office. This review has been undertaken against a backdrop of a global increase in the scale of migration. On the one hand, this has reflected significant rises in refugee and asylum seekers moving between countries. On the other, it also reflects the growth of labour migration, largely because, since the 1980s, many countries have actively sought to attract migrant workers, with “the emergence of a global migration market, mainly for the highly skilled” (Dobson et al, 2001, 3). Together, these have put pressure on, and undermined confidence in, the current channels and controls into the UK.

3.41 With the aim of achieving greater public confidence in the immigration system, the Home Secretary published in February 2005 a five year plan on immigration and asylum (Home Office, 2005). This announced the intention of introducing a new points based system to manage oversee migration flows into the UK, including Scotland. More details of how the
The proposals, importantly, offer scope for the specific needs of Scotland to be managed in support of FT. In particular, under the 5 tier framework, there are categories which are central to Fresh Talent:

- Tier 1, highly skilled individuals;
- Tier 2, skilled labour with job offers to fill gaps in labour force; and
- Tier 4, students.

The proposed system introduces the concept of sponsorship for Tiers 2 to 5. This makes an explicit link between the migrant and the sponsor, usually the employer or an educational institution. This recognises that it is the employer or institution that is best placed to take decisions on the suitability of the migrant and to take responsibility for ensuring that the migrant meets the terms of their leave.

3.42 Importantly, there is specific provision under Tier 1: Post Study for the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme (FTWiSS) to be able to continue to offer 2 years work opportunities without the need for a sponsor or job offer. Points for the main part of Tier 1 are designed to allow different combinations of attributes to permit entry into the UK. For example, someone under 31 will gain extra points that means that they will not be required to give evidence of such a high level of earnings as someone older who does not get points for their age.

3.43 Tier 2 focuses on skilled migrants with a job offer from a UK employer. Migrants will either need to have a job offer in a shortage occupation, as identified by the Skills Advisory Body, or if their job is not on the shortage list, be able to demonstrate that the employer has tried and failed to recruit an EU national. The provision of a specific Scottish Shortage Occupation List will make it easier for applicants with skills that Scotland needs to be attracted to Scotland – what the First Minister has termed “attracting the right people to Scotland” (Press Release, 7/3/06).

3.44 In contrast, existing schemes for low skill levels outside of the EU/European Economic Area (EEA) will be phased out as such needs should be met from within the EU/EEA. However, in order to retain some flexibility, there will be provision under Tier 3 for new quota-based low skilled schemes for temporary shortages as identified by the Skills Advisory Body.

3.45 This emerging process of managed migration raises issues for the FTI about what ought to be the primary focus for non EU/EEA nationals. The new tiered architecture proposed by the Home Office categorises potential fresh talent by their individual skills levels, by skill shortages within the UK, and by a separation of EU from non-EU/EEA countries of origin. Although there are assurances of a specific Scottish flavour within this structure (eg reduced period of settlement; Scottish shortage list), supporting the existing FTI
programmes, the overall policy has its own specific characteristics (e.g. in terms of age and education levels) which define (by default) those migrants who can be targeted by the Initiative.

3.47 In contrast to other nations who have forged their own policies to manage migration, the Executive can only negotiate some local variations to the UK policy. There are, however, within this UK-wide and EU policy contexts opportunities for free movement to Scotland from elsewhere within the UK and EU. The managed migration proposals for the UK suggest that in the future FT will have to be about attracting talent amongst high skill graduates, in areas of skill shortages in Scotland, international students for short periods of time, and lower skilled groups within the EU/EEA.

**Economic growth and prosperity**

“Fresh talent is a policy for the long-term growth of Scotland – it will continue to evolve and develop to meet our country’s needs for our long-term growth and prosperity. It therefore clearly supports and complements the Executive’s enterprise strategy, A Smart, Successful Scotland” (Scottish Executive, 2006a).

3.48 In their response to the Scottish Parliament’s Fresh Talent Inquiry, Ministers reiterated that Fresh Talent initiatives were being developed in the context of the wider Scottish economic sphere.

3.49 Across Scotland as a whole, the labour market has been expanding and, in recent years, there has been a rise in skill levels and a reduction in unemployment. The Office of National Statistics indicates that total employment in Scotland increased from 2,269,000 in 1999 to 2,411,000 in 2005, reflecting growth in service sector employment and a decline in production and construction (ONS, 2005a). Over this time period, unemployment fell from 179,000 to 147,000, representing 5.7% of those aged 16+ years who were economically active. Within the labour force, the skills level too has risen, with the proportion of those in employment being graduates rising from 17.1% in 1999 to 22.5% in 2005 (ONS, 2005b).

3.50 The key messages from the recent labour market projections by the Warwick Institute for Employment Research and Cambridge Econometrics and from FutureSkills Scotland (Dickerson et al., 2004) suggest that:

- the overall size of the workforce has grown steadily since 1981, mainly due to more women joining the jobs market and is projected to grow only marginally between 2003 and 2008 by 1.4% to 2.55 million;

- most growth will be in professional occupations and in the service sector, with a decline in skilled trades occupations;

- there are likely to be 500,000 new job openings between 2003 and 2008 as a result of the need to replace workers leaving jobs (464,000) and as new jobs are created (36,000). More than half of these are expected to be in the most highly skilled occupations (managerial, professional, and associated technical and professional).
3.51 In terms of the current labour requirements, data from NOMIS indicates that, as of June 2005, there were 46,483 notified vacancies in Scotland, with the greatest number lying within relatively low skill areas of sales/customer services (22%) and elementary occupations (26%).

3.52 Alongside this, Futureskills Scotland surveys of employers also provide some key pointers to employers’ assessment of the labour and skill shortages in Scotland. Their data point to less than half of all vacancies being classified as ‘hard to fill’ and only 1 in 4 were the result of skills shortages. Unsurprisingly, most of the hard to fill vacancies were in companies experiencing growth and amongst SMEs, but overall respondents indicated that attracting appropriately skilled staff was only a mid-level challenge, much less significant than increasing competition within Scotland.

3.53 More recent data point to a continuation of the trends of growing demand for staff and a drop in the numbers available to fill labour needs. The Bank of Scotland Scottish Monthly Labour Market Report for April 2006 reported the strongest rate of demand for staff over the past three years, with growth in Scotland outstripping that of the UK as a whole. This survey also noted a rise in skills shortages as the number of staff available on a permanent or temporary basis declined (Bank of Scotland, 2006).

3.54 These surveys point to the current and short-term future position of a growing labour market in which there are some, although not exceptional, skills gaps and hard to fill vacancies. However, there is also evidence that, in a growing economy, there will be a requirement for new labour, while the pool of those seeking employment is declining. In the short term, however, there is limited evidence of an imperative amongst employers to seek talented labour outside of Scotland. A key task for FT is to bridge this divide, encouraging business to look forward and to be more active in embracing talent from within and outside of Scotland.

The importance of cosmopolitanism and diversity in economic growth

3.55 The role which ‘culture’ plays in economic growth has been the subject of widespread debate (Gregson et al., 2001; Kong, 2000; Miles and Paddison, 2005; Pratt, 2004; Shields, 1999; Simonsen, 1999) and Scotland has not been immune to these discussions (Coyle et al., 2005). This discussion has fastened onto four alleged benefits which culture – loosely defined – might bring:

1. hallmark events and boosterist campaigns designed to renew patriotism and pride have been viewed as fostering national self confidence and encouraging greater belief when engaging with global capital and markets. Debate has been fuelled by the unscientific, but widely held suspicion, that Scotland suffers from a somewhat parochial and conservative outlook and that Scottish people lack a degree of self belief (Craig, 2003). Alexander (2003) has, for instance, encouraged Scotland to learn from the Irish experience where national confidence was an important precursor to the rise of the Celtic Tiger phenomenon;

2. local social networks, technology clusters, and knowledge communities, have been thought of as combining to create an atmosphere of entrepreneurship and innovation and have served as a catalyst for the rise of smart and dynamic economies. Therein, deepening the role of social networks and interpersonal relations in business has come
to be thought of as an important ingredient in the development of new industrial
districts and networked learning regions in Scotland;

3. ‘culturalisation’ of the economy has enhanced not only the contribution of the formal
cultural industries to national income, but also the significance of companies reliant
upon creative product design and trading symbolic goods in market places driven by
consumption tastes and lifestyle dispositions. The commodification of culture and the
aestheticisation of the economy have become important motivations for Scotland’s
new national cultural policy; and

4. there has been much debate in Scottish economic policy circles over the extent to
which Scotland is cosmopolitan enough to attract skilled talent (Harrison and Mason,
2003). This debate has focused upon the work of Richard Florida’s and the
applicability of the so called ‘creative class’ to Scottish economic policy (Florida,
2002; 2005a; b).

**Floridian thinking**

3.56 The Fresh Talent Scotland Initiative has been alert to debates over the role of culture
as a trigger of economic growth. Whilst all four of these debates resonate with Fresh Talent
and contribute further rationales for its existence, perhaps it has been the last debate that has
proven to have been the most influential.

3.57 According to Richard Florida, the quality of human capital in any place, and more
particularly the membership base of the ‘creative class’ in that place, is now important in
driving economic growth. Given the central role the creative class play, it is crucial that
regions re-engineer themselves so that they offer the right package of attractions to these
people. ‘Cool places’, which transcend distinctions between the bohemian and the bourgeois
ethic, which provide ‘low entry barriers’, which offer ‘plug and play communities’, and
which promote tolerance, diversity, creativity, and ‘boho chic’ will offer the greatest lure in
the future. The policy diagnoses is for places to transform themselves from stuffy,
conservative, insular, parochial, bureaucratic and stifling ‘working class enclaves’, ‘boring
post-industrial service centres’ and ‘high technology ‘nerdistans’, into liberal, bohemian,
multicultural and culturally cosmopolitan hubs.

3.58 Against this backdrop, Florida claims that countries like Scotland might be capable of
repositioning themselves in the global circulation of talent. Three areas need attention if it is
to succeed.

- **Workplaces that offer the freedom to breathe and to become:** According to Florida,
the creative class are at their best in the ‘no collar workplace’, where hierarchical and
bureaucratic company structures and regimes of surveillance are replaced with new
forms of ‘soft control’ which include self management, peer recognition and pressure,
and intrinsic motivation. The creative class both contribute to and benefit from
revolutionary changes in the workplace which seek to replace fossilised Fordist and
Taylorist ways of working with flexible and stimulating working practices.

- **Everyday life and the lifestyle and lifecourse ‘morph’:** According to Florida, the
creative class aspire to active and busy lifestyles that facilitate the consumption of
new experiences and the ‘deepening of the moment’. Concomitant with these new
lifestyles, the creative class seeks to ‘morph’ orthodox conceptions of the life course
and extend the leisure habits which have previously been associated with the ‘twenty
somethings’ across the lifespan. Cities which are open to alternative ways of living out the life course, and which provide the soft infrastructure which underpins sensory and experimental consumption practices will be preferred by members of the creative class.

- **Cosmopolitanism and borderless communities:** According to Florida, the creative class thrives best in communities which are low in traditional forms of ‘suffocating’ social capital but high in forms of social capital which support easy entry, intense but shallow relationships, and acceptance of difference and individuality. Cities housing communities with porous borders are liable to be more attractive to members of the creative class than ones where strong communities render outsiders visible and subject to suspicion, judgement, inspection, and surveillance.

*The culture and economy debate is a debate*

3.58 Whilst Florida’s work has come to be viewed as a ready made manual for urban and regional development, and whilst the creative class thesis undoubtedly has important policy implications, it is imperative to avoid overly simplistic readings of how culture might be utilised to promote local economic development. Florida’s work has been criticised on a number of grounds, not least in terms of whether migrants really do come to places for their culture as much as for their capacity to offer career opportunities, and whether creative people really are able to exert a significant impact on economic structures, conditions, and trajectories that have been decades in the making.

3.59 The Fresh Talent Initiative is to be applauded for being alert to the thinking of leading economic regeneration practitioners and for seizing the contemporary zeitgeist which posits a fundamental relationship between culture and economy. Nonetheless, it needs to keep aware of the fact that there exists much debate in this area and that many critics are not persuaded that theses like that of the ‘creative class’ really do contribute towards the formulation of a purposeful way forward for countries like Scotland.

*The need for a FT initiative*

3.61 As noted above, the rationale for attracting fresh talent is based on a mix of demographic, economic and cultural imperatives, and over the past 2 years the emphasis given to each of these components has shifted. Taking each of the elements of the rationale in turn, this section explores whether they remain relevant.

*Addressing the consequences of a declining and ageing population*

3.62 Presented as a first and pressing context in which FT was located, there have been important shifts here. Rising in-migration and a small rise in birth rates have resulted in Scotland’s population growing and being projected to grow for the next few years. Although subject to fluctuations around net migration flows, the immediate imperative to overturn a decline has been removed. Nevertheless, the fundamentals associated with an ageing population remain in place, and Scotland’s demographic position is less secure than other parts of the UK or much of the EU.
Enhancing migration opportunities into Scotland

3.63 High levels of in-migration to Scotland over the past years indicates that thousands of people are able to take up opportunities to relocate to Scotland, and in the last 2 years this has more than offset out-migration. However, there will be changes to opportunities for in-migration associated with the Home Office system of managed migration. This will alter the balance between higher and lower skilled migration, and between EU/EEA and other countries of origin.

Meeting labour shortages to sustain economic growth

3.64 Surveys of employers suggest that whilst there are some labour and skill bottlenecks, overall the labour market has been able to meet demand for employment. There is little evidence of an imperative amongst Scottish business to recruit overseas and to bring fresh talent to Scotland. However, both in the medium term, when the number of working age people in Scotland declines and at present, in relation to companies growing, there is a case to be made that additional talent is and will be required.

Increasing cultural diversity and cosmopolitanism of Scottish life

3.65 Openness to and acceptance of diversity is a positive sign of an outward looking and dynamic society and has a positive economic impact. However, the terminology is itself value laden and complex, opening additional questions about the nature of community and equality, for example. Further, the evidence that such diversity and cosmopolitanism influences flows of talent is at best debatable and increasingly contested.

Action Points

3.66 Taken together this review asks questions about the rationales which have been developed as the basis of FT. However, this does not detract from the fundamentals which led to the launch of this initiative. Economically, it is likely that there will be an increasing need for new labour and new talent in Scotland to sustain economic growth and offset rising dependency ratios associated with an ageing population. Second, in-migration is critical in sustaining population levels and to meet at least some skills and labour needs. Further, socially and culturally, Scotland needs to be connected globally and in-migration and exchanges between nations are important.

3.67 In short, there remains a requirement for attracting Fresh Talent to Scotland. However, in the shifting contexts outlined in this chapter, new opportunities exist to allow the FTI to evolve. These are considered in the next chapter.
CHAPTER FOUR NEW OPPORTUNITIES, NEW TARGET GROUPS

Introduction

4.1 Across the developed economies, where nations are experiencing a decline in birth rates and in the balance between births and deaths, there is pressure to recruit labour and address demographic ageing through in-migration. Under such conditions, not every nation can ‘win’! Rather, within such a competitive environment, as with the rush to attract and retain financial capital in a global economy, each nation will have to identify strategies which can respond ever more flexibly and quickly to the potential flight of talented people. Just as there has been a spiral of ever more imaginative and frantic efforts to attract and retain key forms of global financial capital, there is a risk that a similar process will occur over talented human capital. As the attempts to attract inward investment, global hallmark events and international government expenditure and then to retain such capital have shown, there has to be considerable expenditure to achieve the benefits which accrue from the marketing of one’s assets.

4.2 How then can and should Scotland respond to this ‘talent’ competition? The FT response has been to attract particular niches of human capital, building on its own recognised strengths (education, business entrepreneurship) and through such selective talent attraction sustain its future competitive advantages.

4.3 But it also needs to develop a robust, and flexible approach to retaining such talent, for this is the talent which increasingly other nations are also seeking, given its ‘high value’. And widening this, there is also a need to sustain those characteristics which afford a competitive edge - the international quality of the education system, and the economic openness which fosters entrepreneurial activity.

4.4 FT is about human capital; the human resources and skills which engender competitiveness. As indicated in Chapter 3, it complements strategies of the Executive to encourage international financial capital to invest and create employment in Scotland, and those strategies enhancing social capital and the quality of life within Scotland.

4.5 In focussing on attracting new human capital into Scotland, FT has focused on five target groups (see 2.3). With the exception of Scottish business looking to recruit from overseas, and perhaps entrepreneurs (a small cohort), these three main target groups represent talent who have higher than average propensity to migrate – because of their position in their life course (going into higher or further education), or their own desire to relocate for employment, or return to Scotland. Further, these groups can make use of existing channels linking them or their country of origin and Scotland (as shown in Figure 2.1).

4.6 There is thus a sound logic to these being at the heart of FTI. In addition, the initial focus on international students is eminently logical, as there are well oiled channels – for example, between universities and colleges and countries around the world, between the British Council and these countries – and a highly desirable ‘selling point’ in the education quality offered in Scotland.

4.7 However, FT is located within evolving contexts (Chapter 3), creating new spaces in which FT could operate. In this chapter therefore, the opportunity is taken to consider some
new target groups for FT. The four groups outlined each utilise existing assets linked to Scotland: its own talent; its diasporic communities across the world; movement within companies and organisations connected to Scotland; and Scotland’s connection within the EU/EEA area.

4.8 These offer distinct advantages to FT.

- First, in a highly competitive market place for talent, they all place the unique advantages of Scotland centre stage.
- Second, in targeting these groups there are opportunities to build on existing connections – within companies, with the diaspora, within the EU.
- Third, there is a stronger position for business, within Scotland and overseas, within FT.
- Fourth they emphasise the integrity and identity of Scotland as nation and economic unit within the EU.

Retaining talent in Scotland

4.9 The migration statistics for the period 2002-03 highlight that approximately 71,000 people migrated from Scotland. 56.4% of those involved in this out-migration were aged between 13 and 34 years (General Register Office for Scotland, 2005b). Whilst this flow was more than offset by the inflow of migrants to Scotland, the scale of out-migration highlights the significance of retaining talent which currently resides in Scotland. Stemming this flow can provide a major contribution to increasing both the net migration balance and the youthfulness of the population.

Competing with the ‘flight of talent’

4.10 There is a high level of risk attached to a ‘talent attraction’ strategy aiming at addressing demographic and economic challenges.

4.11 First, by its very nature, talent attracted to Scotland is more mobile and less embedded into communities and places. Consequently, they have a higher propensity to relocate again – participating in the global flight of talent. Accurate information on the length of stay of migrants is notoriously difficult to obtain. In the UK, data are derived either from the decennial census or from International Passenger Surveys (IPS). According to the 2001 Census, in the 1990s one in 3 in-migrants left the UK again within 4 years of arrival, although there was some variation between those from OECD countries (50%) and non-OECD countries where only 23% left within 4 years (ONS, 2005c). The IPS provides some sense of the trajectory of stay length, with a drop from 48% entering Britain in 1994 intending to stay for more than 4 years to 34% in 2003. This is matched by nearly half of all in-migrants intending to stay for only 1-2 years in 2003, and about 20% 3-4 years (ONS, 2004).

4.12 Second, given talent’s propensity to flight, there is a risk that others in Scotland join in the flight of talent. If, as argued in attracting talent, there is a honey-pot effect, with pools of talent attracting others, then the reverse is also probable, with ever expanding numbers of migrants attracted elsewhere by new, brighter opportunities.
4.13 Again there is limited information about the flows of migrants out of Scotland to assess this effect. There are few official statistics charting the number of Scots leaving to non-UK destinations, although individual national surveys and censuses across the world offer periodic insights. The 2001 Census indicated that 47,766 people left from Scotland to the rest of the UK during the 12 months before the census date, and that more than half were aged between 16 and 34. In total this is less than 1% of the Scottish population but does point to the likely flow of younger, educated people out of Scotland.

Table 4.1 Number of out-migrants from Scotland to rest of UK, 2000-01

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age cohorts</th>
<th>Number leaving</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-15</td>
<td>7411</td>
<td>15.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-24</td>
<td>14290</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>13741</td>
<td>28.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>5985</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>2947</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>1618</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75+</td>
<td>874</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: General Registrar for Scotland, 2005a

4.14 Third, there is little research evidence of how talent can be anchored to Scotland. Amongst the key questions which require to be researched are:

*Why does talent leave Scotland?*

4.15 Studies such as Boyle and Motherwell’s (2005) study in Dublin and Condor’s (2005) study in England, offer some insights into the barriers which put off expatriate Scots from returning, but this is a poor proxy for understanding why people leave in the first place. Most commentators studying migration motivation point to a combination of pull factors (offered by the destination) and push factors (within Scotland) but little systematic analysis has been undertaken on these in the Scottish emigration context.

4.16 An analysis of the British Household Panel Survey by the ONS concluded that of all movers of working age within the UK as a whole between 1991 and 2000, housing was the primary motivation for moving. However, this is skewed by the high levels of short-distance relocation and the research suggests that employment related reasons accounted for nearly 1 in 3 longer, inter-regional moves, with education (20.1%), housing (19.1%) and quality of the area (16.6%) being of second level importance (Dixon, 2003).

*What would encourage talent to remain in Scotland?*

4.17 Even less knowledge exists about what, or indeed whether, any intervention or adjustment is possible to prevent emigration. For the retention of talent this is of fundamental importance. The assumption is that employment opportunities dominate and that a vibrant and growing economy will assist in retaining talent. However, others have challenged this arguing that quality of life opportunities (Rogerson and Findlay, 1991; Rogerson, 1999) or
what Florida (2002, 2005b) calls the experience of everyday community life are important in retaining creative workers.

Over what timescale is ‘retention’ to be measured?

