Experience of People Who Relocate to Scotland
EXPERIENCE OF PEOPLE WHO RELOCATE TO SCOTLAND

Candice Pires and Pat MacLeod
TNS System Three Social Research

Scottish Executive Social Research
2006
This report is available on the Scottish Executive Social Research website only www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch.

The views expressed in this report are those of the researchers and do not necessarily represent those of the Department or Scottish Ministers.

© Crown Copyright 2006
Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged. For more extensive reproduction, please write to the Chief Researcher at Office of Chief Researcher, 4th Floor West Rear, St Andrew’s House, Edinburgh EH1 3DG
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to Irene Coll, Project Manager in the Scottish Executive Finance and Central Services Department for managing the study. Also thank you to Martin Wight at Scottish Enterprise, who co-funded the study, Jane Hamilton at the Scottish Executive, and Paul Motley from European in Scotland for their valuable contributions through the Project Advisory Group; and Luke Cavanagh at the Scottish Executive who managed the end of the project.

We would also like to thank Neil Caffery, Anna Dudleston, Judith Harkins and Alison Leith, the researchers who worked on this project, for contributing their invaluable interviewing and analysis skills. Also to Joan Corbett at TNS for her help in proofreading the report.

Most importantly we would like to thank the respondents for giving up their time and so enthusiastically sharing their experience and views with us.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1

## CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

- Study background
- Qualitative research
- Study methodology
- Report structure

3

## CHAPTER TWO MOTIVATIONS FOR RELOCATING TO SCOTLAND

- Reasons for relocating to Scotland
- Typology of in-migrants
- Motivations by economic sub-groups
- Location decision by origin of in-migrants
- Conclusions

11

## CHAPTER THREE KNOWLEDGE AND EXPECTATIONS PRE-RELOCATION

- Introduction
- Sources and extent of knowledge of Scotland
- Perceptions of Scotland
- Awareness of the Fresh Talent Initiative
- Conclusions

23

## CHAPTER FOUR BARRIERS TO SETTLING IN AND STAYING ON

- Introduction
- Key barriers
- Getting here
- Living and working
- Practical considerations
- Settling in
- Community cohesion
- Conclusions

38

## CHAPTER FIVE FACTORS THAT HELPED RELOCATION

- Introduction
- Formal support received
- Living and working
- Settling in
- Influence of in-migrants’ attitudes and personal characteristics on experiences
- How likely are people to remain and what affects this decision
- Conclusions

55

## CHAPTER SIX CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Introduction
- Key questions for the Fresh Talent Initiative
- Practical recommendations

69

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

77

## ANNEX 1 TOPIC GUIDE FOR ORGANISATION INTERVIEWS

79

## ANNEX 2 TOPIC GUIDE FOR ORGANISATION INTERVIEWS

85

## ANNEX 3 TOPIC GUIDE FOR IN-MIGRANT INTERVIEWS

87

## ANNEX 4 DISCUSSION GUIDE FOR GROUPS

95
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Context
1. Long-term estimates for Scotland’s population show a decline to less than 5 million by 2036. First Minister Jack McConnell identified this as ‘the single biggest challenge facing Scotland as we move further into the 21st century’ (Scottish Executive, 2004). The Scottish Executive and Scottish Enterprise commissioned TNS System Three Social to research the experiences of those who relocate to Scotland in order to inform future Fresh Talent policy developments.

Aims
2. The aims of this research were to:
   • Understand why people choose to relocate to Scotland – including returning Scots, people from the rest of the UK and people from outwith the UK
   • Explore the factors that have helped people to relocate to Scotland, in particular support with accessing employment opportunities and settling into Scottish life, including understanding the positive experiences and/or barriers encountered
   • Consider the inter relations between the influence of education/work experiences, the importance of living in a particular place, and personal circumstances such as birth connections, family links, and family influence

Methods
3. Qualitative depth interviews were conducted with 55 in-migrants to Scotland and 10 organisations that had contact with in-migrants. Alongside this a literature review on managed migration was conducted to provide a contextual backdrop, and 4 focus groups with in-migrants were used to test emerging findings.

Findings
4. The decision to relocate, and the choice of Scotland as a location, was often for economic reasons such as employment and study, over lifestyle factors.

5. The relocation decisions and motivations of the in-migrants interviewed were used to develop a typology framework for the study. The 4 typologies and the motivations that epitomise them were:
   • Pragmatists – economic opportunities
   • World Citizens – experience of another country and economic opportunities
   • Lifestage Returners – family connections
   • Lifestyle Pursuers – changes in lifestyle

The Fresh Talent Initiative focuses on three economic status groups: entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates. Within these groups there were significant differences in motivations for relocating; in-migrants were better defined by the above typologies.
6. Sources and depth of knowledge of life in Scotland pre-relocation varied drastically amongst in-migrants, with some having visited and researched the country extensively, others returning home, and others having never visited the UK. All in-migrants interviewed from the rest of the UK had visited Scotland before. For those coming from overseas, particularly outside the EU, the main source of knowledge was by word of mouth.

7. On the whole, people had positive experiences of relocating to Scotland. Given the weight that word of mouth carries in other in-migrants’ decisions to relocate this is of great importance. Few in-migrants sought the advice and support of public bodies in relocating; those that did were generally satisfied with the support provided. Positive experiences with work, studies or business were crucial in making the move a success. Pragmatists and World Citizens were most likely to have had positive experiences in this area. Improved lifestyle was a major factor in attracting and encouraging people to stay in Scotland; but was not a strong enough factor on its own to retain people.

8. There were some barriers and frustrations to settling into life in Scotland. This varied by situation and can be broadly attributed to typologies. Pragmatists and World Citizens tended to face fewer, less serious barriers. The group that faced the most significant barriers were the Lifestyle Pursuers who often had unmet expectations of their new lifestyle. Difficulty finding suitable employment, whilst not being the most common barrier, was one of the most salient. Some post graduates expressed problems finding suitable employment, and for a few on the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme this was frustrating as they had had to take jobs unaligned to their career path.

9. Despite overall high levels of satisfaction with relocating to Scotland, most in-migrants were not fully committed to staying on a permanent basis and had a flexible approach to where they would live in the future. Many younger Pragmatists saw their experiences of life in Scotland as helping them towards becoming World Citizens.

10. There was low awareness of the Fresh Talent Initiative amongst in-migrants and the organisations involved with them. In-migrants also said they were unaware of who Scotland wanted to attract, and the roles of the different public bodies in managing migration. This generated important questions for developing Fresh Talent policy:

- Is it important to encourage people to relocate permanently, or are there merits in attracting people who wish to stay for shorter time periods?
- Who does Scotland want to attract, and who should be targeted?
- How can the public, private and academic sectors work together to further develop managed migration?

11. The report also offers practical recommendations for encouraging in-migration and making relocation easier including encouraging the public and private sectors to work closer together; increasing Scottish employers’ awareness of the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme; and making it easier to open bank accounts for overseas in-migrants.
CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1.1 Long-term estimates for Scotland’s population show a decline to less than 5 million by 2036. First Minister Jack McConnell identified this as ‘the single biggest challenge facing Scotland as we move further into the 21st century’ (Scottish Executive, 2004). To tackle this, various initiatives – including Fresh Talent – have been put in place to encourage people to relocate to Scotland and stem population decline. The Scottish Executive (Finance and Central Services Department), and Scottish Enterprise commissioned TNS System Three Social to research the experiences of those who relocate to Scotland in order to inform future policy developments.

1.2 This report seeks to:

- Understand why people choose to relocate to Scotland – including returning Scots, people from the rest of the UK and people from outwith the UK

- Explore the factors that have helped people to relocate to Scotland, in particular support with accessing employment opportunities and settling into Scottish life, including understanding the positive experiences and/or barriers encountered

- Consider the inter relations between the influence of education/work experiences, the importance of living in a particular place, and personal circumstances such as birth connections, family links, and family influence

Study background

1.3 Population projections from the General Register Office for Scotland (GROS, 2005) show that while Scotland’s population will rise over the next 15 years, it is predicted to fall from 2020, while the rest of the UK continues on an upward trend. Current predictions suggest that Scotland’s population will fall below 5 million in 2036. While the number of children aged under 16 and people of working age are set to fall, the number of people of pensionable age, and people aged over 75 is set to rise dramatically.

1.4 Against this background, in-migration can have a significant impact on the development and sustainability of the economy. In a recent report from the European Commission, the UK’s attitude to encouraging migrant workers from accession countries was applauded:

“Countries that have not applied restrictions after May 2004 (UK, Ireland and Sweden) have experienced high economic growth, a drop of unemployment and a rise of employment.” (European Commission, 2006a)
The Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative aims to attract and retain bright, hard working people to Scotland.

**Qualitative research**

1.5 This study was conducted using qualitative research methods. There were two main advantages for doing this over a quantitative approach. Firstly, as identified in the Literature Review, there is a lack of research into the experiences of in-migrants to Scotland. A qualitative approach allowed the issues that are important to in-migrants to be explored. A quantitative approach, would have more tightly controlled the variables under investigation, and hence, not allowed sufficient room for the in-migrants to express their views.

1.6 Secondly, a qualitative approach lent itself well to the subject matter of the experiences of those who relocate to Scotland. Relocating is a major life change and discussing it can be emotional. The qualitative approach allowed for a much greater understanding of the complicated personal decision making process and was able to probe deeply into the multi-layered reasons and motivations behind the decisions. A quantitative approach would not have been able to probe to the same extent.

1.7 Qualitative research does not seek to be representative of the views of a given population. Consequently, it was not necessary to interview a large number of people in order to acquire valuable and meaningful data. In this study we engaged with a broad spectrum of in-migrants covering a range of experiences, backgrounds and situations (inevitably, not all situations will have been covered). From this work we have been able to identify broad themes applicable to the in-migrant population in Scotland.

**Study methodology**

1.8 There were four main elements to the research design of the study. These were:

- A literature review on managed migration
- Depth interviews with individuals from organisations in contact with in-migrants
- Depth interviews with in-migrants in three sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates
- Follow-up focus groups with in-migrants
The literature review - Main arguments around managed migration

1.9 The literature review was conducted at the start of the project to provide a contextual backdrop to inform the planning of the study and the resulting conclusions and recommendations in Chapter 6.

1.10 Key discussions in the literature focus around whether highly skilled in-migrants are primarily influenced by place and/or the existence of similarly talented and creative people, or economic opportunities. From the US experience, Florida (2002) argued that the process of economic development has changed from one of the creation and attraction of firms, to one focused on the quality of human capital, in which the attraction and retention of highly skilled individuals – in particular the “creative class” – is key. Florida describes this creative class as,

“A fast growing, highly educated and well paid segment of the workforce on whose efforts corporate profits and economic growth increasingly depend. Members of the creative class do a variety of work in a variety of industries – from technology to entertainment, journalism to finance, high-end manufacturing to arts. They do not consciously think of themselves as a class. Yet they share a common ethos that values creativity, individuality, difference and merit.”

1.11 On the other hand, work commissioned by Scottish Enterprise suggests that, in Scotland, while the focus on people has risen in importance, there remains a need to ensure that suitable economic opportunities are provided in order to attract in-migrants and encourage them to stay (Harrison et al, 2003 and Findlay et al, 2003). They suggest that talented workers are attracted by the availability of attractive career-enhancing opportunities, and will not move to an “economic desert”.

1.12 Harrison et al (2003) also point out that Florida’s thesis was developed in the context of city regions in North America and it is questionable whether these ideas readily transfer to a European context and to the regional scale. Harrison et al also suggest that the decision to move from an existing location precedes the consideration of the place of relocation and that once the decision to move has taken place, the availability of economic opportunity then takes precedence over the location per se. Even among ex-patriot Scots, where the psychology of returning is substantially based on the emotional attachment to place, there is a willingness to return home only if the economic opportunities exist.

1.13 Creative talent, Florida (2002) also argues, is attracted by cultural cosmopolitanism – a vibrant, bohemian milieu characterised by openness, tolerance, diversity, colour, creativity and spontaneity. Boyle and Motherwell (2005) consider this notion of “cultural cosmopolitanism” to be particularly pertinent to Scottish policy makers because of the “widely held suspicion that to date, creative people have found Scotland to be stuffy, rule bound, parochial and conservative”. In their research on Scottish ex-patriots in Dublin, Boyle and Motherwell use Florida’s dynamic of cultural
cosmopolitanism to create an analytic framework. The framework uses traditional *human capital* explanations of migration (where the economic growth leads to labour market growth) and *quality of life* explanations (which recognise the influence of the standard of living on migration decisions). They found that *human capital* (career opportunities) best explained why Scots initially moved to Dublin, *cultural cosmopolitanism* explained why they settled and enjoyed life in Dublin, and *quality of life* issues explains what might make them return.

**Interviews with organisations in contact with in-migrants**

1.14 Ten in-depth interviews were conducted with organisations in direct contact with in-migrant groups in order to explore perceptions of in-migrants’ experiences. Most interviews were conducted face to face at the respondent’s place of work, but where not convenient for respondents, interviews were conducted by telephone. All organisations were briefed in advance by a letter explaining the purpose of the study.

1.15 Organisations across different sectors, and who were involved at different stages of in-migrants’ relocations, were interviewed in order to gain a broad understanding of their perception of the attractions for in-migrants and the challenges that they face. Respondents included employers, relocation agencies, universities and organisations involved with entrepreneurs, such as business incubators. All interviews were conducted with senior staff who had first hand contact with in-migrants and could provide an overview of their experiences.

1.16 The organisations interviewed were in the following sectors:

- Oil/gas employer
- Public health employer
- Transport employer
- A relocation agency
- Business incubator¹
- Scottish Development International
- Ethnic minority enterprise centre (publicly run)
- Talent Scotland
- Two international student advisors at two universities

As the organisations differed in their type of contact with migrant groups, four different topic guides were used: one for employers; one for relocation agencies; one for business support agencies; and one for universities (see Annex 1 for employers’ topic guide). The organisations interviewed provided valuable insight into how in-migrants are viewed, and how in-migrants’ relocation experiences are perceived.

¹ A support facility for new businesses, providing affordable accommodation, shared office services and business development resources.
Interviews with in-migrants

1.19 Qualitative interviews were carried out with three groups of in-migrants – employees, entrepreneurs and post graduates. Face-to-face depth interviewing was used with all respondents, most lasting about an hour and a half. All interviews were carried out at either the respondent’s place of work or study, or their home. The interviews served to understand the individual’s personal experience of the decision making process and the actual experience of moving to Scotland.

1.20 A proportion of the interviews were with couples who had relocated to Scotland. For people who moved with their family or partner, of which there are many, it was felt that it would be useful to understand the relationship dynamics which may highlight particular issues in the relocation decision and experience. To this effect, 10 paired depths were conducted, each lasting around two hours.

1.21 Each respondent was sent a letter in advance informing them of the study. They were also asked to complete two pre-interview tasks (Annex 2):

- Firstly, to answer a two-page questionnaire on personal socio economic data and indicative scores for high level questions\(^2\)
- Secondly, to think about the thoughts and feelings around their decision to relocate, the actual experience of relocating, and their hopes/concerns about their future in Scotland

The aim of the pre-interview tasks was to give respondents an opportunity to think in advance about their relocation, and thus allow the interviewer to more quickly focus on the reasons behind their thoughts and feelings in the actual interview.

1.22 A general topic guide was used, with a section for specific questions for each of the three broad groups (see Annex 3). The main points discussed were:

- In-migrants’ knowledge of Scotland pre-relocation
- What made Scotland attractive to people who relocated
- In-migrants’ experience of relocating to Scotland
- Awareness of government initiatives intended to attract and retain in-migrants

The sample

1.23 The three main groups covered were: entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates. It was initially intended that each group would have an equal split of the sample. However, as fieldwork progressed it became apparent that there were more varied motivators for moving amongst the employee group, and less so amongst the post graduate group. As a result, the number of employees recruited was increased, and

\(^2\) The aim of the questionnaire was to provide background information on the interviewees, rather than collect quantitative data.
the number of post graduates decreased. The resulting sample consisted of 18 entrepreneurs, 23 employees and 12 post graduates.\textsuperscript{3} This was across 45 households, with 10 interviews with partners.

1.24 Recruitment of in-migrants was undertaken in three ways. Firstly, the organisations who had contact with in-migrants and had been interviewed provided the contact details of consenting in-migrants. Secondly, a snowballing technique was employed by contacting individuals with a known interest or expertise in the area and asking them to use their contacts to find suitable individuals. Thirdly, businesses, business organisations, and universities were contacted and asked to invite suitable individuals to participate in the study, by phone, e-mail or letter. Some organisations sent out information on the study to their members/employees/students, and some contacted individuals directly. The contact details of consenting individuals were passed to the research team. Once contacted, in-migrants were checked against the following criteria to ensure a balanced cross section of experience:

Length of time since relocation to Scotland – All in-migrants had relocated to Scotland within the last ten years, with the vast majority having moved within the last 5, and around a third within the last year. Having this variation meant that the experiences at different stages of in-migration were considered. In-migrants who had recently moved had the relocation fresh in their minds, and found it easy to recall their motivations, whereas people who had had time to reflect on their relocation provided more informed views of life in Scotland as an in-migrant and a better insight into their future plans.

Age and life stage of respondent – The respondents were a mixture of single people, couples without children, and couples with children of varying ages. As shown in previous research by System Three (1996), the decision to relocate is often based around ‘life stage’ events.

Gender – Just over half the sample were male.

Where they live now – Scotland has a diverse range of lifestyles to offer. To reflect this it was important that the sample was recruited across the whole of Scotland, encompassing a spread of regions and a mixture of city, town and rural dwellers. Around half of the in-migrants interviewed lived in large cities; just over a quarter were in small cities or towns, and the rest lived rurally. As expected, all post graduates were recruited from cities, most employees were also city based (although a number lived in accessible rural areas), and entrepreneurs were a mixture, with many living rurally.

\textsuperscript{3} In total, 45 households were visited and 55 people interviewed. Where paired depths with partners were conducted, only economically active partners were counted as individuals in the sample. This resulted in 53 in-migrants in the sample.
Where they originated from – In-migrants to Scotland, or for that matter, to any country, come for different reasons. Previous research for Highlands and Islands Enterprise (NFO, 2004) showed differences in motivation to relocate by different origins. Respondents from the rest of the UK were more likely to have been motivated by quality of life considerations while the decisions of returning Scots were more employment-led. Given this, it was important to ensure that the sample reflected different origins. Just over half the respondents interviewed were from overseas, and the rest were a mixture of people from the rest of the UK, and returning Scots.

Types of work: Entrepreneurs – The entrepreneurs recruited had varied working patterns, environments, and were in various industry sectors. This included people in health, bio and material science, media, tourism, retail, and business consultancy. Some ran small companies, and were start-ups, others directed their own larger companies that they had relocated from outwith Scotland.

Employees in different sectors – As employees make up a large proportion of in-migrants it was important to recruit people who were from different backgrounds to reflect the diversity of the group. The employee sub-group included people working in the energy/oil industry, health/biosciences, finance, public sector, education, design and construction.

Post graduates in different sectors – Post graduate students recruited were studying, or had recently finished studying a variety of disciplines. This included engineering, bioscience, humanities, business, and law.

Couples – Given the importance relationships have on the decision to relocate and that it often does not just involve one person, couples were included in the sample. Research of people moving to the Highlands and Islands showed that most relocated to the area in couples, than as single people (NFO, 2004).

Focus groups

Four focus groups were held with in-migrants who had participated in the depth interviews in four locations: Edinburgh, Aberdeen, Glasgow and Inverness. Respondents who had agreed to take part in the focus groups at the individual interview stage were recontacted. The main objectives as set out in the discussion guide were to test emerging findings; generate suggestions for what could be usefully done by the Scottish Executive in relation to managing migration (see Annex 4 for discussion guide).
Limitations of research approach

1.25 Due to the nature of the sample there were a number of limitations to the study that were acknowledged:

- The in-migrants in the sample had all managed to relocate, and were still living in Scotland. Therefore the experiences gathered were likely to be quite positive compared to those who had faced significant barriers and had not gone through with the relocation, and those who had unsuccessful relocations and not stayed on. However, length of time since relocation ranged from just a few months to more than five years, offering a good breadth of experiences.

- The sample members were all English speaking, though not always as a first language. This meant that language was rarely identified as a strong barrier, which is probably not reflective of the in-migrant population as a whole.

- Virtually all in-migrants recruited to participate were contributing to the Scottish economy; therefore this study does not cover the experiences of in-migrants who are economically inactive.

Report structure

1.27 This report offers an analysis of why people choose to relocate to Scotland. This is done using a framework of four typologies of in-migrants that emerged from the research; these are Pragmatists, World Citizens, Lifestage Returners, and Lifestyle Pursuers. These four typologies are referred to throughout the report and are explained in detail in Chapter 2, along with an analysis of motivations to relocate. Chapter 3 reviews the knowledge and perceptions of in-migrants prior to moving to Scotland, and their awareness and knowledge of the Fresh Talent Initiative. Chapter 4 reviews the barriers to settling in and staying on as experienced by in-migrants, and Chapter 5 focuses on those factors that made their relocation easier and what encourages them to stay on. Chapter 6 considers the scope for further attraction and retention of in-migrants by raising some important questions for the Fresh Talent Initiative, and also offers some practical recommendations for encouraging and retaining in-migrants.
CHAPTER TWO  MOTIVATIONS FOR RELOCATING TO SCOTLAND

Introduction

2.1 This chapter examines the motivations for relocating to Scotland among the different groups included in the study. The first section examines the key reasons driving the relocation decision and categorises respondents into a typology based on reasons for relocating. These typologies are unique to this research. The location decisions by economic sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates are also considered, as well as from the perspective of the origins of in-migrants.

Reasons for relocating to Scotland

2.2 As with most decisions, particularly the larger life changing ones, there are different stages to the decision making process, beginning with some kind of catalyst for change and leading through to final actions. For many in-migrants Scotland – as a country, a concept or a culture – did not necessarily appear in the first stages of decision making, but emerged as more important further into the process.

2.3 On the whole, as well as being secondary in the timeline of the decision making process, lifestyle and cultural factors relating to Scotland were also very much secondary in importance. In fact, with the exception of a small minority of cases, decisions were made in relation to economic factors with post-rationalisation of the decision relating to positive factors of living (and often staying) in Scotland. This finding supports the arguments of Harrison which propose that the availability of economic opportunities take precedence over location in the decision making process (Harrison et al, 2003).

2.4 For many overseas in-migrants, Scottish separateness from the UK had been a very minor issue or, in many cases, Scotland had not actually been considered as a separate entity within the UK, especially in the early stages of decision making. For those coming from the rest of the UK, Scotland was seen as a separate entity, but more as an alternative to where they came from than a completely different country. However, some in-migrants did express surprise at the differences experienced, as reported in Chapter 4.
Key Reasons for relocating

2.5 The key reasons driving the relocation amongst the respondents were:

- Employment and economic opportunities
- Higher education
- Proximity of family
- Lifestyle – pace or interests
- Return to roots

Generally, the key initial driving factor tended to be economic or education related but then secondary factors associated with lifestyle, culture and friends and family were considered. There were however a minority for whom the latter issues were more important drivers than the former. This is considered in more detail below.

Typology of in-migrants

2.6 The Fresh Talent Initiative focusses on three economic status groups: entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates. This research study found that within these groups there were significant differences in motivations for relocating to Scotland. Although not everyone fits neatly into a classification – in some cases there were slightly different motivations within a household – it was possible to categorise in-migrants into a useful typology which demonstrates the key initial drivers for relocation. The four groups that emerged from this study were:

- Pragmatists
- World Citizens
- Lifestage Returners
- Lifestyle Pursuers

Each typology, and their motivations for relocating to Scotland are expended upon below.

Pragmatists

2.7 These were in-migrants who relocated for an economic or educational purpose and for whom Scotland as a location was secondary. A number of entrepreneurs who were offered funding by Scottish public bodies fell into this typology, as did many employees who were offered jobs in Scotland. Most post graduates fitted into this category as they were relocating for educational purposes, rather than any desire to live in Scotland specifically. An example, of a Pragmatist is an employee who moved from overseas who when asked about why he chose Scotland said:
“I had interviews here, I had interviews there, but this was a better interview. It's that simple.” (An employee from overseas)

Other Pragmatists described Scotland as a location as “irrelevant”; they were clearly coming for the economic opportunity as opposed to the place.

2.8 There were differences between Pragmatists from the UK and those from overseas. Many from overseas were actively seeking a position in the UK, and Scotland as a final location was incidental. For example, one employee from overseas said:

“We were looking for a place in the UK but there was an opportunity here that just opened up – it was the opportunity rather than Scotland itself.” (An employee from overseas)

2.9 Although a number of Pragmatists were part of what Florida would call the creative class (2002), their motivations for relocating to Scotland were not driven by an attraction to be with similar people. Rather they were following economic opportunities. Although this was a qualitative study, and the sample were not chosen representatively, more in-migrants fell into this typology than any other. This suggests that the experience of in-migrants moving to Scotland is closer to Harrison et al’s research than the Florida argument. Harrison et al argue that people are attracted by suitable economic opportunities over similarly creative people (Harrison et al, 2003).

2.10 Pragmatists – Typology Summary

- Key driver for relocating was economic/educational purposes
- Scotland as a location was secondary in their decision
- Had realistic expectations of life in Scotland
- Faced some barriers in settling in; but often not significant
- Generally undecided as to whether they would stay on, but were often happy in current situation

World Citizens

2.11 Generally, those within this group relocated to Scotland because of an opportunity offered by an employer, and their key reason for relocating was the career opportunity and life experience. The defining difference between this and the Pragmatist typology was a tendency to have lived and worked in several countries or locations, often for the same organisation or type of organisation (often large multi-nationals). This group were the least likely to view their move to Scotland as permanent.
2.12 World Citizens are similar to Boyle and Motherwell’s ‘Tumbleweeds’ in their research on the Irish in-migration experience, in that they were very footloose and got a ‘buzz’ from new adventures and traveling (2005). However, their choice to live in Scotland was principally shaped by career ambitions, unlike the Tumbleweeds. The Tumbleweeds Boyle and Motherwell discuss, no doubt exist in the Scottish experience, however the jobs that they did which characterised them and were somewhat incidental to their travel experiences, such as bar work, were not covered in the interviews conducted.

2.13 World Citizens – Typology Summary

- Key driver for relocating was life experience of living in another country through employment/academic opportunity
- Had lived and worked in several different countries
- Did not face many barriers to settling in
- Most likely to see move to Scotland as non-permanent
- Often had thoughts on where they might relocate to next

**Lifestage Returners**

2.14 Lifestage Returners were those born and brought up in Scotland who moved to other locations, within the UK or overseas, to pursue educational or career opportunities and who have returned to Scotland. The main driver for returning was generally family reasons – either to be near their own families or for their children to experience being brought up in Scotland. Returners without children were often moving back to be near friends and family. Returners with children were often moving back so that their children could be near older family members, and grow up in an environment they were familiar with.

2.15 Examples of Lifestage Returners included an employee who had moved to London to kick start a career in the legal profession. After a few successful years, he decided it was time to return to be nearer friends and family. Similarly, a couple from Aberdeen spent several years working abroad for a large multi-national organisation. The decision to return to Scotland was largely driven by the fact that they had had children:

“We felt our children knew nothing about Scotland...we wanted them to have somewhere that they might be able to call home because up until that point in time they very definitely didn’t. We also felt it was time to touch base again with home, in particular with ageing parents.” (A couple returning from overseas)
2.15  **Lifestage Returners – Typology Summary**

- Born and brought up in Scotland; key driver was location
- Left to pursue educational or career opportunities
- Returning to Scotland for ‘lifestage’ reasons
  - To be nearer family and friends
  - To bring up own family in Scotland
- Often had unmet expectations of life ‘back home’ and faced barriers to settling in

---

**Lifestyle Pursuers**

2.16  This group were people who had relocated specifically for a change of lifestyle, whether a ‘rural idyll’ or merely a ‘slower or different’ pace of life, and who did not have previous family connections in Scotland. In-migrants coming from the rest of the UK were more often in this group than those from overseas.

2.17  There were two types of Lifestyle Pursuers: those for which Scotland specifically as a location was a key driver (mainly from previous holidays), and those who were driven by a lifestyle dream that Scotland coincidentally offered. The minority specifically chose Scotland whilst others considered a range of options within the UK. For example, a couple moving with their family from South West England were pursuing a location that would offer them a quieter lifestyle:

  “*Our first option was Devon but it was just twice as expensive...Then we were looking at South Wales ... Then we came up here and had a look up here...and decided straight away.*”

2.18  For those within this group, there often appeared to be a ‘push’ from their previous location rather than a specific ‘pull’ to Scotland. This group strongly supports Harrison *et al*’s argument that the decision to move from a previous location precedes the consideration of the place to relocate to (2003). This was particularly true of those coming from London and South East England. When consulted in the focus groups, in-migrants identified with this typology:

  “*I did experience a push from my previous location. I was living in the centre of London and it was just too crowded and noisy and I was paying a fortune for a flat.*”  (Edinburgh focus group – employee from the South East)
2.19 **Lifestyle Pursuers – Typology Summary**

- Key driver for relocating was pursuing a change in lifestyle, therefore location important
- Often from the rest of the UK
- Two types of Lifestyle Pursuers
  - Knew Scotland and were pursuing that dream specifically
  - Wanted a change in lifestyle and Scotland fitted into their dream
- Experienced a ‘push’ from their previous location over a ‘pull’ to Scotland
- Often relocated without economic opportunities organised
- Disappointed with local job markets and therefore sometimes dissatisfied with the move

**Summary of typologies**

2.20 One of the key variables between the different groups in the typology is the weight that *location* had in the decision making process. For some (Lifestage Returners and Lifestyle Pursuers), location is a key driver while for others (Pragmatists and World Citizens) location came further down the line and was certainly less important than an economic opportunity for making the move.

2.21 Although this is essentially a qualitative study, more respondents displayed the characteristics of Pragmatists than any other typology. This means that, as suggested above, Scotland *per se* is not a key factor driving the initial relocation decisions of many in-migrants, apart from those with previous family ties or roots to the country. This would suggest that at present, the Scottish experience does not reflect Florida’s description of a country that attracts creative classes who are attracted to places by human capital (2002). Our findings reflect Harrison *et al*’s assertion that:

> "...the nature of the ‘job’ appears to take precedence over the ‘place’ in the decision of individuals to move, or return, to Scotland." (Harrison *et al*, 2003)

**Motivations by economic sub-groups**

The Scottish Executive is interested in relocation issues for three economic sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates. The motivations of these groups are considered in detail below. Due to the lack of homogeneity in motivations for relocating within each group, the above typologies may better define in-migrants.
Entrepreneurs

2.22 There was some diversity in the motivations for relocating for the entrepreneurs in this study. Firstly, there were those who had been approached by public bodies, and were motivated by the business incentives offered in Scotland. These were very much the Pragmatists or World Citizens, and had not previously expressed any great desire to live in Scotland. This group were all very satisfied with their experience of relocation. Secondly, there were in-migrants who had moved to Scotland for lifestyle factors, and subsequently became entrepreneurs. They fell into the Lifestyle Pursuer category to a great extent; there were also some Lifestage Returners. The decision to set up their own business was mainly in response to not being able to find suitable employments. Maybe attributable to this, their experience of being an entrepreneur, and of relocation, was not as favourable.

Employees

2.23 There was a broad range of motivations to relocating to Scotland for the employees in this study. Of the three economic sub-groups, employees had the least homogeneity in motivations. Within the typology framework, there were employees within each category. For Pragmatists and World Citizens, most of the Lifestage Returners who had been economically motivated to move, they had their jobs organised before they relocated. For the Lifestyle Pursuers it tended to be the case that they had come from the UK and sought work once they had made the move. This included highly skilled people who made assumptions that they would easily be able to find work post relocation, with an awareness that they would have to compromise on salary. However, for a number, the economic opportunities were not as abundant as hoped for, and there was evident dissatisfaction with their situation.

Post graduates

2.24 There was little diversity in the motivations of post graduates relocating to Scotland. They nearly all did so because of the academic reputation of the university they attended. There was little evidence of a pull to Scotland because of location specifically, although a few did mention that they chose Scotland over England because of the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme which allowed them to continue working in the country after graduation. However, for those coming from overseas, they were pulled by factors related to the UK as a whole (as outlined above). Due to this, nearly all post graduates fall into the Pragmatist typology.

2.25 Amongst post graduates interviewed who had finished studying in Scotland, there was a mixture of those in employment who were satisfied and those who were not. Those who were satisfied, had progressed into academic fields within Scotland – they were a mixture of English and overseas in-migrants. Those who were dissatisfied were in unsuitable employment and felt frustrated at the lack of economic opportunities
available to them; this included some people on the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme.

It is clear that there are key differences in motivations for in-migrants depending on where they have relocated from. The differences between those coming from overseas, the rest of the UK, and as returners, are considered below.

**Location decision by origin of in-migrants**

**In-migrants from overseas**

*Choosing the UK*

2.26 Amongst those relocating from overseas, the UK as a whole was a key factor influencing location decisions. As discussed above, the decision to relocate to Scotland was, in many cases, made for respondents who were looking for an economic opportunity when the best opportunity arose in Scotland. However, for those who had not previously resided in the UK, there were some specific key ‘pull’ factors – with the most important being:

- The dominance of the English language
- The importance of the UK as an economic power
- Life opportunities compared with country of birth, including schooling
- Work/visa opportunities for EU citizens
- Academic reputation of universities

*Choosing Scotland*

2.27 For those who had decided on the UK but had to make a location choice within the UK and chose Scotland, the decisions again were largely pragmatic and opportunity based with few making decisions on a cultural or similar basis. Some had not even considered that there were differences between Scotland and the rest of the UK:

“...from the outside, you always consider the UK as a general – you don’t consider England as something and Scotland as something. Once you’ve been here it is clear there are differences...” (An entrepreneur from overseas)

2.28 There were, however, some key ‘pull’ factors seen as important in choosing between, for example, Manchester and Glasgow or Reading and Aberdeen. Some of the main ‘pull’ factors of Scotland within the UK context were:

- Perceived quality and good reputation of some specific higher education academic institutions (particularly among overseas post graduate students)
- The control or research centres for certain industries including oil, chemical, life sciences and finance for all three sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates
• The Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme
• Some public sector run schemes and initiatives for entrepreneurs and employees

2.29 Examples of how these ‘pull’ factors influenced the location decisions of some overseas locaters include:

“I think the education in the UK is good – better than some other European countries. I applied to some in Scotland and some in England but when I looked at the history of Aberdeen University I think this is better so I decided on Scotland.” (A post graduate from overseas)

“It is the oil capital of Europe and our company has a big base here.” (A returner from overseas)

“If I could have got a job in London and a visa, I would have lived there permanently but here I have the Scottish Fresh Talent visa.” (A post graduate from overseas)

“It was the Talent Scotland website where I originally found the job attachment and to be honest the location was almost irrelevant.” (An employee, previously living in the USA, from England)

**In-migrants from the UK**

2.30 There were some cultural, political or lifestyle factors suggested as specific pulls towards Scotland within the UK context. For example:

• Positive perceptions of lifestyle – slower, more relaxed
• Less traffic
• Good public services – particularly education
• Reduced cost of living – particularly compared with South East England

2.31 Even among those relocating to Scotland from within the UK, the majority had not consciously made a distinction between Scotland and the rest of the UK in their decision making process. For example, the main location criteria for a prospective post graduate student who was looking for a university to undertake her PhD, was to be north of the Midlands. In another example, an entrepreneur had made a conscious decision to move to a rural location in order to enter the hospitality industry and seriously considered parts of Wales and England before settling on the Scottish Borders. Similarly, another entrepreneur now based in rural Scotland said about the process, “We started looking all over the place – Dorset, Cornwall.”
2.32 A few of the UK in-migrants with no previous family connection with Scotland had a real desire to live in Scotland owing largely to childhood or young adult holidays taken in the country. However, even among those with a desire to live in Scotland, it was more likely to be specific locations within Scotland rather than Scotland per se:

“I had kind of decided I would move to Edinburgh ... Obviously my past experience of visiting. I have probably never been to a city anywhere else that is like here.” (An employee from England)

Returning Scots

2.33 Those with existing connections with Scotland had broadly similar reasons for returning. Like most in-migrants, the location was, to a certain extent, the second part of the decision making process, but was more important once a relocation decision had been made. There were very strong wishes to ‘return to roots’ and particularly to expose children used to living outwith Scotland to Scottish culture and way of life.

2.34 Key pull factors for returners were:

- Perceptions of lifestyle – slower, more relaxed and safer

  “I think the kids were the big drive to be honest, we didn’t want to bring the kids up in a South East environment...There was crime ... I didn’t feel it was the right place for them. I was brought up in the central belt of Scotland in the middle of the sticks and know that having freedom as a child is something to cherish.” (A couple from South East England)

- Family ties and the wish for children to experience their own culture

  “We got to the stage when we felt our children knew nothing about Scotland and we wanted them to know about their cultural background.” (An employee returning from overseas)

- Some public sector run schemes and initiatives for entrepreneurs and employees

  “We were applying for a Smart Grant in England and they put a cap on it so we decided to apply to Smart in Scotland. So basically we decided to set the business up in Scotland.” (An entrepreneur returning from South East England)

2.35 These respondents had not previously been considering locating to Scotland (despite one of them originally being from Scotland) – they had been looking at other locations such as Wales, Cumbria and Northumbria. Had the funding opportunity in Scotland not emerged, they would not have considered Scotland. However, once the
opportunity arose and they looked at Scotland in detail, they noted some key benefits not previously considered – in particular, the cost of premises was considerably cheaper than in the other locations they had considered.

**Conclusions**

2.36 For many in-migrants, the decision to relocate was often made in relation to economic factors. Lifestyle factors relating to Scotland were often secondary in the decision making process.

2.37 The motivations to relocate to Scotland of the in-migrants were used to develop a typology framework. The 4 typologies and the motivations that epitomise them are:

- Pragmatists – economic opportunities
- World Citizens – economic opportunities and experience of another country
- Lifestage Returners – family connections
- Lifestyle Pursuers – changes in lifestyle

2.38 Motivations by the economic sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates interviewed in this study were considered:

- Entrepreneurs motivations for relocating were split by those who were helped to relocate their business to Scotland via the public sector, and those who set up a business out of economic necessity. The former group were more commonly Pragmatists and World Citizens, where the latter group were Lifestyle Pursuers.
- Of the three sub-groups there was most variation in terms of motivations for relocation amongst the employees.
- The post graduates had the most homogeneity in motivation; that being the academic reputation of the university they attended. However, there was little differentiation between Scotland and the UK as a whole.

2.39 This chapter also highlights the differences between relocation motivations according to origin of in-migrants. The main findings were:
• Those coming from overseas were attracted to the UK as a whole more than Scotland *per se*. Choosing Scotland largely came down to pragmatic reasons.

• Those from the rest of the UK also made little distinction between Scotland and the UK as a whole. However, lifestyle factors played more of a role in their decision making process than those from overseas.