4.18 Location decision are ‘final’ for few people and as many as 1 in 10 of the UK population relocates each year (Dixon, 2003). Under FTWiSS the retention of talent for 2 years is viewed by some employers as too short a time, not least as on the job training and the embedding of graduates into an organisation can take up most of that time. On the other hand, flexibility and mobility within the labour market are viewed as dimensions of a vibrant economy. Further, at present it is difficult to identify the ‘population’ being considered here in order to undertake analyses of the motivations and circumstances involved. In other words, there are issues about identifying who is departing/has departed and who is retained (ie considered leaving but decided to remain in Scotland).

4.19 Researching answers to these questions will be critical if FT is to improve understanding of actions by the Executive and others capable of retaining talent in Scotland.

Sustaining competitive advantages

4.20 Such knowledge is vital, because in the absence of evidence about what ‘pushes’ talent away from Scotland, it is difficult to tailor the retention strategy to key areas. Instead, the approach is broad, associated with the maintenance of those attributes which are perceived to offer a competitive advantage for the target groups.

4.21 Consequently, the approach is one largely involving:

- investing in the HEIs and SCs to enhance their attractiveness to international students and abilities to continue to provide a high quality of education
- offering further support to attract more entrepreneurs to Scotland and provide a economic environment in which they can continue to develop ideas
- assisting the economy to grow and to continue to seek skills and talent
- providing opportunities and support for members of the diaspora to locate back to Scotland.

Action points

4.22 In developing a robust retention strategy, there is a need for fundamental research. Under some of the FT schemes there are opportunities to explore some of the issues outlined above with an identifiable sample of migrants, both in terms of those who have to decided to stay (eg under FTWiSS and scholarships) and those who after experiencing Scotland did not stay. It is important that these opportunities are grasped.

4.23 Therefore, two important action points arise in relation to FT and talent retention. First, augmenting the current questionnaire surveys under FTWiSS, and follow up studies of those attracted to Scotland under FTWiSS, SISP and other programmes could provide important insights and contribute to answers to these questions. Second, there is a need to
commission research into identifying emigrants from Scotland and their motivations for relocating and what interventions might have prevented their departure.

Making global connections: constructing a ‘FT affinity diaspora’

"Losing people isn't a bad thing," declares Tom Tierney, 44, worldwide managing director of Bain & Co., an international consulting firm headquartered in Boston. "We attract the best and the brightest. And those people are the hardest to hold onto. Our job is to create a value proposition that gets them to stay another day, another month, another year. But ultimately, it's foolish to believe you can trap good people. The idea is to stay connected with them after they leave your payroll. How do you turn them into advocates, clients, business partners?" (Krisner, 1998, 136)

4.24 The achievements under FT so far have been largely with the resources and expertise of partners within government and state-funded agencies, linked to economic development, education and tourism. FT needs to reach out beyond this and utilise more fully those ‘Scots’ around the world who have an affinity with Scotland.

4.25 As Tom Tierney acknowledges, talent is mobile and even if talent cannot be retained in Scotland there are advantages to staying connected with it. As the UNHCR commented recently, “the skilled expatriate population, if mobilised in diaspora networks, may be considered as a potential asset instead of a definite loss” (UNHCR, 2004). In short, this could be a ‘brain gain’.

4.26 Translating this diasporic community into a group to work for FT, however, requires further thought. Many people across the world feel an affinity with Scotland – through parentage, heritage, or other senses of belonging. However, in the context of FT the key group in this wider diaspora is composed of those who have both an affinity with Scotland and a recent experience of living, working or studying in Scotland. This element of the diaspora – what could be termed an ‘FT affinity diaspora’ – forms a new target group.

Feeling Scotland

4.27 At a time when images, knowledge of and opinions about places can be communicated globally across space without the recipient ever visiting a location, the felt, experiential dimension of place has become an important marketing tool. The importance of developing personal experience of place enables individuals to feel a deeper sense of affinity with that place than can be gained through ‘remote’ experiences.

4.28 Such experiencing of Scotland has underpinned the promotion of the tourist industry in Scotland, with its emphasis on encouraging people to visit Scotland and gain a (more) ‘felt’ sense of place. It is also engrained in the development of international business networks, for example GlobalScot and Scottish Networks International, ensuring that affinities with Scotland can be drawn upon across the globe to strengthen the relationship between Scotland and others. By translating their own personal felt affinity into other networks, these champions or advocates ensure that a wider audience is aware of the
potentialities of Scotland and help to open connections between Scotland and other communities.

4.29 Such members of the FT affinity diaspora sit alongside the traditional diasporic community and the ‘Friends of Scotland’ who have some, but often remote, links with Scotland. The FT affinity diaspora is different, however. First, members will have had a recent ‘lived experience’ of Scotland and thus their felt affinity to of modern Scotland. Second, its members are those who can assist FT to attract its target groups. Third, the focus of the links with this affinity diaspora is about FT. In turn, the expectation is that this group will have a strong affinity with (modern) Scotland and will promote the nation as a place to live, work or study.

4.30 Fresh Talent has already made progress in this area. First, through its promotion and marketing, as well as specific initiatives and projects, FT has enabled some groups to experience Scotland and has devoted considerable resources to promoting a positive image of Scotland. Under the scholarship programme and Challenge Fund for example, there has also been an effort to ensure that those attracted to Scotland have a positive experience. Second, it has encouraged those attracted on FT schemes to join diasporic networks such as SNI. Third, FT has developed the messages which are being communicated to the existing diaspora. “Scotland is the place”, for example, enables a sense of modern Scotland to be provided to inquirers.

4.31 The importance of the diaspora is also acknowledged by the Executive in its diaspora strategy. To quote:

“We already recognise returning Scots as a target group for the Fresh Talent initiative. Through our Diaspora Strategy, launched in Canada in October 2005, we intend to engage with and mobilise the Scottish diaspora to further Scotland’s interests for the long-term benefit of our economy and society. We aim to encourage the diaspora’s active participation and engagement in promoting Scotland as a great country to visit, live, learn, work, do business and invest. We hope that, as awareness of a vibrant Scotland grows, some of the diaspora will consider returning to Scotland.” (Scottish Executive Response, 2006b)

4.32 Beyond this general approach, however, there is scope for FT to target, more formally, part of this wider diaspora – and not just to view them as target groups of talent which can be attracted back to Scotland. In so doing the FT team needs to formalise this into a strategic objective so that the character of the diasporic community relevant to FT can be identified and action taken to ensure that they are working for Scotland in meeting the FT aims.

**Employing talent for Scotland**

4.33 As such, the rationale for constructing a FT affinity diaspora is less about the attraction of talent to Scotland, but the deployment of talent which has been here and is now overseas to the benefit of Scotland. Of course, for such positive relationships to exist and be maintained, considerable effort is required. This includes – as already acknowledged in FT schemes – ensuring that when attracted to Scotland, talent has a positive experience and
communicates this through their own personal networks to other parts of the world. At another level, it is about developing trust and relationship within networks, which may form the basis of more substantial and longer-lasting channels. It is also about identifying and selecting members of the affinity diaspora. Key groups could include those:

a) those who have been part of FT schemes and initiatives;
b) those within existing networks who have had recent experience of working and studying in Scotland;
c) recent emigrants from Scotland;
d) tourists.

4.34 Critically, in each case the main criterion is the strategic importance of ‘talent’ as much in terms of their ability to hold positions within key networks in their country of destination and their communication and articulation skills, as about formal employment skills.

**Assisting business to go global**

4.35 The value of the diaspora as ‘ambassadors’ and advocates for Scotland has been recognised within the initiative. Affinity diasporas have further advantages for business and the economy.

4.36 As companies increasingly go global, they find themselves confronted with a variety of problems that lie outwith their area of expertise. These include knowledge of other markets and marketing practices, labour law, currency fluctuations, cultural orientations, recruitment methods, and accounting rules and regulations. Because it is simply too difficult for each company to build these competencies in house, they turn to producer services (management consultants, international lawyers, accountants, and recruitment agencies, IT specialist, language specialist etc) for help. Producer services furnish companies with the capacity to operate transnationally - they give them global command capability.

4.37 There is a geography to producer services, however. They tend to concentrate in so called ‘world cities’ and because being in and around these services is so vital to TNCs, they too prefer to cluster in world cities. In the United Kingdom context this means that many companies from the British regions, once they grow and internationalise, reach a certain size that requires them to relocate to London. This is why there is a geography to company HQs in the United Kingdom and why Scottish firms find it so hard to go global without relocating to London. Some try to stay in Scotland and use London-based producer services to broker their relations with the rest of the world, but this is a fraught task (see Lyons and Salmon, 1995 for a general account).

4.38 It is against this backdrop that the concept of a FT affinity diaspora might be so important in Scotland. If we are to encourage Scottish companies to internationalise and compete in the global market without then losing them to the local imperatives only London can fulfill, then perhaps the affinity diaspora might be an important asset. It might be a resource which enhances the capacity of Scottish companies to go global from Scotland.
Bringing together networks

4.39 One role for FT could therefore be connecting the existing affinity diaspora networks which exist within Scotland and developing support services to maximise the benefits of the ‘talent’ embedded within each. Importantly, for the affinity network to be of maximum benefit members should be voluntary, opt-in to support FT and be directed to supporting specific FT target groups. Therefore it is necessary that either FT, or its partners, have opportunities in place for those who have recently visited, lived, worked or studied in Scotland and are leaving the country to register their interest in assisting FT goals. A central database of the FT affinity diasporaeans will need to be maintained and regularly updated – adding new members and also ending involvement as the members’ experience of Scotland fades over time. These latter members could be added to other diasporic networks such as Global Friends of Scotland to ensure that their connections with Scotland are maintained.

4.40 There are many existing networks from which the FT affinity diaspora could be drawn. Most obviously and indeed already operating along the lines of a FT affinity network is SNI; focussed on students and graduates, but with the potential of assisting business in the future. GlobalScot with its focus on high-level business links, University alumni, TalentScotland and Global Friends of Scotland all could be linked to the FT diaspora.

4.41 But new connections could also be made to assist FT. These could include:

   a) arrangements with VisitScotland and local tourist boards to provide opportunities for visitors to offer their services
   b) new links made with voluntary societies/organisations who have connections internationally, for example through culture, literature, arts and heritage
   c) identifying ways of maintaining contact with emigrating Scots, perhaps in partnership with relocation agencies
   d) collaborating with businesses who have international offices to maintain contact with those who worked in Scotland.

Renewing the felt experience

4.42 In a rapidly changing world, keeping up to date with developments and opportunities in Scotland when living elsewhere is difficult. As noted above, the importance of recent experiences of a stay in Scotland has been widely recognised. If FT is to succeed in maintaining positive relationships with the diaspora it has generated under scholarship and other programmes, then a strategy for renewing experiences of Scotland needs to be developed. At present, this is likely to be through remote contact; for example, information emailed or posted, and through occasional contact with invitations to events connected with Scotland in their own country or through the GFoS ‘Scotland Now’ electronic newsletter of activity by Scots across the world.

4.43 There needs to be scope for at least some of the FT affinity diasporaeans to be supported through opportunities to revisit and thus renew their ‘felt experience’ of Scotland. This would have the twin advantages of ensuring greater awareness of the current opportunities in Scotland and of deepening their affinity with Scotland.
Connecting beyond physical migration

4.44 It is understandable that in the context of a projected decline in total population within a decade, the quicker ageing of the population, and the need to bring new talent into Scotland, the Fresh Talent initiative was conceived around the physical movement of people, settling for a period of time in Scotland. With an associated retention strategy, such medium-term permanency and physical relocation was deemed to be beneficial, both demographically and economically for Scotland. The ultimate metric for evaluating the success of FT is the number of talented people attracted and retained in Scotland.

4.45 With the lessening of the demographic pressure, if only in the short term, there is time and space to reflect on whether this physical migration should be the primary metric by which FT is assessed.

4.46 As the Smart, Successful Scotland strategy acknowledges, connections to the global economy enabling the flow of information and arguably talent, need not be achieved only by long-term physical mobility. In a modern economy, information and knowledge flows are often associated with short-term mobility of people. Face to face contacts - within organisations, at international meetings, and through mobility associated with time-limited contracts – may offer more powerful economic benefits to Scotland than physical relocations. In addition, virtual mobility – achieved through ICT and other forms of communication without any distance being travelled – has enabled Scotland to be well connected in the creative channels of the global economy.

4.47 A new target group for FT should therefore be those companies who already have international links and channels, either as part of trans-national organisations or through less formal exchange routes. The transfer of knowledge and expertise linked with talent has become an important form of exchange (Beaverstock, 2004, 2005; Findlay and Garrick, 1990). Such knowledge networks enable transfer of expertise and skills through short-term mobility, and appeal to a much wider set of skilled migrants. Temporary – whether for a few days or a few months – relocation is potentially much more appealing than the permanent relocation associated with traditional notions of migration.

4.48 Support for more open channels between Scotland and others parts of the world based on short-term mobility has an appeal because it:

- ensures flows of knowledge about Scotland and return flows of insights to new ideas, thinking and cultures;
- encourages larger and well connected companies to employ overseas talent as part other internal labour pool;
- encourages more businesses to experience employing overseas talent;
- cements a stronger affinity with Scotland than merely through trade; and
- enables opportunity for talent within Scotland to experience other cultures and places without the need for longer-term emigration.

As this mobility within companies builds personal contacts and provides experience of people and places in Scotland, there are added advantages of temporary, business and virtual visitors being part of a wider business FT affinity diaspora (see above).
4.49 Whilst the obvious downside to this form of virtual and short-term mobility is the limited opportunity for talented individuals to gain a ‘felt experience’ of Scotland, in the absence of strong evidence of having to reside in Scotland for longer periods of time in order to benefit Scotland, the opportunity to reach a new pool of talent should be developed. Just as business seeks a balance between the desire for face to face contact and proximity over other attractive locational factors, it may be that, under FT, accessing a wider, international pool of talent – students, entrepreneurs, diaspora – and connecting them with Scotland through ICT will be as effective as seeking to relocate people.

4.50 The benefits of short-term mobility might also be carried forward to existing target groups. For students, for example, FT could, in conjunction with HEIs, provide scholarships (as at present to those with talent and work experience) which involved distance learning courses and off-campus support in India or China and support the attendance of intensive, short courses in Scotland for the scholarship holder and their partners. The opportunity for access to high quality education is thus supported by opportunities to gain some, albeit time limited, insight into Scotland for students and dependents who are likely to be involved in relocation decisions.

4.51 For business and workers, the current FTWiSS programme offers only a time-limited (2 year) focus and, as noted in Chapter 6, the focus on SMEs has emphasised permanent migration. For larger employers and those who are already part of international networks, opportunities to support short-term transfers of staff may provide an excellent exchange of talent – including new ways of working, new ideas and new ways of thinking – as well as enhanced global connectivity. There is scope within FTWiSS for short time period mobility to be supported for recent graduates (especially for those who do not wish to or cannot uproot themselves and family) to return to Scotland.

Meeting Scotland’s labour needs from within the EU/EEA

4.52 Most countries which have instigated a managed migration policy have done so with the aim of meeting labour market needs. In Canada, Australia and New Zealand, for example, emphasis is placed on attracting skilled workers with transferable skills to hard to fill posts. In each case more than 60% of the planned migration intake is of skilled migrants.

4.53 In the UK, the proposed points system has some characteristics which mirror these three examples, although it is less explicitly linked to skill needs and shortages (Home Office, 2005; 2006). Nevertheless, under the proposals, emphasis will be on the applicant’s attributes, especially their work experience, age and academic qualifications. Under the new policy, emphasis is also placed on increasingly enabling skilled migration into the UK and restricting low skilled migration. Increasingly in the future, low skilled migration will become restricted to EU/EEA countries and quotas imposed on non-EU/EEA countries.

4.54 There is a logic under this system for FT to target a geographical group of talent, that within the EU/EEA. This is pertinent first as talent is more than just a higher skilled, higher educated group, and in Scotland, in-migration also assists in meeting labour needs in lower skilled sectors.
The significance of this group

4.55 Since the Accession countries (A8) joined the EU on 1 May 2004, the Worker Registration Scheme (WRS) adopted by the UK provides evidence of the potential importance of this group as a source of labour. Between 1 May 2004 and the end of December 2005 (the latest data), 345,000 people from the A8 countries have registered within the scheme. The majority have come from Poland (59%) with Lithuania (13%) and Slovakia (11%) being the next largest origin countries. Of these migrants, just under 24,000 registered in Scotland, forming 7.3% of those in the scheme. Recently published research highlights the significance of this migration source to the UK, filling labour shortages in low skill and low wage sectors of the economy (Anderson et al., 2006).

4.56 Compared with other regions of the UK, a higher proportion of those registering for work in Scotland were employed in sectors which traditionally have lower skills levels – hospitality and catering (9.0% of this sector were employed in Scotland) and construction (11.3%) – whereas in the (higher skilled) administration, business and managerial services sector which was the largest sector of employment, only 3.5% were in Scotland. Although the proportion of workers under this scheme represents less than 1% of the total labour force of the UK and is less than the levels of unemployment in the UK, many took employment in ‘hard to fill’ sectors of the economy where skill or labour shortages existed – in the public sector (bus and lorry drivers, care services, education and health services) and especially in the private sector (construction, hospitality and catering).

4.57 For FT, the evidence from the WRS points to a number of advantages in adopting this geographical target group:

a) accurate information is available on the number of migrants, and the flows by occupation into Scotland. This provides a clear evidence base on skill shortages which are hard to fill with indigenous labour. However, although the WRS requires applicants to re-register each time they change employment, or take on additional employment, there is no de-registration scheme. As a result, the data is only on entry to the UK labour market and provides no longitudinal information on timescales within the labour market. Other information from local and specific studies of sample groups of migrants suggest that a higher proportion of A8 migrants are likely to be longer-stayers (more than 2 years) than other groups (Schneider and Holman, 2005);

b) the profile of those involved in the scheme fit the demographic attributes sought under FT. The vast majority of registrants are young and single; 83% are between 18 and 34 years old, and 94% had no dependent in the UK. As Traser (2005) notes, for the countries of origin, this migration stream represents a ‘youth drain’ as much as a brain drain;

c) although this entry route to the UK has only been in operation for 2 years, there is evidence elsewhere in the EU to suggest that the pattern will be sustained. Ireland too operates a registration scheme, but has attracted Central European migrants for more than 5 years. They have viewed this influx of migrants as necessary to sustain economic growth and prosperity, with construction employment being the dominant sector and, as with the UK, Poland is the main source country;

d) this target group is more closely aligned to the perceived skills and labour needs of businesses within Scotland. Adopting this target groups therefore enables FT to develop a stronger partnership with Scottish employers. The fact that these workers
do not need work permits also potentially makes them more attractive to Scottish employers.

**Action Points**

4.58 In meeting skills needs, FT will need to be positioned carefully within the EU and UK contexts. In the last few years, many more migrants have come into Scotland from elsewhere in the UK and the EU than from overseas. There is no evidence of this changing and the proposed system of managing migration will enhance this pattern.

4.59 If FT is to be evaluated in its contribution to expanding the total population in Scotland and reduce its age profile, then a skills based approach focussed on the EU/EEA will be valuable.
CHAPTER FIVE EVALUATING PROGRESS ON ACTIONS UNDER FRESH TALENT

Introduction

5.1 It is recognised that at this early stage of the FTI, evaluation in terms of measurable outcomes will be problematic as no element has been in existence for more than 2 years and most initiatives have existed over shorter time periods. However, in developing a measurable and evidence-based approach, two forms of progress evaluations, based on Fresh Talent targets, have been undertaken.

5.2 First, in this chapter the specific FT actions taken by the Executive and partners over the past 2 years are reviewed. In so doing, each individual initiative is assessed in relation to its own specific, short-term objectives. These initiatives can be divided for convenience between:

a) those which are new strands, developed under FT;
b) those which relate to existing activities, but which are supported through FT; and
c) those within other areas of the Executive which have been informed by FT.

In each case, reflecting the considerable level of scrutiny and evaluation to which FT has already been subjected, the review draws on and refers to existing evaluations, often by external agencies.

5.3 Second, FT needs to be evaluated in terms of how it is meeting the wider and longer-term targets and objectives. These have been expressed in relation to the 5 key target groups of talent to be attracted to Scotland and an evaluation of these is conducted in the next chapter.

Undertaking the evaluation

5.4 Evidence for this review has been gathered from both published material relating to Fresh Talent, previous reviews and evaluations commissioned for the Executive, and from interviews conducted by the research team.

5.5 Amongst the published material, the review draws on the evidence provided to the Scottish Parliament European and External Affairs Committee inquiry into Fresh Talent conducted in 2005 and on reports published by the Executive since then. However, most of the written evidence has come from evaluations – both internally conducted by the Executive and commissioned studies by external agencies – already undertaken. Unsurprisingly given the importance attached to FT by the First Minister and the cross-cutting nature of FT, each Fresh Talent project is subject to a high level of evaluation.

5.6 In augmenting this evidence, the research team contacted three main groups of people for face to face or telephone interviews:

Group A: those who have a central position within the overall FTI – specifically within IPD, RAS, the Home Office liaison, and SISP;
Group B: those who can comment on specific initiatives in place and where there has not been evaluation to date. These include the Challenge Fund, Global Scot, and SNI;

Group C: other groups which have been identified as partners in current or future areas of activity, especially in implementing international student and business dimensions of FT.

5.7 An interview programme was constructed around, first, those involved with the international student schemes; second, those related to business; and, third, those whose involvement was wider, cross-cutting FT as a whole. Each member of the research team led on one of these sets of interviews. A full list of all those individuals interviewed is provided in Annex 2.