• Amongst returning Scots, family connections in terms of going back to older family and bringing up younger family in Scotland were the most salient motivators.
CHAPTER THREE KNOWLEDGE AND EXPECTATIONS PRE-RELOCATION

Introduction

3.1 From the in-migrants interviewed in this study, it was apparent that the depth, source and extent of their knowledge of Scotland varied drastically. This chapter looks at the perceptions and knowledge that were behind the decisions to relocate. It begins by considering the sources and extent of knowledge of in-migrants pre-relocation. It then looks at actual perceptions of Scotland pre-relocation. The focus is then turned to in-migrants’ awareness of the Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative.

Sources and extent of knowledge of Scotland

3.2 The extent to which individuals had previously visited or had any contact with Scotland varied considerably. On the one hand, some in-migrants had never visited Scotland or the UK, whereas others had worked or lived in the country for a period of time, and others still were returning to their place of birth. As shown in the following sections, respondents’ knowledge was often linked to their motivations for coming – on the whole overseas Pragmatists and World Citizens (who had not lived in Scotland before) tended to have less knowledge of Scotland than Lifestyle Pursuers, and obviously Lifestage Returners.

3.3 Whilst all in-migrants interviewed coming from the UK had previously visited Scotland and experienced it firsthand, for many overseas in-migrants a key source of their knowledge was secondary and informal through word of mouth; these two groups are considered individually below. Generally, post graduate students from overseas had very little prior knowledge of, and contact with Scotland, compared to the knowledge of employees and entrepreneurs; they are also considered separately.

In-migrants from the UK

Regular holidays

3.4 A number had spent many holidays in Scotland. For these in-migrants, their relocation was largely based on the perceptions of the country from their visits; evidently holidaying in Scotland had made a positive impression on them. This group of in-migrants mainly fell into the Lifestyle Pursuers typology. A number of examples were given from people who had holidayed in Scotland’s cities and from others who had enjoyed its rural areas. Many Lifestyle Pursuers coming from the UK who had extensively visited Scotland on holiday felt that they knew the particular area they had visited very well; however, when they made the move, the reality was different:
“I always used the phrase...I am moving from home to home really. I think I conned myself because I didn’t know it all that well.” (An employee from England)

This may occur because visiting a place on holiday does not offer the same experience that relocating and settling in do. Common problems faced post-relocation by these in-migrants was a perceived lack of employment or business opportunities, and difficulties adjusting to the new lifestyle (these are explored further in Chapter 4).

**Visiting friends**

Many in-migrants from other parts of the UK, had never lived permanently in Scotland, but had friends in Scotland, and this connection attracted them to relocate. For example, an employee who relocated to Glasgow from London used to visit friends in the city once a month. He really enjoyed his time there and so decided to look for a job and relocate. Although he was a Lifestyle Pursuer, his personal connection to Scotland greatly assisted his ability to settle in easily.

**One-off visits**

3.5 Not all in-migrants from England knew that much about Scotland. A few had only visited once prior to moving. In one example, an entrepreneur and her partner happened to stumble across a business they were attracted to and despite having limited knowledge of the location or country, decided to relocate. When asked what she knew of Scotland prior to the move, she replied, “Nothing. I didn’t even know where Aberdeen was!” This in-migrant had no real desire to move to Scotland in particular, but more to move to a rural area; knowledge of the area or country she was moving to was less important than the feeling of the place being right. This is typical of one type of Lifestyle Pursuer where Scotland conformed to aspirations.

**In-migrants from overseas**

3.6 On the whole, the knowledge of overseas in-migrants of life in Scotland was limited. For those who had not visited Scotland, they often had a general impression of life in the UK, or England from word of mouth, rather than Scotland specifically. Others had received information from universities or relocation agencies; conducted self-directed research, or had some existing background knowledge. There were also in-migrants from overseas who had visited Scotland beforehand either on holiday or work. Each of these sources is considered below.

**Word of mouth**

3.7 The main source of knowledge for many overseas in-migrants was word of mouth. To many Pragmatists, the location was somewhat incidental to their move, thus they did not require a thorough knowledge of the location. Often they were given information informally from work colleagues. Others spoke to friends and family:
“I talked to people who had relocated, people in my company who had already been in London...I talked to friends who’d been here, co-workers who’d visited on holidays, things like that.” (An employee from the USA)

Most post graduates from overseas had gained information on their current university through their previous one. Knowledge of the university was of more importance than knowledge of the location they were moving to.

3.8 Other post graduates gained knowledge of their university through foreign exchange students they had met in their home country. For example, one post graduate from France had met students from the Scottish university she ended up attending through a foreign exchange scheme. Another student from China had friends who had previously undertaken exchanges to Scotland. She said that she had looked at photographs they had taken and brochures they had brought back with them before deciding to relocate. It is evident that the positive experience of others’ resonates within tight-knit communities, such as academia.

Support services

3.9 A number of services exist to inform people about life in Scotland. The recently established Relocation Advisory Service, part of the Fresh Talent Initiative, is one example. Although not specifically asked, no respondent in this study said they had contacted the service.

3.10 Services used prior to moving included relocation agencies and international student associations at universities. A post graduate sponsored by an employer, gained useful knowledge from a relocation agency that assisted with the move:

“...they brought us here for four days...to explain more about this programme, to show us a little bit of the city, to show us the university and they gave us a lot of information about all the things we can do in Edinburgh.” (A post graduate from Mexico)

Other post graduate students reported that their universities sent brochures and welcome packs pre-relocation. One post graduate from India contacted the Indian Student Association at her new university to ask about the practicalities of living in Scotland. They provided advice such as what items she should bring from India, and what she should wait to buy in Scotland, which she found very useful. One post graduate from Malaysia said that she had attended an annual British Education Fair in her home country. This provided her with information on universities across the UK; she picked a Scottish university on the strength of its reputation.

Self-directed research

3.11 A few Pragmatists who had never visited Scotland carried out quite extensive research before deciding on the move. For example, an in-migrant relocating to Aberdeen researched population data to determine how quiet the city was. Another in-
migrant relocating from the USA conducted internet research on the weather, cost of living, and culture. For a few post graduates who had either no, or very limited contact with Scotland, they carried out extensive research on the internet – both on universities and location. One student moving from India to Glasgow reported that she used the internet to find out about the weather, language and appropriate clothing.

**Previous work experiences**

3.12 Some in-migrants from overseas had spent time working in Scotland before relocating. In these cases, their positive experiences influenced their decision to relocate again. One respondent said, “I just felt very much at home in Scotland.” Similarly, an entrepreneur from the USA who had previously visited Inverness with work was very impressed with the area. Once he saw an opportunity to return, he did so with the firsthand opinion that it was “beautiful and safe.”

**One-off visits**

3.13 In many cases, individuals who had moved to take up employment had not visited until they were offered the job. This was often the case for Pragmatists who had never previously considered living in Scotland until the job opportunity arose. For one respondent the decision to move to Scotland was based on one visit even though he said he “wasn’t considering Scotland initially.” In another example, an employee from the USA was offered a relocation to Scotland from her company and given a holiday to the country to make the decision:

“A lot of the people I met when I was on holiday were really friendly and it went so smoothly…everything was new and exciting and I just thought wow, I could have two years of adventure if I came over here.” (An employee from the USA)

**Existing background knowledge**

3.14 A few in-migrants from overseas demonstrated knowledge of aspects of Scotland from what they had been taught in school and university. A number of individuals mentioned learning about the architecture, history of industry, and geography of Scotland. Others who had no direct contact with Scotland mentioned that some of their knowledge came from watching films such as Braveheart and Rob Roy, or Bollywood movies filmed in Scotland.

**No knowledge**

3.15 Although the majority of individuals either had some previous contact with Scotland or had gained some information before the move, some respondents had minimal knowledge about living in Scotland. They sometimes did not have any preconceived notions of Scotland as a place to live, as they had never considered it before they were provided with the job opportunity:

“It was mostly a touristic place rather than a place to consider working and living in. It was a bit weird to think about it at the beginning.” (An employee from Israel)
Perceptions of Scotland

Having considered in-migrants’ extent and depth of knowledge of life in Scotland prior to relocation, attention is now turned to their specific perceptions.

Perceptions of the cost of living

3.16 Perceptions of the cost of living differed by where in-migrants had relocated from. In-migrants coming from other parts of the UK expected it to be less expensive. Those coming from overseas generally expected it to be more expensive than their home country.

UK in-migrants

3.17 People moving to Scotland from the rest of the UK often visited the place they were moving to in order to gain an indication of how much it would cost to rent a property in different areas. Others spoke extensively to people who lived in the area they were moving to, and found out about prices in supermarkets or the prices of drinks in pubs etc. Some in-migrants discovered that although their salary would be less, the cost of property and groceries etc. was also less.

Overseas in-migrants

3.18 Many individuals moving to Scotland from overseas had a firmly held belief, without doing any research, that the cost of living would be higher than in their home country. Some in-migrants who had come for employment said that they had researched the cost of living on the internet before relocating as they had to consider their proposed salary and whether it would be financially viable to live in Scotland. An employee in the education sector moving from the USA learned that her cost of living would double while living in Scotland – although this did not deter her from making the move.

Post-graduate students

3.19 Many students relocating to Scotland from overseas worried about how they would manage financially prior to the move, especially those who had no previous experience of Scotland. A post graduate student moving from Malaysia with her husband was warned by a relative that it would be expensive. She realised the cost of living for her family would be higher than in her home country. However, she still made the move, and once relocated, adopted a stoic attitude towards the higher costs. This was common for overseas post graduate students, especially those from outside the European Union. The same student said:

“When we come here it’s really back down to basic, we can’t be picky on nothing so we have to accept those things and as you can see those are the emotional and psychological things that we have to struggle with and to be strong and say don’t worry, it’s not too long, finish off and then we can go home.”
Some students were not concerned with the cost of living, as their parents were funding their education in Scotland.

**Perceptions of economic opportunities**

3.20 There were mixed perceptions of economic opportunities available in Scotland. Prior to the move, many respondents had already organised economic opportunities and hence, did not think about whether they would have to look for work. Those moving from the rest of the UK without arranged employment (Lifestyle Pursuers) reported that they were aware that they may have to accept a lower salary and that the job market would be more limited than what they were used to.

3.21 Pragmatists and World Citizens who had prior employment arranged recognised that although they had good job prospects at the moment, this might not always be the case. That is, they may reach a point where they could not progress any further with their career in the Scottish job market and so would be forced to move away.

3.22 In terms of job prospects, those moving from South East England worried that there would not be many jobs available in their chosen field. This seemed to be linked to perceptions of Scotland as a small country with few sectors and as one in-migrant stated “a stagnant economy”.

3.23 There were some mixed responses from in-migrants coming from overseas. There did appear to be a general perception that job opportunities were limited in Scotland, especially in specific sectors. However, after conducting some research, some reported that this was not always the case:

“I was quite surprised after doing a bit of research how many companies are actually operating in the biotechnology sector...My initial thinking was it would be very hard, whereas I think it is very easy to find a job if you know where the right opportunities are.”

(An employee from overseas)

3.24 Entrepreneurs who had moved to start up their own businesses and had support from public sector agencies felt that certain areas in Scotland were proactive and supportive of new business activity. Those entrepreneurs who had been involved with initiatives to encourage businesses to move to Scotland were very encouraging of the support they had received.

**Perceptions of universities and academic reputation**

3.25 In-migrants’ perception of the standard of universities in Scotland was very high. The reputation of the universities was the reason that most students from
overseas moved to Scotland. For example, a research scientist who relocated from Brazil had a very high opinion of Glasgow University, and was very impressed by the brochures sent to her which provided information on the city and student accommodation. Another student from the USA applied to 5 different universities internationally. One was Edinburgh University on the strength of its reputation; when asked how she knew of its reputation she replied:

“...you ask your own university like, do people consider Edinburgh good or not...you think about where your supervisors want you to go, where they don’t want you to go, and then you think about where you can go, who has programs...” (Post graduate from the USA)

3.26 As expected, some post graduates were specifically attracted to their university on the strength of certain academic departments. A post graduate from the north of England attended Dundee University as he rated it very highly:

“I knew it would be a very good institution with an international reputation and it sort of gave me very good prospects for my future career, as in going over to the States.” (Post graduate from England)

**Perceptions of the quality of life in Scotland**

3.27 Generally, in-migrants relocating to Scotland expected to gain an improved quality of life. Many mentioned they were attracted by the laidback pace of life Scotland seemed to offer, however, this obviously depended on where they had relocated from. Factors commonly mentioned were:

- Lack of traffic and ease of commuting
- Access to outdoor activities and the countryside
- Beautiful countryside
- The weather (pros and cons)

**Lack of traffic and ease of commuting**

3.28 In-migrants from the rest of the UK often talked about how they were enticed by less traffic and less pollution than where they had come from. Changes in commuting habits were a particularly important consideration for those from London; this was thought to substantially improve their quality of life:

“You don’t get such a bad commute as what you do further down south...I don’t have to spend 2 or 3 hours in traffic to get somewhere... Also...there is plenty of parking.” (An employee from London)

**Access to outdoor activities and the countryside**

3.29 One factor which influenced some individuals to move to Scotland both from overseas and other parts of the UK was the easy access to outdoor activities:
“...hobby wise it has got plenty of activities that I can do. I am an outside person myself and Scotland offers the perfect opportunity to pursue those hobbies.” (A post graduate from overseas)

In-migrants in cities also thought it would be easy to take part in outdoor sports, due to having increased access to the countryside.

**Beautiful countryside**

3.30 Most in-migrants often spoke about how they expected Scotland to have very beautiful countryside, with a wonderful sense of space and freedom. It was abundantly apparent that Scotland had a very good reputation for being a very aesthetically pleasing country:

“I thought it was absolutely amazing and beautiful, I had seen a few pictures and the movies and many of my friends who have been here on vacations have said that Scotland is the most beautiful country in the whole of UK.” (An employee from India)

One couple from the USA had a very romantic notion of Scotland, and acknowledged this was based simply on watching films set in Scotland:

“I think we had the romantic view, we pictured ourselves trooping on the moors, whatever that looked like.” (An entrepreneur couple from the USA)

**The weather (pros and cons)**

3.31 Nearly all in-migrants mentioned apprehensions about Scottish weather, expecting it to be very cold and wet. People had this perception from watching television and films set in Scotland, and word of mouth. This was consistently mentioned by individuals from overseas, including some returners, and was a real issue for some who thought that their quality of life would be affected by it:

“I would find it more challenging than some of the other places that I had been in...And I think initially my wife was worried - she doesn’t like the cold and the dark so it takes some adjusting.” (A returner from overseas)

Some in-migrants did see positive benefits in Scotland’s climate however; people who were from, or had been living in extremely hot places such as India or Dubai appreciated the fact that it was much more comfortable to be outside in Scotland, giving more scope to enjoy outdoor activities for them and their families.
Perceptions of safety

3.32 On the whole, in-migrants thought that Scotland would be a safe place to live in. Perceptions of low levels of crime were expressed for those moving to more rural locations, and for a few, especially Lifestage Returners this was a motivation for relocating. Worries about safety were acutely expressed by those relocating to Glasgow. In contrast, Edinburgh had a much more favourable reputation. When prompted, both these images had been formed mainly from the media and word of mouth. For example, an employee from London said that his friends warned him not to move to Glasgow, as they had heard negative things about the city. This perception of Glasgow was also present among individuals from overseas:

“I’ve actually got family coming from Germany to spend Christmas with us and my aunt phoned me and said ‘I’ve heard that Glasgow is high in crime - are you sure we should be coming?’” (An employee from France)

This view was also shared by a couple who relocated from the USA to start up a business and had not decided where in the Central Belt they would settle. When they moved, they were advised by most people they spoke to, to live in Edinburgh. However, upon visiting Glasgow they were so impressed by the cultural opportunities on offer, they settled there.

Perceptions of Scottish people

Overall, individuals from both overseas and other parts of the UK had very positive perceptions of Scottish people.

In-migrants from overseas

3.33 Overseas in-migrants who had researched Scotland or who had had previous contact with Scottish people said that they expected them to be warm, welcoming, friendly, and open. A post graduate from China said that she relocated to Scotland rather than England, as she had heard that the English were cold and unfriendly whereas Scots were warm and welcoming.

3.34 An in-migrant from India commented that he had heard from friends that Scotland, and the UK as a whole, was not a racist country as people are unbiased and that they “treat people like their own”. However, some from overseas had heard negative comments about racial attitudes. For example, one post graduate who moved from France had not been given positive information about people in the UK as a whole. Similarly, an asylum seeker who had moved from Africa had heard that the people in Glasgow were very racist and was worried about moving.
In-migrants from the rest of the UK

3.35 On the whole, perceptions of Scottish people from those coming from the rest of the UK were positive. More so than amongst those coming from overseas, perceptions of Scottish people were linked to the area where individuals were relocating to. An in-migrant moving to Inverness expected people to be friendly, trusting, and talkative. He also expected there to be a real sense of community in the town.

3.36 There were one or two concerns that attitudes in Scotland would be somewhat old fashioned and traditional. For example, one couple had been worried that people would disapprove of them as they were an unmarried couple who were cohabiting, but they discovered that this did not present any difficulties. Some individuals were aware of the stereotypes of Scottish people:

“Scottish people are not the people who wear these kilts and haggis type hats and get drunk all the time and drink Irn Bru...I didn’t expect that from 100% of the Scottish population but I don’t think I have ever, ever seen that scenario.” (An employee from England)

3.37 Some in-migrants relocating from England had a perception that Scottish people may be anti-English, or that they would be simply wary of ‘incomers’. For example, an entrepreneur relocating from Devon had heard that Scottish people could be unwelcoming towards English people who relocated. She had not previously considered this to be an issue, and did not let it affect her decision to move to rural Scotland. It was reported that these feelings were more likely to be directed towards middle class, southern English people. However, this was not commonly reported, and the extent to which it was a problem is considered in Chapter 5.

Perceptions of location

3.38 Expectations of specific locations were often related to the type of area in-migrants were relocating to, rather than related to Scotland in particular. For example, one couple moving to rural Scotland had a very clear idea of what they thought life would be like, and this perception was related to the rurality of the area:

“A community that kind of wants to know what you’re doing and would be there to help you if they needed to...they’ll walk to school, people in and out of your house, collecting wood...the sense of community and the freedom, the outdoor activities, the seemingly lack of need for material stuff.” (A couple from South East England)

3.39 Perceptions of Scottish cities were somewhat different. For example, many students from both overseas and other parts of the UK were keen to attend universities in Glasgow and Edinburgh as they liked the idea of the busy cities. Generally, the cities in Scotland seemed to have a good reputation for nightlife. Thus, many younger people were excited about going out a lot, socialising, and discovering the new city.
3.40 A few in-migrants observed that Scotland’s cities turned out to be smaller than they had expected; for example, a few in-migrants in Edinburgh said that there was the sense that they recognised most people in their work or academic field, and their areas of personal interest, and that there might be a limited pool of people to get to know.

**Perceptions of the working environment**

3.41 Most employees did not expect the working environment in Scotland to be very different from what they were used to. The following quote from an employee who had relocated from overseas and worked for a multi-national company illustrates this perception:

“...no matter where in the world I go...when you are in an office it doesn’t really matter where you are, the kind of work culture is much the same. The national culture may differ slightly but in the office because of our multinational flavour we tend to be very mixed up wherever we are.” (An employee from overseas)

Some respondents reported positive workplace experiences in the past with Scottish colleagues:

“The impression I had of them are they are very easy going...the ones I have met were warm people, perhaps less reserved than some of the people you meet in the south.” (An employee from overseas)

The perception that the UK as a whole had a meritocratic work culture was mentioned by one professional coming from overseas.