5.8 Each interview was loosely structured around an exploration of the interviewees involvement with FT, their opinions of FT and its development to date, and the impact of FT within their own areas of operation. As the programme of interviews progressed, however, the focus shifted from general questions about FT to more specific questions about the evaluation of FT. In addition, themes and issues raised in earlier interviews were discussed with subsequent interviewees, with opportunities taken, where required, to return for further discussion with earlier interviewees. In each case, notes were made from each interview and these were returned to the key interviewees for verification and, if required, amendment and clarification. This ‘rolling’ agenda enabled the researchers to ‘drill down’ further into any elements which interviewees felt were central to the evaluation.

Evaluating FT projects

5.9 In the remainder of this chapter the focus is on assessing and evaluating the impact of each of the activities which fall under Fresh Talent. For convenience, these have been divided into those which have been associated explicitly with FT; a set which have attracted support from FT, but were initiated by other agencies; and those connected with other areas of the Executive. The core activities are:

- The formation of the Relocation Advisory Service (RAS)
- The introduction of the Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme (FTWiSS)
- Scottish International Scholarship Programme (SISP)
- The Challenge Fund
- Enhancing involvement with business
- International image/marketing
- University alumni networks
- Scotland is the place website (Sitp)
- Global Friends of Scotland (GfoS)
- Research into experiences of recent migrants to Scotland

The other FT related activities include:
- Scottish Networks International (SNI)
- Dare to be Digital
- EDGE
And the connections made with other Executive areas include:

- Demographic research
- Informing other policy areas

5.10 In reviewing each of these, the following discussion outlines the genesis of each activity, provides some quantifiable assessment of the activity, and considers any evaluations that have been undertaken or are currently being conducted. For each, where relevant, the section concludes with a commentary on possible future evaluative actions that would enhance an assessment of the impact of FTI.

Core FT areas

Relocation Advisory Service

5.11 A key strand of the New Scots document was the setting up of a Relocation Advisory Service (RAS) in conjunction with the Home Office and Work Permits UK. Originally envisaged as a new one-stop relocation service to advise on jobs, accommodation, visas, work permits, school and university opportunities, RAS has expanded and deepened its role within Fresh Talent. In essence, it has become pivotal to most of the FT activities, as advice associated with each project is often provided through RAS.

5.12 The main actions to date are:

- an advisory service dealing with inquiries about permits etc associated with working, living, studying and doing business in Scotland;
- liaison with key partners in Scotland – especially the Scottish Enterprise Network through SDI – over business dimension of FT; and
- assisting in developing promotional material associated with FT.

5.13 One specific business element of RAS’s work has been the publication of the Employers’ Toolkit containing useful information on employing foreign nationals who need permission to work in the UK. Set within the context of FT, this gives a clear and simplified introduction to the different entry routes available to employers for workers into the UK, whether they come from within the EU/EEA or elsewhere. Further, it highlights the support available from RAS to support them through the process and specifically outlines FTWiSS as one such route.

5.14 The head of RAS, who also leads the FT policy team, has been responsible for liaison with the UK departments responsible for migration policy and implementation – especially Home Office, Immigration Advisory Service UK, WorkPermitsUK - and with the Home Office in writing the new proposals for managing migration within the UK. Integral to the team from the start are two immigration specialists with knowledge and experience of UK migration processes. They are secondees from the Home Office and from the Immigration Advisory Service UK.

5.15 At present, RAS is a three year pilot scheme starting from October 2004 and there is no decision yet on its future beyond this period.
5.16 Most of the inquiries to RAS are by email – 86% of contacts in the first year – and the advice provided over this initial period was shown to satisfy 77% of customers, with only 5% dissatisfied overall.

5.17 The centrality of RAS to FT as a whole is underlined by its role in providing advice to all five target groups. However, during the first eighteen months, from October 2004 to March 2005, nearly 40% of all inquirers were not classified into any of the five target groups. Of those who were, 44% of all customers of RAS have been workers seeking employment and all but 2% of the remainder were students. Returnee Scots, entrepreneurs and employers each accounted for less than 1% of all specific customers (Table 5.1). The experience of the last 6 months has been that an increasing proportion of inquirers have not been classified, but otherwise little has changed in the proportions between the five target groups.

Table 5.1 Customers of RAS by FT target group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workers</td>
<td>4106</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>3555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>1382</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>1096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Returnee Scots</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneur</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>3709</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>1289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9385</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>6097</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Management Statistics, RAS, April 2006

5.18 The unspecified category is composed of those inquirers who do not indicate their position and who fill in tear-off slips used at events which do not request details about their areas of interest. As the unspecified group now accounts for 3 in every 4 inquiries, more active steps could be taken by the RAS team to ensure that this information is gathered where possible.

Evaluation

5.19 RAS has been subjected to both formal and informal evaluations. The main evaluation was conducted by external assessors on behalf of the Executive in 2005, one year after RAS was formed. This review collected information from customers of RAS, their partners and reviewed the internal financial and human resource structures (Scottish Executive, 2006b).

5.20 Four key points emerged in their overall assessment of RAS at that time:

- the small size of the team, relative to the levels of demand which had been generated, resulting in some inquirers waiting long times for information and the team not always meeting the expectations and demands of inquirers;
- the need to clarify and assign responsibilities with partners, especially in ensuring that inquirers were directed to the most relevant partners;
• attempt to offer more tailored services – providing more generic information for standard inquiries and allocating more staff resources to offer intensive support where required; and
• offer a more targeted service, especially in identifying and targeting resources to meet skill shortages, concentrating resources and showing “a more demonstrable part in solving some of the difficulties of the Scottish economy” (Scottish Executive, 2006b, 63).

The review recommended a strategy for development which included both tailoring and targeting of services.

5.21 Since this first review there have been developments within RAS which address some of these concerns and as the team has become more experienced, they have been more efficient and timeous at responding. Through stronger partnership working – especially with British Council Scotland, SEN and Universities - RAS has been able to improve its response rates and provide more tailored advice. This has also been assisted through better on-line information sources and through specific FT schemes channelling some inquiries directly to those with specialist knowledge (especially for student inquiries). Stronger working relationships with the Home Office and other departments in London have unsurprisingly grown over time as RAS has matured.

5.22 However, the team remains relatively small (with only 7 staff) and the need to retain expertise and established connections with partners is important to the service. As with all ‘one stop shops’, RAS inevitably has not been able to tailor advice completely. The purpose of such advisory services is to offer general advice accurately and rapidly to cover most inquiries and where there is a specialist inquiry to be able to channel this efficiently to a suitable, specialist advisor.

5.23 Further, and associated with the coming on stream of new FT initiatives and directed promotional events, RAS has experienced growth in the number of inquiries and the need to channel more to specialist advisors. The team members therefore continually have to acquire new knowledge of entry points to RAS - for example from the expanded number of websites directing inquiries on FTWiSS to RAS - even if the core advice remains unchanged. The new migration points system will in due course (and probably beyond the end of the pilot stage of RAS) require some re-training for staff to ensure they are familiar with the new relationship to UK entry.

5.24 The ultimate measure of impact of RAS can only be the extent to which potential migrants do move to Scotland. It is worth repeating that RAS operates within a political context where migration policy is a reserved matter, not devolved to the Executive, and thus for non EEA nationals ultimate entry to Scotland is through the UK and the Home Office. As a consequence and with limited resources in staff and finance, RAS is undertaking tasks and developing an initiative which in other countries (eg Canada and Australia) would be located within a government department. Therefore, expectations of RAS in shaping in-migration need, to be proportionate to the degree of influence the organisation has on migration decision-making. Relocation decisions are only partially influenced by RAS and other metrics will inevitably be used in the evaluation of FT as a whole. The quality of service (accuracy, timeliness, utility of advice) and the strength of links with partners for specialist advice are proxies.
5.25 It is important that a further evaluation of RAS is conducted during the next 12 months, more than 6 months before the end of the pilot. Such a review, currently being undertaken, should address similar areas as those of the 2005 review but also examine issues of sustainability of the service. In particular, the option of RAS being relocated itself as a separate body, perhaps as a distinct unit, should be considered. This would enable the FT team to focus on new developments, and the RAS team to focus on delivery of the advisory service. The review should also consider the skills and human resources of RAS in light of the new UK managed migration scheme.

**Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme**

5.26 The introduction on 22 June 2005 of FTWiSS followed agreement between the Executive and the Home Office, with the scheme being managed by the Home Office. This scheme enables recent graduates from non-EEA countries to apply to stay and work in Scotland for a period of 2 years after the end of their course without the need for a work permit. To qualify, applicants need to have graduated from a Scottish university or college on a Higher National Diploma (HND), degree, Masters or PhD course, and have resided in Scotland for an appropriate period during their studies.

5.27 Under FTWiSS, the applicant, and any dependents with them, must be able to show that they can maintain themselves without applying for public funds. Applicants can seek entry to the scheme either while they are in Scotland following completion of their studies, if they still have extent leave to remain as a student, or from outwith the UK for up to 12 months following completion of their studies.

5.28 Students are entitled to apply to bring their spouse or, if unmarried, their partner, and/or any children under the age of 18. The fee is £335 for postal applications and £500 for applications made in person at a Public Enquiry Office. The expectation is that 70% of all postal applications will be dealt with in 20 working days, whilst 98% of all applications made in person will be dealt with in 24 hours.

5.29 As of April 2006, 1516 FTWiSS visas had been issued to graduates from over 75 countries. In the early stages of the scheme, around 15% of applicants were rejected, largely because they failed to submit the application properly. It is hoped that, with experience, this figure might decline. During the first 5 months of the scheme, 1 in 6 of the applications were made from overseas, with the majority (486 of the 586) made from within the UK. At that time (November 2005), of the 586 successful applicants, two countries predominated: India (147) and China (125), with other major nationalities being USA (47), Nigeria (44), Malaysia (30) and Pakistan (23).

5.30 Beyond FTWiSS, graduates from Scottish universities and colleges who want to stay on in Scotland to work can participate in the following UK wide schemes: Science and Engineering Graduate Scheme (SEGS), Highly Skilled Migrant Programme (HSMP), Training and Work Experience Scheme (TWES), Innovators Scheme, and Work Permit scheme. SEGS is probably the closest fore-runner to the FTWiSS programme. This scheme allows certain UK science, mathematics, engineering and technology graduates to remain in the United Kingdom for a year after completing their studies. Recently, this scheme has been widened to include graduates from all Masters and PhD courses which commenced from May 2006, although it will continue to be called SEGs.
Evaluation

5.31 Information on the number of applicants and the characteristics of applicants is retained by the Home Office. At present, some evaluation is being undertaken by means of a questionnaire sent out to all successful applicants by the Scottish Executive on a 6 month basis. The questionnaire follows up attitudinal information on living in Scotland and the nature of participants’ employment. To date a response rate of 28% has been obtained, with 433 responses.

5.32 Monitoring of the scheme is also to be undertaken by the Executive in the future to assess whether the scheme has been effective in encouraging overseas students to pursue a career in Scotland. Data relating to participants is to be provided by the Home Office but information will be collected by the Executive.

5.33 FTWiSS offers a unique source of information relating to migration into Scotland. As noted in Chapter 2, knowledge of why migrants come to Scotland, their locations and subsequent histories is limited. There is an opportunity through FTWiSS follow up questionnaires and surveys to improve this knowledge base.

Scottish International Scholarship Programme

5.34 The Scottish International Scholarship Programme (SISP) is managed by the British Council on behalf of the Scottish Executive. The programme makes available a total of 22 scholarships to support overseas students wishing to undertake a taught Masters course at a Scottish university/college. Whilst small in number, each studentship is greatly valued by participating institutions and creates a disproportionate amount of marketing gain.

5.35 Designed to be distinctive from the existing UK-wide Chevening Scheme, but based on the experience of this scheme, SISP scholarships are made available primarily for courses in the areas of science, technology and the creative industries. Aside from meeting the normal academic standards (including a high level of English), students must be currently living in the country from where they are applying, must have 3-5 years work experience (the criteria for joining the Scottish Networks International programme), and must demonstrate ambition, drive, innovation and creativity. Studentships are well financed, and a well developed infrastructure of social and cultural support has been developed.

5.36 The prestigious nature of the scholarships is reinforced by the British Council and Executive offering supportive events to ensure that holders are welcomed to Scotland. In addition to a welcome meeting where information and support is provided, there are special events (eg Celtic Connections), receptions (including at Bute House with the Minister for Finance and Public Service Reform) and networking events during the year for scholarship holders in Glasgow, Dundee and Edinburgh providing opportunities to meet each other and experience aspects of the Scottish culture.

5.37 Universities have supported the scheme by offering a 20% reduction in fee levels (equivalent to that of a Chevening award) and holders are provided with a stipend of £670-£690 per month. In addition, an arrival and a departure allowance is provided (to cover
excess baggage and books etc to be sent home) along with flights and support for research material/thesis preparation.

5.38 In 2005/2006, the first batch of 22 scholarships were awarded to applicants from pre-selected target markets [Australia (2), China (9), India (6), New Zealand (1), Singapore (2) and South Africa (2)] to take up courses at the University of Edinburgh (5), Edinburgh College of Art (1), the University of Glasgow (5), Glasgow School of Art (1), the Institute for System Level Integration (3), Queen Margaret University College (1), the University of Strathclyde (3), the University of Stirling (1), and St Andrew’s University (1). All 22 students have taken up the opportunity to participate in Scottish Networks International. Preparations are already well advanced for the 2006/2007 academic year when a further 22 awards will be made.

Evaluation

5.39 Evaluation of this project is being conducted by British Council Scotland with support from the Executive’s Analytical Services Division. Questionnaires are to be sent to all British Council overseas offices involved with the scheme, asking for their assessment of the planning and promotion of the scheme, the processes involved in application, assessment and support to assessors, and the impact of SISP on inquiry levels and marketing. This is due for completion in 2006.

5.40 An initial progress report based on the experiences until the end of 2005 was written for the Executive. This highlighted the considerable interest generated around the scheme, with the specific website associated with SISP recording as many as 5000 views per month and the strong media coverage of the programme. This interest was translated into more than 290 applicants, of whom more than two thirds were resident in India. As each of the 2005-06 scholarship holders were interviewed as part of the SNI programme, the report concluded that

“the scholars were high calibre individuals, enthusiastic and keen to gain practical experience and to make the most of their time in Scotland” (Scottish Executive, 2006c, 4).

5.41 The first year of the scheme has provided some lessons for implementing future programmes. First a longer lead-in time to enhance promotion prior to the closing date in March and interviews in April in 2006 will provide the British Council offices with more opportunity to disseminate details of the scheme. Second, in 2006 there has been more selective support within the British Council to local offices across the 6 target countries, providing further details of the scheme and greater media coverage.

Challenge Fund

5.42 The Challenge Fund was instituted in April 2005. Its objective was to provide funds for Universities and Colleges to develop new ways of supporting overseas students studying at Scottish Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and Scottish Colleges (SCs). Specifically, the scheme aims to:

- enhance support and mentoring available to international students in Scotland;
• provide opportunities for international students to build academic and social bridges with indigenes;
• assist higher and further education institutions to develop innovative approaches to support international students, and;
• furnish international students who wish to remain in Scotland for work with any information and assistance they require.

5.43 There was considerable guidance provided to potential bidders by the Executive on the range of projects which were likely to be supported in 2005-06. Most directly, the announcement of the scheme by the Finance and Public Services Reform Minister at Harvard Business School in Boston pointed to support for events and activities which bring international students in contact with domestic students and local communities; opportunities to learn about Scottish life; and seminars or work shadowing to link these students with local employers and agencies.

5.44 In the 2005-06 academic year, a total of £300,000 was provided to support 12 bids, five of whom involved consortia. Projects are expected to be sustainable for up to two years after funding stops and a small amount of ‘year 2’ funding has been made available for this purpose connected with each project. Amongst the 12 successful bids, 2 were explicitly about careers, 5 were work shadowing/meeting local employers, 2 were supporting international student organisations, 1 focussed on insights to Scotland and 1 on teaching materials.

5.45 A further £300,000 is being made available for the forthcoming academic year 2006-2007 and, following further competitive bids, an announcement of successful applicants is due in September 2006.

Evaluation

5.46 As part of the conditions of the grant, each institution that received funding under the first round of the Fund is expected to prepare a report of its achievements. This will cover changes in the nature of the project from its original proposals, the aims and objectives, who benefited, and comment on the outputs/outcomes from the first year of the project. Details are also to be supplied on how the projects are to be mainstreamed within the institutions(s).

5.47 In evaluating the success of this scheme, emphasis needs to be placed on the lasting impacts of support being provided alongside the impact on participants. Competitive bidding for funds by HEIs and SCs has enabled FT to generate new activity and support for students. The degree to which each funded project continues beyond 1-2 years remains to be assessed.

Enhancing involvement with Business

5.48 In May 2005, the RAS team was expanded with the creation to a post dedicated to linking with business. Working with partners, including, importantly, the Scottish Enterprise Network, the aim is to assist and develop channels for talent to flow to Scottish business. This involves making connections between business and migrants through other FT elements – especially in conjunction with RAS and the scotlandistheplace.com website – and providing assistance to other economic and business networks.
Evaluation

5.49 Given the relatively short time of this dimension of FT, there has not been a separate evaluation of its impact. The main evaluative targets will be related to the awareness of business of the opportunities for recruiting overseas workers, the support offered by RAS and FT, and the extent to which they engage with the wider marketing elements of FT.

5.50 The impact of FT on business is considered in Chapter 6.

International Image/Marketing

5.51 Research conducted in 2004 for the Executive on Scotland’s International Image indicated that Scotland is not perceived as a country offering business opportunities and that international perceptions are often rooted in tradition and the past. However, there were selling points in relation to its education system and its people (Scottish Executive, 2004c).

5.52 Within FT there was recognition of a need to alter such previously held perceptions and images of the country. As the First Minister indicated in January 2004 in addressing the Consular Corps in advance of the Fresh Talent launch,

“In the future I want those around the world who regard themselves as Friends of Scotland to know that it is: - not just about our landscape and history, but also about our people; not just about what Scotland was, but what Scotland is now, and what it will be in the future; that our future will be better than our past. Above all I want the world to know that Scotland is open: for visitors, for business, and for new people to live and work here."

5.53 Against this backdrop, FT has involved considerable efforts to promote a positive image of modern Scotland and to support ways of educating audiences within Scotland, in Europe and globally about the opportunities available within Scotland. Alongside the development of ambassadorial networks, FT has been involved in promotional events associated with FT core activities (such as career fairs where scholarships and FTWiSS are marketed) and in supporting more generic events such as Tartan Week in the US, diasporic visits in Canada, and trade fairs in Eastern Europe.

5.54 As part of IPD, one of the four units is responsible for international marketing and a further one for the scotlandistheplace.com website (see below). The importance of the marketing and promotion dimension of FT is acknowledged in the provision of £500,000 in the 2004-05 budget (nearly 25% of the FT related budget) and £270,000 in the 2005-06 budget. This resource has enabled a marketing team to be recruited within IPD and for leaflets and promotion to be associated with Tartan Day events, trade fairs, and careers fairs. Involvement with these fairs has been primarily linked to events in targets countries – India, China, Malaysia and Singapore in Asia, and Poland in the EU. Tartan Days events have focussed on the areas with largest Scottish diasporic communities; in the US, Canada and Australia.

5.55 At the heart of the campaign has been a desire to educate non-Scots about ‘modern Scotland’ and the supported opportunities which exist for people to participate. This has involved both printed material and investment in e-promotion, especially through the Sitp
website. This operates as a window to news and events within Scotland and offers: access to the FTWiSS links, advice and links for business, and provides opportunities to gain feedback from e-visitors.

5.56 The key messages portrayed relate to opportunities to work, live, study and do business in Scotland, and the specific services available under Fresh Talent. Table 5.2 illustrates the messages which were used as part of the brand positioning in Asia during 2005.

**Table 5.2 Key Fresh Talent messages**

| A. Scotland is a great place to study - The quality of the education is extremely high, Scotland’s universities and colleges rank among the best in the world offering first-rate courses in a wide range of subjects and conducting pioneering research. |
| B. Scotland is a great place to live - friendly/welcoming people, a vibrant sporting and cultural life, extra curricular activities and world-renowned scenery. |
| C. Scotland is a great place to work - low rate of unemployment/job opportunities available for skilled graduates from a range of disciplines. |
| D. From the summer of 2005, all overseas students graduating from a Scottish college or university with an undergraduate or postgraduate degree, PhD or Higher National Diploma (HND) will have the right to stay on and work in the country for an additional two years without the need for a work permit. |
| E. Representatives from the Scottish Executive will be attending the education events and will be available to provide advice on how to study, live and work in Scotland. |
| F. The Fresh Talent Initiative provides free practical advice for anyone looking to study, live and work in Scotland, through the Relocation Advisory Service. |
| G. Signposting to further information. |

**Source:** Consolidated Communications, 2005, 6

**Evaluation**

5.57 Turning promotion into metrics that quantify impact is difficult but there are two main areas of evaluations here. First, and conducted with each event, is an assessment of the translation of coverage into quantifiable engagement with FT schemes and projects. Evaluation of this has primarily been conducted through analysis of the extent of outreach and media coverage. These highlight the high levels of coverage associated with the targeted events and also point to associated measures (eg applications for scholarships; visits to associated websites; inquiries to RAS) which can quantify the impact of these events.

5.58 The targeted nature of some of the events produced significant results. For example, the Careers Fair at Warsaw and Wroclaw over a period of 4 days in March 2005 produced nearly 7000 hits of the website during the event and increased by at least a factor of 2 the weekly total of hits over the next month. This translated too into more than 1000 new
registrations under RAS during the first quarter of 2005. By focusing on promoting Scotland as a destination for local business/skilled people and offering easily accessed advice, the event not only enabled individuals to realise opportunities available in Scotland, but also to achieve significant media coverage of these opportunities and the active steps being made to welcome people to Scotland under Fresh Talent.

5.59 Education recruitment events have also been targeted. Between 8 and 18 April 2005, for example, Fresh Talent promotion took place at Education Worldwide Summits events in New Delhi, Mumbai and Bangalore. Over 100 institutions participated and 27,000 visitors attended over the three venues. Again, in the weeks of the events, visitors from India to the RAS website nearly doubled to c350 per week and, during the first quarter of 2005, nearly 800 customers from India registered with RAS.

5.60 Whilst some of these events are clearly targeted to FT groups, there are questions whether the support for events such as Tartan Week or Burns Suppers are the most appropriate means of supporting and connecting with the diaspora. In attempting to present images of modern Scotland, attendance at entrepreneurial or modern cultural events would be more closely related to FT aims.

5.61 Second, there is a need for a much longer-term and more qualitative assessment of how perceptions of Scotland have been changed through international marketing. To date, no direct evaluation has been undertaken to assess this dimension, although the recently completed marketing analysis by ScotInform of ‘sense of place’ around the points of entry campaign points to a positive message of Scotland being held by visitors (Scottish Executive, 2005e). An evaluation could involve questionnaires or interviews with a sample of e-visitors to the website, or follow up to those participants in trade and careers fairs or to special events. Alternatively, or additionally, perceptions might usefully be assessed through repeat research in 3-5 years time with those involved in the Executive’s 2004 research to identify the extent to which perceptions of these key groups have altered. Further, longitudinal research could be conducted using members within the networks (GfoS, GlobalScot; SNI) to map out the changing perceptions of this already informed group about Scotland image internationally.

5.62 There is a need for evidence to show how the promotion and marketing expenditure and effort is changing the global image of Scotland – replacing kilts and tartan with diversity and openness for example.

Scottish University Alumni Networks

5.63 To target local markets, the external marketing consultants Consolidated Communications proposed utilising the existing alumni networks of the Scottish Universities for ambassadorial and promotional purposes. Initial responses from the 14 University offices were lukewarm and all declined to provide lists, as these were confidential and sensitive. Most indicated that contacts might best be forwarded via international offices and most agreed to send information to targeted cohorts of their network, while two offered to highlight the RAS website.
Evaluation

5.64 University alumni networks form an obvious channel through which FT promotion could occur and along which FT could benefit from collaboration with universities. The approach adopted in 2005 was unproductive. The objectives set for working with alumni were overly ambitious. However, CC did rightly focus on asking alumni officers within Universities to forward information rather than provide lists of contacts. Only 3 email responses had been received from alumni associations and secondary contacts and the contact channel formed for responses has since been closed.

5.65 There are clear mutual benefits to alumni, Universities alumni offices/international offices and the Executive deriving from Fresh Talent which can be capitalised on in the future. For recently graduated alumni, there are possible benefits under Fresh Talent to gain access to employment with Scotland under FTWiSS and this is currently under-promoted. For other alumni, FT can reinforce the connections which remain open between Scotland and themselves, as well as with the university. For alumni offices and international offices of the Universities, FT offers a competitive advantage in the marketplace by providing an additional dimension to the advantage of a Scottish degree and could, through joint promotional and marketing events with the Executive, assist to sustain the Scotland experience. For the Executive, alumni offer a pool of ambassadors for Scotland as a place to study and access to a pool of talented individuals who occupy many different positions in target countries.

5.66 The key to opening this network is for the FT team to show how both alumni and universities can benefit from their engagement with FT. Unless financial resources are made available associated with the forwarding of information on FT (eg pay postage or staff costs to prepare postings) and the messages being sent chime closely with the aims of the alumni offices, it is unlikely that alumni officers will be more receptive to FT approaches. More productively, there is scope for partnership working between individual universities or, collectively, Universities Scotland and the Executive. This could for example take the shape:

a) joint promotional events within target markets, where both ministerial and university representatives engage with a selected cohort of alumni.

b) enhanced cooperation between British Council (as partners for the Executive) and universities; for example, FT covering the costs of meeting spaces organised by British Council and the universities inviting alumni to events

c) meetings of selected, talented alumni of a single university and senior ministerial/Executive representatives to generate champions, who then could be contacted via other networks (eg GlobalScot or GfoS) as appropriate.

Scotland is the Place

5.67 As part of FT, a special website – scotlandistheplace.com (Sitp) – has been established to offer help and encouragement to those thinking of moving to Scotland to live or work. The site includes a registration facility that then provides updates and e-newsletters. Over the last 18 months, the site has evolved to include links to and information about RAS, business, and information about modern Scotland, including regularly updated news and events. The Information Exchange element of the site provides a central location that contains images, logos, branding guidelines and other information, all related to Scotland and
can be used by journalists and others (once registered). Sitp also provides specific links to FT initiatives where information on the schemes can be obtained.

5.68 There are plans currently being developed to merge the Sitp and the Global Friends of Scotland websites (see below) into a single gateway. In conjunction with partners in the British Council, Scottish Enterprise Network, and VisitScotland, this single site may offer new opportunities to streamline access to core FT information and also provide more scope to tailor components of the site to the needs of target groups. A scoping study has been completed in February 2006 and has provided some technical advice on the implementation of this development.

**Evaluation**

5.69 Currently, information is logged about the number of discrete visits made to the website. No formal evaluation has been undertaken.

5.70 In conjunction with the new joint website (ie the amalgamation with friendsofscotland.gov.uk) the opportunity exists for additional logging and recording to be made if the new Sitp site were to act as a gateway portal. This is not yet finalised and it is clear that agreement with partners is not yet secured. A key question is whether scotlandistheplace.com is (or will be) the obvious ‘front’ point for general online searches. At present, it is not clear from the website who manages it on behalf of which relocation arm in Scotland (and thus there is no clarity about the quality of the information). If it were to be revised as proposed in the scoping review, then a clearer statement of ownership of the site is required.

5.71 Future evaluation information associated with a revised gateway site should include the capacity to record not only the total number of discrete visits, but also the number of directed links made to partner sites. This would enable the ‘front’ entry point function to be assessed and to guide the nature of the material displayed and available.

**Global Friends of Scotland**

5.72 Alongside the Sitp website there is another website under the auspices of Global Friends of Scotland (GfoS) which is now part of the International Projects division. This site attempts to strengthen existing relationships and forge new cultural, educational and business links globally. Through its ‘Features’ and ‘Scotland Now’ sections, portraying the latest developments in culture, sport, education and business and articles of Scotland’s links with other countries, the site provides not only information to those interested in Scotland, but also an invaluable tool to those interested in promoting Scotland.

5.73 The other arm of GfoS involves a network of people who feel an affinity with Scotland. Members of the network are native Scots living and working abroad, those that have worked or studied in Scotland, or those that have a strong affinity with Scotland but no direct connection with the country. The GfoS network is a development of a pre-existing network, Friends of Scotland, which had its origins in the Scotland Office in London. As part of wider moves to promote Scotland internationally, it was renamed and has been reactivated in the past 2 years. Most of the Friends are in areas related to science, technology and creative industries and have joined the network through their own registration with the
In contrast to other networks (e.g., GlobalScot, SNI) there has not been a Scotland-led recruitment to recruit members.

5.74 Some Friends are frequent contacts within the network, whilst others make infrequent contact; some react whilst others are more proactive, seeking information or offering assistance. A survey of all Friends conducted about a year ago indicated that most wished to be asked to help and directed towards areas for assistance rather than be proactive themselves. For most part, the use of Friends by the Executive has been to use their ‘local knowledges’ in assisting events, meetings or other activities within specific countries. To ensure that contact with Friends can be targeted, details are kept on their geographical location, their main interests, the contact they have made through the network, and recent assistance provided.

5.75 The GfoS network also offers channels through which marketing of Scotland can take place. With their support, members of the network act as advocates for Scotland, offering a positive message of Scotland and, because of their connections, provide a ‘rippling out’ of information about Scotland. In short, they are encouraged “to talk about Scotland and talk Scotland up” (interview with Alyson Mitchell).

**Evaluation**

5.76 There has not been any formal evaluations of GfoS since their positioning within IPD, reflecting their relative youthfulness and on-going development. However, from the interviews, it is clear that a number of issues arise which are pertinent to this progress review:

- given that neither GfoS nor Sitp are the only networks or websites associated with the promotion of Scotland as a place to live, work, study or do business, having strong operational links with other units within the Executive, Scottish Enterprise Network, VisitScotland and British Council is important. A positive operational relationship exists, with regular meetings of partners to discuss effective links and flows of information. This forum does not currently include university student alumni which reflects in part the lack of a representative committee that can speak on behalf of this particular group.
- GfoS network has been built around a different set of contacts than other networks with which FT has connections. In contrast to the business elites of GlobalScot and the postgraduate high-flyers of SNI, GfoS is more diverse, reaching out to 400 friends across 28 countries and representing not only business-led connections. There is, however, some sectoral overlap with the TalentScotland network in terms of technology and creative sectors.
- the development plans to provide a stronger ‘gateway’ website portal currently considered by the SITP team marks an obvious approach to reduce the costs associated with website maintenance and to further customise the information being made to members of the network, to other partners and to a wider, global audience. Opportunities also exist for this single site to target specific diasporic communities in future.
Migrant experience research

5.77 The Executive commissioned research into the “Experience of people who relocate to Scotland” from TNS System Three Social Research in 2006. This study interviewed 10 organisations in direct contact with migrant groups along with 23 employees, 18 entrepreneurs and 12 postgraduate students, each of which included Scottish returnees, in-migrants for elsewhere in the UK and in-migrants from abroad. This study concluded that a number of different barriers, motivations and prior knowledge of Scotland existed between those who came from overseas, from elsewhere in the UK and were returning Scots.

Table 5.3 Experience of recent migrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th>Knowledge of Scotland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overseas migrants</td>
<td>Accessing financial services (bank a/c)</td>
<td>Economic opportunity in UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Red tape/visas</td>
<td>English language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finding accommodation</td>
<td>Work/visa within EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Some pre-visits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Advice from friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Learnt through school education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>relocation agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK migrants</td>
<td>Cost of living</td>
<td>Cost of living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community acceptance</td>
<td>Education (&amp; services)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>lifestyle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Previous visitors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Friends/social network in Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Returning Scots</td>
<td>Weaker family ties</td>
<td>Lifestyle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higher cost of living</td>
<td>Children experiencing culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social problems in communities</td>
<td>Initiative schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Family connections</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


5.78 The research also revealed what assistance had proved most helpful in enabling the migrant to settle into their new community, employment and cultural setting. This inevitably depended on the individual circumstances, but, in general, there were some important channels through which assistance, if it were provided, greatly enhanced the relocation experience.

Table 5.4 Key supportive channels for migrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Postgraduate students</th>
<th>University – international student advisory services</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University student community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurs</td>
<td>Public agencies – SEN, Business Gateway, Knowledge Transfer Programme (KTP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relocation services (either private agents, or within TNCs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Returnees</td>
<td>Family ties and past connections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community social networks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


5.79 The research also revealed, at least for these three groups, which represent different life stages and migration histories, that there were some common elements that were likely to make them ‘settled’ in Scotland or (and this was the majority) not committed to Scotland.
Table 5.5  Key factors influencing retention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>‘Settled’</th>
<th>Level of commitment to employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Future of the economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lifestyle/quality of life satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Life stage of family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Not committed’</td>
<td>Desire to move on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Best business/employment opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Partner’s work or personal needs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


5.80 One key conclusion from the analysis of these three groups was that amongst each there were many who had ‘itchy feet’ and, if given the chance, would remain footloose. They were highly likely to move outside of Scotland if and when opportunities arose. More positively, whilst having this tendency to move, many also viewed attractive opportunities in Scotland as being very likely to encourage them to remain. Contingent on experiencing a positive quality of life, few had an immediate desire to leave Scotland.

Evaluation

5.81 This research offers an initial insight into motivations for migration to Scotland, the barriers (real and perceived) which affect such decisions, and the differences between prior knowledge of Scotland and the experience to be had through migration. However, the utility of the study is hampered by the small and selective nature of the sample size. There is scope in future research for greater tailoring of interviewees to either the current characteristics of migrants - by location of origin (eg from the UK, elsewhere in the EU, outside of the EU), by affinity with Scotland (returnees, prior work/living experience of Scotland), by skill level, and by employment – or by including migrants who, having lived in Scotland, have since left. Such research would fit more neatly into the aims of FT, and provide more definitive and targeted insights to the key groups of talent being sought under the initiative.

Other FT related activities

Scottish Networks International

5.82 Scottish Networks International (SNI) is managed by the British Council Scotland, and Scottish Development International (SDI). Now more than a decade old, it aims to select the cream of overseas postgraduate studying in Scotland to join a growing global network of ‘associates’. Its purpose is to develop and maintain an international business network and it aims to attract approximately 80-100 international postgraduate students each year. All those on SISP have joined the scheme in 2005-06 and others are recruited through application and interview.

5.83 The scheme operates to the advantage of all participants, enabling:

- individual members to build rapport and networks and gain support from mentors and potential employers;
- the British Council to learn more about why people chose to study in Scotland and what their first impressions of Scotland are;
• companies to gain through work experience schemes, enhanced knowledge of export markets, and access to a global business network.

5.84 There is a rigorous interview process conducted by staff in the British Council Scotland office, meeting with applicants who have to have at least 6 months of their course to run. As the scheme is competitive – there are between 400 and 500 applicants each year – applicants are expected to have at least 3 years work experience, an interest in gaining work experience in Scotland, and have dynamism and enthusiasm. Postgraduates taking Masters and PhD programmes, once selected for mentoring, are paired with a Scottish company keen to solve a pressing global challenge (like penetrating a new market), and for some work placement experience. For those applicants who are successful, SNI provides a greatly enhanced student experience.

**Evaluation**

5.85 Assessment of SNI’s impact for FT is still to be completed, with further management data and action reports to be provided to the Executive during 2006 by the SNI team in the British Council. This will include information on the recruitment process, the calibre of applicants and information of the promotional activities employed by the British Council in connection with the event.

5.86 The data to date indicate that the scheme is highly attractive, continuing to attract many more applicants than places and this network sits comfortably alongside the other affinity networks of GlobalScot and Global Friends of Scotland, developing a different, younger group of people.

5.87 There is scope for expanding links with employers. The proposal for a bi-annual conference and smaller events to meet with employers in different regions and for commissioned research to understand the barriers and benefits of employing a diverse workforce for SMEs should help.

5.88 In contrast to the rigorous entry interviews to the scheme, there is relatively limited follow-up of each year’s cohort to gain insights from their individual experiences and this could usefully be a joint area of evaluation by the British Council and the Executive.

**Dare to be Digital**

5.89 DARE was launched in 1999 as an open competition for computing students at the University of Abertay in Dundee and developed into a national competition open to all students from Scottish universities in 2001. This has since blossomed to incorporate students from the rest of the United Kingdom and, increasingly, from overseas. It is sponsored by Scottish Enterprise, BBC Scotland, NCR Electronic Arts, and Microsoft. Teams of students are invited to spend ten weeks at the University of Abertay and, with a modest wage and budget, work out a product business concept to sell to entrepreneurs from the games and entertainment industry. Throughout the ten weeks they are mentored by seasoned industry experts and acquire priceless commercial skills to augment their academic abilities. A panel of judges presides over the final Sales Document and digital prototype at the end of the ten weeks and decides on a winning team.
5.90 In 2005, against the backdrop of the Fresh Talent Initiative, the Scottish Executive provided 8 funded places to students from South East Asia - Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand, India, Taiwan, and China - to relocate to Dundee for the ten week summer programme. Further funding for international students will be provided in 2006. This support was a return flight to Scotland, a project fee of £1700 for 10 weeks participation and free University accommodation, equating with that offered to the UK participants. Each international student joined a team of 5 UK participants, providing them with opportunities to integrate into a team.

5.91 Through the offer of 8 ‘scholarships’ for this programme, the Executive has been able, with the active support of the British Council, to launch associated marketing and media events positioning Scotland (and the UK) as an innovative economy. Specific events in Singapore and Malaysia and wider marketing were used to promote DARE.

**Evaluation**

5.92 This programme has been evaluated in 2005 through analysis of questionnaires sent to all international student participants by the course organisers. As FT was not the primary aim of the course, there were no questions specifically on FT. Associated with funding for 2006-07, the organisers have been asked to conduct a more FT focused questionnaire and more specific feedback will be achieved.

5.93 Further evaluation was undertaken by Scottish Enterprise Tayside. Lessons over how to tailor the experience more closely to FT aims have been noted and incorporated into the funding contract with the DARE organisers for 2006-07. In addition, recommendations were made on maintaining the project team in the British Council and the PR relationship as these had worked well. In 2006-07 the target areas were to focus on India and China. Overall, the assessment was that this was an effective and efficient way to showcase Scotland within the entertainment industry and to offer positive experiences for talented graduates in Scotland and to encourage them to work in Scotland.

**EDGE**

5.94 The EDGE programme, launched in 2005, is an 8 week programme sponsored by Columbia University New York, Scottish Enterprise Dunbartonshire, Glasgow University, and Careers Scotland. It is designed to foster a climate of innovation and entrepreneurship for young people in the Dumbarton area. The project links 48 students from Columbia University, Glasgow University, and young people from local schools in Dunbartonshire and offers them the opportunity of working on specific projects of interest to local business. A total of 16 local businesses took part in the first year and worked closely with carefully selected teams of students and pupils to find practical solutions to pertinent and concrete business problems and opportunities. Following the successful launch of EDGE in 2005, a similar expanded programme will be held in 2006.

**Evaluation**

5.95 Scottish Enterprise Dunbartonshire commissioned a review of the 2005 programme to consider its impact, its fit with other entrepreneurship promotion and training programmes in Scotland, and whether it could be expanded across Scotland (GEN Consulting and O’Herlihy,
2005). This analysis concluded that EDGE offered a unique, intensive and productive intervention which, through cross-cultural working, encouraged participants to develop an entrepreneurial outlook. The quality of participants – businesses as well as students – was important to the success of the programme. From the FT perspective, the report highlights that the programme had a positive impact on raising awareness of work opportunities in Scotland. The authors note that some of the participants from Columbia University were seeking employment in Scotland and some of the businesses involved had established new international connections. Evidence of the longer-term impact on students (for example, are they likely to become entrepreneurs and had the associated cultural programme altered perceptions of Scotland?) cannot be assessed for a few years.

5.96 Although at this stage it is not possible to quantify the impact of both DARE and EDGE, in terms of longer term attraction of talent, the two schemes already offer benefits towards FT goals. Connecting businesses with overseas (and local) talent, making overseas students aware of opportunities in the Scottish economy, and the creation of a group of young advocates for Scotland point to these both offering good value for money. In addition, in the coming year, the tailored feedback and evaluation of these two schemes being requested by the FT team will provide some much needed insights to potential migrant’s views of opportunities in Scotland. If opportunities to support further such schemes emerge – for example, through a roll out of EDGE in other areas of Scotland – the Executive should consider supporting these.

Other areas within the Executive

Demographic research

5.97 In conjunction with the ESRC, the Executive has funded 6 research projects which examine aspects of underlying demographic processes shaping Scotland’s population. There are two projects on each of the following areas: ageing, fertility and migration. This research is due for completion in 2006/7 and will assist in understanding some of the demographic contexts in which FT is operating. In addition, some of the individual projects should provide evidence of ‘good practice’ in ways to attract specific talent and migrants into Scotland. However, the evidence will be limited to the experience of migration to and from the South East of England and Scottish graduate migration.

Evaluation

5.98 However, there remain some distinct gaps in knowledge which are of relevance to FT. Most of these relate to an understanding of the factors which shape the propensity of people to migrate and the experiential aspects of the migration process – from the initial decision to consider relocation through to the assimilation within a new set of communities.

Informing other Executive policy areas

5.99 If FT is to work effectively as a cross-cutting initiative, then it is essential that its aims are acknowledged and supported by other policies and strategies of the Executive. The importance of this wider context has been outlined in Chapter 3.
5.100 In fiscal terms, the funding of FT provides clear evidence of being cross-departmental, with contributions to the initiative being identified out of a number of Ministerial areas of responsibility. However, there remains a lack of clarity about this in the published Financial Statements, with the result that this cross-departmental support for FT is less visible.

5.101 There have also been explicit links between FT and UK migration policy under the Home Office. As a result of considerable effort by the FT policy team, and their contribution to the drafting of the current proposals for managing migration, FT aims and initiatives feature prominently.

Evaluation

5.102 There is, however, less evidence of explicit links being made between FT and other policy areas within the Scottish Executive. Few of the supporting strategies announced by the Executive have been revised in the light of FT and not all new policy statements in the areas which support FT goals (outlined in Chapter 3) have made explicit reference to FT.

5.103 Positively, the Working Together for Race Equality scheme (Scottish Executive, 2005c), announced in 2005, makes prominent reference to FT as one of the areas which support race equality. This has ensured that those working in the public and voluntary sectors in this policy area are well aware of the FT schemes – as witnessed by their responses to the European and External Relations Committee inquiry in 2005.

5.103 On the other hand, given FT’s role in providing skilled labour through migration, there should be some acknowledgement within the measures being used to assess progress towards the Smart, Successful Scotland strategy (Scottish Executive, 2005d). At the very least, this strategy could include informing employers of opportunities for employing new talent attracted to Scotland via FT and include the importance of international graduates in the partnership working with Higher and Further Education institutions. Such links might assist to raise awareness in the business community and agencies involved in economic development of FT’s role in supporting growth.