**Awareness of the Fresh Talent Initiative**

**Overall awareness of the Initiative**

3.42 In-migrants and the organisations that had contact with them were asked about their awareness of the Fresh Talent Initiative. Few of the in-migrants interviewed in

---

4 In February 2004, First Minister, Jack McConnell, launched the Fresh Talent Initiative. It consisted of the following 4 strands (Scottish Executive, 2004):

- A Relocation Advisory Service to assist and advise those who wish to live and work in Scotland
- Measures to actively promote Scotland as a destination for people seeking to use the work permit route to come into the UK
- To allow all overseas students graduating from Scottish Universities, to stay an additional two years to live and work in Scotland, and also to offer a scholarship scheme for overseas graduates (Working in Scotland Scheme)
- To focus on first impressions of Scotland and reflect that it is a welcoming country in its ports, airports, bus and rail stations
this study were aware of the Fresh Talent Initiative. Where they were aware, there was much confusion around what it was about:

“I saw an ad about Fresh Talent in a programme at the Edinburgh Fringe Festival, so I looked it up on the web site. It referred to Scotland being the best small country in the world but there was no information about how to get into Scotland, or what Scotland wanted.” (A post graduate from Mexico)

Most entrepreneurs and employees had not heard of the Fresh Talent Initiative. Of the few organisations that were aware, where they were also involved with the Initiative, they had good knowledge of it. People in academia and from overseas were the most likely to say that they had heard of it, in particular the Working in Scotland Scheme which allows graduates to work in Scotland for two years after graduating.

### Awareness from organisations’ perspective

3.43 A number of organisations that had contact with in-migrants had heard of Fresh Talent. Those that had had involvement with it were very aware of the issues around it, however, others had only ‘vaguely’ heard about it through the national media, and generally didn’t know what it was all about.

3.44 Some organisations had no awareness at all. When told about it they were generally receptive. A representative from an oil organisation, who had not heard of Fresh Talent before, thought that a key part of the Initiative should be inter-culture training, rather than just addressing the practicalities of relocating to Scotland.

3.45 One of the organisations had been heavily involved with Fresh Talent and was very enthusiastic about it making a difference:

“They’re taking a very proactive response and attitude towards professional and sensible recruitment from overseas... [The Executive’s saying] let’s try and make it easy for people to try and get jobs in Scotland rather than difficult and I think that’s the key to their agenda which is going in one direction in contrast to the rest of Europe which is going in a different direction. I think that Scotland’s taking it to the next level.” (An employer who works with in-migrants)

However, the same individual expressed concern over awareness of the Initiative amongst employers:

“...they need more resources that shout their message from the roof tops saying ‘you don’t have to struggle looking for people, there are

---

5 In-migrants were asked if they were aware of Scottish-wide policy initiatives intended to attract and retain people; if they had not they were prompted with an explanation of the Fresh Talent Initiative.
places with people out there who’ll want to come and work for you and bridge those gaps’.”

3.46 A few organisations said that they were confused as to how Fresh Talent differed from Talent Scotland, and what the Scottish Executive and Scottish Enterprise were responsible for, and how they differed.

**Awareness in academia**

**Universities**

3.47 People in the academic world were more likely to have heard of Fresh Talent (International Student Advisors and post graduates), especially the Working in Scotland Scheme aimed at encouraging post graduates to stay on and look for employment in Scotland.

3.48 The two International Student Advisors from two separate universities displayed the most comprehensive knowledge of the Initiative, and mentioned it without the interviewer having to prompt. One Advisor thought that the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme had helped to attract more post graduate students to Scotland over other parts of the UK. He reported that post graduates were trying to work out which scheme gives them the best chance of finding work; the Highly Skilled Migrant Worker programme or the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland scheme. The Highly Skilled Migrant Worker Programme was thought to be better known to students at present as it had been around for longer. There were some apprehensions about what the scheme offered as explored in Chapter 4.

**Post graduate students**

3.49 As with the Advisors at universities, awareness of the Fresh Talent Initiative was higher amongst post graduate students interviewed than entrepreneurs or employees. A number of the students interviewed were either involved in the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme, hoped to become involved, or had friends who had been involved. One student who had relocated from China said that the Working in Scotland Scheme was one of the reasons she decided to study in Scotland. Generally, opinions were positive:

“*I think it’s excellent...you are attracting young people, people that are looking for an education, and also if they have the opportunity to stay here and look for a good job I think it is a benefit for both parties because otherwise Scotland will educate these people and then force them to leave.*” (A post graduate from overseas)

The opinions of a few post graduate students involved in the scheme are considered in Chapter 4.
3.50 Increasing awareness of the Working in Scotland Scheme does seem to be needed, as some students involved in the research were lacking information about whether it would be possible for them to continue to work in Scotland after they have completed their studies:

“...first of all, I would like to know if it’s possible, not being European, possible to come here and work here, live here...Then the kind of skills Scotland is looking for, the kind of profile.” (A post graduate from Mexico)

These post-graduates had not heard of the Working in Scotland, or of any policy that might make it possible for them to work in Scotland after they had graduated. There was a feeling that the Initiative could only have limited impact in terms of attracting and retaining talented people in Scotland, if people were not aware that it exists and thus, it was not yet greatly influencing decisions to move to Scotland rather than other countries.

Receptiveness to the Fresh Talent Initiative

3.51 In essence the broad principle of having an initiative in place to encourage people to relocate to Scotland was welcomed; however there were many questions in people’s minds about what exactly the Initiative involved. It was evident that people just did not know what Fresh Talent offered. People who had relocated from overseas in particular were receptive to the concept of using a helpline to give advice on the practicalities of moving and getting settled in to working/studying in Scotland, as already provided by the Relocation Advisory Service.

3.52 On a more general awareness level, there was a feeling amongst some that Scotland did not advertise enough to encourage people to visit the country, either for a holiday or on a longer term basis:

“...maybe I’m missing it completely - but I’m not aware of marketing for visiting or...certainly not for coming to Scotland and living and working here. It’s not something I have picked up on or not something that attracted me anyway.” (An in-migrant from England)

On a similar note, one post graduate from overseas had seen an advertisement for Scotland, but after following it up, was dissatisfied by what he found:

“The only thing I have seen is an advertisement and I think it was in a magazine...Basically said that Scotland was the best small country in the world but I went to the web page and I didn’t find any information...just like okay, it’s the best place but they don’t tell you how to get in, what you are looking for, links to other places that can help you.” (A post graduate from overseas)
Conclusions

3.53 Sources and depth of knowledge of life in Scotland pre-relocation varied amongst in-migrants, with some having never visited the UK, others having visited and researched the country extensively, and others returning home.

3.54 All in-migrants coming from the rest of the UK had visited Scotland before. However, a number who had visited on holiday found that they did not know the particular area they had moved to as well as they had initially thought.

3.55 For those coming from overseas, particularly outside the EU, their main source of knowledge of life in Scotland was from word of mouth.

3.56 Most in-migrants from overseas expected the cost of living to be higher than their home country.

3.57 Respondents moving from the rest of the UK, in particular, were concerned that there may be a lack of economic opportunities compared to where they had come from, and were prepared to have to accept a lower salary than what they were used to.

3.58 Many post graduates were acutely aware of the reputation of UK universities, and had based their relocation decision on this.

3.59 Most in-migrants moving to Scotland expected to gain a better quality of life, including less traffic, easier access to outdoor activities, and beautiful countryside to enjoy.

3.60 Overall, all in-migrants had positive perceptions of Scottish people, including that they were friendly and welcoming.

3.61 There was low awareness and understanding of the Fresh Talent Initiative both amongst in-migrants and the organisations involved with in-migrants.
CHAPTER FOUR  BARRIERS TO SETTLING IN AND STAYING ON

Introduction

4.1 Although overall experiences of relocating to Scotland were positive, in-migrants experienced a broad range of barriers and frustrations in relation to settling in. The barriers faced and the extent to which they were a problem varied by situation, and can be broadly attributed to typologies. Pragmatists and World Citizens tended to face fewer, less serious barriers to settling in. Within these typologies, those coming from overseas often experienced problems accessing financial services. Returning Scots and their families often faced barriers to settling back into life in Scotland that were less practical. The group that faced the most significant barriers to settling in were the Lifestyle Pursuers who often had unmet expectations of their new lifestyle.

4.2 It is worth noting that there was a subtle different between the barriers experienced, and what might be better termed frustrations. A culmination of frustrations can add up to become actual barriers that may prevent people from settling in and staying on. However, the respondents in this study were all still living in Scotland, so barriers that could not be overcome, to either relocate or stay on, are not represented. The biggest barriers amongst this sample were around the challenges of finding suitable work opportunities, and personal happiness with new lifestyles. Frustrations, included difficulties with opening a bank account, were not a barrier to staying on but contributed to some overall negative feelings about life in Scotland.

4.3 A minority of the barriers can be seen as unique to Scotland but the majority were the kind of difficulties that are likely to be experienced when relocating anywhere. Some barriers for overseas in-migrants were perhaps applicable to the UK, or the European Union, rather than Scotland specifically. For example, the relative high cost of living.

Key barriers

4.4 The main barriers and frustrations to settling in faced by in-migrants are grouped under the following headings:

- Getting here
  - Immigration and visas
  - Concerns expressed by business support agencies
• Living and working
  o Difficulties finding suitable employment
  o The high cost of living
  o Finding suitable accommodation

• Practical considerations
  o Access to financial services
  o Access to other services
  o Tax and benefit systems
  o Other public services
  o Transport

• Settling in
  o Issues related to Scotland generally and specific areas in particular
  o Difficulties making friends
  o Family or partner not settling in
  o Missing a previous location
  o Language

• Community - culture and cohesion
  o Differences in culture
  o Racial, religious and cultural intolerance
  o Anti-English feelings
  o Anti-incomer feelings

Each area is considered in more detail below.

Getting here

Immigration and visas

Getting advice on immigration
4.5 In-migrants from overseas reported mixed experiences of the UK immigration system and procedures. One of the biggest frustrations was the sense of not really knowing where to turn to get advice. There were individual cases of people having serious difficulties in finding out what visa they needed for their particular circumstance, and having on-going problems with the immigration services. Advice sought by potential in-migrants from British Embassy staff prior to moving was not always seen as helpful.

Treatment by Embassy staff
4.6 There were a number of examples of people reporting that they had been treated badly by overseas British Embassy staff. Even if this had occurred several years ago, there was still bitterness and resentment around it. For example, a medical consultant
who had relocated from South Africa felt he was treated very badly by British Embassy staff in his home country:

“The way those people treat you is a disgrace. It’s really, really terrible. Heavy handed, difficult, you can’t ask questions. I don’t know whether anybody has an idea how bad it is.” (An employee from overseas)

Renewing visas
4.7 Frustrations were also reported around the process of renewing visas, especially the need to pay a significant amount of money for each person in the family, and the need to send away original documents for several weeks, or to travel to Glasgow, or in one example, Croydon, to do this in person.

Concerns expressed by business support agencies

4.8 The representative of the business incubator that was interviewed felt that although Scotland offered excellent opportunities to new businesses in terms of financial and advisory support, there were barriers to relocation. When asked how easy it was for businesses or entrepreneurs to make the move, the reply given was:

“The feedback I get from the client is that they find it very confusing, they find all the various agencies, organisations, whilst we in the industry may understand how it all interrelates those on the outside don’t and Scottish Enterprise, those enterprise companies, cluster teams and then you have spin offs and so forth so it’s not surprising I think the point is where do I go, who do I talk to?”

This view was backed up by other organisations that were consulted. Another issue seen by the representative of the business incubator was a perception of Scotland not being a major business hub; but he felt that there was work being done to change this.

4.9 One business support agency who worked specifically with ethnic minorities, said that there was a frustration amongst people coming from England and of an ethnic minority background, that Scotland did not offer them as much business support as they had been used to receiving. The agency was also concerned by the amount of people from ethnic minority backgrounds that set up businesses out of economic necessity, because they couldn’t find employment. There was also concern expressed over the fact that many entrepreneurs only found out about available business services once they had already settled in, and were at a stage that it was no longer as helpful.
Living and working

Difficulties finding suitable employment

4.10 Some in-migrants who had not arranged work in advance of moving or not made many initial enquiries about possible work opportunities, were very surprised to discover how difficult it was to find either work that used their skills, or in a few cases, any type of work at all. Problems were experienced both in cities and rurally, and by those from the UK and overseas, and by in-migrants at different life stages.

Post graduates and Fresh Talent

4.11 A number of post graduates who had completed their studies had problems finding suitable employment. This included a few that were on Fresh Talent visas. One graduate from the USA was working two part time jobs because she was not able to find suitable employment. Of her job search in Edinburgh she said:

“It was absolutely ridiculous. Things I was over qualified for, I wasn’t considered for...(then) I was under qualified, even with my Masters degree...when it came down to it there really weren’t the jobs.” (A post graduate from the USA)

4.12 One post graduate from overseas had completed a Business and Management Masters at a reputable Scottish University, having done a degree in Engineering in his home country. He had moved to Scotland in July 2005 on a Fresh Talent visa and was still looking for suitable employment. At the time of interview he was working in retail. Of employers and his job search he said:

“They are a bit reluctant to recruit people under this Initiative because they don’t know first of all and of course it is more like they recruit people from EU having unrestricted work permit...You will probably get retail jobs, or admin jobs, but getting a proper career...just very, very slow.” (Post graduates from overseas)

4.13 Supporting this, the International Student Advisors interviewed at two universities were also worried that employers were not aware of Fresh Talent, making it hard for post graduates on the visa to get work, and forcing them to take on something unaligned to their career plans. They also reported other reservations about the Initiative and how it may develop:

- One Advisor thought the Fresh Talent literature was very emotive, and referred to opportunities to find work in Scotland, which implies that there will be work available. There was a concern that students would be disillusioned when they could not find suitable work. Fresh Talent was seen as unintentionally promising something that it does not intend to/cannot deliver.
• One of the Advisors had been asked by her students for advice on the scheme, and although she wanted to be as helpful as possible, she had to refer them to the Relocation Advisory Service (RAS). From her point of view there was a problem with RAS only operating from Glasgow; some students were nervous about sending their documents off and preferred dealing with someone face-to-face, but the journey there was a long and expensive one.

• One advisor said that just before Fresh Talent started, he had 200 students keen to remain, now the numbers who are interested is less, as they are realising it will cost them money at the end of their studies to stay, at a time when they would not have much.

Lifestyle Pursuers from the UK

4.14 Difficulty finding suitable employment was a particularly notable issue for Lifestyle Pursuers from the UK. They discovered they had unrealistic expectations of job opportunities in Scotland, particularly for highly skilled professionals coming from the South East and living outside Scotland’s Central Belt. One in-migrant assumed that although the job market he was moving into was small, there was one company that offered similar work to his previous employment. Even though the work was not particularly what he wanted to continue doing, he had envisaged that he would be able to rely on his past experience to secure a job post-relocation, which was not the case:

“Having worked in a large company in toiletries I just thought oh well I’ll just fit in there and I’ll have to put up with what I have to put up with.” (An entrepreneur from South East England)

Others were surprised by the limited types of jobs available in their new location. One couple who subsequently set up their own business said:

“We both started to look at jobs...It was the public sector or nothing...I just never imagined there wouldn’t be a private sector. I just kind of thought you couldn’t have an economy without a private sector but actually you can and here it is.” (A couple from London)

4.15 As with the couple in the above quote, the lack of work opportunities led to a few in-migrants setting up a business of their own. People reported mixed feelings about becoming self-employed when driven to this by economic necessity rather than a genuine desire to start a business. At worst, a few people spoke about feeling lonely and isolated.

Overseas in-migrants and partners

4.16 All in-migrants from overseas either had a job, or came with a partner who had a job. However, some unemployed partners from overseas had trouble finding suitable employment once here:
“A major problem we really do have is finding a job for my wife...the general feeling is that the job market for professional people is not that big here in Glasgow area. So, if you come with a job that’s no problem, but if you come here and then start looking for a job, then it can become a problem.” (An employee from Israel)

There was a sense of frustration that in some places and some employment sectors there was an established network of local people who knew each other and, from the viewpoint of some in-migrants, got the best jobs.

The employers’ perspective – recruiting from overseas

4.16 One organisation who had an overarching remit of recruiting staff from overseas, saw the main challenge being that a large number of Scottish companies that required highly skilled in-migrants were small/medium firms and did not have specialist HR divisions. In these cases, senior managers or owners felt outside their comfort zone when thinking about recruiting from outside Scotland; the prospect of recruiting from overseas was perceived as a timely and costly process, and thus, off-putting. Companies also perceived that it would be difficult to deal with immigration for work permits, and that relocatees may not settle into Scotland and thereby time and money would be invested in a venture that may not be successful.

4.17 Harrison et al’s research (2005) found that amongst their sample the companies they interviewed carried out very little recruitment of overseas staff, one worry being that their families might not settle in. A few concerns were expressed by employers in this study about recruiting from overseas. These were around differences in overseas qualifications and training, and differences in work culture. Some employers made great efforts to help their employees settle in as they saw this as an important part of retaining them (as discussed in Chapter 5); others who were more confident that they wouldn’t have retention problems, and could fill the vacancies with UK employees had a more nonchalant attitude to providing assistance:

‘There’s nothing too much to worry about other than the softer things around family and friends...and they wouldn’t be asking us about that...that’s a personal decision.’ (An employer)

Other issues

4.18 A few individuals mentioned frustrations around the problems of recognition of professional qualifications gained overseas, specifically in medicine and veterinary. A public sector medical consultant spoke of the frustration of not being able to get professional recognition for his specialist qualifications from South Africa. He felt this could potentially put off other experienced consultants from applying for posts in Scotland.
High cost of living

4.19 There were some frustrations with higher cost of living for some. This heavily depended on where in-migrants had relocated from, and the area of Scotland they relocated to. Those from overseas generally anticipated that the cost of living would be higher than where they had come from, but still felt the effects of it. A number of in-migrants from overseas commented that they had made significant changes to their lifestyles:

“It has been about double of what it costs to have the same quality of living in America.” (An employee from the USA living in Edinburgh)

4.20 Living and working in other countries led Scottish returners to get used to different costs of living which required some re-adjustment upon their return:

“The cost of living here is high I think by standards of many other parts of the world so getting used to that is thought provoking.” (A returner from overseas)

4.21 There were mixed responses over the price of living for those relocating from the UK. Some respondents thought that there had been no change in their outgoings; others found comparisons varied; a few found that in taking a reduction in salary they were financially worse off than before the move:

“If you think downsizing is fun think again…I don’t like not having any money and I’ve been very open about that, I think there’s a reality in that and you can’t eat the scenery.” (A couple from South East England)

Although they had somewhat anticipated it, this couple expressed a frustration that salaries were lower in the rural area they now lived in compared to South East England. When asked what their barriers to settling in and staying on were, they said “You can’t earn decent wages up here – forget it!”

4.22 A number of individuals from the UK admitted that they had not extensively considered the cost of living pre-relocation, and that this had caused some problems:

“I don’t think I thought about it a lot…we’ve had some rude awakenings.” (A couple from England living in the Highlands)

It was commonly reported that property prices were higher than anticipated – both in cities and ruraly. A young couple, who had moved from London to Edinburgh with the intention of saving to buy a flat, said that their monthly savings were much lower than they expected due to the “astronomical amount of council tax”. In-migrants from overseas were often completely unaware of having to pay council tax until they
received the bill. Many commented on the fact that council tax was higher than they had anticipated:

“The only thing I would say about Glasgow which I think is quite expensive is council tax. I think I am paying more than I used to pay in London. Apart from that the cost of living is better here, it is much cheaper.” (An entrepreneur from London)

Finding suitable accommodation

4.23 The main problems in-migrants had in accessing accommodation related to cost, suitability and dealing with systems which were different from their country of origin. For in-migrants with children, the importance of being able to send children to a good school meant that schools and property locations had to be explored together.