5.104 The Executive should ensure that, where relevant, strategies and policy announcements, in those areas which support FT explicitly indicate how they support FT goals. Further, in announcing the budgets and financial statements, the Executive should make explicit the cross-cut expenditure of FT.

Evaluation Summary

5.105 A summary of the main actions, objectives and evaluation of the 15 principal elements of FTI is provided in Table 5.6 below.
### Table 5.6  Principal actions under FT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Partners</th>
<th>Project evaluation</th>
<th>Fresh talent Evaluation metrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a) New FT projects</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1. RAS   | 3yr Pilot scheme set up in October 2004 as ‘one stop shop’; 7 staff, two of whom are immigration specialists (one seconded from the Home Office and one from Immigration Advisory Service UK). Business team to work with Scottish business | 1) Advise on living, working and studying in Scotland  
2) Streamline information on public services  
3) liaise with WPUK  
4) assist business to understand immigration system | Home Office, Immigration Advisory Service UK, WPUK and Enterprise Networks | Evaluation undertaken – report Dec 2005; provided in-depth advice to over 8,700 customers from over 135 countries; | 1) extent to which attracts/supports FT people to Scotland (ie uptake of advice by individuals)  
b) efficient/ effective delivery of service  
c) effective partner working (including involvement of HO and Immigration Advisory Service UK)  
d) business contacts via website                                                                 |
| 2. FTWiSS | From June 2005, enable students post-graduation to remain in the UK for 2 years without work permit. At the end of the 2 years, successful applicants can apply to another managed migration route (eg. a work permit, Highly Skilled Migrant Programme). | 1) encouraging overseas students to pursue their career in Scotland  
2) promoting employment opportunities at home and abroad, including attendance at fairs in target countries, and linked media activity | Home Office | For overseas publicity: Consolidated Communications report 2004  
In the first 7 months, there were over 1,500 successful applicants from over 75 countries | 1) Numbers of applicants each year as a proportion of eligible graduates  
2) effective working with RAS (eg hits on RAS website)  
3) effective links with other FT schemes (eh website connections)  
4) number of graduates retained beyond scheme                                                                 |
| 3. SISP  | launched in October 2004, 22 1 year masters scholarships pa from | 1) Combine 1 year pg study with enhanced work | British Council + Universities | Progress report Jan 2006 On-going | a) positive study/placement experience  
b) retention (number and skills level) in Scotland of scholars |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Challenge Fund</td>
<td>Fund aims to support activities to retain international students in Scotland during and towards end of study period. Launched in April 2005, £300,000 available to support projects; 12 projects supported in 2005/06.</td>
<td>Universities and colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Business involvement</td>
<td>Employers toolkit was completed in late 2004; distributed to businesses across Scotland. Appointment of senior business development executive to RAS in April 2005. Business seminars on Fresh Talent held in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Aberdeen and Inverness.</td>
<td>WPUK, Scottish Enterprise Network, GlobalScot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. International marketing/image</td>
<td>Development of a marketing team to support the dissemination of key FT messages. Promote a positive image of modern Scotland. Promote FT events. Hold events and fairs.</td>
<td>Executive and Ministers, British Councils, Universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005/06 academic session – targeted on 6 countries and in three areas (science, technology, creatives); all must have 3-5 yrs work experience</td>
<td>placement opportunities 2) Encourage entrepreneurship</td>
<td>c) involvement of scholars in SNI d) ambassadorial/ promotional role of scholars in future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Challenge Fund</td>
<td>Fund aims to support activities to retain international students in Scotland during and towards end of study period. Launched in April 2005, £300,000 available to support projects; 12 projects supported in 2005/06.</td>
<td>Universities and colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Business involvement</td>
<td>Employers toolkit was completed in late 2004; distributed to businesses across Scotland. Appointment of senior business development executive to RAS in April 2005. Business seminars on Fresh Talent held in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Aberdeen and Inverness.</td>
<td>WPUK, Scottish Enterprise Network, GlobalScot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. International marketing/image</td>
<td>Development of a marketing team to support the dissemination of key FT messages. Promote a positive image of modern Scotland. Promote FT events. Hold events and fairs.</td>
<td>Executive and Ministers, British Councils, Universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **7. University alumni network** | Develop links with University offices | To gain access to alumni as advocates within key countries | University alumni officers | - | a) number of inquiries from alumni  
   b) effective use of alumni networks for target events and markets |
| **8. Scotland is the place** | Launch of the website of this name in May 2004  
   Number of visitors: >250,000 sought information | 1) To support the promotion of modern Scotland  
   2) to provide information on living and working in Scotland | British Council, SEN | Report March 2006 on development with GfoS as information gateway. | a) supportive reviews from partners  
   b) external perceptions of Scotland updated  
   c) effective channelling of inquiries to FT information sites |
| **9. Global Friends of Scotland** | Widen scope of GFOS; Provision of website friendsofscotland.gov.uk and network of influential individuals (champions) to promote Scotland | 1) To encourage more registration into network and engage with diaspora  
   2) To showcase Scottish achievements  
   3) To reach out to the global diaspora  
   4) To promote contemporary image; | Scotland is the place, Scottish Enterprise | Diaspora Strategy, Oct 2005 | a) Effective utilisation of network for effective advocacy of Scotland  
   b) Number of members active in assisting FT  
   c) role in meeting targets set out in Diaspora strategy (p8) |
| **10. Migrant experience research** | Commissioned research in 2005 | To gain understanding of recent migrant experiences of moving to Scotland | TNS System 3 report March 2006 | a) knowledge of migrant channels  
   b) understanding of barriers/opportunities attracting/hindering migration and retention |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>b) other activity areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. SNI</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide 20 work placements per annum for international students - £225,000 over 3 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improves business networking for overseas students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building relationships in a business network around postgraduates studying in Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Council Scotland + Scottish Development International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress reports to be provided. There is also current discussions about running a survey of alumni in 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) activity rates of associates in supporting FT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) number of graduates assisted to stay in Scottish economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) number/range of placements offered in Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) overseas business connections established through the associates</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **2. Dare to be Digital** |
| Support for 8 international students, 10 week programme £41,500 in 2004/2005 |
| To showcase Scotland’s dynamism Make long term contacts Encourage talented graduates to Scotland |
| University of Abertay Dundee |
| Ekos report, Dec 2005; evaluation for Executive linked to 2006 funding |
| a) demand for places |
| b) number of returnees/employees in Scotland after graduation |
| c) involvement of students in future promotion events/ambassadors |
| d) number of Scottish companies involved in subsequent FT recruitment |

| **3. EDGE** |
| Cross-cultural programme to develop entrepreneurial skills. £35,000 in 2005/06 |
| 48 students from US, Glasgow University and East Dunbartonshire schools |
| Scottish Enterprise Dunbartonshire + Glasgow University + Careers Scotland |
| GEN/O’Herlihy report 2005 |
| a) number of students employed in Scotland or take up postgraduate opportunities |
| b) number of business recruit in US |
| c) effective ambassadorial role of participants in future |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>c) Other Executive areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Research on demographic trends</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 SE/ESRC commissioned research projects in April 2005 £x.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To investigate and understand demographic trends in Scotland on fertility, migration and ageing processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESRC : the demographic trends in Scotland, 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. First impressions | Commissioned Milligan report  
New ‘Points of Entry’ campaign launched May 2005 | To provide a meaningful welcome to Scotland at points of entry etc | VisitScotland | First impressions of Scotland, report 2005  
External research on points of entry campaign commissioned Mar 2006 | - |
|---------------------|----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------------------------------|----|
| 3. Other policy areas | Sectarianism | Action plan published Jan 06  
Outline key areas for action and report on progress | | | explicit links with FT |
| Race equality/ Cosmopolitanism | Update of action and places | | Working together for race equality scheme, Nov 2005 | | explicit links with FT |
CHAPTER SIX  KEY TARGET GROUPS: STUDENTS AND BUSINESS

Introduction

6.1 As the previous chapter illustrates, Fresh Talent has generated considerable activity by the Executive and its partners. To date, however, FT has focused primarily on 2 of the 5 target groups - students and business. Taking cognisance of this, this chapter evaluates effectively different activities and strands weave together to assist attracting and retaining talent amongst these 2 target groups.

Prospecting for overseas students in a crowded market place

Launching Fresh Talent for students

6.2 Of the 5 groups which the Fresh Talent initiative has targeted as priority, to date students have received the greatest attention. Arguably, putting in place measures to attract overseas students is logistically more straightforward than putting in place equivalent measures for the other priority groups and therefore the early focus upon overseas students has been effective in launching and securing early momentum for FT. In addition, Scottish universities and colleges have for some time now been actively prospecting for an increased share of the overseas student market. For these institutions, FT has been a welcome asset and has helped to fortify the Scottish ‘education offer’ at an opportune moment.

6.3 More importantly, research from other countries that are also actively prospecting for overseas students (see for instance Ziguras and Law, 2006) suggests that an early focus upon students can bring additional benefits:

a) high fee paying overseas students are especially important in nations where education is a major export industry; in 2002-3, HESA suggested that fee revenue for overseas students to the UK brought £1.5 billion and generated a similar sum associated with student spend when studying in the UK;

b) graduates from the recruiting country’s own universities and colleges are more readily employed within the indigenous labour market than foreign graduates;

c) international education is an economic sector that is attractive to the UK because it is knowledge intensive and high value added; students, by definition, possess higher levels of skills and aptitudes and therefore help to increase the recruiting country’s pool of highly trained workers;

d) given that the majority of students are at the start of their working lives, students are best placed to sustain the number of working age adults; helping to address the ratio of working to elderly population;

e) students are potentially some of the most authoritative ambassadors and persuasive marketers for not only an education establishment or system, but also a country. The student experience - and this includes not only their academic studies but also their daily living - is critical in forming and influencing their views.

A global market

6.4 Given these advantages, it is not surprising that competition to attract mobile students is becoming fierce. The ‘Vision 2020: Forecasting International Student Mobility’ study,
conducted with support from the British Council, suggested that the total global demand for international student places will increase from about 2.1 million in 2003 to approximately 5.8 million by 2020, with demand for places in the Main English Speaking Destination Countries forecast to increase from about 1 million places to about 2.6 million places (British Council, 2004).

6.5 Competition to attract these international students is fierce and approaches are becoming more professionalised and it is in this context that the work of FT needs to be situated. The United Kingdom, the United States of America, France, Germany, and Australia remain the major providers of international education. However, as the British Council acknowledges:

“Technological innovations are changing the nature of learning. Today's international students are more technologically literate, have greater expectations and are harder pressed than their predecessors. Not only is international competition increasing rapidly, its nature is changing significantly. The global opportunities available will attract many new players, public and private, international and national, with innovative and different alliances and partnerships and new approaches to delivery.” (Kemp, 2005)

6.6 Competition between the main English-speaking countries has resulted in a diversification of the modes through which international education is delivered. Four types in particular have now become routine:

- the relocation of international students to the degree provider country;
- the growing importance of ‘remote’ education through distance learning and on-line learning.
- the development of partnerships and collaborations with overseas institutions, with education provision through other deliverers; and
- the development of off-shore campuses and the relocation of staff from the provider country for a specific period.

6.7 Whilst all four are of interest to FT, clearly the focus of the scheme has been upon the first mode of delivery, the physical relocation of students to Scotland. Therein FT has focussed on ways in which to: increase the number of overseas students coming to Scotland to undertake educational courses; improve the quality of the student experience whilst in Scotland; and persuade more overseas students to stay on in Scotland to work after graduation.

6.8 In reporting upon the progress which has been made to date, this section is organised around three headings. Firstly, data establishing the flow of overseas students into Scotland will be examined. Secondly, the principal instruments which FT is deploying to meet its objectives will be introduced. Finally, based upon existing evaluations and interviews conducted with higher education partners, a number of areas where there might be scope for development will be outlined.
Overseas students studying at Scottish Universities and Colleges

6.9 The novelty of Fresh Talent initiatives in this area, allied with the natural time-lag through which education statistics come to be reported, means that data on student numbers at Scottish Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and Scottish Colleges (SCs) largely predate the establishment of the scheme. In any case, even if such data were available, it would be premature at this point to judge whether FT has increased the number of overseas applicants to Scottish HEIs and SCs (see below for discussion on future measurement). The purpose of this section therefore, will be to examine historical data so that FT might be put into context.

Sourcing data

6.10 Data relating to overseas students taking degree courses in Scotland are collected by the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA). Both the Scottish Executive’s Department of Enterprise, Transport, and Lifelong Learning (DETLLD), and the British Council (Education UK) have programmed these data for wider distribution.

6.11 Definitional issues mean that there can be some minor differences in the data with which each organisation works and all datasets require careful handling. Firstly, most commonly, students’ home domicile (ie their place of residence prior to studying) rather than their nationality is used to provide a locational fix. Domicile has the potential to be misleading if applicants are, for instance, siblings of Scottish workers living abroad who are returning home for a Scottish education. Secondly, as noted above, Scottish Universities and some SCs deliver education internationally using a variety of modes. Students might be registered at a Scottish University for a degree but rarely (possibly never) set foot in Scotland.

Mapping international students in Scotland

6.12 In 2005, the Scottish Executive published a profile of students in the Scottish Higher Education sector for 2003-04 (Scottish Executive, 2005b). Included in their profile were both an overview of the origins of students by domicile (Table 6.1), and an assessment of shifts in catchment areas of entrants from 1998-1999 to 2003-04 (Table 6.2). Proceeding cautiously, some important points can be made about the context within which FT is working.

6.13 In 2003-04, there were 271,865 higher education students in Scotland, 80% (216,255) of whom studied in HEIs, and 20% (55,610) studied in SCs. Of those in HEIs, 70% (152,185) were domiciled in Scotland and 30% (64,065) elsewhere. For SCs, only 3% (1,830) were not domiciled in Scotland.

6.14 In the 2003-04 period, then, the total number of students with non-Scottish domiciles registered for a higher education course in Scotland was 65,895, predominantly registered with HEIs.

1 Of the 64,065 ‘non Scots’ studying at a Scottish HEI, 41% (26,305) came from the rest of the UK, 17% (10,695) were from the EU (including the 2004 accession countries), and the remaining 24% (27,065) were from the remainder of the world. In the case of the 1,830 ‘non Scots’ who were registered at an SCs, 39% (705) were resident in the rest of the UK, and 61% (1,125) came from overseas. Together, these figures highlight that the rest of the UK constitutes a core market for Scottish HEIs in particular. It is interesting to
note that in 2003-04 only 13,290 Scots chose to study in another part of the UK, making Scotland a substantial net importer of students. In addition, Scottish HEIs enrol substantial numbers of overseas students and it is clear that their catchment area far exceeds the EU. Asia and North America remain important overseas markets for the higher education sector.

Table 6.1 Students in higher education at Scottish HEIs by domicile and location of study 2003-2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domicile</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Studied wholly or partly in the UK</th>
<th>Studied wholly outside the UK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All domiciles</td>
<td>216,255</td>
<td>205,350</td>
<td>10,910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>152,185</td>
<td>152,170</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest of UK</td>
<td>26,305</td>
<td>26,250</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU 15</td>
<td>10,380</td>
<td>9,550</td>
<td>830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU Accession</td>
<td>1,765</td>
<td>1,340</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>2,905</td>
<td>1,885</td>
<td>1,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>12,565</td>
<td>8,415</td>
<td>4,150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australasia</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>3,240</td>
<td>1,490</td>
<td>1,755</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>5,395</td>
<td>3,410</td>
<td>1,990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South America</td>
<td>660</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other overseas</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please note: rounding to the nearest 5: numbers may not sum to totals because of rounding. Source: Scottish Executive, 2005b; Table 12

2 In 2003-04, 10,910 students registered for a higher education course from a Scottish HEI but studied wholly outside the UK. Only 15 of these students had a Scottish domicile and only 50 had a UK domicile, implying that this is not a phenomenon driven by Scottish or Scottish based UK students studying wholly overseas. It would seem possible to conclude therefore, that between 15% and 20% of ‘overseas’ students registered at Scottish HEIs are studying wholly outwith the country, via an alternative mode of course delivery.

3 Between 1998-99 and 2003-04, the number of entrants to Scottish HEIs grew by 14,815 (Table 6.2). The bulk of this (12,385) can be attributed to the growing number of Scottish domiciles who have availed of the expansion in higher education opportunities. Most also has been to undergraduate and sub-degree level, with postgraduate students accounting for only 13% of the increase. Interestingly, entrants from the rest of the UK have shown a downward trend, whilst in the overseas category, students from the pre-accession EU15 and from Asia have witnessed the largest increases, at undergraduate and postgraduate levels. Scottish HEIs are operating in an increasingly competitive market for both UK and overseas students and success in some markets has been tempered by a dip in others.

6.15 In summary, these statistics suggest that HEIs, in particular, are already significantly involved in attracting students within the core market for FT – those students outside of Scotland who apply and study for a degree in Scotland. In the 2003-04 period, HEIs attracted 65,895 non-domiciled Scots, of whom more than 27,000 came from outside of the EU. However, the largest market remained elsewhere in the UK.
Table 6.2  
Entrants to Higher Education in Scottish HEIs by domicile 1998-99 to 2003-04

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>56,130</td>
<td>54,910</td>
<td>56,400</td>
<td>66,040</td>
<td>63,160</td>
<td>68,515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest of UK</td>
<td>10,125</td>
<td>8,725</td>
<td>8,385</td>
<td>8,790</td>
<td>8,665</td>
<td>8,640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU 15</td>
<td>4,205</td>
<td>4,145</td>
<td>4,355</td>
<td>4,595</td>
<td>4,985</td>
<td>5,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-EU 15</td>
<td>805</td>
<td>635</td>
<td>775</td>
<td>875</td>
<td>790</td>
<td>865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>980</td>
<td>730</td>
<td>625</td>
<td>995</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>1,035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>3,670</td>
<td>3,255</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>4,425</td>
<td>5,355</td>
<td>5,940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australasia</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>1,085</td>
<td>825</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>895</td>
<td>635</td>
<td>1,005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. America</td>
<td>1,620</td>
<td>1,575</td>
<td>1,495</td>
<td>1,930</td>
<td>1,845</td>
<td>1,935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. America</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other overseas</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Scottish Executive (2005b, Table 14).

6.16 The latest statistics pertaining to 2004-05 were published in May 2006. These data point to three main changes in the patterns identified above:

a) overall last year there was an increase (4,840 or 1.8%) in the total number of students studying at Scottish HEIs and SCs; from 271,865 in 2003-04 to 276,705 in 2004-05

b) a rise at HEIs of both Scottish domiciled students (4,025) and non-UK students (5,725 or 15.2% rise) more than offset a reduction of nearly 3,300 in the number of students at SCs

c) most of this increase in non-UK students at HEIs (4,700) was from non-European regions, although more than 3,700 were involved with studying wholly outside of the UK.

Consequently, within the 2004-05 period, there was an increase of less than 1,000 students attracted into Scotland from outside of the EU over the levels in 2003-04.

Understanding student location choices

6.17 Given the growth of global competition, it is essential that policy makers and institutions are well informed on the likely reasons why students choose to study outside the country of domicile. The British Council has identified 6 factors which affect students’ choice of destination:

- quality of education provision
- future employment prospects associated with the education qualification
- affordability
- personal security and risk
- lifestyle
- accessibility of the education system
The British Council also concluded from their modelling that the first two factors on the list were of over-riding importance for the UK in offering a competitive advantage (Kemp, 2005).

6.18 To date, there is very limited research into the locational decision making of international students coming to Scotland. The Executive’s commissioned study on recent migrants (TNS System Three, 2006) included interviews with some postgraduate students and confirmed the importance of some of these factors, although the specific experiences of students are not explored in the research. Much more research is required if FT and its partners are to remain successful in attracting a high proportion of international students to come to Scotland.

**FT : Specific student initiatives**

6.19 With its focus on attracting students to come to study, live and work in Scotland, Fresh Talent has instigated a number of programmes. These can be divided into those which have been associated explicitly with FT and a set which have attracted support from FT, but which were initiated by other agencies or education bodies. The three *core* initiatives are:

- The introduction of the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme (FTWiSS)
- Scottish International Scholarship Programme (SISP)
- The Challenge Fund.

6.20 FTWiSS occupies central ground. This scheme is designed specifically to enable overseas applicants an improved chance of staying in Scotland for work after graduation. It has also been employed as a marketing tool to encourage more overseas applications in the first instance. However, FT has wisely augmented the Visa scheme with flanking supports. The Scottish International Scholarship Programme assists in marketing taught Masters courses overseas and recruiting the most able candidates, whilst the Challenge Fund helps to improve the student experience in Scotland. That FT has recognised the need to buttress the Visa scheme with additional measures is to its credit.

6.21 In addition, three further programmes with a different genealogy have important *supplementary* Fresh Talent dimensions:

- Scottish Networks International (SNI)
- Dare to be Digital (DARE)
- EDGE Programme

6.22 Much of the FT efforts to date have focused upon prospecting for talent beyond the EEA. Given the current funding of student places, this is politically understandable, but there are strategic advantages of supporting market strengths. However, FT is keen to harness the skills of graduates from other parts of the United Kingdom and the rest of the EEA and is aware that these areas remain more important overseas markets for Scottish Colleges and Universities.
FT: Developmental Opportunities

6.23 Given their recent origins, meaningful detailed evaluations of the core FT activities are only now being instituted. In contrast, given their relative longevity, detailed evaluations of the longer established supplementary programmes have already been undertaken. Against this backdrop, the purpose of this section is to review the ‘package’ of core interventions launched so far under FT with a view to identifying possible areas for future development. Discussion will be structured around two central themes: firstly the relationships which FT has developed with the higher education sector and the extent to which the partnership is working; and secondly, the research and information gathering which will be necessary in the future if sufficient evidence is to be available to judge the longer-term impacts of FT as a whole in relation to international students.