Renting property

4.24 A number of in-migrants complained about the standard of some of the rented accommodation available:

“I was really surprised by the poor quality of rented accommodation. Places were similar to apartments in Poland twenty years ago. I cannot understand why a rich country like this has such poor housing.” (Medical consultant from Poland)

“I was shown awful places by the local council; a flat in an otherwise derelict building, with burned out cars outside, and people calling us names and spitting at us…They only showed us places that other people did not want.” (Post graduate student from Malaysia)

4.25 Where in-migrants wanted or needed to arrange accommodation prior to relocating, letting agents were felt to be very unhelpful. Success was more often achieved via newspaper websites and dealing directly with landlords. Another surprise for some was the time taken to arrange renting a flat. For example letting agencies needed to do a credit rating check which took 10 days to complete.

Buying property

4.26 When buying a property a number of in-migrants found the Scottish system extremely frustrating. In particular the closed bidding and ‘offers over’ were very hard for some to understand and use:

“It’s ridiculous – the offers over. You just don’t know where to pitch it…It’s just wasting time.” (An employee from overseas)

4.27 For some coming from the rest of the UK and buying a property in Scotland, it seemed very difficult to find a way of synchronising the sale of one property with the
purchase of another. It was felt only feasible to buy in Scotland once the sale of an existing property was completed, which was different from the system familiar to English in-migrants. This led to the additional complication of having to think about renting a property at first. There was the sense that the Scottish system favours the seller and is not helpful to in-migrants.

Accommodation problems for post graduates

4.28 Sometimes universities arranged accommodation, although it was more typical for post graduates to find their own. Finding suitable accommodation for students with families was extremely difficult. In some areas it was reported to be in very short supply and the organisations in contact with students felt frustrated that they often ended up staying in unsafe areas.

4.29 Some complications had arisen when post graduates from overseas needed their accommodation confirmed before they could register with universities, which was practically impossible to do before arrival. The International Student Advisors were concerned about this, and believed it was an unnecessary requirement. Additional problems occurred when students agreed in advance to a lease contract before seeing the property in question, and then had difficulties getting out of the contract when it turned out to be unsuitable.

Practical considerations

Access to financial services

4.30 Frustrations around opening a bank account in Scotland were commonly reported by overseas in-migrants for all economic sub-groups of entrepreneurs, employees and post graduates. The effects of the difficulties they experienced were both practical and emotional:

“We are educated, middle class Californians, we are academics, we are home owners, and we could only get the most basic account, it was very annoying logistically, and it was insulting. The inability to set up basic things like bank accounts and a telephone line made us feel transitory, it prevented us from settling in, it made us feel uninvited and unwelcome. This is crazy if Scotland really wants people from abroad.” (An employed couple from the USA)

4.31 The problem was not only faced by those new to the country. One returner felt that the UK’s “banking system has not caught up with the international globalisation of business”. Having left the UK system for several years, a few Scottish returners reported difficulties opening bank accounts and re-establishing credit histories:

“Buying a car was...difficult because we had been living abroad for 10 years and we were no longer on the electoral register so we couldn’t get a loan.” (A returner from overseas)
4.32 Clearly, a lack of access to a bank account had knock on effects on access to other financial services, leading to more frustration. The feeling of being stuck in a vicious circle came up a number of times:

“Because you can’t get a bank account, you can’t rent because you have to have a bank account and then you can’t get one because you don’t have a place to live so you can’t win.” (An employee from overseas)

Access to other services

4.33 There were also some frustrations around not being eligible to take out monthly payment contracts for mobile phones. A highly skilled, entrepreneur couple from overseas were extremely dissatisfied that they would have to wait 3 years to take out a monthly payment mobile phone contract. They were unaccustomed to having to use ‘pay as you go’ phones, and were left with a feeling that there was a lack of trust towards them.

4.34 Getting landlines and broadband connections proved to be time consuming and complicated for a number of in-migrants. In one particular case, a month to get a business landline installed was thought to be far too long for an entrepreneur who wanted to get his business set up as soon as possible. This was linked to a feeling that customer service in Scotland was poor compared with some other locations. Examples included, phone calls not being returned, records of agreements not being kept, which was compounded by the fact that reportedly local people accepted this was the way things were and did not complain.

Tax and benefits systems

4.35 Taxation systems were felt to be complicated for global entrepreneurs and returners, or anyone whose circumstances were not straightforward. One very successful entrepreneur almost decided not to set up his business in Scotland due to the complexities and frustrations of trying to understand legislative and taxation issues. It was reported that it was very hard to find the right people to provide advice on such matters, with international business advisors being very cautious. A self-employed consultant noted that it was difficult to get clear information on registering for taxes and setting-up as self-employed:

“After I got this work permit and arrived in the UK, there was really no website or place that I could go to help me...I still don’t know at this point what I’m supposed to do as far as to register myself to pay taxes.” (An entrepreneur from overseas)
There were frustrations amongst those who pay UK tax and were not allowed to claim certain benefits as a condition of their visa arrangement.

**Other public services**

4.36 In the main, in-migrants were satisfied with the health and education facilities available in Scotland. There were of course some concerns, for example the lack of public dentists was mentioned by a number of in-migrants from England. There were also frustrations around the variation in standards provided by schools (especially secondary education) and the need to know how to “beat the system” by living in the right catchment area. A few non–Christian in-migrants said they had difficulty in choosing suitable schools as most state schools in their area were Christian.

**Transport**

*Public transport*

4.37 Newcomers often found it difficult to know how to use public transport at first. It was felt that local buses in cities were quite expensive for short journeys, and the routes were not always easy to understand. In addition they were not felt to be reliable enough to use for commuting to work:

> “The buses in Glasgow are not as good as in London. They are not well signposted, they don’t tell you the route they are following, they have complicated fares, why can’t they have a flat fare structure and be made easier to understand?” (A returner from London)

> “I’d really like to use the bus for commuting to work in Glasgow but they are too unreliable.” (An employee from overseas)

4.38 Trains tended to be regarded more favourably. Routes were easier to understand and some lines in particular were singled out for praise e.g. East Coast line Aberdeen to London. Comments were made however about trains being dirty. Flights were generally considered to be fairly expensive for personal use, with some complaining of a limited range of direct routes available. Scotland was, however, regarded as a good “gateway to Europe” and therefore the rest of the world, in terms of air routes. Also, low-cost coach companies were mentioned by some post graduates as useful for their very cheap long distance journeys.

*Private transport*

4.39 Fuel costs were deemed to be very expensive by those coming from outwith the UK; people living in rural locations in particular were often surprised and frustrated by how much they had to spend.
Settling in

Location - Scotland generally and specific areas

4.40 There were some examples of in-migrants who were frustrated because their lifestyle had not improved as much as they had anticipated. This was most commonly experienced amongst Lifestage Returners and Lifestyle Pursuers. In these cases it was possible to make adjustments by moving to another location for example. One couple who had moved their family from South East England to rural Scotland found that they had a long car commute to Inverness, and were not achieving the rural life they had wanted. They planned to move nearer Inverness to remedy this.

4.41 Some parts of Scotland suffered from not being perceived as cosmopolitan, multicultural or open to change when compared to other destinations by both new in-migrants and returners:

“I am missing the multi-culturalism...I miss seeing people from all walks of life, people from different cultures and places, gay people. There is nothing Bohemian in the Highlands, it is all too twee.” (An in-migrant from South East England to the Highlands)

“Scotland can feel claustrophobic...it can feel like a small country, and not in a good way.” (A returner)

“There is a conservative and pompous side to Scotland, for example the legal profession in Glasgow is very resistant to change.” (A returner from London to Glasgow)

Friendship difficulties

4.42 A minority of in-migrants talked about difficulties around making friends, and not feeling welcomed as part of a community. These were issues that could be commonly experienced moving to any new community:

“I think one of the barriers is social relations because they are difficult to create, to make friends. Even though people are friendly, if you are not involved in some kind of activity where you meet people, it is difficult.” (An employee from overseas)

It is worth noting that it was sometimes harder for older single people, especially returners, to feel settled quickly, due to friendships taking longer to form. Many recognised the importance of making an effort to meet new people and not just staying at home all the time; but this was sometimes a barrier to settling in.
Family and/or partner not settling in

4.43 Family and partner not settling in was a barrier that came through more clearly from the organisation level interviews. This may be due to the fact that the in-migrants interviewed were not comfortable addressing the problems of not being able to settle in, and that in the cases where in-migrants had not settled in they had not stayed on. One relocation agency explained the problems faced by partners of employees as follows:

“The spouse is left at home to muddle through and try and organise all the problems that are arriving hour by hour so the person at home has a heck of a lot more stress and problems to deal with than the person who is coming over here to work.” (A relocation agency)

Finding suitable work, apart from the added financial security, was an important way for partners to feel settled in their new location. This was a particular issue in smaller towns and rural areas, and for people with specific skills and qualifications who were looking for specific work. Partners sometimes compromised and took on work that might not be their first choice where the other person in the relationship had found suitable employment.

Missing previous locations

4.44 What people missed about their previous location obviously depended on where they had come from and where they had moved to. There was a lot of variation in what people reported that they missed. As may be expected, those who were less happy with their relocation were more likely to talk at length about missing their previous location. Aspects that in-migrants missed included:

Across all groups
- Family and friends – this was the first thing mentioned by most in-migrants

Those from South East England
- Cultural diversity
- Better employment opportunities and wages available

Those from overseas
- The weather in their home country - both more sunshine and more snow
- Local foods – comments were made on missing food from in-migrants’ home countries, but when they could find it, it was very expensive. Some people also commented that they missed eating out as much as they used to, due to high prices.
Language

4.45 The dominance of the English language in the UK was a key pull factor for many overseas in-migrants. Some had come to improve their English and felt that their lack of fluency sometimes hindered them. A number had not realised the extent to which accents differed within the UK and struggled in both cities and rural areas:

“If took me months to be able to understand what people were saying to me. People called me hen. I had no idea what it meant you know for months.” (An in-migrant from overseas)

A minority reported that people did not understand them due to their own accent.

Community cohesion

Differences in culture

4.46 In-migrants from overseas, both outwith and within the European Union, struggled with the less positive aspects of Scottish culture, including excessive drinking, anti-social behaviour, and unhealthy eating. The most significant problem was the prevalent drinking culture:

“I was very shocked by people drinking to excess at a Saturday night work function, it was totally inappropriate…I am amazed that staff think nothing of going to work with a hangover.” (An employee from the USA)

An employer that works with in-migrants to help them settle in commented that the effect of the drinking culture on some overseas in-migrants is that it leads to a feeling of exclusion. This was reflected in a comment by an in-migrant:

“I feel totally out of synch with the Scottish way of life, all that emphasis on smoking and drinking.” (A couple from the USA)

However, a number of in-migrants, particular younger people, enjoyed this aspect of the social culture.

4.47 Other visible social problems also made in-migrants feel uncomfortable. Examples given included poverty, homeless people on city streets, drunk people on weekend evenings, problems with drug misuse, and anti-social behaviour:

“Although there is less violence than the US the anti-social behaviour here is more “in your face”, you see it everywhere
whereas in the US it would be confined to ghettos.” (An in-migrant who has lived in a number of countries)

This aspect of a culture of violence was seen to be mirrored in the media:

“If you switch on the news and if it is British it is just full of murder and stabbing...I’m not sure I can get used to it.” (An employee from Germany)

4.48 A number of in-migrants from overseas were surprised by ‘unhealthy living’. Comments were made about the high proportion of people who smoke, the lack of exercise taken, and a poor diet amongst Scottish people. A few in-migrants from overseas were also surprised that Scotland was culturally less Christian than expected.

Racial, religious or cultural intolerance

4.49 Several incidents of racial, religious or cultural intolerance were commented on, however, most thought that Scotland was less racist than other places they had lived. In the main, anyone who had been the victim of this type of attitude and behaviour wanted to minimise the ill feeling it had caused them, and put it down to the ignorance of the person in question. Those reporting examples of this type of behaviour and attitude included people from India, the USA, Malaysia, Iran, Brazil and England. Specific examples given included verbal abuse, spitting, difficulties getting work and service staff being rude and unhelpful.

4.50 On a more positive note, there were some comments from people from the USA indicating that they observed people in Scotland to be more tolerant and accepting of people from different backgrounds. A few in-migrants from other countries felt that their own beliefs helped them be accepted within a community.

Anti-incomer feelings

4.51 Some anti-incomer feelings were experienced; however it was at a low level and more apparent outside the central belt. There was a feeling that locals in rural areas felt frustrated that “incomers” were going to make a profit on property and cause house prices to increase, forcing them out of the market. At the same time in-migrants often understood such resentment:

“It takes time for someone like me to get into the local community. There is a suspicion that we are just here for the property market and will then leave.” (An entrepreneur from England living rurally)
**Anti-English feelings**

4.52 In-migrants from the UK found it difficult to address the question of whether anti-English feeling existed, and how it manifested itself. On the whole, it was reported that it existed, but not at a level that was directly offensive:

“I'm chatting to a lot of people all the time, and you do find there are people who are obviously anti-English, but they're anti-English, not anti-English person. If they're chatting to an English person, they say ‘well you’re ok, you’re fine’. It's just the English generally are terrible!” (An entrepreneur couple from South West England)

However some ‘banter’ did leave English people feeling uneasy, and with a feeling that there was something ‘real’ in the comments. One non-UK in-migrant commented:

“The English have a tougher time than other non-Scots. It is often bound up in a bit of a joke...but underneath the banter and the humorous tone there is actually a bit of an edge, a bit of antagonism, a bit of resentment.” (An in-migrant from South Africa)

4.53 There was a feeling that there was more awkwardness towards more middle class people, and those from London and the South East, than in-migrants from Northern England. Also, anti-English feelings were more prevalently reported in Northern Scotland (Aberdeen and Inverness) than in Glasgow and Edinburgh.

**Conclusions**

4.54 There were a broad range of barriers and frustrations in relation to settling into life in Scotland as experienced by in-migrants. This varied by situation, and can be broadly attributed to typologies. Pragmatists and World Citizens tended to face fewer, less serious barriers to settling in.

4.55 The group that appeared to face the most significant barriers to settling in were the Lifestyle Pursuers who often had unmet expectations of their new lifestyle.

4.56 Difficulty finding suitable employment, whilst not being the most common barrier, was one of the most salient. It had serious implications for how successful some people saw their move as being. Lack of employment opportunities led a number of in-migrants to set up their own businesses.

4.57 Post graduates in particular expressed problems finding jobs outside of academia, and for a few on the Fresh Talent visa this was frustrating as they had had to take jobs that were unaligned to their chosen career path.
There were some frustrations around the high cost of living, but this had been anticipated amongst most in-migrants coming from overseas. A few in-migrants coming from the rest of the UK were surprised to find the cost of living to be higher than they had expected.

Finding suitable accommodation prevented some in-migrants, especially post graduates from settling in quickly.

Many in-migrants from overseas expressed that they had had problems and delays in opening bank accounts in the UK.

For some overseas in-migrants, differences in culture were difficult to overcome. One aspect that was mentioned quite commonly was the tendency for socialising in Scotland to revolve around alcohol.

Racial, religious or cultural intolerance was experienced by some in-migrants. In-migrants who had been the victim of this tended to play it down.
CHAPTER FIVE  FACTORS THAT HELPED RELOCATION

Introduction

5.1  In the main, in-migrants were pleased with their experience of relocating to Scotland. Those who had arranged employment, academic courses, or were well advanced in setting up their own business, prior to moving, generally had a straightforward experience. Those who were motivated to move to Scotland for emotional reasons (e.g. change of lifestyle, chasing the rural dream, in love with the romantic notion of life in Scotland) without arranging prior employment, just hoping that something suitable would turn up, were more likely to experience challenges.

5.2  This chapter considers the factors which helped make the relocation easier for in-migrants, and what encourages them to stay on in Scotland. The final two sections consider the influence of personal characteristics on experiences of relocating and what affects the decision to remain.

5.3  What helped the move to Scotland is analysed under the three following sections:

- Formal support received
  o Support from public bodies for entrepreneurs
  o Support from employers for employees
  o Support from universities for post graduates
  o Relocation agencies

- Living and working
  o Satisfaction with work, studies and business
  o Satisfaction with accommodation

- Settling in
  o Improved lifestyle
  o Existing friends, family and other contacts
  o Making new friends and feeling part of a community
  o The attraction of specific locations in Scotland
  o Scottish cultural attitudes
Formal support received

5.4 The majority of in-migrants, especially those moving from other parts of the UK, did not seek or use any support in terms of relocating to Scotland. Support was not sought or used for two reasons. Firstly, many in-migrants did not know it existed and secondly, many (particularly those coming from the UK) did not think they needed it. However, where it was readily available a number of in-migrants from overseas took advantage of it, and were pleased with the services received. Many returners had a fairly strong support network in Scotland and did not feel that there was much that could be offered to them.

Support from public bodies for entrepreneurs

5.5 Entrepreneurs fell into two groups; those who had been “wooed” by public bodies to relocate and set up their business in Scotland and had organised funding and support before they arrived – typically Pragmatists; and secondly those who only thought of setting up a business post-relocation, often driven by economic necessity in the absence of suitable employment – typically Lifestyle Pursuers.

5.6 Those in the former group tended to be very satisfied and impressed with the support they received. Being contacted by a public body, and the incentives and help they subsequently received, was their main reason for moving to Scotland. One couple from the USA described the funding and support they received from Scottish Enterprise via the Global Entrepreneurs Programme as being the main thing that made Scotland an option as a destination. In particular they welcomed the mentoring they received. Similarly, a partnership of entrepreneurs – one returning from South East England and one originally from South East England – said:

“Scottish Enterprise have been absolutely brilliant...we’ve had to put a lot less effort in to making all these other contacts than we would have had to if it hadn’t been for them.”

5.7 Those who only explored the idea of being entrepreneurial post-relocation had mixed experiences of the support they received from public bodies. It was suggested that this varied by locality and the experience/attitude of the advisors they were assigned. One individual who returned to Scotland from overseas to start up a business was dissatisfied with the advice and service she received:

“I went to the local enterprise company...and they weren’t very helpful either. They said ‘oh I don’t think it will work’...I thought ‘I’ll have to do it myself’. ” (A returner from overseas)
5.8 More positive aspects mentioned about public business support agencies included the availability of short courses on, for example, applying for funding, writing a business plan, book keeping, and food and hygiene.

5.9 Some respondents, who had found their jobs through the Talent Scotland website, did not mention this in their interview. Rather they stated that they were interested in working in engineering or life sciences in Scotland, and found a job that was suitable. One employee, originally from the UK, mentioned finding a job through the Talent Scotland website whilst working in the USA. He was also a positive example of an individual taking advantage of the Knowledge Transfer Programme (KTP) provided by the Department for Trade and Industry, facilitating moves from the academic world to business.

The business support perspective

5.10 In the interview with a representative from a business incubator that supports new start-ups, it was reported that most new businesses that contacted the centre and received help were from England – many of whom were starting up satellite offices. It was estimated that around ten per cent were from outwith the UK, and that around ten per cent were from Scotland. Hardly any returning Scots had contacted the centre. The business incubator representative stated that people coming from England were very surprised by the level of advisory support they received:

“English companies think it’s a bit of an outpost...they’re a bit surprised by how sophisticated the network is...one of the things that is commented on...when I’m down south working in the incubation network...is that the companies up here definitely get a much, much higher level of...advisory support.” (Scottish business incubator rep)

Support from employers for employees

5.11 A small proportion of in-migrants moving from overseas received a substantial degree of help to relocate from their employer. This tended to be for employees of multi-national private companies and large public bodies. These in-migrants were more likely to be Pragmatists or World Citizens. Typically support included a financial package to help with relocation costs and guidance to help find out about location, schools, accommodation etc. Temporary accommodation was sometimes also offered. Individuals who had been provided support were very positive about it:

“Just imagine if you don’t know anything about a country where you’re going to be relocated to and you start doing research on your own, you don’t know where to start but if you have something like [in-house relocation agency] and some brief material it helps you a lot and it helps in your planning.” (An employee from India)
Those who actively sought employment in Scotland specifically, for example Lifestyle Pursuers, were less likely to receive financial help and other support/advice; whereas those who were less attracted by the idea of living in Scotland *per se* were more likely to receive a relocation package to encourage them to move. For returners in multi-nationals where help and support was offered, there was a feeling that it was not as comprehensive when the relocation was requested rather than offered. One returner had received extensive help from his employer in his move away from Scotland which he was not keen on, but not his move back which he initiated. Some multi-nationals were perceived to be helpful only up to a point, leaving some in-migrants with the feeling that dealing with the challenge of moving is part of demonstrating they are capable of taking on a senior role.

Attention was paid by some employers to helping the employee’s family settle in as well. One multi-national offered a service specifically designed to help ensure that partners of employees felt comfortable with the move. The reasoning behind this was that because the company work culture is very much the same everywhere in the world, this offers a comfort and familiarity factor for their employees, who then have fewer issues with settling in to a new place than their partners (see 5.14 for course content).

*The Employers’ Perspective*

The three employers interviewed in this study had varying recruitment strategies and skill requirements, and different approaches to the support they offered to their employees. Examples given included:

- An employer in the transport sector actively recruited drivers from a recent EU accession state by going there and directly advertising and interviewing. It was seen as advantageous to the company to do this, as retention of overseas employees was significantly better than that of UK employees. The employer provided the following support to in-migrant employers:

  **Pre-relocation**
  - A two week residential course to learn English
  - Showed British programs to familiarise in-migrants with colloquialisms and the accent (including Billy Connolly and Eastenders)
  - Showed a DVD of the depot and area they would work in
  - Handled work permits, driving licenses and administrative requirements

  **During relocation**
  - Met employee upon arrival
  - Took employee to accommodation which was available to them for 6 months, the first 2 of which were free
  - Provided information on where to buy groceries etc.
  - Provided contact numbers for a company ‘Integration Officer’ who dealt with any settling in problems
  - Made it clear that they were treated the same as employees from the UK
• An employer in the oil and gas sector, had a workforce whose careers placed them in different countries for a few years at a time, which meant that their employees were accustomed to relocating. This employer was active in helping the partner of the employee settle into life in Scotland, as it was identified that partners had a more difficult time settling in, as their own careers were often disturbed by the move. To this end, the employer ran a course for the partners of the employees to help them settle in. The course included inter-cultural training to help people understand: their own culture; how cultures differ; and the culture of Scotland; as well as offering practical advice on the locality. Key points of cultural differences included preparing people for the prevailing sense of pessimism often found in Scotland, and the culture of socialising around alcohol that often comes as a surprise to those from overseas.

• An employer in the public health sector reported that they provided new employees with a standard relocation package and accommodation. The HR department also provided information on the local area via the local Council.

Support from universities for post graduates

5.15 Post graduate students received a certain amount of support to get settled into their new location. There were a variety of sources that provided help including university staff, student run societies, church organisations, other students, and helpful local people.

5.16 There were a few examples of people who had come from outwith the EU who were more comfortable seeking and receiving support from people from their own country, even when they did not know them pre-relocation. This was either done through making contacts through extended friend networks, or by contacting the student association for their home country. Where these contacts had been made, the networks established were heavily relied on for support.

Relocation agencies

5.17 In the main, relocation agencies seemed to be used by employers who had attracted staff to Scotland, not individuals who moved on their own initiative. Large, multi-national employers used services on offer from private relocation agencies (e.g. help with accommodation) or had their own departments who dealt with these aspects. This meant that, most commonly in-migrants in the World Citizen and Pragmatist typologies benefited from this type of help.

5.18 The relocation agency that was interviewed for this study pointed out that returners often needed the most help settling in, in relation to managing their expectations. However, most returners, unless working for large companies, did not
seek the help of relocation agencies, or any services for that matter. One returner to rural Scotland said that he was aware that there were organisations in the area that could have helped him, but as he had family around and was aware of how things worked in Scotland, he did not need extra assistance.

**Living and working**

**Satisfaction with work, studies and business**

5.19 Analysis of the interviews showed that a positive experience with work, studies or business was crucial in making the move a success. Those who were happy in their current economic situation felt that they had made the right decision in relocating to Scotland; this was often Pragmatists and World Citizens.

5.20 One reason that those who had moved for pragmatic reasons may have settled in better than those pursuing a different lifestyle may be down to expectations. In-migrants who moved for pragmatic reasons were focused on a job, business or course, rather than the actual location. As long as their job, business or course lived up to their expectations - and on the whole it did - then their overall relocation was perceived as a success. Conversely, people who were pursuing a lifestyle tended to have higher expectations, and invested more of themselves in the relocation by taking a risk and sometimes not moving with economic opportunities. Even if the lifestyle was as expected, for most, satisfaction with a job, business or education greatly helped with the relocation.

**Satisfaction with accommodation**

5.21 Finding somewhere to live that met in-migrants’ needs was a crucial first step in moving and starting to put down roots. Pragmatists and World Citizens tended to take a slightly more rational and thoughtful approach to choosing a home, whereas Lifestyle Pursuers were more likely to let their emotional feelings take over in choosing where to live. Indeed, the identification of an appropriate home that reflected their lifestyle dreams was often a major catalyst for Lifestyle Pursuers and Lifestage Returners to decide where to settle. However, this was not always a key factor in the success of the move.
Settling in

*Improved lifestyle*

5.22 Improved lifestyle was a major factor in encouraging people to stay in Scotland; however, as mentioned in the previous section, this was not always a strong enough factor on its own to retain people. In-migrants who had previously lived and worked in big cities particularly appreciated experiencing a less pressured lifestyle, with the possibility of easier commuting journeys. One of the key aspects of improved lifestyle was the sense that there was more time available to enjoy the wide range of accessible leisure activities; in-migrants mentioned hill walking, fishing, golf, skiing and having easy access to a short walk on the beach. Another key aspect was the sense of safety and security on offer in Scotland, especially for people who had lived in big cities (London in particular). There was also the sense that Scotland was less vulnerable to terrorist attacks than other countries. Cultural activities, plus shopping opportunities, were commented on by some as an advantage of living in the big cities.

5.23 Although Pragmatists and World Citizens were less likely to have mentioned improved lifestyle as a reason to relocate they were often pleasantly surprised to discover how much they appreciated the lifestyle opportunities available to them.

*Existing friends, family and other contacts*

5.24 The main group of people who already had family or friends connections were the Lifestage Returners; these connections were a key motivator in their return. Having family and friends around was important to them, and something they had missed when away from Scotland. However, although returners appreciated being with them again, renewing these bonds was not always straightforward. A couple who returned to Aberdeen found that they saw less of their siblings and their families than when they had been visiting from abroad. Similarly, an entrepreneur returning to the Highlands discovered that the group of young, free and single people she had left were now settled with partners and children. Overall though, these familiar contacts helped them settle back into life in Scotland.

5.25 For those few who had never lived in Scotland before but had friends or family in the area they relocated to, the feedback was consistently positive. There were several examples of people getting help and support from friends, family and contacts who provided advice and local knowledge or even somewhere to stay for a few days. In addition some fortunate in-migrants, across all typologies, found a new neighbour or colleague to be especially helpful in making their arrival a smooth experience.
Making new friends and feeling part of a community

5.26 Making friends and feeling part of a community was key for some people in terms of helping them feel that they were settled into their new life. Many spoke about the importance of being proactive in getting to know people, making friends, and participating in their community. Pragmatists and World Citizens often entered into established communities, whether it be at work or university, and met friends that way. Lifestyle Pursuers and, to a certain extent, Lifestage Returners often had to make a conscious effort to join in with local activities to make new friends where they were not in a job or at university.

5.27 In the main, children settled well into their new lives and the consensus of opinion was that children are remarkably adaptable. Children of World Citizens in particular, who may have been born overseas, and already lived in different countries, were good at fitting in with new schools and making friends. Parents in the World Citizen typology were good at identifying the need to create opportunities for the whole family to make new friends and get involved in new activities for example golf, going to the dry ski slope, learning a new musical instrument. They also articulated the need to make a new house into a home as quickly as possible for example by unpacking everything quickly, putting up pictures and getting a pet.

5.28 Several people spoke about joining a local church as a way of meeting people, even if they did not consider themselves to be particularly religious. An overseas post graduate student from a Buddhist family, described herself as ‘not religious’ but attended Bible classes, prompted by new friends, and enjoyed the topics discussed and meeting people through it. An entrepreneur from overseas tried several local churches before finding one she liked. It was an important part of her social life and she became an active member of it, making many friends along the way.

5.29 A few respondents had met partners in Scotland. There were a couple of examples of people who whilst being happy in the country, were interested in exploring other places were it not for being with someone who was more committed to living in Scotland.

The attraction of specific locations in Scotland

5.30 In-migrants tended to have a very clear idea about the specific aspects of Scotland they wanted to experience and, having made their choice, tended to try and make the most of what was on offer. Pragmatists and World Citizens were more likely to find themselves in a city location, and appreciated the diversity of activities on offer:

“Edinburgh has got everything we could wish for as a family, the zoo, the aquarium, the parks, plus we can travel around Scotland as a family, and they are very accustomed to foreign people around
here, for example as tourists and students. It feels very cosmopolitan and we feel welcomed.” (A post graduate from overseas)

Lifestyle Pursuers and Lifestage Returners tended to have more mixed, individual views about whether they preferred the attractions of a city or rural situation.

5.31 In addition, many newcomers especially from overseas appreciated aspects of Scotland because they reminded them of home. Examples mentioned were Inverness being reminiscent of Ohio (small city surrounded by a rural area), Scotland’s green hills being reminiscent of the mountains of northern India, and the Highlands being reminiscent of the wildness of Poland.

Scottish cultural attitudes

5.32 Some in-migrants, especially entrepreneurs, Pragmatists and World Citizens, were very enthusiastic about the sense of optimism and dynamism they felt existed in Scotland. For example they liked being in a country going through a period of change, and felt a sense of excitement about the Scottish Parliament and opportunities for the future. Entrepreneurs in particular talked about being impressed with the initiatives in place to encourage new business, such as Business Gateway, but also felt people were not widely aware of them.

5.33 One in-migrant from the USA was vocal in his affection for Scottish cultural attitudes:

“I like the small city and rural feel of Inverness. The whole area feels Scandinavian, the people are environmentally conscious and optimistic and forward looking.” (An entrepreneur from the USA)

This affection also spread to in-migrants in cities. A number of Pragmatists were surprised by their new surroundings, possibly due to not having very defined expectations pre-relocation:

“We thought we would like Edinburgh then we got swayed by Glasgow. The culture, the feel of the place, its “blue collar” spirit, its friendliness, the architecture and the sense of change and progression.” (An entrepreneurial couple from the USA)

This couple ended up settling in Glasgow.
Influence of in-migrants’ attitudes and personal characteristics on experiences

5.34 A key factor that influenced in-migrants’ experiences of relocating related to their attitude to relocating. There was a real sense that those who actively wanted to make the most of their time in Scotland would have the best chance of doing so. In-migrants talked about having a sense of adventure, an interest in different places and people, and a determination to make the most of wherever they found themselves. They were not going to sit back and simply wait for things to happen:

“We are determined to make the most of being here; we want to put down roots.” (An employee from Poland)

“Success will be down to my effort, my commitment, my determination. I am grateful to Scotland for the opportunities that I have had and I want to give back as much as possible.” (A post graduate in-migrant from England, now an employee)

This ‘pioneering’ attitude seemed to be especially prevalent amongst young single people, families with pre-school children and career minded people. For example, for younger people (post graduates, first career job) there was the sense of achievement that came with beginning to live a more independent life, of growing up and taking on more responsibility.

5.35 Some in-migrants were very conscious of what they got out of the whole experience of moving; for example becoming more confident, tolerant and sociable, and progressing from being inward to more outward looking. This added up to a sense of personal growth as a key benefit of relocating:

“Before I moved up here I was a lot more reticent, a lot colder...what are the things that help you relocate? I think the Scottish cultural attitude was one. I had felt myself very welcomed up here and that has kind of rubbed off on me and I have kind of opened up more.” (An entrepreneur from London)

Many in-migrants said they were aware that it was necessary to take responsibility for being ‘the foreigner’ and to make an effort to go more than half way if required to connect with people:

“We are adaptable, well traveled people who like people. We know that what we get back from people is largely dependent on what you give to them. We aim to be friendly and open without being too pushy.” (An in-migrant from England)
A few in-migrants also related how they knew some people had not settled in well, and attributed this to them not having the right attitude to the move or inclination to make an effort to get to know people.

How likely are people to remain and what affects this decision

5.36 The key factors in determining whether someone will decide to stay in Scotland or leave were perceived to be:

- the level of contentment with work/career development and the opportunities that were felt to be available
- the future of the economy
- the level of satisfaction with the lifestyle being followed
- the desire for personal growth through the challenge of moving somewhere new
- the lifestage reached by various family members (e.g. children and education commitments, elderly parents and health care arrangements)

These factors interplayed with each other, and for different people carried different weight.

5.37 Despite the relatively high levels of satisfaction with life in Scotland, the general trend was for people to not be committed to staying. Having already relocated once, the in-migrants involved in this study were very open-minded about living in different locations. A few already had plans for their next move; these were often Pragmatists and World Citizens who would be moving on for career development or personal growth and adventure, and/or post graduates who were looking to experience new places. Even those who were perfectly happy talked of moving:

“I am passionate about what I am doing at the moment but in the future I might like to go to Europe – to Austria or Germany perhaps.” (An employee from Germany)

5.38 There was some evidence that people from overseas saw their relocation to Scotland as a more temporary move than those who had relocated from within the UK. This fell in line with most Lifestyle Pursuers being from the UK, and as they were seen as chasing a lifestyle rather than an economic opportunity, the move was more long term. Those coming from the UK maybe did not see their move as relocating to another country, and although it was of a shorter distance, it carried more risks.

5.39 Many entrepreneurs who had moved to Scotland for pragmatic reasons were very open-minded about following the best business opportunities. They were prepared to move to places where, for example, funding or favourable tax breaks were available. This was also seen amongst aspiring entrepreneurs:
“In the next few years I want to be able to set up my own bioscience business. It could be in Scotland. I am at a stage in my life where I need support and encouragement; I am at the stage where I will be able to make a difference to my life, to the company that I am working for and to the economy.” (A post graduate from England, now an employee)

5.40 Employment opportunities played a significant role in in-migrants thoughts of whether they would settle in Scotland. For some, the nature of their job meant that they expected to be relocated again. For others, they were aware that in order to progress in their field, they may have to look for employment outside Scotland. A few in-migrants had employment in Scotland, but their partners did not, the decision to stay on hinged somewhat on their partner finding suitable work. Particularly for post graduate students, the availability of future employment was an important deciding factor for whether to stay:

“I’ll stay if I can find suitable employment or more funding for my research, otherwise I will go abroad to experience a different culture.” (A post graduate from England)

5.41 For overseas post graduates, staying on in Scotland was seen to positively contribute to their future employment opportunities in their home country. This was particularly true for some students from parts of Asia, where equivalent academic opportunities did not exist, and the experience of working in the UK was valued highly:

“We’ll probably try and get some work experience...it is more important than just having academic qualifications and then we will return...because of family connections.” (Post graduates from India)

Even when post graduates were having difficulty finding suitable work, they stayed on in Scotland in jobs that were not that suitable in the hope that they would find something else.

5.42 Scotland was also recognised as presenting favourable economic conditions, and whether some in-migrants remained in the country was contingent on such climates being sustained:

“We appreciate the relevance of the “health” of the oil industry in shaping the economic climate of Aberdeen. It is currently in good shape and if this continues we will be all the more likely to stay.” (An employee from Poland, not involved in the oil industry)

5.43 It may be expected that Lifestage Returners were the most likely to commit to staying in Scotland post-relocation, due to family ties. However, having enjoyed living abroad already, many were often tempted by the prospect of moving away again. Rather than giving the sense that once they were back in Scotland they would stay
forever, there was more of a sense that because they had been away, they knew how rewarding it could be:

“We are happy to be here at present with our children at secondary school but in a way we are taking stock of the situation, this may just be a stepping stone, we might go away again once they are grown up.” (A returner from overseas)

“It’s going to depend on work opportunities. I really liked living and working in the US and I would go back if the opportunity arose and I could get a visa.” (A returner from overseas)

Other in-migrants were also driven by life stage factors:

“We are happy with primary school education for our children but for secondary we may want to return.” (An employee from Israel)

5.44 Less positively, a few in-migrants who were not having a satisfactory time living in Scotland were committed to reloca ting once their contracts had come to an end:

“I would be promoted if I stayed here and I’m not willing to take a promotion and stay, I would rather just go back and stay in my position...I was very open minded to letting it go the way it needed to go...but I’ve pretty much told them that I’ll stick to my two years.” (An employee from the USA)

5.45 For many involved in this study, especially those who were highly skilled and had lived in other countries, their attitude to staying on in Scotland was very flexible. The clear majority had had good experiences, and were enthused about doing the same in other destinations. The idea of becoming a World Citizen, and having lived in Scotland as part of this, was very much one that many aspired to. The following quote illustrates this flexibility and aspiration:

“I still want to live in different cities and experience different things...I would consider coming back...Scotland will always be a place that I think of fondly...If I were to keep working and they take me on full time or something else develops that I quite like then I would probably consider staying...it also depends on the person I am seeing...if he wants to move to London then that is probably what we will do. If work takes me to New York or San Francisco that is where I will be.” (A post graduate, now an employee from the USA)
Conclusions

5.46 On the whole, people had positive experiences of relocating to Scotland. Given the weight that word of mouth carries in other in-migrants’ decisions to relocate (especially those from overseas) this is of great importance.

5.47 Few respondents actively sought the advice and support of public bodies in making their relocation, however those that did, generally had positive experiences.

5.48 Employees that received support from their employers to relocate generally had better experiences. Support was more commonly provided for employees who had not actively pursued a relocation, compared to returners, for example, who wanted to move back to Scotland.

5.49 Universities offered some support to post graduates in their relocation, but this varied widely. Wherever it was available, it was valued. A number of post graduates from overseas heavily relied on support networks of other in-migrants from their home countries.

5.50 A positive experience with work, studies or business was crucial in making the move a success for most in-migrants in this study. Pragmatists and World Citizens were most likely to have had positive experiences in this area.

5.51 Improved lifestyle was a major factor in attracting and encouraging people to stay in Scotland; however, was not a strong enough factor on its own to retain people.

5.52 Another key factor influencing in-migrants’ experiences of relocating was their frame of mind and attitude to moving. A positive approach was valued highly in helping people settle in quickly.

5.53 There were many inter related influences in play when people thought about whether they would stay on in Scotland; these included future employment opportunities; the level of satisfaction with the lifestyle they were pursuing; and the lifestage of members of the family.

5.54 Despite overall high levels of satisfaction with relocating to Scotland, most in-migrants were not fully committed to staying on in Scotland on a permanent basis. In fact, the group of in-migrants interviewed had generally enjoyed their relocation so much that they valued the experience of living in another country.