Partnership building with the Higher Education sector

6.24 The Fresh Talent team have successfully enlisted the support of the key Further and Higher Education Institutions in Scotland. There is a definite sense that Principals and Senior Officers are very supportive of both the concept of FT and its more specific initiatives. Of course, there has been a timely coincidence of interests. As noted above, Scottish universities and colleges are very aware that they are now operating in a highly competitive but lucrative market place and indeed for some time now have been putting in place strategies designed to maximise market share. FT has been viewed as a timely and helpful asset in these efforts. The importance of supporting FT has been a message which has strongly permeated into service departments within the HEIs and SCs and is exerting a strong influence on practice.

6.25 In particular, International Offices within HEIs and SCs have presented FT schemes and scholarships prominently on their websites and within their published information. Most have also provided insights into the rationale for FT and have illustrated how international students are being supported within their own institution.

6.26 Whilst virtually all service departments and personnel express solidarity with the objectives of the scheme, some do have concerns about the practical aspects of its implementation. There remains an issue about the extent to which the Fresh Talent team can continue to engage and enthuse service departments further down the command and control chain within Scottish colleges and universities. Nevertheless, many of the concerns demand responses not just from the FT team but also from service departments themselves and from universities and colleges more widely. With the co-operation of all stakeholders it will be possible to work towards their resolution. Among the most important areas of concern which service departments raised were:

Relations with Careers Services

6.27 There would appear to be scope to improve the relationships which exist between FT and Careers Services. Some careers officers felt that FT was launched with insufficient consultation with the Association of Graduate Careers Advisory Services (AGCAS) [Scotland]. This created some initial difficulties since Careers Services were being asked questions from overseas students prior to FT providing them with information about their various programmes. In spite of now being in possession of more facts, some AGCAS members feel that there remains scope for closer dialogue between FT and Careers Services.
The formation of the FT Virtual Forum in February 2005 was one response to this and has assisted dialogue between members including AGCAS, the British Council, Scottish Universities International Offices Group, Strathclyde Region Advisors to Overseas Students (STRATOS) and the FT team. These developments are promising and ought to be developed further.

**Student expectations**

6.28 There is a need for all stakeholders to manage student expectations better. Many overseas students seem to have an inflated understanding of the labour market opportunities which Scotland might provide. Some come to Careers Advisers in the expectation that high quality employment is “virtually guaranteed” and that Careers Services have an obligation to place them in good jobs. The reality is that, with the exception of some sectors in some parts of the country, graduate employment is highly competitive and there is a general scarcity of job opportunities. Graduates are often under-employed if not unemployed for some time after graduation. There is a concern that when the reality hits home, students might feel disappointed and embittered that the image they had prior to arrival has failed to materialise. This concern was raised at initial stages of the FT initiative by AGCAS (Management Committee, April 2004) who are concerned about “the dearth of opportunities for graduates and the need to support home as well as overseas graduates in making successful careers in Scotland”.

**Using fee income to support FT**

6.29 There is a need to address the question of the distribution of fees from overseas students within universities. The rise in the number of overseas students is proving to be increasingly burdensome on some service departments who have been expected to deal with increasing workloads without a corresponding increase in resources. Overseas students require substantially more reassurance, guidance, practical assistance and support than indigenes when applying for jobs. In addition, when they fail to secure an appropriate job they revisit Career Services for advice on the labour market back home. Lacking expertise in labour markets in countries of origin, Careers Services are having to conduct primary research from scratch and create in some instances new web resources. Universities clearly benefit from the increased fee income which overseas students bring. All stakeholders should work together to ensure that given this new revenue stream, services are provided which are commensurate with quantitative and qualitative increases in student demand for advice and assistance.

**Scotland or the UK?**

6.30 There is a concern that whilst there is an expectation that graduates will stay and work in Scotland, it is not illegal for them to work elsewhere in the United Kingdom. Advisors are often asked this question by students and at best resort to an argument about the moral expectations that students accept when applying. The possibility that some applicants might deliberately or inadvertently be using FT:WiSS as a channel into the wider British labour market is a concern worthy of noting and monitoring at this early stage.
Timing initiative launches

6.31 The timing of the introduction of the Challenge Fund (announcements made about awards in September at the busiest time in the academic year) has meant that it has been quite a challenge for institutions to get programmes up and running this year. Given that there is an expectation that funded projects will create sustainable practices for at least two years post funding, there is a concern about the workloads that will need to be maintained in the forthcoming two years. Consequently, there is a sense that fewer bids might be submitted for the forthcoming funds and that the quality of bids might not be as good second time around. To counter this concern however, ASCOL report that it is likely that colleges will submit even more bids in 2006-2007. However, the majority of international students are located within HEIs and any reduction in bids to support these areas will reduce the impact of the Challenge Funds.

Further research opportunities

6.32 If the effectiveness of FT’s approach to support the attraction and retention of overseas students is to be measured at an appropriate point in the future, it will be important that a number of gaps in the current research base be filled. Three areas of research in particular present themselves as being of primary importance:

- quantitative assessments of changes in overseas applications;
- qualitative research into the experience of overseas students who relocate to Scotland;
- and
- quantitative assessments of the pathways taken by students who have successfully applied under FTWiSS.

6.33 If attracting more overseas students to Scotland continues to be a complementary objective of FT, then shifts in the number of overseas applicants registering at Scottish HEIs and SCs over time will be an important barometer. In time, it will be necessary to undertake more rigorous research into Scotland’s changing share of the international market. Both the DETLL and the British Council’s (Education UK) programming of the HESA data makes possible very detailed market analyses. This includes more complex cross tabulations and modelling of changing numbers of arrivals through time in terms of the specific countries they come from, the level they are studying at, their subject, age group, fee status, mode of study, institution of study, extent to which they are only visiting or on exchange, and their gender.

6.34 If improving overseas students’ experiences whilst in Scotland continues to be a central objective of FT, then gaining insights into students’ encounters with Scotland, including their embroilment in specific FT programmes, will be an important barometer. Some valuable work has already been undertaken to this end by TNS Systems Three (2006), but the student experience was considered a part of a broader relocation population and the results are pertinent only to the early stages of the scheme. There would seem to be merit in setting in place a longitudinal study NOW, so that a relatively small number of students could be tracked from the moment of application to, if appropriate, their passage through the Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme and perhaps even onto a Work Permit.
6.35 If encouraging more overseas students to stay on in Scotland to contribute to the labour market continues to be a central objective of FT, then the fate of those students who have been awarded leave to remain visas under FTWiSS will be an important barometer. Currently, HESA funds Careers Services at Scottish universities (and colleges) to track student’s employment records six months after graduation (80% response rate). To date, funding has been provided for UK domiciled and EU students only. It is possible to debate whether HESA ought to provide additional funding or whether universities ought to redistribute fees from overseas students to extend this research to extra EU students. Nonetheless, given that they only possess students’ address of domicile, it is logistically impossible for Careers Services to contact overseas students who stay on in the United Kingdom, including those in possession of FTWiSS visas. The FT team have conducted their own survey tracking the trajectory of FTWiSS participants visa holders through time and the intention is to repeat this survey every six months. From a population of 1516, a total of 433 responses have been received from the first round (28% response rate). The data are currently being analysed and the first results are due in the summer of 2006.

**Action points**

6.36 Based upon the above analyses of FT’s ongoing programmes designed to attract and retain overseas students, six main action points present themselves. These action points require responses not only from the FT team but from all stakeholders:

1. There would appear to be scope for FT to forge stronger working relationships with service departments in Scottish universities. In particular there might be merit in FT and AGCAS forming a stronger partnership when programmes of mutual interest are being conceived, launched, and managed (perhaps through the Advisory Group);

2. A fine balance has to be struck between aggressively selling Scotland to overseas students in a highly competitive market place, and overselling Scotland. The expectations of overseas students needs to be managed carefully to avoid the scheme rebounding on universities and colleges and the Scottish Executive;

3. The reluctance of some employers to appoint overseas students might be alleviated by: a) investing in schemes at opportune time windows designed to improve overseas students command of English, and b) advocating and simplifying the methods through which FTWiSS visa participants holders might pass on to other immigration schemes including the Highly Skilled Migrant Programme and/or Work Permits;

4. In time, more detailed analyses of market trends might be made. It will be impossible to gauge whether any changes in particular kinds of student demand have been caused by FT but it will be valuable to assess whether trends are going in the right direction and by what degree;

5. There is a need to commission a longitudinal qualitative study tracking the experiences of students who navigate through the Scottish education system and FT programmes in different ways. It might be that this research could be integrated into a wider Challenge Fund bid in 2006-2007; and
6. It is recommended that decisions are reached as to who ought to be responsible for financing and collecting information on the career trajectories of extra EU students who have graduated from Scottish Universities and Colleges. At present, there is a gap and the only data which is available is that collected by the FT team tracking FTWiSS applicants. Until this matter is resolved consideration might be given to the questionnaire FT uses, the method of distribution and collection, and the advanced cross tabulations and modelling which might be possible given the existing data (eg salary levels, nature of employment). This is the most valuable data set in existence and as such it might benefit from nurturing at this point.

Bringing talent to business

6.37 FT’s direct involvement with the business community has been recent, more limited and less focussed in scale than the activities addressing the student target group. Nevertheless there are a number of activities that have been developed to support business. These include:

a) a business dimension to RAS through the secondment of a Scottish Enterprise member to the team;
b) linking business into the Scotland is the place website; and
c) the publication of a toolkit to guide small businesses through the work permit scheme.

In addition, SE Dunbartonshire’s EDGE Programme (as well as connecting with students) is a business-related project supported by FT given its focus on encouraging entrepreneurship.

6.38 The main involvement of FT in supporting business to attract fresh talent comes more indirectly through schemes which link students with work (eg work placements linked to SNI or through DARE), the provision through FTWiSS to enable graduates to find employment in Scotland without the requirement of a work permit and advice and assistance on how businesses can navigate the current immigration system. There is also an important role in educating businesses about the new points based system as it is developed and tested. This latter assistance is not insignificant, given that employers find the current system time-consuming, complex, cumbersome and bureaucratic and even when employers have experience of the system, they complain about it being lengthy and inefficient (Dench et al., 2006, 7).

Partnership working in a crowded arena

6.39 In contrast to the scope available to FT in the area of international students, FT’s ‘action space’ for new initiatives is more restricted, as there already exists considerable effort and support to business from the Executive through the activities of the Scottish Enterprise Network. Consequently, for FT to be supportive, it has had to develop a different form of partnership working, with SEN and others, than that adopted in relation to HEIs and SCs.

6.40 First, the channels through which business in Scotland already engages with Executive strategies and policies are well established being at the core of the rationale of Scottish Enterprise, Highland & Islands Enterprise and partnerships, such as SDI or SCDI.
6.41 Second, channels through which business attracts talent outside of Scotland are also already well established for many organisations who currently recruit internationally. The migration of ‘talent’ into (and out of) Scotland occurs through the internal labour markets of large global companies and globally networked companies (Figure 2.1). They and others employ recruitment agencies to assist and support their recruitment and most already have experience of applying to the Home Office under work permit and visa schemes. It is debatable whether FT can influence significantly such flows or indeed if such business would require or welcome FT involvement.

6.42 Further, there already exist entry schemes to the UK which aim to attract very highly skilled migrants, either as innovators or entrepreneurs, and there exists business networks in existence between Scotland and other parts of the world through areas such as GlobalScot.

6.43 This limited ‘action space’ is further reduced by business’ perception that FT is about meeting the needs of particular economic sectors (eg high tech, engineering, creative industries). Consequently, there is a risk that the typical SME thinks that FT has no relevance to them.

Who is the client for FT?

6.44 Indeed, there are fundamental issues over to whom is it selling and what are FT’s selling propositions? In terms of target groups, FT seeks to work with 3 business components: people seeking employment; Scottish business looking to recruit from overseas; and entrepreneurs and self-employed looking to start up businesses in Scotland. Each ‘client’ group has different demands and asks for different support and intervention by the Executive under FT. To date, initiatives under FT have focused on the first 2 client groups.

People seeking employment

6.45 FT has assisted this group primarily through a strategy of facilitating entry into the UK and thus providing opportunities for individuals to find employment in the Scottish (or UK and EU) labour markets. Both FTWiSS for graduates and the wider RAS operate to inform, support and enable access to Scotland, via entry to the UK, for such talent. However, FT is not about matching skills with vacancies, or entrants to employment. This remains either the responsibility of other agencies (such as SEN) or, more generally, the private sector where recruitment agencies and others are key players.

6.46 Further, given the migration policy context in the UK and the EU, FT has focused primarily on supporting talent from outside of the EU/EEA, mainly within markets which have traditionally not been principal sources of labour and which are now growing (eg India and China). There has been some specific support for groups in the EU, through the WRS associated with the accession of the A8 countries in 2004 and promotional work in Poland.

6.47 FT support for this client group has operated only to assist them to enter and experience Scotland, but has not been focussed on addressing specific groups of individuals to match up with any specific labour or skills shortage in Scotland.
Businesses in Scotland

6.48 The extent to which government should intervene in labour markets and exactly how such intervention can be effective reaches right to the heart of politics, with fundamental ideological differences existing between and within states.

6.49 In the current Scottish political and economic context, where FT’s role is to support economic growth, for FT to intervene effectively in the labour market there are a number of issues:

- Just what can FT offer to business in terms of products and services which are not already provided by the market or other agencies? Can one product/service ‘fit all’ or are the needs of the business community too diverse?
- What proportion of Scottish businesses have a need (whether articulated or latent) for FT’s products and services? How many have serious skill or labour shortages?
- How many employers would consider solutions which involve recruiting workers from outwith Scotland? And what action can be taken to overcome barriers to such recruitment?
- Can, and should, FT also meet the needs of other employing organisations in Scotland, notably the public sector (which is responsible for around half of all jobs in Scotland) and the voluntary/charitable/not-for-profit sector?

6.50 There are important and related links between each of these questions and an assessment of whether FT can intervene effectively to support economic growth. The following section considers the answers to each in turn.

FT services to business

6.51 At present, FT’s primary services are:

a) assisting businesses within Scotland that may lack the resources, or the confidence, to navigate the visa and work permit system – through directing them to the immigration expertise contained within the RAS and offering advice through the employers’ toolkit; and

b) stimulating more businesses in Scotland to recruit staff from overseas – primarily by selectively introducing business to talent (eg through DARE, EDGE, SNI placements) through events in conjunction with Scottish Enterprise to the top 100 indigenous companies in Scotland, events in conjunction with SCDI to businesses looking to find out more about Fresh Talent and the current and new immigration systems and, more generically, through education/promotion via websites (eg Business Gateway) and marketing (eg Business Insider) highlighting success stories and experiences.

c) Generating a new pool of talent of overseas students who are available for employment through FTWiSS.

d) Supporting international networks (eg GfoS, alumni) through which business can make contacts with others internationally.

6.52 In providing these, RAS, as noted in Chapter 5, does not attempt to offer a tailored service. There will therefore always be tensions between the differentiated and at times specialised needs of business and the generic advice and support available under FT. Of course, specialised advice in relation to international markets is available elsewhere – from SEN, or Chambers of Commerce, for example. Nevertheless, it is unlikely that RAS can offer
tailored advice to businesses of different size (turnover and workforce), sectors or organisational structures. FT has focussed on SMEs who are likely to have least experience and resources to manage international recruitment internally.

6.53 In so doing, FT supports a particular form of migration; one that emphasises the physical and permanent relocation of talent to Scotland. Amongst larger and international organisations, however, shorter term mobility, and internal transfers also provide productive ways to enhance flows of talent.

Future shortages of skilled labour in Scotland?

6.54 Futureskills Scotland surveys of employers offer evidence of the current position amongst employers across Scotland. Based on the surveys of more than 7,500 employers, the 2004 Skills in Scotland report indicates that, in a growing economy in which new developments are taking place, there are some skills and labour shortages (Futureskills Scotland, 2005a).

6.55 However, the presence of some vacancies and some skill needs is an inevitable outcrop of a dynamic and vibrant economy. The surveys suggest that skill shortages were not limiting businesses. First, in relation to vacancies, the research points to a vacancy rate of 1.7%, and of this (equivalent to 73,400 posts) 46% were ‘hard to fill’ and a quarter were classified as ‘skill shortage’ vacancies. Such skill shortages affected fewer than 5% of all employers, typically those who were growing, were smaller workplaces and were involved in skilled trades and sales/customer services. In the context of Fresh Talent, the Futureskills research points to employers with hard to fill vacancies indicating that they often have had to “change their recruitment practices, including using a wider range of recruitment channels than normal to find a suitable candidate.” (Futureskills Scotland, 2005a).

6.56 Second, in relation to skills gaps (ie a current employee not being fully proficient as judged by employers), the surveys indicate that 20% of workplaces experienced a skills gap, affecting 182,000 employees (9% total workforce). For most employers skills gaps had little or no negative impact of their business. Gaps, however, were most frequently occurring in hotels and restaurant industry and in parts of the public sector and these were of greater significance in inhibiting activity.

6.57 Whilst this current position can be interpreted as “the market working effectively to fill vacancies” (Futureskills Scotland, 2005a, 7), it is also possible to argue that businesses have lowered their ambitions, adjusted their strategies and capital investment to accommodate current skill levels. Under this ‘low skills equilibrium’ scenario, the skills mix at present is limiting business from reaching their full potential: “the workforce might be fit for purpose but not for higher value purposes” (Futureskills Scotland, 2005b, page 10). The solution, however, may not be for higher skills, but for higher productivity to gain benefit from the existing skills base.

6.58 Together, this evidence highlights the importance of making better use of the existing skills levels within the current labour force in Scotland and also the selective and limited nature of any skills shortages in Scotland.
Employers’ views of migrant labour

6.59 Drawing both on previous studies in the UK and their own primary research of employers in England who have recruited migrant workers, Dench et al.’s (2006) study offers some important insights into how business has and might engage with FT and, second, what role FT and its partners might have in enabling the attraction of talent to Scotland.

6.60 There appears to be a general acceptance across business that the UK economy relies on a significant number of skilled migrant workers. The actual proportion varies between sectors with some, like agriculture, construction and the hospitality/catering sectors, being heavily reliant on flows of in-migrants, often employed for short time periods. In last 2 years, these sectors too have relied heavily on the employment of Central and East European migrants entering the UK under the WRS, attracted by their ‘work ethic’ and their education and skills levels (Anderson et al., 2006).

6.61 We summarise here some of the most relevant components of these two recent research reports from the perspective of employers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The importance of migrant workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Fill skill gaps and hard to fill vacancies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• More crucial in low skill sectors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The strengths of migrant workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• More motivated, reliable and committed than domestic workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Favourable work ethic encouraged domestic workers to work harder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Widened horizons of domestic workers with new ideas, thinking and cultures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The disadvantages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Language barrier – especially in relation to health &amp; safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Integration between different cultural groups of workers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recruitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Many argued that they simply reacted to the pool available and sought to recruit the best qualified applicants, regardless of nationality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exploitation and skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The skill and qualification levels of migrant labour often exceeding job requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Some anecdotal reports of some employment on lower wages, longer hours, fewer employee rights</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.62 The clearest conclusion from this and previous research in Northern Ireland (Bell et al., 2005), in north east Scotland (Solutions, 2005) and in Norfolk (Taylor and Rogaly, 2004) was that most employers did NOT set out to recruit migrant workers - they reacted to the pool of labour available. In short:

- most employers are neutral to overseas employment; not seeking migrant labour, but accepting it if fitting their needs
such recruitment is primarily to fill skill gaps
most gaps are in the low-skilled labour market
if language barriers can be overcome, there are clear work ethic advantages of migrant labour.

Voluntary and public sectors
6.63 To date, most of the information provided under FT, through RAS, the Scotland is the place website and at events supported overseas, the emphasis has been on working with private sector business and employers. It is important that the needs of other employing organisations in Scotland, notably the public sector (which is responsible for around half of all jobs in Scotland) and the expanding voluntary/charitable/not-for-profit sector could also be addressed. In Scotland, there are acknowledged skill shortages in both areas of public services (eg care sector) and in the voluntary and charitable sector (NCVO, 2003).

Connecting students with employers
6.64 Within its emphasis on international students, FT has opened up opportunities for students from overseas to be employed in Scotland. However, from interviews with those in the careers services charged with connecting graduates with employers a number of concerns have been registered. There is a perception among some careers officers that insufficient consultation with employers prior to FT student schemes being launched has created difficulties for those attracted under FT to gain employment. In particular, these officers perceive that:

1. not enough employers know about the scheme and appreciate what benefits it might bring to them.
2. for some employers two years is not long enough under FTWiSS. The average graduate training programme lasts for about 18 months so a lot of time and money is spent and then the employee has to return to their home country or switch to another scheme and few employers seem willing to get involved in the immigration system.
3. FT has been indiscriminate in its recruitment of overseas students and has not targeted markets that are capable of yielding skills appropriate to the genuine bottlenecks in the labour market.
4. employers taking on overseas graduates often need to organise a suitable induction programme. All stakeholders, including employers themselves, need to be aware of the limited development of these induction programmes to date and the extent to which the absence of an induction programme might be responsible for the reluctance of managers to take overseas graduate students on board. There might be a need to resource training on how to organise induction.
5. language is the single biggest hurdle that faces many overseas graduates when competing in the labour market. Of course, all must have met the basic TOEFL or IELTS requirements to get on to courses, but spoken language and even written language in the form required by companies is different again from what students learn at universities. Graduates in some sectors such as engineering might be able to cope with limited English, but clearly those wanting to go into managerial roles or marketing roles or human resources roles often require an advanced command of the English language.
Entrepreneurs

6.65 The attraction of entrepreneurial talent in the UK is already a clear priority, with UK Trade & Investment being the lead UK Government organisation helping businesses locate in the UK and grow internationally. This is supported by the Highly Skilled Migration Programme (HSMP) for entry to the UK. The HSMP has evolved since its launch in January 2002 to widen its scope and encourage younger, well qualified and experienced individuals and their dependents to come to the UK.