5.55 Most in-migrants had a flexible approach to where they would live in the future, and often saw their experiences of life in Scotland as helping them towards becoming World Citizens.
CHAPTER SIX  CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction

6.1  As explored in Chapter 1, encouraging in-migration is a key component in tackling the problems associated with a declining population and for strengthening Scotland’s economy. Through conducting research with recent in-migrants, this study has addressed people’s motivations for relocating to Scotland (Chapter 2), what their perceptions of the country are (Chapter 3), and identified what makes the experience more difficult (Chapter 4) or easier (Chapter 5).

6.2  This chapter considers implications of the findings of this research study on the future direction of the Fresh Talent initiative in two ways. First and foremost it raises and considers key questions for the Initiative and for clarifying the public sector’s strategic approach to managing in-migration. Secondly, the chapter provides specific recommendations of practical activities that could be undertaken to encourage people to in-migrate, make their relocation easier and encourage them to stay on.

Key questions for the Fresh Talent Initiative

6.3  Although it is clearly acknowledged that Scotland needs to encourage in-migration to strengthen its economy, current strategy needs to be clarified and communicated more effectively, as addressed by the questions below. This is followed by a discussion of the issue of limited economic opportunity in Scotland - a key theme emerging from the research both with organisations and individuals. We also consider Scotland and its cities compared with other destinations competing for in-migrants.

6.4  From this research study, 3 key questions emerged for those involved in aspects of managed migration and the Fresh Talent Initiative:

- Is it important to encourage people to relocate permanently, or are there merits in attracting people who wish to stay for shorter time periods?
- Who does Scotland want to attract, and who should be targeted?
- How can the public, private and academic sectors work together to further develop managed migration?
Is it important to encourage people to relocate permanently, or are there merits in attracting people who wish to stay for shorter time periods?

6.5 This research indicates that the people who had the most positive relocation experience were the Pragmatists and World Citizens, i.e. those who were motivated to relocate for economic reasons above any desire to change their lifestyle. They faced fewer barriers to settling in, as they had more manageable expectations, and as epitomised by their typology they came to Scotland with economic opportunities in place. However, although these two groups were happy with their relocations on the whole, they were the most likely to say that they did not see their move to Scotland as a permanent one.

6.6 Scotland has many benefits to reap from such short term relocations, including:

- The contribution to the economy of in-migrants who enter Scotland with pre-arranged opportunities
- The positive experiences these people have had of Scotland which they will go onto share with others by word of mouth in their future destinations (the most common source of in-migrants’ knowledge of life in Scotland was by word of mouth)
- In-migrants who relocate to Scotland non-permanently will prove less of a burden on its public services in the long term, e.g. pension provisions, while contributing to the economy by paying taxes and spending in the short term
- Having a variety of in-migrants who move to Scotland for a short period of time increases exposure to other cultures for Scotland’s businesses and people
- This would result in a country with a dynamic in-migrant population that is constantly refreshing itself and would attract others in the future

6.7 Those who relocated because they were pursuing a lifestyle change tended to be moving to Scotland without prior economic opportunities arranged. In these cases they had trouble settling in and had less pleasant relocation experiences. There were a number of examples of highly skilled people reluctantly setting up businesses because they could not find suitable employment opportunities. As a consequence, where external support had been provided, this was not always appreciated. Such businesses were often struggling as this was a forced, rather than chosen option, and it could be argued may be difficult to sustain.

6.8 In summary, findings from the research suggest that Scotland’s economy would benefit from explicit targeting of Pragmatists and World Citizens. These groups are not necessarily moving to Scotland with the intention of it being on a permanent basis, but make valuable contributions whilst they are here, and have the most positive experiences.
Who does Scotland want to attract, and who should be targeted?

6.9 A key finding from this study is that the in-migrants who had moved to Scotland were unaware of who Scotland wanted to attract. There was a lack of clarity about who Fresh Talent was targeted at and what the Initiative was trying to do. On the one hand Scotland was seen as having a very open, forward-thinking attitude to immigration and portrayed itself as a country that welcomed everyone, no matter what their background or skill level. However, this was contrasted by the impression that Fresh Talent exists to only encourage the in-migration of bright, young people. A number of returning Scots and those from the rest of the UK thought Fresh Talent was only aimed at those from overseas. There is scope therefore to state clearly the objectives of Fresh Talent; to highlight who it is aimed at; and to ensure these key messages are appropriately communicated to target audiences.

How can the public, private and academic sectors work together to encourage managed migration, and make relocation easier?

6.10 There was a strong sense of confusion around the current roles and responsibilities of public sector organisations in relation to encouraging people to in-migrate to Scotland. There are a number of organisations who have a role in managed migration, and our research highlighted the need to clarify the roles and responsibilities of those organisations, as well as to develop further partnerships between them. Both in-migrants and the organisations working with them often commented on not knowing how the Scottish Executive differed from Scottish Enterprise, nor how Fresh Talent differed from Talent Scotland. Other people suggested ways in which they could have been helped during the decision making process and the move itself, but were unclear about who would provide that help.

6.11 The private sector has an important part to play in helping to encourage in-migration from the perspective of making the relocation process a straightforward one. From both the interviews with organisations that had contact with in-migrants, and in-migrants themselves, there was a call for public bodies to work more closely with the private sector. Relocation agencies (both company in-house and independent) felt that they had a lot of expertise and experience that the Scottish Executive could capitalise on. Through years of working with in-migrants and helping them settle in, they knew their client base well, and were enthusiastic about sharing their knowledge, and existing services, with the Executive.
Other key considerations

Limited economic opportunity

6.12 This study found that before relocating to Scotland, some in-migrants were concerned about a lack of economic opportunities for highly skilled positions in most industries. While the research included only those who had successfully relocated, it is possible that such perceptions act as a barrier to relocation for others. Our research found that once people had relocated, their worries about lack of suitable employment opportunities were at times confirmed. This was identified in both the individual depth interviews, and the focus groups with in-migrants as a strong barrier to relocating and staying on in Scotland. It was particularly found to be the case for couples, where there was difficulty in two people both finding suitable employment.

6.13 Notwithstanding the position relating to couples, in general Pragmatists and World Citizens were satisfied with their employment experience. An exception was post graduate students, most of whom were Pragmatists. Their experience is covered in more detail below. Lifestage Returners and Lifestyle Pursuers noted employment difficulties relatively often. On occasion, returning Scots suggested that the limited opportunity had led them to revise their plans to remain permanently in Scotland; instead they were becoming open once again to moving elsewhere.

6.14 An emerging concern about the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme was that it raised expectations that were not matched by experience. Whilst it may help to attract graduates and has developed a mechanism to assist them to stay on after graduation, suitable economic opportunities do not necessarily exist in Scotland. The problem of lack of suitable employment opportunities for post graduates was also highlighted in previous research (Harrison, 2003).

6.15 Some post graduates who were still studying said that they would like to continue living in Scotland, but would not be able to given that they would have to go elsewhere to gain suitable employment. Post graduates who had recently graduated expressed frustration at the lack of employment opportunities available to them in Scotland, more so amongst those who did not want to go into academia. As a result they were working in jobs that did not use the skills they had gained and were unhappy with this position. This was neither to their, nor Scotland’s advantage. Given the reliance on word of mouth in selecting a place of study for future post graduates, it is particularly important that current students have positive experiences in Scotland.

Competing with other destinations

6.16 Evidence from this research suggests that Scotland’s cities are not viewed as ‘world class’ by many of the in-migrants who moved here. The cultural opportunities of Edinburgh and Glasgow and the academic reputation of Scotland’s universities were
commonly acknowledged and in-migrants were often pleasantly surprised by aspects of life in Scotland, including transport links being better than expected for some, the easy access to outdoor life, and the friendly nature of Scottish people. However, Scotland clearly did not offer the career opportunities, or have the international and dynamic reputation of say London or San Francisco. Even those who were happy in their jobs were aware that in order to progress their career, they may have to look to other locations for further opportunities. From the in-migrant perspective Scotland’s cities cannot compete in most industries with the major world population centres in offering the depth and breadth of attractive employment opportunities.

6.17 Some of the younger in-migrants (post graduates and first- and second-jobbers) saw their move to Scotland as a first step to becoming World Citizens. For example one employee who had come from London, described his relocation to Edinburgh as testing the water for bigger moves. For those coming from the rest of the UK, moving to Scotland felt like they had moved to a different country, but one which was relatively ‘safe’. They were physically removed from their home country, whilst not having large physical distances to travel; language and cultural barriers to overcome; or visas and immigration to negotiate.

**Practical recommendations**

6.18 Many of the practical recommendations made by people who had relocated to Scotland were already in place by the Scottish Executive or other public bodies. However, the fact that suggestions were made for initiatives that already existed, indicated a clear lack of awareness of the support and advice available. These included the functions of:

- The Relocation Advisory Service
- Funding available for new businesses through the Enterprise Networks
- The Talent Scotland website
- The ‘scotlandistheplace’ website
- The Working in Scotland Scheme for graduates

6.19 Other recommendations made were in areas that the Executive is already aware of and in some cases is already addressing:

- Difficulties people from overseas and returners face in opening bank accounts
- Problems with recognition of professional qualifications gained overseas
- Problems with lack of transport options to and from remote areas, and direct international flights from Scottish cities to other cities

As well as tackling the overarching problem of the lack of a coherent strategic approach to in-migration, the following are practical recommendations for encouraging in-migration, making relocation an easier process, and helping people to settle in, as concluded from the interviews with in-migrants.
Encouraging in-migration

Extending the Working in Scotland Scheme
6.20 Given that many students will have left Scotland after graduating to pursue life in other countries, it is suggested that the Working in Scotland Scheme is extended to anyone who has left a Scottish University in the last ten years. In-migration across countries is more fluid than ever and therefore, there is greater flexibility as to at what life and career stage people make relocation decisions. Extending the period of time since people have graduated may attract more experienced candidates who may have less problems finding suitable employment.

Scottish Executive and employer alliances
6.21 The Scottish Executive wants Fresh Talent to encourage in-migration; there are in-migrants who want to move to Scotland but are put off by the lack of economic opportunity, and there are some employers with skills shortages. One practical suggestion to marry these three needs would be to have a partnership between the Executive and employers who could jointly attend careers fairs outwith Scotland. The Executive would benefit from advertising the employment opportunities alongside its usual message of Scotland offering a good lifestyle.

Help for small to medium businesses to recruit from overseas
6.22 There was a concern that some employers were put off recruiting from overseas as they were not comfortable with the perceived time and costs involved, and their concerns over retention. Employers could be offered incentives to recruit in-migrant staff, and smaller employers could be offered help to do this. Linked to the previous point, some employers already offer support to their staff when relocating, and actively recruits from overseas itself. This report recommends that the Scottish Executive looks at some case studies of what is being done to learn from them.

Promoting awareness of Scotland’s meritocratic work culture
6.23 It was reported by some in-migrants that the sense that young people in particular can get the opportunity to take on responsible work roles is not one experienced in all work cultures. Promoting this amongst overseas graduates and within the specific sectors that Scotland wants to attract is recommended.

Targeted marketing for the public sector’s business support strategy
6.24 All entrepreneurs that were approached by public bodies to relocate or set up their business in Scotland, were not previously aware of the support on offer. Upon taking up the support and relocating, they were all very satisfied with the outcomes, however, felt that Scotland needed to target the business sectors to which the available services would be relevant, and inform them of it.
Tax breaks to attract and retain entrepreneurs

6.25 A number of in-migrants cited examples of this being done in other countries and thought that offering tax breaks to in-migrant entrepreneurs would show that Scotland is serious about fresh talent.

Recommendations to help the relocation and settling in

Inter-cultural training for overseas in-migrants

6.26 Certain aspects of Scottish culture came as a surprise to in-migrants from overseas, especially that of socialising around alcohol. An employer who provided inter-cultural training to the partners of employees who relocated, found that it helped them settle in. It is recommended that this kind of training is piloted amongst more employers, and in universities, for very recent in-migrants.

Training and guidance in customer service and managed migration policies for British Embassy staff abroad

6.27 There were complaints from in-migrants from overseas of unsatisfactory and rude customer service from British Embassy staff abroad. To convey Scotland’s message - that it is serious about encouraging in-migration and welcoming new in-migrants - the image presented, at this first port of call for many in-migrants, must be improved. It is recommended that steps are made to convey this to Embassy staff.

Promoting employers’ awareness of the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland Scheme

6.28 It was reported amongst post graduates that some were having difficulty finding suitable employment whilst on the Fresh Talent visa, and had to take up employment unaligned to their career plans. One explanation for this was that employers were unfamiliar with the Scheme and reluctant to employ them. Given that the visa is for a limited period of two years, it is important that to maximize its advantages, those on the visa move into suitable employment soon after graduating. Once it has been agreed which sectors Scotland particularly wants to recruit in-migrants for, it is recommended that employers in this sector are targeted and made aware of the Scheme.

Creating an ‘arrivals package’

6.29 Many in-migrants expressed frustration around the practical elements of relocating to Scotland, especially around being unaware of how taxation and other administrative systems worked. In particular, council tax came as a surprise to many. It is recommended that new in-migrants from overseas are provided with an ‘arrivals package’ made available at international arrival ports. This should include information and contacts on key factors, including Council Tax, immigration procedures, finding accommodation, Inland Revenue, Business Gateway and support networks.

Making it easier to open bank accounts

6.30 This was a key frustration reported by many in-migrants from overseas. As well as the practical problems, difficulties and delays in opening bank accounts caused new in-migrants to feel like they were not trusted, which reflected on the country as a whole as giving an inadequate welcome. It is recommended that the public sector do
what is within their power to make it more straightforward for overseas in-migrants to open bank accounts. This would also include providing clear guidance for in-migrants as to what documents they have to supply in opening an account.

Making it easier to get mobile phone contracts
6.31 As with bank accounts, in-migrants had problems accessing other services, including getting mobile phone contracts. Having to use ‘pay as you go’ mobile phones created a sense of transience for some, and it is recommended that efforts are made to make mobile phone contracts more easily available.

6.32 It should be noted that addressing practical issues alone will not substantially affect the in-migration process. To manage the migration process successfully, the strategic issues discussed earlier in the chapter need to be addressed first and foremost.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


NFO Social Research (2004) *In-migration to the Highlands & Islands*, Highlands and Islands Enterprise


ANNEX 1  TOPIC GUIDE FOR ORGANISATION INTERVIEWS

Experience of People who Relocate to Scotland
Topic Guide for Depth Interviews with Employers

Aim: To explore employer’s experience of recruiting people from outwith Scotland

Objectives

1) To explore fully
   - who does employer aim to attract
   - characteristics of those who relocate
   - employer’s experience of work issues/personnel issues
   - employer’s views of why people come to company/area/Scotland
   - employer’s views on attractions/challenges for people coming to company/area/Scotland
   - employer’s views on what encourages people to leave
   - employer’s views on how to encourage people to stay longer

2) To capture “case study material” on employees who have had a positive and successful experience of relocating to Scotland and who have had a negative or unsuccessful experience.

3) Extent to which employer is aware of any initiatives intended to attract and retain people.

1. Background to Project
   - About TNS Social, independent research agency
   - About the project
     o To explore employers’ experience of employing people from outwith Scotland
     o Commissioned by the Scottish Executive
     o This is one of a number of interviews being conducted with employers, and part of a larger research project
   - Duration of interview – around 45 minutes to one hour
   - Confidentiality and tape recording – will not name individual but organisation may be identifiable – confirm respondent ok with this
   - Explain purpose of research
     – Refer to box above
     – stress interested in returners and people from rest of UK as well as people from overseas (note: ask about difference in issues facing overseas people from within and outwith Europe)
     – and interested in different stages of relocating: attracting people to Scotland, process of relocating, and longer term settling-in and deciding whether to stay on
2. Organisation information

2.1 Collect or check demographic/ socioeconomic information as follows:

- What is your name and job title?
- What is your role regarding employees who have relocated?
- What type of business is this? (if relevant)
- How many employees work in this office?
- What is your approx turnover? (if relevant)
- What are your recruitment needs? Where are their skills shortages?
- Do you have a criteria for recruitment (e.g. job spec, skill set)?
- Which parts of Scotland does your organisation cover?

2.2 Please give a brief background to your reasons for considering employing people from outwith Scotland?

2.3 How much experience and what contact do you have with people who are relocating?

2.4 Ask about recruitment procedures for people from outwith Scotland:
   - At what stage do you have contact - attracting people/around the time of the move/longer term

2.5 Is there anything that puts the organisation off recruiting returners/rest of UK/overseas?
Probe:
   - work permits
   - accreditation of qualifications
   - recruitment costs
   - administration
   - language barriers
   - likelihood of people staying
   - other

2.6 What support, if any, does your organisation give to people who relocate? Probe – relocation package? Financial assistance? Help with finding accommodation? etc

2.7 To what extent do you use other organisations or services to help you recruit from outwith Scotland?

2.8 What are your needs/ expectations of these organisations?
3. Attracting and supporting in-migrants

3.1 Where do in-migrants come from and why?
- To what extent does your organisation actively recruit returners/from rest of UK/from overseas?
- As an organisation, where is your ‘competition’ for people based? Probe: returners/rest of UK/overseas
- Where else do people consider moving to?
- Why do people come to Scotland/area/your org?
- Why do you think people come to you rather than other parts of Scotland/other organisations?
- Who is it easiest to attract? Why?
- Who is hardest? Why?

3.2 In your experience, what are the characteristics of the people who relocate? Can you describe:
- ‘typical’ returner?
- ‘typical’ in-migrant from the rest of UK?
- ‘typical’ in-migrant from overseas?

Probe:
- age?
- with partner/family?
- which countries do they come from/return from?
- Type/level of job?

3.3 How much do you think people know about life in Scotland/specific place/your organisation?
- What do you think are their perceptions of Scotland
- What do you think attracts them to Scotland/place/organisation/job
- What concerns/apprehensions do people have about coming to Scotland?
- Where do they get this information? What are their previous connections?
- What do people ask you/the organisation about? What are their concerns?
- How much are you able to help?
- Do you refer them to any other organisations for more information/support?
- Once here, do you think there are any aspects that are better than they expected?
- Any aspects that are worse than they expected?

3.4 As an organisation, what support, if any, do you get to attract people from outwith Scotland?
- What support would be useful?
- Where do you think support should come from?

3.5 In general, what could be done to attract more people/different people?
Who is best placed to do this?
4. How easy is it to move to Scotland?

4.1 To what extent do you think people relocating to Scotland find it straightforward or face challenges?

- If easy what smooths the way
- If face challenges - What are the main challenges people face? Probe: returners/rest of UK/overseas

Prompt:
- work permit/immigration?
- bureaucracy?
- accommodation?
- partners?
- children? schools?
- money?
- language?
- anything else?

4.2 How much is your organisation able to help with these things?

- What situations are easier/harder to assist with?

4.3 As an organisation, what support, if any, do you get to help people relocate to Scotland?
- What support would be useful? Think of two key things that would help.
- Where do you think this support should come from?

5. Settling-in and staying on

5.1 In your experience, do people tend to settle in and stay in Scotland?
- Who does? Why?
- Who doesn’t? Why not?

5.2 What do in-migrants say about – place they live, work place and family/friends - probe separately

Scotland/area/community
- How welcoming are public in Scotland feel accepted/integrated
- Becoming part of /engaging with community
- Accessing services – education/health etc
- Accessing social/leisure/cultural facilities
- Quality of life? What’s good? What’s not so good?
- Housing?
- Cost of living?
- Transport/travel?

Work
- Work culture – different from expectations
- what’s good/not so good
- Language issues
- How does the company help people integrate with other employees?
- Are they made aware of their employment rights/health and safety issues?