6.66 Whilst the HSMP is not specifically for entrepreneurs, there are number of entrepreneur-friendly immigration programmes. The Business Ownership programme allows people to live in the UK if they are establishing or taking over a business. Amongst other requirements, they must invest at least £200,000 of their own money in the business and create or maintain at least two full-time jobs. To date, this has attracted over 100 entrepreneurs to the UK but is a relatively limited scheme. The Innovators Scheme launched in 2000 is open to a wider group. It is designed for entrepreneurs with proposals for setting up a new business which will bring economic benefit to the UK. Under this initiative, the applicant does not have to invest personally in the business and is fast-tracked for entry to the UK. In addition, there are opportunities to gain access to investors providing capital for new developments.

6.67 There are also some sector-specific programmes. The UK T&I Global Entrepreneurs Programme provides assistance to entrepreneurs in the life sciences and information & technology sector to establish new businesses. At the heart of the scheme is the linking of individuals with established ‘dealmakers’ to assist guiding ideas to fruition.

6.68 As immigration is a reserved area of responsibility, all of these schemes are relevant to entrepreneurs considering Scotland as a location. There are no specific Scottish schemes, but support for entrepreneurs considering Scotland can gain information, advice and assistance from the Scottish Enterprise Network. The TalentScotland website acts as a gateway for this service, providing both advice on support and opportunities and news about successful developments.

6.69 This has been supported through funding packages made available for entrepreneurialism and innovation. The SMART, SPUR and SPURplus awards are targeted at promoting innovation, encouraging existing companies to enhance their products and processes through innovation and help to facilitate the formation of new leading edge businesses. Two further Scottish Executive initiatives, SCORE and SEEKIT, are specifically aimed at encouraging greater co-operation between SMEs and the Science Base, and in addition, the Scottish Executive is a key sponsor of Knowledge Transfer Partnerships, helping business to develop and grow by accessing the wealth of knowledge and expertise in the UK’s universities, colleges and research organisations. The £33m allocated under the Proof of Concept Fund for ‘ground-breaking’ projects enables them to germinate.

6.70 The attraction of this talent is rightly one area in which FT needs to be supportive. Research suggests that founders of new firms are more likely to be in-migrants. LeVie’s recent analysis indicates that immigrants to the UK and within-UK regional migrants are more entrepreneurial than long-term residents (Levie, 2005) pointing not only to the non-UK migrant as important, but also those from elsewhere in the UK. It is difficult, however, to envisage further specific initiatives which can be undertaken that would attract many more
overseas entrepreneurs. The focus on ‘potential entrepreneurs of the future’, through specific graduate schemes such as EDGE or DARE, represents added value to those of SEN and UK T&I.

6.71 There are a number of challenges to be faced in targeting this group, on which the evidence from other countries who also seek to attract entrepreneurs and immigrants with business ideas, can assist. First, very few entrepreneurs relocate (even to the next town, never mind a different country) specifically to set up a new business. Most migrant entrepreneurs move to another country for job reasons and subsequently set up a business. And most of these businesses are small to medium size enterprises. Consequently, the success of translating the talent into entrepreneurial activity has been shown to be dependent on being part of local networks – or embeddedness. As in-migrants take time to generate such networks, research in Australia (Collins, 2003) and Canada (Frouscharuer, 2001; Ley, 2003) highlight the importance of internal policies by the state and local business communities in facilitating the entrepreneurial activity of these in-migrants. Therefore, for FT support to enable this lubrication – language training, assisting with set-up bureaucracy, personal development training courses – may be as important as attracting such potential entrepreneurs into Scotland.

**FT: developmental opportunities and action points**

**People seeking employment**

6.72 There is scope for FT to assist further in supporting people into employment in Scotland. This could involve adapting some of the approaches currently applied to students to employees; for example:

- creating an effective web-based market place for businesses seeking to recruit workers and individuals looking to move to Scotland (or the UK) to work so that they can ‘meet’. This may be a function for the Scotland is the place website and could involve a voluntary register be generated of those interested in working in Scotland

- Providing or linking with an after-care service for individuals and families who do move to Scotland to enable them to settle in quickly, thereby increasing the likelihood that they will be retained

**Changing employers’ attitudes**

6.73 Together this evidence sets out some of the challenges faced in relation to FT if it aims to focus on employers as its client. Whilst there is merit in informing and educating the business community on how to recruit overseas to overcome skill shortages, to de-mystify the visa/work permit system and lubricate recruitment channels into foreign labour markets, and provide a source of expertise to companies and individuals with work permit/visa problems, this is unlikely to be sufficient to increase significantly opportunities for in-migrants.

6.74 More fundamental mind shifts are required. In particular, employers in Scotland – and especially those mainly smaller companies who have had no experience of overseas labour - need to be exposed to fresh talent, enabling them to gain positive, first hand knowledge of this talent. This could include:
• greater involvement of businesses in Scotland within the global networks already in place. This could make them more aware of the nature and skill levels of those overseas and also highlight their affinity to Scotland and support for the Scottish economy.

• provide more opportunities for international students studying in Scotland (either under FT schemes or more generally) to have opportunities on work placements. Given their linguistic abilities (necessary for entry to HIEs and SCs) this would assist to overcome the perceived language barriers of employers and expose them to strengths of migrant labour.

6.75 In addition, there needs to be more opportunities to connect employers (and their needs) with overseas fresh talent who want to move to Scotland, in order to explore opportunities to relocate to Scotland. This could involve:

• creating an effective web-based market place for businesses seeking to recruit workers and individuals looking to move to Scotland (or the UK) to work so that they can ‘meet’. This may be a function for the website Scotland is the place and could involve a voluntary register be generated of those interested in working in Scotland

• make greater connection between graduates supported under FT with employers and with expansion of schemes such as DARE and EDGE that make such connection.

6.76 To counter the low-skill base in migrant labour, FT could develop its own programme of attracting highly skilled talent to Scotland. This could involve:

• an inward-entrepreneur programme that is distinct from any UK scheme, to attract individuals and teams to locate new business ventures in Scotland, thus emphasising the higher skilled nature of some migrants. This should include targeting non-Scottish students who are studying at Scottish universities on a permanent or visiting basis. This focus on individual entrepreneurs would complement SDI which focuses on the attraction of businesses.

6.77 And FT could aim to attract independent knowledge workers who set up businesses, often in their home, and who have considerable more flexibility in location than other business sectors (Green et al., 2000; Green, 2004). In conjunction with the Executive’s Broadband Strategy (Scottish Executive, 2001) and the wider appeal of Scotland’s quality of life, this could involve:

• promoting Scotland’s success in home-working and the support provided by the Executive and other partners to assist in independent knowledge workers to create business in Scotland.

Moving beyond students and business: expatriates and returnee Scots

“I think home will always be your home and it will always be like that” (Boyle, 2006).

6.78 As the profile of RAS customers reveals, to date most of the advice provided under FT has been to workers seeking employment and business to recruit overseas and to students.
Further, most of the individual initiatives and projects have supported the student target group. In contrast, expatriates have arguably not been central to FT at this stage.

6.79 The growing research into diasporan migrants and populations highlight that for them the above sentiment ensures that, as a target group for FT, they have existing ties with Scotland. FT is, to an extent, knocking on a door which is at least ajar to its messages of Scotland as a place to live, work and study, and is likely to generate a welcoming smile.

6.80 But it is of course a huge challenge to turn that feeling of ‘home’ into a return migration move. Nevertheless, the snapshot provided by the 2001 Census suggest that each year, many Scots overseas, are returning to Scotland. The Census revealed that 1 in 4 of those migrants coming into Scotland from outside of the UK in the 12 months to the Census were returning Scots – amounting to more than 7,200 people.

6.81 However, there are important issues which need to be recognised in addressing this group of potential migrants.

1. as critics of the term diaspora point out, there is a tendency to view the group as sharing a common tie to Scotland. In reality, diasporaens will have very diverse connections with Scotland – some strongly linked to family and friends, others weak; some based on recent experiences of Scotland, other distant memories and stories; some with positive views of Scotland, other wishing to leave Scotland behind.

2. all have, to varying degrees, become embedded within other communities with different social, cultural and political practices. The very terminology employed here is suspect and value laden: what is ‘home’ and what is meant by ‘return’ migration for example.

3. if the diaspora is defined in terms of first generation Scots outside of Scotland, they have all migrated FROM Scotland, whether by choice or need. This group therefore has actively moved away and thus, whilst they have shown themselves to be mobile, they have chosen NOT to locate in Scotland previously.

In each case therefore there are challenges to convince this target group to move again, to retrace their migration pathways and to let go of some of the social capital they have accumulated in their current place of residence.

6.82 The diasporic community can offer a rich source of support and talent which can assist Scotland in its global setting. However, this is not to infer that many are seeking to relocate to Scotland. Some may be encouraged to return but, even if not, they can provide talent to assist the promotion of Scotland globally.

The Scottish diaspora

6.83 Quantifying the Scottish diaspora is very difficult. Not only are there fundamental definitional problems over the nature of the connection with Scotland to qualify as part of the diaspora – familial ties or a sense of belonging for example – there are also few records kept in other countries of the nationality of all but recent migrants. The US and Canadian
Censuses identify more than 15 million people in the North American Scots diaspora, but few other countries attempt such measurement.

**Diasporic communities and FT**

6.84 Those involved with FT have recognised the merit in looking beyond the diaspora as a pool of people to be attracted back to Scotland. The approach to date has three strands:

Strand 1: communicating with the existing diaspora  
Strand 2: generating future diasporaans  
Strand 3: attracting diasporic returnees (back) to Scotland

6.85 Strand 1: this has involved some reorganisation of the GfoS network and liaising with other networks – including GlobalScot, SNI and, to a more limited degree, university alumni networks. There is also an understandable assumption that members of the diaspora will access information on modern Scotland through the websites, such as scotlandistheplace.com, which are constructed primarily for other purposes. The inclusion on the Sitp website for example of the ‘This is Scotland’ section is as much aimed to diasporaans as to general surfers.

6.86 Strand 2: a key element of the initiatives addressing international students has been supporting them if they choose to return overseas to act as advocates for Scotland. The emphasis on them having a positive experience – in general life in Scotland as well as education – is an active attempt to generate a future diaspora which is positive to Scotland.

6.87 The underlying rationale for these two strands is a need to alter the sense and image of Scotland held by many outside of the country. In particular, as research for the Executive has revealed in relation to the international image, there is not a perception of Scotland as offering business opportunities and perceptions are often based on traditional and rooted in the past, yet Scotland has many strengths which reflect a modern nation. On the assumption that the diaspora is familiar with at least some aspects of modern Scotland, they become important advocates for instilling a more modern portrayal of Scotland in their current communities.

6.88 Strand 3: this is largely un-developed and to date has not involved any specific initiatives.

**Return migration: barriers and hindrances**

6.89 But perhaps the biggest barrier here is knowledge. Although it is important to recognise that each migrant’s decision to relocate is based on their own unique circumstances, there are a number of more commonplace and shared dimensions which can be understood and addressed. There, however, is a knowledge gap here. To date, there has been a dearth of specific research into the Scots diaspora and which members are considering a return to Scotland. Too little research has examined the experiences of those return migrants to Scotland from the diaspora to understand what factors assist and which hinder there relocation; and, in particular, to what extent their migration decision making differs from non-diasporaans.
As a result, evidence to date is based upon a few, specific case studies. Condor (2005) offers one such insight into possible reasons why some Scots currently living in England are not returning. This longitudinal research, based on interviews with a sample of 60 people born in Scotland, offers some insights within a UK context. Although this research is cast in terms of a post-Devolution position, the factors raised are not directly connected with the re-organisation of government. She identified four key factors:

- concerns about English partners or children not being accepted within Scotland
- lack of social capital, networked into relevant professional or occupational culture in Scotland
- non-recognition of professional qualifications or experiences
- having become out of touch with contemporary Scottish culture and political events

A second case study by Boyle and Motherwell (2005) offers further depth to understanding what barriers members of a Scottish diaspora (in this case in Dublin) construct as reasons for not returning to Scotland. They conclude that the absence of a strong Scottish diasporic community in Dublin and, possibly as a consequence of this, a limited sense in Scottish nationalism meant that the diasporicans were more likely to be attracted back to Scotland through “the superiority of the social quality of life on offer in Scotland” – the cost of living, social service infrastructure, and family networks – and by assisting the smoothness of the migration process (the costs in time and effort to search out information on services and locations). However, even these may not overcome the primary issue for most migrants – economic opportunities. Without hard economic opportunities, extracting Scots diasporicans away from their current life locations will prove difficult.

In contrast, there is a little more research on the return of other diasporic migrants that could assist FT in reaching out to this group.

Other research into other diasporian communities may point to shared experiences and opportunities for the development of the third strand of this part of FT. Boyle’s (2006) research into the recruitment of Scots to Dublin within the last decade reveals the importance of producer services which assist relocation decision-making. As his research shows, for many participants the recruitment agencies, executive search firms, and recruitment exhibitions all mediated their decision to relocate to Dublin.

**Practical action**

It is recommended that attention is given to the research currently being progressed under the Arts and Humanities Research Council’s ‘Diasporas, migration and identities’ programme in order to inform FT about the approaches and methods being used to study and engage with diasporian communities across the world.
Achievements of FTI: Scotland’s global sense of place

7.1 It is said that wine needs age to mature to the point at which an experienced wine taster might make a valuable judgements as to its quality. Young wine can never be judged to be good or bad as such assessments would be hasty and unjust. The exigencies of political life rarely afford policy agendas - like that of Fresh Talent - such a luxury. In any case, young wine often has special spirit to it that age mellows and extinguishes.

7.2 The Fresh Talent Initiative has recorded a host of significant achievements in spite of its comparative youth. The details of these achievements, in terms of specific projects, have been described in the previous chapters. Here, and standing back, it is important to recognise the profound contributions which FT has already made to Scottish life.

7.3 The globalisation of economic activity has not always created a parallel growth in cosmopolitanism. As nations become caught up in global flows of capital, people, goods, information, and culture, there often exists a temptation to lapse into primordial and defensive senses of place; the line between ‘them’ and ‘us’ comes to be drawn more sharply. Exploiting irrational fears and cultural stereotypes, some groups have been quick to argue for fortress mentalities.

7.4 The Fresh Talent Initiative is to be welcomed as a far-sighted counter to such trends. FT recognises that Scotland will fare better in the global economy if it positions itself as an outward looking, diverse, tolerant, and open society. In a sense, FT makes a bold statement about Scotland’s preparedness to embrace a progressive ‘global sense of place’ and to exercise leadership in defining how small nations must orient themselves if they are to compete in the 21st century economy. FT reveals a Scotland which is confident of its relations with the rest of the world and which revels in the potential benefits which flow from becoming a meeting point or honey pot for talented people.

7.5 Even at this early stage, four ways can be identified to illustrate how FT might be said to be active in cultivating a ‘progressive’ global sense of place for Scotland.

Changing the attitudes of Scots to outsiders

7.6 FT makes a statement that Scotland occupies a particular niche within British immigration policy and sends out a strong signal to Scots that Scotland is seeking to be more open to ‘outsiders’ than other nations and regions in the United Kingdom. FT has garnered solid support from Scottish universities and colleges and helped to consolidate and fortify ongoing efforts to attract overseas students. In addition, it is working to change the attitudes of Scottish employers to overseas talent by making them more aware of the virtues of this talent and by demystifying Home Office migration schemes.

Changing the attitudes of outsiders to Scotland

7.7 FT has generated substantial press coverage across the world and there has been useful tracking of the press coverage associated with specific programmes. There can be no
doubt that FT has put Scotland more firmly onto the map as a possible destination for overseas talent and FT has enjoyed success as a marketing tool or branding device. FT has reached beyond traditional markets in the rest of the UK, Australia, Canada, the US, and Europe, to awaken fresh interest in the Accession States in Eastern Europe and the far east, including the important markets of China and India.

**Widening and lubricating the channels through which people relocate to Scotland**

7.8 In so far as it serves as a one stop shop for people thinking of relocating to Scotland, the Relocation Advisory Service helps to remove impediments to relocation and facilitates the passage of migrants into Scotland. FT has also mobilised actors who control key routes into Scotland and helped to widen these channels. Whilst Scottish Universities and Colleges have been targeted for greatest attention to date, it is clear that channels more pertinent to business are now being focussed upon.

**Deepening overseas talent’s engagements with Scotland**

7.9 FT helps to thread and embed overseas students into the Scottish labour market and to improve their chances of remaining as part of the labour force beyond graduation. It has introduced a series of flanking supports for overseas students which have enhanced their experience of Scotland, improved their quality of life and their sense of social, cultural, and economic inclusion. It has also helped talent to connect and stick with Scottish business by improving the ability of overseas workers to contribute more effectively to the needs of Scottish business and helping students ‘fit’ into Scottish companies more readily.

**Improving the quality: practical actions points**

7.10 Inevitably, in blending together different ingredients to meet the challenge of giving Scotland a global sense of place, some aspects have proved less effective than others. Throughout the report there have been a number of suggested areas for action arising from this review’s assessment of progress to date. This section summarises these.

**Rationale for FT**

7.11 Although recent evidence indicates a diminishing in the immediate demographic imperative to overturn a downward trend in population, the fundamentals associated with an ageing population remain pertinent – and the population trend in Scotland is less positive than elsewhere in the UK or much of the EU. Further, the latest projections do emphasise the long-term nature of the demographic issues being addressed by Fresh Talent and do underline how even relatively small adjustments in the level of net migration to Scotland can impact on its demography. It will be vital that continuing monitoring of migration flows into and out of Scotland is maintained and FTI is informed by this (3.24).

7.12 In contrast to other nations who have forged their own policies to manage migration, the Executive is limited in the interventions in can make in this area. It needs to negotiate local variations to the UK policy. The managed migration proposals for the UK offer the Executive new opportunities to reposition FT in future. Under the proposed scheme, FT should focus on: attracting talent amongst high skill graduates into areas of skill shortages in
Scotland, international students for short periods of time, and workers within the EU/EEA (3.47).

7.13 Future skills surveys in Scotland point to the current and short-term future position of some, but not exceptional, skills shortages and hard to fill vacancies. However, there is also evidence that, in a growing economy, there will be a requirement for new labour and that the pool in Scotland of those seeking employment is declining. In the short term, there is limited evidence of an imperative amongst employers to seek talented labour outside of Scotland. A key task for FT is to bridge this divide, encouraging business to look forward and to be more active in embracing talent from within and outside of Scotland (3.54).

Understanding migration

7.14 Although some research on migrants’ experience in Scotland has been commissioned under FT, it is evident that there remains limited knowledge about the motivations which bring migrants to Scotland. Further, there is very poor quality data currently available to track migrants who enter Scotland. Research in this area will be essential if FT is to be able to work effectively at attracting and retaining talent through migration (3.31).

7.15 The recently commissioned research by the Executive (TNS System Three, 2006) offers an initial insight into the motivations of migrants relocating to Scotland, the barriers (real and perceived) which affect such decisions, and the differences between prior knowledge of Scotland and the experience to be had through migration. However, the utility of the study is hampered by the small and selective nature of the sample size. There is scope in future research for greater tailoring of interviewees to either the current characteristics of migrants - by location of origin (eg from the UK, elsewhere in the EU, outside of the EU), by affinity with Scotland (returnees, prior work/living experience of Scotland), by skill level, and by employment. Such research would fit more neatly into the aims of FT and provide more definitive and targeted insights to the key groups of talent being sought under the initiative (5.81).

7.16 There also remain some distinct gaps in knowledge which are of relevance to FT. Most of these relate to an understanding of the factors which shape the propensity of people to migrate and the experiential aspects of the migration process – from the initial decision to consider relocation through to the assimilation within a new set of communities (5.98).

Specific FT schemes

Relocation Advisory Service

7.17 It is important that the further evaluation of RAS currently being conducted by Ipsos Mori addresses similar areas as those of the 2005 review, but also examines issues of sustainability of the service. In particular, the option of RAS being relocated itself as a separate body, perhaps as a distinct unit, should be considered. This would enable the FT team to focus on new developments, and for the RAS team to focus on delivery of the advisory service. The review should also consider the skills and human resources of RAS in light of the new UK managed migration scheme (5.25).
Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme

7.18 FTWiSS offers a unique source of information relating to migration into Scotland. As noted in Chapter 2, knowledge of why migrants come to Scotland, their locations and subsequent histories is limited. There is an opportunity through FTWiSS follow up questionnaires and surveys to improve this knowledge base. In determining the future direction of FTI, such knowledge could prove invaluable (5.33).

Marketing/International Image

7.19 There needs to be a longer-term and more qualitative assessment of how perceptions of Scotland (replacing kilts and tartan with diversity and openness for example) have been changed through international marketing. This could involve questionnaires or interviews with a sample of e-visitors to the website or a follow up to those participants in trade and careers fairs or to special events. Alternatively, or additionally, this might usefully be assessed through repeat research in 3-5 years time with those involved in the Executive’s 2004 research to identify the extent to which perceptions of key groups have altered. Further, longitudinal research could be conducted with members within the networks (GfoS, GlobalScot, SNI) to map out the changing perceptions of this already informed group about Scotland’s image internationally (5.61, 5.62).

Scotland is the place/Global Friends of Scotland

7.20 The development plans to provide a stronger ‘gateway’ website portal mark an obvious approach to reduce the costs associated with website maintenance and to further customise the information being supplied to members of the network, to other partners and to a wider, global audience. Opportunities also exist for this single site to target specific diasporic communities in future (5.77).

Scottish Networks International

7.21 The proposal for a bi-annual conference and smaller events to meet with employers in different regions and for commissioned research to understand the barriers and benefits of employing a diverse workforce for SMEs should help offer stronger connections with business in Scotland. In contrast to the rigorous entry interviews to the scheme, there is relatively limited follow-up research of each year’s cohort to gain sights from their individual experiences and this could usefully be a joint area of evaluation by the British Council and the Executive (5.87).

Supporting other activities

7.22 Although, at this stage, it is not possible to quantify the impact of both DARE and EDGE in terms of longer term attraction of talent, the two schemes already offer benefits towards FT goals. Connecting businesses with overseas (and local) talent, making overseas students aware of opportunities in the Scottish economy, and creating a group of young advocates for Scotland point to these both offering good value for money. In addition, in the coming year, the tailored feedback and evaluation of these two schemes being requested by the FT team will provide some much needed insights to potential migrants’ views of opportunities in Scotland. If opportunities to further support such schemes emerge – for
example, through a roll out of EDGE in other areas of Scotland – the Executive should consider supporting these (5.96).

Other policy areas

7.23 Whilst there is clear evidence of explicit links being made between FT and other policy areas within the Scottish Executive, there are also gaps. Although challenging, in reaching its desire to make FT cross-cutting, the Executive should ensure that, where relevant, strategies and policy announcements in those areas which support FT indicate how they support FT goals. Further, in announcing the budgets and financial statements, the Executive should make explicit the cross-cut expenditure on FT (5.104).

Target Groups

Students

7.24 Scottish universities and colleges have welcomed FT as an important asset in their wider efforts to compete for a healthy share of the lucrative overseas students market. Based upon the above analyses of FT’s ongoing programmes designed to attract and retain overseas students, however six main action points present themselves. These action points require responses not only from the FT team but from all stakeholders. Discussion between stakeholders will be required to establish which particular action points they might prioritise and for which they will take responsibility:

- there would appear to be scope for FT to forge stronger working relationships with service departments in Scottish universities. In particular there might be merit in FT and AGCAS forming a stronger partnership when programmes of mutual interest are being conceived, launched, and managed (perhaps through the Advisory Group);

- a fine balance has to be struck between aggressively selling Scotland to overseas students in a highly competitive market place, and overselling Scotland. The expectations of overseas students needs to be managed carefully to avoid the scheme rebounding on universities and colleges and the Scottish Executive;

- the reluctance of some employers to appoint overseas students might be alleviated by: a) investing in schemes at opportune time windows designed to improve overseas students command of English, and b) advocating and simplifying the methods through which FTWiSS participants might pass on to other immigration schemes including the Highly Skilled Migrant Programme and/or work permits;

- in time, more detailed analyses of market trends might be made. It will be impossible to gauge whether any changes in particular kinds of student demand have been caused by FT, but it will be valuable to assess whether trends are going in the right direction and by what degree;

- there is a need to commission a longitudinal qualitative study tracking the experiences of students who navigate through the Scottish education system and FT programmes in different ways. It might be that this research could be integrated into a wider Challenge Fund bid in 2006-2007; and
• it is recommended that decisions are reached as to who ought to be responsible for financing and collecting information on the career trajectories of extra EU students who have graduated from Scottish universities and colleges. At present, there is a gap and the only data which is available is that collected by the FT team - tracking FTWiSS applicants. Until this matter is resolved consideration might be given to the questionnaire FT uses, the method of distribution and collection, and the advanced cross tabulations and modelling which might be possible given the existing data (eg salary levels, nature of employment etc). This is the most valuable data set in existence and as such it might benefit from nurturing at this point.

*Business*

**People seeking employment**

7.25 There is scope for FT to assist further in supporting people into employment in Scotland. This could involve adapting some of the approaches currently applied to students to employees; for example (6.72):

• creating an effective web-based market place for businesses seeking to recruit workers and individuals looking to move to Scotland (or the UK) to work so that they can ‘meet’. This may be a function for the Scotland is the place website and could involve a voluntary register of those interested in working in Scotland

• providing or linking with an after-care service for individuals and families who do move to Scotland to enable them to settle in quickly, thereby increasing the likelihood that they will be retained

*Changing employers’ attitudes*

7.26 Whilst there is merit in informing and educating the business community on how to recruit overseas to overcome skill shortages, to de-mystify the visa/work permit system and lubricate recruitment channels into foreign labour markets, and provide a source of expertise to companies and individuals with work permit/visa problems, this is unlikely to be sufficient to increase significantly opportunities for in-migrants. More fundamental mind shifts are required. In particular, employers in Scotland – and especially those smaller companies who have had no experience of overseas labour - need to be exposed to fresh talent, enabling them to gain positive, first hand knowledge of this talent. This could include (6.74, 6.75):

• greater involvement of businesses in Scotland within the global networks already in place. This could make them more aware of the nature and skill levels of overseas workers and also highlight their affinity to Scotland and support for the Scottish economy.

• provide more opportunities for international students studying in Scotland (either under FT schemes or more generally) to have opportunities on work placements. Given their linguistic abilities (necessary for entry to HIEs and SCs) this would assist in overcoming the perceived language barriers of employers and expose them to strengths of migrant labour.

7.27 To counter the low-skill base in migrant labour, FT could develop its own programme of attracting highly skilled talent to Scotland. This could involve (6.76):
• an inward-entrepreneur programme that is distinct from any UK scheme, to attract individuals and teams to locate new business ventures in Scotland, thus emphasising the higher skilled nature of some migrants. This should include targeting non-Scottish students who are studying at Scottish universities on a permanent or visiting basis. This focus on individual entrepreneurs would complement SDI which focuses on the attraction of businesses.

7.28 In conjunction with Executive’s Broadband Strategy and the wider appeal of Scotland’s quality of life, FT could aim to attract independent knowledge workers who set up businesses, by (6.77):

• promoting Scotland’s success in home-working and the support provided by the Executive and other partners to assist independent knowledge workers to create businesses in Scotland.

Returnee Scots

7.29 It is recommended that attention is given to the research currently being progressed under the Arts and Humanities Research Council’s ‘Diasporas, migration and identities’ programme in order to inform FT about the approaches and methods being used to study and engage with diasporic communities across the world (6.94).

Taking FT forward: options for future development

7.30 This final section considers more operational and logistical dimensions of the development of FT and evaluative measures which could be adopted to assess FT’s future success. In particular, the discussion of a number of possible scenarios recognises that the Executive is only able to influence migration decisions to a limited extent and that FT involves increasing partnerships with other agencies in Scotland, with government at the UK level, with business in Scotland and overseas, and with individuals across the world who can support the aims of FT.

7.31 Based on the evidence identified from this research, a number of scenarios for FTs future development are proposed. In discussing each of these, it is recognised that there are a number of key issues which will condition judgements about the virtues and vices of each:

• The rationale of Fresh Talent, especially in relation to demography
• The target population groups
• Available ongoing financial resources for Fresh Talent
• Human resources to implement and develop FTIs
• The sustainability of projects and initiatives.

The rationale of Fresh Talent, especially in relation to demography

7.32 The immediacy of the pressure to address a declining population has diminished in the short term and, whilst there are issues about the ageing of the population and the concomitant decline in those of working age, this is not as unique to Scotland. This shift in demographic projections can reduce the evaluation of FT being in terms of overall numbers
of in-migrants, towards a strategic approach which focuses on talent for purpose (eg skills needs, age profile).

The target population groups

7.33 As the evaluation identifies, FT has expanded from its initial focus on students to address some aspects of the business target group. With the lessened demographic pressure, there is scope for FT to prioritise further its target groups and indeed to focus attention to supporting the attraction of talent within only some of them.

Available ongoing financial resources for Fresh Talent

7.34 Achieving the targets set for FT has incurred expenditure and will incur further costs. At present, different departments of the Executive contribute to the overall FT costs. This reinforces the cross-cutting dimension of FT, but also means that each Minister has to agree to these resources allocated from their ‘core’ activities. The 2003-04 Financial Statement indicated that expenditure on FT would amount to more than £5.5m, over 3 years. Expenditure will be focused on RAS (£1.17m), promotion and marketing (£0.77m), research and IT (£0.47m) and on the specific projects on students (£2.83m) and business involvement (£0.07m). For FT to continue and to expand to develop further initiatives and sustain the current ones, there is a critical issue of whether and how much further financial resources can be committed to FT.

The sustainability of projects and initiatives

7.35 At present, most of the FT projects have been created to exist for a time limited period. RAS is a 3 year pilot and SISP, Challenge Funds and SNI involvement are planned for 3 years. There is thus a core question of the future sustainability of each of these schemes. At present, with the exception of the Challenge Fund which explicitly expects sustainability arrangements to be in place, there are no plans within these areas of expenditure to ensure that any project can be sustained without further expenditure from the Executive. Options for making some or all the projects either mainstreamed within Executive budgets or funded outside of the budget should be explored.

Human resources to implement and develop FT

7.36 Covering all aspects of FT, a small team of staff within the Executive is currently being required not only to complete the growing set of tasks under FT, but also to respond to the heavy demands of monitoring and evaluation. The expertise of the team, drawn from within the Executive and beyond, has been vital to the development of FT. Ensuring that key skills and expertise is available will be important for the future development of FT as it operates within the UK migration policy context and meets new challenges to attract and retain talent.

Scenario for FT development

7.37 In developing these scenarios, it is assumed that the initial rationales for FT should be revisited. In particular, the need to attract more people to expand the population rapidly is
assumed to be no longer a priority and that a growth in talent can be achieved over a longer time period than originally envisaged. Further, it is assumed that for the present - ie to the end of the 3 year period for most elements of FT - all existing schemes will remain in operation and there will be no change in the core structure of the FT team. After this period, however, scope exists for reconfiguration of the organisation tasked with FT development and with the targets and objectives being set.

**Scenario 1: “roll out”**

This involves the continuing evolution of FT to address all the five target groups with further initiatives to augment the existing projects. For this to be achieved, as each initiative in turn is rolled out, it will require the Executive to make a growing financial commitment to FT projects and an expanding human resource base to meet the expertise and skills required. The ‘roll out’ of FT will expand the FT team and develop further partnerships with other parts of the Executive and agencies in and beyond Scotland.

It is envisaged that this will include:
- development of links with business in Scotland to indicate opportunities for overseas recruitment,
- expansion of FT links with diaspora under the Diaspora Strategy and enhanced web links with existing networks
- new emphasis on attracting entrepreneurs to Scotland
- continued provision of scholarships to overseas students and partnership working with HEIs and SCs
- support for graduates retained under FTWiSS to enter on more permanent migration schemes and thus retain fresh talent
- expansion of FT to support SEN and others to retain talent in Scotland

To support these areas, **enhanced knowledge** of the following is needed:
- experiences and histories of talent attracted through FTWiSS
- the push factors of emigrants from Scotland, focusing on those in the rest of the UK
- changes in perceptions of Scotland as a destination to work and live amongst diaspora members

**Evaluation** will involve continued assessment of each of the initiatives and projects, both in terms of their individual goals, and also:
- their sustainability beyond Executive funding
- their interaction with RAS
- the effectiveness of partnership working with business, HEIs/SCs, SEN, British Council and others.

**Key evaluative metrics** of FT under this scenario will include:
- number of FTWiSS applicants retained beyond 2 years
- number of overseas entrepreneurs and self-employed supported to apply for entry through UK schemes
- number of supported talent who join FT affinity diaspora and networks
- continuing flow of inquiries to RAS for assistance/advice under FT schemes
Scenario 2: “roll forward”

In order to address each of the five target population groups, but recognising that there is likely to be a limited financial and human resource base on which to draw, this scenario envisages a sequential targeting on each group and a concomitant mainstreaming of existing activity. Not all current activity will necessarily continue, but the desirability of developing sustainable projects would have to be prominent in the development of each new one.

None of the current projects, primarily focussed on students (eg SISP, Challenge Funds) have been launched with a clear strategy for sustainability, although there is a limited expectation for sustainability in the Challenge Fund. There are major questions about whether any of these initiative can be sustainable without continuing core funding.

Options to assist in managing the overall resources required under FT include:
- RAS could be formed into a separate unit with its own remit focused on the advisory service. It would be important that the unit retains a skills mix which includes familiarity with the workings of the Home Office and immigration legislation. The recommendation from the first review of RAS that it should become for targeted and tailored is endorsed.
- The international marketing team, which is currently drawn largely from staff outside of the Executive, could also deliver to its remit at arms length from the Executive as a dedicated unit;
- the focus of the FT team therefore would be on policy, development and constructing new partnership working. New initiatives would therefore be ‘rolled forward’ initially by the FT team but mainstreamed elsewhere.

Key evaluative metrics of FT under this scenario will include:
- successful sustaining of key FT initiatives with reductions or removal of FT funding
- evolution of new projects which stimulate and pump-prime initiatives to attract and retain FT
- meeting the objectives of each project/initiative and contributing to attraction and retention of one of the five target groups
- sequential mainstreaming of key initiatives within either the Executive or other agencies and partners
Scenario 3: “focussed” targets

This scenario involves re-focussing on one (or possibly two) priority target groups and ensuring that meaningful and lasting interventions are made within FT budgets and with support from partners.

Which target group(s)? There is a logic to continue to work with students as this has been the current focus and is one which most closely fits the objectives of FT in terms of youthfulness, skills, diversity and economic potential. In addition, it is an area where the Executive already has a major role. Consequently, further action by partners (especially with HEIs and SCs) can most effectively be leveraged.

This focussed activity could include:
- Gathering of information on destinations of overseas post-graduation
- Further partnerships with HEIs to provide studentships for international students
- Support by Executive to work placement and short-term courses which enhance overseas student experience of Scotland
- Closer working with University alumni offices
- Support for graduates retained under FTWiSS to enter on more permanent migration schemes and thus retain fresh talent
- Support for new initiatives from business, HEIs/SCs and public or voluntary sector to link overseas students with Scottish economy and culture

If a second group is included in the focussed approach, it is recommended that this should be the wider diasporic communities as the others groups (Scottish business, migrant workers and entrepreneurs) are already being supported through other arms of government and the marketplace.

As the focussed approach is to deepen support of the target group(s), there will need to be development of further detailed data about and knowledge of the target group(s), their experience in Scotland, the factors which influence their attraction and retention, and information about actions elsewhere (the competition) to attract the group.

Key evaluative metrics of FT under this scenario will depend on the number and selection of the target group, but would include measurements of:
- the successful interventions in Scotland on areas which provide competitive advantages in attracting the target group
- the number in the overseas target group seeking information on and access to Scotland
- the experiences of those attracted to Scotland
- the effectiveness of departed talent in promoting Scotland overseas to target group(s)
Scenario 4: “skill needs”

This scenario recognises that, under a more managed migration system and sponsorship scheme proposed by the Home Office, there is a greater opportunity to focus on matching skills with the needs of the Scottish economy. FT can address both current shortages within selected sectors and be involved in enhancing business capacity for future growth. This option is thus less about targeting specific population groups (all 5 could remain important) but taking initiatives to link those attracted with employers and the labour market.

It is envisaged that this could include:
- Linking students with employers, through extension of work placements and encouraging business to offer studentships for overseas students
- Supporting new talent in Scotland to become networked with entrepreneurs
- Including representatives from the business sector within the development of the SNI, GfoS and Sitp websites
- Partnership working of FT staff with business sectors at joint career, trade and other overseas events with explicit connections between FT entry schemes and labour shortage
- Updating of the set of ‘skill shortage areas’ in Scotland made available under Tier 2 of the managed migration scheme
- Supporting business (especially SMEs, but also larger organisation) in the process of sponsorship under the managed migration scheme where this involves FTWiSS and other FT scheme participants
- Support for larger, international organisations in Scotland to enable short-term mobility of talent from overseas into Scotland

Key evaluative metrics of FT under this scenario will include:
- The rate of growth of business involvement in FT schemes
- Number of FT project participants employed in Scotland
- The growth and utilisation of an FT affinity diaspora network to support business
- The flexibility of FT schemes to respond to skill needs
REFERENCES


Futureskills Scotland (2005b) *The demand for and use of skills in the modern economy: a briefing by Professor Francis Green*, Scottish Enterprise: Glasgow


Harrison R and Mason C (2003) *The attraction and retention of high skilled labour* Scottish Enterprise: Glasgow


Scottish Executive (2004a) *New Scots: attracting fresh talent to meet the challenge of growth* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2004b) *A Smart, Successful Scotland* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2004c) *Scotland’s international image: findings from consultation and research* Research Findings No4, Scottish Executive: Edinburgh


Scottish Executive (2005b) *Students in higher education in Scotland 2003-3004* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh


Scottish Executive (2005d) *Consultations on ‘Measuring progress towards a smart, successful Scotland’ : progress measures* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2005e) *Scotland’s International image: sense of place. Impact evaluation of the points of entry campaign* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2006a) *Fresh Talent Inquiry Response* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2006b) *Evaluation of the pilot relocation advisory service* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Executive (2006c) *Scottish International Scholarship Programme: progress report* Scottish Executive: Edinburgh

Scottish Parliament (2005) *An inquiry into the Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative: examining the problems it aims to address, its operation, challenges and prospects* European and External Relations Committee: Edinburgh


Solutions (2005) *An initial survey of migrant labour in the North East of Scotland* Banff & Buchan College of Further Education: Banff


## ANNEX 1  TIMELINE OF FRESH TALENT INITIATIVES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Feb</td>
<td>First Ministerial announcement of Fresh Talent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Relocation Advisory Service opens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Oct</td>
<td>New Scots report from Steering Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Feb</td>
<td>Fresh talent website <a href="http://www.scotlandistheplace.com">www.scotlandistheplace.com</a> launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Jan</td>
<td>Fresh Talent leaflets distributed via British Council and FCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Feb</td>
<td>Home Office launch 5 year plan on immigration and asylum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>Milligan report on First Impressions of Scotland published</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Mar/Apr</td>
<td>Educational fairs in China, Singapore, Malaysia, and India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>April</td>
<td>Worker fair in Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Milligan report on First Impressions of Scotland published</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Participation in New York Tartan Week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Scotland is the place poster campaign at Scottish airports launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Response to First Impressions of Scotland report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Dare to be Digital scholarships awarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>EDGE programme launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Home Office launch consultation paper on points based system for managed migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Sept</td>
<td>First students under SISP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Sept</td>
<td>Involvement with SNI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Sept</td>
<td>First 12 projects funded under Fresh Talent: Supporting International Students Challenge Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Oct</td>
<td>Diaspora strategy launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Jan</td>
<td>Sectarianism action plan launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Home Office publish next stage of managed migration including Scottish flexibilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Feb/Mar</td>
<td>Education fairs in China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Attendance at NAFSA Conference, Montreal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 2  INTERVIEWEES

In the course of undertaking this project, advice was sought from the following individuals. The researchers are grateful for the assistance provided by each of the interviewees. Whilst we have tried to reflect the diversity of opinions provided, the views expressed in the report remain those of the authors alone.

*Face to face interviews* held with

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liz Neil</td>
<td>British Council (Edu/UK)</td>
<td>Co-ordinator of SISP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duncan Macniven</td>
<td>GROS</td>
<td>Registrar General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celia McIntyre</td>
<td>GROS</td>
<td>Head of Population and Migration Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann McKay</td>
<td>University of Edinburgh</td>
<td>Adviser, International Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Wilson</td>
<td>University of Strathclyde</td>
<td>Adviser, International Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbara Graham</td>
<td>University of Strathclyde</td>
<td>Director, Careers Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joanne Beaumont</td>
<td>University of Strathclyde</td>
<td>Challenge Fund Co-ordinator, Careers Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John McCann</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise</td>
<td>Manager, GlobalScot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lorna Clark</td>
<td>Scottish Executive</td>
<td>Head, Fresh Talent Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Hamilton</td>
<td>Scottish Executive</td>
<td>Fresh Talent Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Jones</td>
<td>University of Strathclyde</td>
<td>Alumni Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin Wight</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise</td>
<td>Scotland is the place/Global Friends of Scotland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alyson Mitchell</td>
<td>Scottish Executive</td>
<td>Liaison with Home Office/Work Permits UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allan Gemmell</td>
<td>Home Office</td>
<td>Senior Business Development Executive, RAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrea McLeish</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise (on secondment to Executive)</td>
<td>Head, International Projects Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louise McDonald</td>
<td>Scottish Executive</td>
<td>Economist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeremy Kempton</td>
<td>Home Office</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Telephone interviews* held with

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jim Robinson</td>
<td>Scottish Enterprise</td>
<td>Manager, Graduates for Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Fanton</td>
<td>University of Aberdeen</td>
<td>Deputy Director, Careers Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regina Styles</td>
<td>University of Aberdeen</td>
<td>Adviser and Challenge Fund Coordinator, Careers Service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linda Ali</td>
<td>University of Edinburgh</td>
<td>Director, Careers Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liz Speake</td>
<td>ASC</td>
<td>International Advisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niall Stuart</td>
<td>Federation of Small Businesses</td>
<td>Scottish Office</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Written submissions* received from

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ann M Livey</td>
<td>University of Paisley</td>
<td>Senior Careers Adviser, Student Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeanette Graham</td>
<td>Heriot-Watt University</td>
<td>Adviser, Careers Advisory Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penny Law</td>
<td>University of St Andrews</td>
<td>Careers Consultant, Careers Service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>