**Personal/Family issues**
- Importance of family settling
- Issues of isolation/homesickness in-migrant or family members
- Language issues for family members
- Work opportunities
- Education opportunities

5.3 What support, if any, do you get as an organisation to help people settle in longer term?
- What support would be useful?

5.4 What support, if any, is available to individuals from other sources to help them settle in? Probe:
- from recent movers?
- from family/friends
- from other groups/organisations

5.5 In your opinion, what could be done to help more people settle in and decide to stay?
- Who is best placed to do this?
6. **Case studies (ensure time at the end - or use as prompt earlier in interview)**

Could you describe the experience of an individual you know who has had a positive and successful experience of relocating to Scotland?

Could you describe the experience of an individual who has had a negative and unsuccessful experience of relocating to Scotland?

7. **Finally…**

Are you aware of any local or Scottish-wide policy initiatives intended to attract and retain people?

If not - Provide information on Fresh Talent Initiative:

The Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative aims to attract and retain bright hard working people to Scotland. Strands of the Initiative include a Relocation Advisory service that provides information to individuals and employers about relocating to Scotland; a Working in Scotland scheme that enables graduates to remain in Scotland for up to two years after graduating; sponsorship of academic scholarships and a marketing arm that promotes Scotland in the UK and abroad.

If yes - What experience do you have of these initiatives?
   - What do you think of them?
   - Any thoughts on how they could be improved?

Is there anything else you would like to say?

Discuss the best way to contact employees who have relocated for the individual interviews.

**Thank and close**
ANNEX 2   TOPIC GUIDE FOR ORGANISATION INTERVIEWS

To help us with the interviews for the Experience of People who Relocate to Scotland study, please take a few minutes to answer the following questions and send them back to us. This information will help us to check we are speaking to a wide range of people and tell us a bit about you before the interview.

1. When did you relocate to Scotland?
   □   a. Within last year
   □   b. 1 up to 3 years ago
   □   c. 3 up to 5 years ago
   □   d. 5 years plus

2. Where did you move from?

3. Where did you move to?
   □   City   □   Town   □   Rural

4. Are you originally from Scotland?
   □   Yes   □   No

5. Would you say you are:
   □   a. Professional   □   b. Skilled   □   c. Postgraduate student
   □   d. Other (please state)

6. What is your occupation? (If postgraduate, what qualification level are you studying for?)

7. What sector do you work in? (If postgraduate, what subject are you studying?)

8. If you moved with a partner/family – please state relationship and ages:
   -
   -
   -
9. How old are you?
☐ 18-24  ☐ 25-34  ☐ 35-44  ☐ 45-54  ☐ 55-64  ☐ 65+

10. Are you:
☐ Male?  ☐ Female?

11. Generally, how easy or difficult did you find relocating to Scotland?
☐ a. Very easy
☐ b. Quite easy
☐ c. Quite difficult
☐ d. Very difficult

12. How likely are you to stay in Scotland?
☐ a. Very likely
☐ b. Quite likely
☐ c. Undecided
☐ d. Quite unlikely
☐ e. Very unlikely

13. How attractive would you rate Scotland as a place to relocate to for people in your industry?
☐ a. Very attractive
☐ b. Quite attractive
☐ c. Quite unattractive
☐ d. Very unattractive

14. How attractive would you rate Scotland as a place to relocate to generally?
☐ a. Very attractive
☐ b. Quite attractive
☐ c. Quite unattractive
☐ d. Very unattractive

If you have any queries, please contact the person who is interviewing you, or xxxx.
Thank you for your time. We look forward to speaking to you.
ANNEX 3  TOPIC GUIDE FOR IN-MIGRANT INTERVIEWS

Experience of People who Relocate to Scotland
Topic Guide for Depth Interviews with Individuals

Aim: To explore individual’s experience of relocating from outwith Scotland

Objectives:

To explore fully:

1. People’s knowledge of Scotland including:
   - How they found out about life in Scotland.
   - Their perceptions of Scotland before and after the move.
   - The impacts of any previous visits to Scotland.
   - Any previous links to Scotland.
   - Characteristics of those who relocate.

2. What made Scotland attractive to people who relocated, including:
   - People’s reasons and influences for relocating to, and staying in Scotland.
   - Where else they considered moving to.
   - The barriers and hurdles people have faced in relocating.
   - Which geographical areas have been attractive to people who relocate and why.
   - What were the most positive aspects of moving to Scotland?
   - What could Scotland could do to attract more people to relocate.

3. People’s experience of Scotland, including:
   - The barriers and hurdles people have faced in remaining in Scotland.
   - People’s experiences of living in Scotland.
   - The importance of respondents’ personal characteristics to their experience.
   - What do they miss about the places they moved from?
1. Introduction / warm up

Introduction to TNS Social; background to project; purpose of interview (refer to objectives, p1); confidentially and tape recording; thanks for completing pre-interview tasks and explain we will be referring to these throughout the interview and will keep them for reference.

When did they move and where did they come from?

2. Knowledge of Scotland

What previous connections did they have to Scotland/the area they relocated to?

Before relocating: how did they find out about Scotland, what were the best sources (publications, organisations etc)?
Was there any information they wanted to know but could not find out? If so, what?
Any suggestions for improvement?

What were their perceptions of Scotland before relocating?
Prompt for price of living, lifestyle, people, community, job prospects, business environment (if applicable), academic strength (if applicable) etc
What are the origins of those perceptions (family, media etc)?

What impact did any previous visits to Scotland have on their decision to relocate?

For returners:
Did they leave with the intention of coming back, if not, why did they come back?
How often did they come back to visit?
Do they still have friends or family in the area?
Do they ever talk to friends/peers about returning - what might prompt them to do so?

3. Attractiveness of Scotland

Identify when and why the idea of moving (back) first presented itself, how the idea gestated and developed and what triggered the process of actually moving. Explore any significant life events that preceded the move. Also understand how areas are selected and what factors, if any, are critical.
3.1 Deciding on the move

When was the very first time they thought they might move to Scotland? What ‘planted the seed’?
Which factors did they take into consideration in relocating - which were the most important factors and why?
Determine whether there was a conscious process of deciding upon the move or whether it was more spontaneous and opportunistic?
Was there one specific thing that made the move possible?

If they hadn’t made the move when they did, would they have done it in the future? If yes, why did they do it now, and what were the reasons for always wanting to do it? Did they have any apprehensions about relocating and if so, what were they? Were these apprehensions realised when they relocated? How?

3.2 Choosing the location

How was the choice of location made? Was there a conscious process of narrowing and selecting or was it more spontaneous and opportunistic?

Where did they consider moving to and why? Prompt:
- City vs town vs rural area
- Different regions of Scotland
- Other parts of the UK
- Other countries
What factors were critical in determining where they moved to?
What type of area did they move from?

3.3 Making the move

What barriers did they have to overcome to relocate to Scotland?
Did they experience any problems with:
- Work permits/immigration?
- Finding accommodation?
- Finding work? (This will be explored further in the last section)
- Partner/family settling in? Children settling in? Finding schools?
− Cost of living?
− Language?
− Anything else?

Was there anything that helped make the move easier, and if so, what was it?

4. Experiences of Scotland

Ask them to describe their experiences of relocating to Scotland in terms of:
− Accommodation/housing experiences
− Neighbourhood experiences/contact with local people
− Work experiences
− Use of public services including schools, hospitals, transport etc
− How they felt emotionally – isolated/lonely v accepted?

What lifestyle factors are important to them as in-migrants to Scotland; what activities do they enjoy, what is good vs what could be improved? – What is missing?

Have they experienced any racial/religious/cultural intolerance/tolerance; if yes, what was it and what impact has this had on their decision to remain in Scotland?
To what extent do they feel involved in their local community?

What do they think is the role/relevance/importance of their personal characteristics in their experience of moving to Scotland; age, sex, country of origin, place of residence, date of arrival etc.? How important are family/community links in determining their attitudes and experience of living in Scotland: children/age of children/links to family members/member of shared community etc?

How likely are they to remain in Scotland? Why?
What barriers, if any, have they faced in seeking to remain in Scotland?
How have their experiences of Scotland influenced their desire to remain or leave?
Can they see circumstances in which they would move away from Scotland? Or move elsewhere in Scotland? What would they be, and where would they go?

What do they miss about the place they moved from?
5a. Entrepreneurs/self employed

5a.1  Type of business

Was their business started in Scotland or brought in from outwith?
When was it started?
Number of employees and approx turnover?
What does the business do?

5a.2  Deciding on the move

What role did the business play in their decision to relocate?
Determine whether they decided to set up business before they decided to relocate.
If so:
  − What did they see as the advantages of running a business in Scotland/this area?
  − What did they see as the disadvantages?
  − Did they contact any organisations/anyone about setting up a business in Scotland?
    o How did they hear about them?
    o What help/guidance was offered?
    o Was it helpful?
  − What else would have been useful to have known beforehand?

5a.3  Starting/moving the business

What problems did they face in starting up/moving their business to Scotland?
Prompt for:
  − Recruitment
  − Finding Accommodation
  − Business regulation
  − Attracting business/customers
  − Raising finance
  − Business and work culture

What have been the advantages of running a business in Scotland?
What have been the disadvantages?
What could be done to attract more entrepreneurs into Scotland?
5b. Employees

5b.1 Employer

What does the company they work for do?
Do they actively recruit from outwith Scotland?
Approx numbers/proportions of employees from outwith?
Were they remunerated for the relocation? How? Was it sufficient?
Did employer supply them with information on living and working in Scotland/the area?
Probe for help with:
  − Work permits/immigration
  − Finding accommodation (and schools if applicable)
  − Advice on cost of living
  − Other

What else could their employer have done to help with the relocation?

5b.2 The job

Determine whether in the same job/company now as when first relocated – if changed, explore both jobs to see if there was progression between jobs.

What came first – decision to relocate to Scotland or job offer?
Explore relationship between location and job in terms of making the decision.
  − If job offer came first, had they considered living in Scotland before?
  − If decision to relocate came first, are they in a job they want to be in?

How did they hear about the job?
Did they have specialist skills that were particularly attractive to their employer?
  − If so, what were they?

Do they get the impression that Scottish employers have difficulty finding people with their skills in Scotland?
  − If so, do they feel that contributed to them being recruited, as someone from outwith Scotland?

Have they/did they have any problems in settling into the job? What were they?
If they were doing a similar job before they relocated, what are the differences in doing the same work in Scotland?
How is the work culture in Scotland different to other places they have worked?
5c. Post-graduate students

5c.1 University and location

What attracted them to study in Scotland/their particular university?
Which other universities did they consider?
What was the deciding factor in choosing this university?
Do they feel that they made the right choice? Why?

What support was available for relocating as a postgraduate student?
What other support would they have wanted to help them settle in?

5c.2 Experiences of Scotland and prospects

Do they think they will continue to study/work in Scotland?
  If yes, what keeps them in Scotland?
  − Where else in Scotland is an attractive location for them?
  − Why would they not want to return to the place they came from?

If no, where do they see themselves going?
  − Why would they not stay in Scotland?
  − What would make them stay in Scotland?

5c.3 Future Employers

Having studied in Scotland, do they feel this makes them attractive to employers?
Why?
Do they expect/have they been actively recruited by employers from within Scotland?
From outwith Scotland?
Do they expect/have they approached employers from within Scotland? From outwith Scotland?
6. Finally (ask all)…

What have been the best aspects of relocating to Scotland?
What would people similar to themselves who were thinking of moving to Scotland want to hear about?
What could Scotland do to attract and retain more in-migrants?

If not already covered - Did they receive support from any organisations (or people) in choosing Scotland as a location, relocating, or settling into the area? Who? How?
What help do they think should be available? Which organisations should provide it?

Are they aware of any local or Scottish-wide policy initiatives intended to attract and retain people?

If not - Provide information on Fresh Talent Initiative:
*The Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative aims to attract and retain bright hard working people to Scotland. Strands of the Initiative include a Relocation Advisory service that provides information to individuals and employers about relocating to Scotland; a Working in Scotland scheme that enables graduates to remain in Scotland for up to two years after graduating; sponsorship of academic scholarships and a marketing arm that promotes Scotland in the UK and abroad.*

If yes - What experience do they have of these initiatives?
   What do they think of them?
   Any thoughts on how initiatives could be improved?

Collect pre-interview questions if respondent has not already answered them.

Anything else?

Explain we are doing follow up focus groups in February and check they would be happy for us to possibly contact them to participate.

Thank and close
ANNEX 4  DISCUSSION GUIDE FOR GROUPS

Experience of People who Relocate to Scotland
Discussion Guide for Mini Groups with In-migrants

**Aim:** To discuss emerging findings and to explore response to/implications of specific policy initiatives and campaigns

**Objectives:**
1. To validate current research findings, specifically:
   - The existence of the 4 Typologies
   - Whether there were any barriers that weren’t identified and to get a feeling for which are more important
   - Whether there were any factors that helped relocation that weren’t identified and to get a feeling for which are more important

2. Groups to generate suggestions for what can be done by the Executive to:
   - Encourage people to in-migrate
   - Help them settle in
   - Encourage them to stay on

3. To explore feelings and thoughts about the concept of the Fresh Talent Initiative and any other policies they are aware of:
   - Begin by discussing what they are aware of
   - Moderator to introduce Fresh Talent initiatives

**Guide timings:**
Intro and warm up – 10 minutes; Objective 1 – 45 minutes; Objective 2 – 45 minutes; Objective 3 – 10 minutes

**Note to moderators** – draw on distinctions between the needs/wants of employees, entrepreneurs and post graduates throughout
Introduction (5 mins.)

- Thank for attending and taking part in depths. Explain report will be published sometime after March by the Scottish Executive
- Moderator introduction – explain that from an independent research company that have been commissioned by Scottish Executive. Stress that looking for honest opinions from their experience as in-migrants, and that there are no right or wrong answers.
- Explain that a draft report has been written on the initial findings, this group will be used to explore whether these findings reflect their experiences, and also to get some suggestions from them as in-migrants on what can be done to encourage more people to relocate, help them settle in and retain them. Explain that their feedback will directly feed into the final report.
- Session to last about an hour and a half
- Ask for permission to tape record

Brief warm-up (5 mins.)

- Where they moved from and when
- Where they live now and what they do
- Main reason for moving to Scotland

Objective 1 (45 mins. overall for Objective 1)

Typologies (15 mins.)
(Materials – 4 typology sheets)
Talk through the 4 typologies that we devised. Main points to mention are:
T1 – Economic/Incidental Pragmatists
- Key motivation for relocating was economic/educational purposes
- Scotland as a location was secondary in decision
- Faced some barriers in settling in; but often not significant
- Generally undecided as to whether they would stay on

T2 – World citizens
- Key motivation for relocating was life experience of living in another country through employment/academic opportunity
- Lived and worked in several different countries
- Did not face many barriers to settling in
- See move to Scotland as non-permanent
- Have thoughts on where might go next
T3 – Lifestage Returners
- Born and brought up in Scotland
- Left to pursue educational or career opportunities
- Returned to Scotland for ‘lifestage’ reasons – to be nearer family and friends
- Often faced barriers to settling in again

T4 – Lifestyle/Dream Pursuers
- Key motivation for relocating was change in lifestyle; therefore location important
- Experienced a ‘push’ from their previous location (more than a ‘pull’ to Scotland)
- Often moved without economic opportunities arranged

Mention that typologies can rarely include very specific characteristics particular to individuals and that devising the typologies is a way of helping make sense of the plethora of experiences we have encountered during the study. Discuss response to these; do people feel these are “about right”. Do they know people who would fit into these descriptions? What about themselves? Do they feel they identify with one/more of these?

Ask group to comment on the titles (and details of the typologies), do they feel “about right”, do they have any other ideas for names/titles for these groups?

Ask group to add some more ‘human’ elements to the typologies – what are these people like? Where would you see / encounter them? What do they do for a living? Age etc?
Barriers and what helped them settle in (15 mins.)

Break up into two groups and each work on one of the tasks
(NB – depending on size of group and how receptive they are, may be better to do the following as a whole)

Group 1 - Barriers
(Materials - Stimulus cards listing barriers to relocating and settling in, 10 sheets)

Ask them to discuss which of these barriers were the most significant, and whether there are any missing. Then report back to all.

A. Finding suitable employment
B. Not easily making friends and settling in
C. Lack of suitable accommodation
D. Access to financial services
E. Racial, religious or cultural intolerance
F. Family or partner not settling in
G. Obtaining visas and work permits
H. Language differences
I. The high cost of living
J. Cultural differences

Does everyone agree that these are the biggest barriers? What has made these so problematic, and what could be done to overcome them? Are any barriers missing? What problems do they think they have experienced which are individual to Scotland?

If cost of living comes up as a significant barrier – what specifically do they find more expensive?

Do those that have lived here longer have less negative views about life in Scotland and the barriers faced to settling in? Why?
Group 2 - Things that helped them relocate/settle in (15 mins.)
(Materials - Stimulus cards listing what helped them relocate and settle in, 8 sheets)

Ask them to discuss which of these were the most significant, and whether there are any missing. Then report back to all.

A. An improved lifestyle
B. Help from public bodies
C. Friends, family and other contacts around
D. Help from relocation agencies
E. Finding suitable accommodation
F. Scottish cultural attitudes
G. Being satisfied with work/study/business
H. Help from employer/university

Discuss the two or three factors that helped most in more detail; why did these make such a difference?
Were there any factors that if had not been there, they would not have settled in?
Is there anything missing?
Objective 2: Suggestions for policy (45 mins. for objective)
(Materials – pens, suggestion sheet)

This is linked to the activity done with barriers and what helped them to relocate.

Use as an ‘ideas generation workshop’

Tell them that they are in charge of encouraging people to relocate to Scotland at the Scottish Executive. From the barriers and the factors that helped them relocate as just discussed, what would they do to:

1. Encourage people to in-migrate to Scotland
2. Help the relocation go smoother
3. Encourage people to stay on

(Hand out Suggestion Sheet. Suggest spending just under 10 minutes on each point, and then 10 minutes for discussion. I did not make explicit whether the Suggestions Sheet is for the group or pairs, you can decide on the night depending on numbers.)

Ask for specific and relevant suggestions. Encourage respondents to be creative. Get them to draw on their own experiences.
Objective 3: Initiatives and campaigns (10 mins.)

Awareness
How aware are they of any Scottish Executive or other policy initiatives to encourage people to in-migrate to Scotland?
Where have they seen/heard about it?

Image
If they have seen/heard of any publicity for initiatives, what did they think of it?

Moderator to discuss the different strands of Fresh Talent to inform Group
(Materials – statement of Fresh Talent)

The Scottish Executive’s Fresh Talent Initiative aims to attract and retain bright hard working people to Scotland. Strands of the Initiative include a Relocation Advisory service that provides information to individuals and employers about relocating to Scotland; a Working in Scotland scheme that enables graduates to remain in Scotland for up to two years after graduating; sponsorship of academic scholarships and a marketing arm that promotes Scotland in the UK and abroad.

Response to FTI
What is the initiative aiming to convey?
And how do they respond to these messages?

Who is the FTI aimed at? Refer back to typologies
“Personality” of the initiative (could use a bit of a projective technique here e.g. word board with prompt words, or just read out some suggestions e.g. authoritative, encouraging, supportive, friendly, inviting etc)

What does Fresh Talent say about Scotland as a country? How does it make Scotland sound as a country? E.g. Desperate, progressive, multi-cultural, global, growing, shrinking, land of opportunity etc

How could this initiative have helped them personally?
What effect will the initiative have? How will we know if it has been successful or not?
What effect does this initiative have on their impressions of the Scottish Executive

What should be done to optimise the effectiveness of the initiative?

Sum up: Explore whether they thought it would improve the image/encourage people to move to Scotland

Thanks and Close
Give expenses